From Tin Pan Alley to the Royal Schools of Music

The Institutionalisation of Classical and Jazz Music

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts in Sociology
at Massey University

Patricia Rosalind Ubeda
2000

Abstract

This thesis argues that the development of both classical and jazz music has been influenced by motivating conditions which have existed within differing and changing religious, social and political regimes. It argues also that the motivating conditions have been generated and regenerated by social forces and factors in society.

Presently, a breakdown of these former modes of regulation, which created a gulf between classical and jazz music, is taking place as both genres come under one institutional administrative locus, the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music. A focus has been made on new opportunities for the teaching and the learning of jazz piano music generally as presented by this institution. An implication is made that a break-down of attitudes, identified within social class, which previously kept classical and jazz music apart is taking place.

This theoretically driven narrative locates both classical and jazz music against their respective historical backdrops. From this perspective, the ideas of various theorists have been drawn upon in order to make an understanding of how the motivating conditions are perpetuated. Attitudes, opinions and experiences from local classical and jazz music teachers and pupils, past and present, among others, are drawn on to solidify the theoretical arguments made in this thesis.

Whilst an institutional wedding of classical and jazz music has taken place, philosophical artistic difference and intellectual development of each genre based on socialisation, it is argued, will remain.

Acknowledgements

The opportunity to write this thesis has been a privilege. The process of researching and writing has been a joy and a pleasure. I am deeply grateful to a number of people.

My first gratitude is expressed here to Albert, not only for unrelenting encouragement but for constant practical support including proof-reading. To Núria, thank you for proof-reading for different reasons. To Carlos and Miquel, thank you for continuing with life as though the whole procedure was 'normal'. To Teresa, thank you for quiet belief.

I would especially like to thank my supervisors, Dr Ann Dupuis and Dr Warwick Tie. The support, praise, criticism, direction, guidance and mental probing has been invaluable. I have enjoyed your company and treasure your friendship.

Thank you to the teachers of the new jazz piano syllabus who 'took the plunge' with their opinions about the unknown. Similarly, thank you to Mr Charles Beale of the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, and to Mr Phil Broadhurst of Massey University for sharing opinions and experiences about jazz music education. I am grateful to the Catholic sisters who openly described their experiences of, and opinions about, music teaching and to a number of their pupils who recalled their memories for the purpose of this thesis.

My gratitude is also recorded here to Mr David Goodyear, New Zealand Examinations Administrator and the Assistant Examinations Administrator, Mrs Christine Rowe, of the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music for practical assistance. Similarly, thank you to the ever-obliging staff of Massey University Library, Albany Campus.

Finally, thank you to special friends for not only general interest and encouragement but, on occasions, for wisdom and foresight.

With much gratitude in mind, I hope that this story presents a fair understanding of the institutionalisation of classical and jazz music with special focus on private musical education in New Zealand from the beginning of the first European settlers until the present time.

Contents

Abstract ii

Acknowledgements iii

Contents iv

'The Piano Lesson' (Illustration) viii

Chapter One: **Introduction**

1.1	**The Perspective**	**1**
1.2	**The Objectives**	**2**
1.3	**Classical and Jazz Music Defined**	**4**
1.4	**Context of the Research**	**4**
1.5	**Thesis Structure**	**7**
1.6	**Methodology**	**9**
1.7	**Abbreviations**	**12**

Chapter Two: **Classical Music**

2.1		**Introduction**	**13**
2.2		**Three Dimensions of Modes of Regulation**	**17**
2.3		**Modes of Regulation: The First Dimension**	**18**
	2.3.1	Christianity	19
	2.3.2	The Aristocracy	25
	2.3.3	The Effects of Intentional Regulation	26
2.4		**Modes of Regulation: The Second Dimension**	**28**
	2.4.1	Educational Institutions	30
2.5		**Modes of Regulation: The Third Dimension**	**33**
2.6		**Conclusion**	**38**

Chapter Three: **Jazz Music**

3.1		**Introduction**	**40**
3.2		**History**	**43**
	3.2.1	European Influences	44
	3.2.2	The Place of the Piano	46
	3.2.3	Summary	48
3.3		**Modes of Regulation**	**48**
3.4		**Modes of Regulation: The First Dimension**	**49**
	3.4.1	Improvisation	50
	3.4.2	Nature or Nurture?	53
	3.4.3	Significance of Lack of Influence	55
	3.4.4	Summary	56
3.5		**Modes of Regulation: The Second Dimension**	**56**
	3.5.1	Negative Regulation	57
	3.5.2	Summary	59
3.6		**Modes of Regulation: The Third Dimension**	**60**
	3.6.1	Regulatory Knowledge has its Founders	62
3.7		**Conclusion**	**65**

Chapter Four: **The Gatekeepers**

4.1		**Introduction**	**67**
4.2		**Authorities of Modernity**	**68**
	4.2.1	Effects of the Intellectual Climate of Modernity	69
	4.2.2	Institutionalised Education	70
	4.2.3	The Place of Music	71
	4.2.4	Cultural Particularities	74
	4.2.5	Intellectuals: The Decision Makers	76
4.3		**Gate-keeping within the Postmodern World**	**79**
	4.3.1	Market Forces as Gatekeepers	80
	4.3.2	Leisure and Pleasure	83
	4.3.3	The New Middle Class: the De Facto Gatekeepers	85
	4.3.4	Social Class Priorities	87
	4.3.5	Teachers in the New Market Place	88
	4.3.6	What is the Product Anyway?	92
	4.3.7	Summary	92
4.4		**Conclusion**	**93**

Chapter Five: **Strategies of Socialisation and Disciplinary Devices**

5.1		**Introduction**	**96**
	5.1.1	Relevance of These Concepts	97
5.2		**Cultural Dominance**	**99**
	5.2.1	Historical Context	99
	5.2.2	Obedience: A Way of Life	102
	5.2.3	Discipline: Effects on Music Teaching	104
	5.2.4	The Present Time	110
	5.2.5	Summary	113
5.3		**The Formal Institutions of Musical Knowledge**	**114**
	5.3.1	Reciprocal Understandings	114
	5.3.2	Some Consumer Appeals	119
	5.3.3	Jazz Music Problematised	123
	5.3.4	Summary	125
5.4		**Subject Positions**	**125**
5.5		**Conclusion**	**128**

Chapter Six: **Credentialism and Prestige**

6.1		**Introduction**	**129**
	6.1.1	Recognisable Qualifications	130
	6.1.2	Definitions	131
6.2		**Cultural Dominance**	**132**
	6.2.1	Music Preference is Not Static	134
	6.2.2	Equality in Jazz and Classical Music?	136
	6.2.3	Summary	143
6.3		**Role of Institutions**	**143**
	6.3.1	The Lure of Examination Success	144
	6.3.2	Jazz Music and the ABRSM	145
	6.3.3	Summary	146
6.4		**Subject Positions**	**147**
	6.4.1	The Occupation of Private Music Teaching in New Zealand	148
	6.4.2	Professions and Semi-professions	149
	6.4.3	Private Music Teaching: A Profession or a Job?	151
	6.4.4	Foregone Conclusions?	155
	6.4.5	The Formal Credentials	160
	6.4.6	The Future of the Occupation	161
6.5		**Conclusion**	**166**

Chapter Seven: **Conclusion**

7.1	**Context of the Thesis**	**168**
7.2	**Rationale**	**169**
7.3	**Theoretical Framework**	**169**
7.4	**Supporting Theoretical Considerations**	**171**
7.5	**Future Considerations**	**176**

References **182**

The Piano Lesson

Music Lessons, Icon Exposure: The Photographers Art, Published by Icon, England Popperfoto Item No 14 40022

Chapter One

Introduction

1.1 The Perspective

This thesis is about music and society. This thesis is not about music and the divinely artistically inexplicable. It is about music and the earthly explainable.

Igor Stravinsky (1882-1971) once said:

> (I) know that twelve notes in each octave and the varieties of rhythm offer me opportunities that all of human genius will never exhaust (Exley, 1991:9).

Whilst this is undoubtedly so, musical composition, like the writing of literature and the creation of paintings, is bound by the conditions under which it is composed. Nevertheless, endless words are written which suggest that the great artistic creations of writers, painters and musicians have come into existence as a result of some sort of divine inspiration.

Whilst not wishing to undermine the genius of much musical composition and performance, this thesis examines music in terms of the motivating conditions and/or the regulatory regimes, through which classical and jazz music have come into being. Their creation and development are central to this thesis because, having developed culturally, socially and intellectually in contrasting ways, they have recently come together under the one institutionalised administrative locus.

The motivating conditions which have buffered the development of both these genres of music have been identified within differing and changing religious, social, political and institutional regimes. Forces and factors which exist in society and hold these motivating conditions in place are discussed in this theoretically driven narrative. Excerpts from interviews with people who are, or who have been, associated with music teaching highlight this thesis.

1.2 The Objectives

Whilst Igor Stravinsky marvelled over the possibilities held within the twelve notes of each octave, it is purported that he also said:

> (J)azz opposes our classical conception of music a strange and subversive chaos of sounds ... it is a fashion and, as such, destined some day to disappear (Giddins, 1998:vii).

At approximately the same time, a headline of The New York Times (1926) was:

> Cornetist to Queen Victoria Falls Dead on Hearing Coney Island Jazz Band (Giddins, 1998:vii).

Much criticism, much humiliation, as exemplified, has been directed at jazz music. Despite seeming incongruity, this musical form, born of complex African rhythms and nurtured by the aural perception of black Americans was, eventually, rationalised, and formally included in institutionalised syllabi.

The rationalisation of jazz music for piano for teaching and learning purposes by the charitable trust and commercially viable British institution of music, the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) in the late 1990s in the United Kingdom (among other places) and in New Zealand in the year 2000 is a major consideration in this thesis. Jazz music was, by its inclusion in the syllabi of this internationally acclaimed institution, removed from its original context and institutionalised in the same manner as classical music had been by the ABRSM

over one hundred years earlier. Arising from this institutionalisation are two central questions. The first considers the implications which the coming together of these two major genres of music under one administrative locus generates. The second question asks how the institutionalisation of jazz music alongside classical music reflects the dynamics of contemporary social life in the Western world.

In seeking theoretical explanations for the development and the eventual 'coming together' of these two genres of music, consideration is given to known and recognisable influences. For example, people who make major contributions to the sciences are generally considered to be 'intelligent'. People who make major contributions to the arts are generally considered to be 'talented'. There appears to be a suggestion that to be a scientist is an explainable condition and that to be an artist is not. Similarities and differences which exist presently, and historically, between classical and jazz music have been identified in this thesis in order to suggest that being a musician is also 'an explainable condition'.

Accepting that being a musician is an 'explainable condition', this thesis argues that musical composition and performance are the end results of rational thought. They differ little from, for example, the ability to design a bridge, a jet engine or to find a remedy for AIDS. They are all the end products of the circumstances in which they were inspired. Serendipity is likely to have its place in all events. The human beings who were there at the time may be described as being the vehicle for bringing the composition, the performance, the bridge, the engine or the remedy into existence. Therefore, these phenomena may be considered to have an existence *before* the actuality of their creation. It is within creation, however, that the imprints of social class, cultural particularities and philosophical thought begin to make their presence obvious.

By tracing the creation and development of classical and jazz music, this theoretical narrative has considered events, attitudes and philosophical beliefs which have caused jazz music to be accepted *at this time* into formal institutions of musical education in various parts of the Western world. This process is best

exemplified by the ABRSM's recent action of presenting a structured framework of jazz piano for teaching and learning purposes.

1.3 Classical and Jazz Music Defined

For the purpose of this thesis the words 'classical' and 'jazz' are used broadly to distinguish between two distinct genres of music. Firstly, classical music is understood in a general definition as found in the Webster Encyclopedic Unabridged Dictionary, 1983:273:

> pertaining to, or constituting the formally and artistically more sophisticated and enduring types of music, as distinguished from popular and folk music and jazz. Classical music includes symphonies, operas, sonatas, song cycles, and lieder.

An understanding of 'jazz' music is restricted to the defining feature of the new jazz piano syllabus by the ABRSM (Beale, 1998:151) which considers improvisation as its most distinctive feature.

Two major differences between the two genres of music are considered to be firstly, that classical music was, from approximately the 9th century, codified and developed accordingly with enormous attention paid to written detail. Secondly, that jazz music has an aural tradition and has developed accordingly with an exceptional need for an immediate understanding of the expectations of fellow musicians.

1.4 Context of the Research

In order to consider the questions outlined in the objectives, it is necessary to provide a contextual backdrop for these two genres of music. Chapters Two and Three present an outline of the origins of each genre whilst focusing upon

motivating conditions for their development. For introductory purposes, it is stated that classical music had its origins in the Christian churches. It developed initially through the patronage of the Catholic Church in Europe from, in the main, the 9th century to the time of the Reformation in the 16th century. By this time, music in religious services under the authority of the Catholic Church, became increasingly elaborate to the point that the congregation itself was excluded (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:81). The Reformation and the religious philosophy of Lutheranism, however, encouraged congregational participation by including elements of folk music in their religious ceremonies (Blume, 1974:3). Concurrently, patronage of musicians and composers for secular music came from the aristocracy of Europe. Therefore, it will be argued that religious philosophies and aristocratic preferences affected the development of music because these factors had a confining influence. This is not necessarily to imply that confinement was inhibiting. Indeed, at times the confinements nurtured intense development in the world of music whilst at other times, the development, because of confinement, was pushed in recognisable directions. The results of the confinements may be heard in classical music in its various forms in concert halls, on the air waves and in the teaching studios to this day.

The music which came to be known as 'jazz' developed from communications, by 'hollers', in the plantations of Virginia where the black African people from the West Coast of Africa worked under bondage; it developed from the brothels and the 'ginmills' (public houses) of New Orleans to its respectable 'swing' era in the United States of America and eventually it reached the concert halls of the world (Encyclopaedia Britannica (A) 10, 1980:126). The step into the formal institutions of music through intellectual rationalisation signals 'approval' by the 'experts' of this formerly shunned music.

Approximately 110 years lapsed between the two intellectual rationales which constitute classical and jazz music within the ABRSM. It is argued that classical music was perceived during this time and until recently, by society in general as well as by the formal institutions of music as being socially, emotionally and intellectually superior.

The introduction to New Zealand of the new jazz piano syllabus from the ABRSM in the year 2000 is an interesting time in the development of music teaching and learning in this country. It presents a moment within which to reflect upon that which has been, and that which may come. Music education can never be again as it was, because the classical syllabus now shares a practical and intellectual space with the jazz syllabus. The reasons *why*, and the reasons *what*, pupils may learn and *why* and *what* teachers may offer, are likely to be changing for all time. Therefore it will be argued that the new syllabus induces change to existing social and cultural images and priorities in the world of music. The status of classical music upheld by education in order to perform at certain standards which are, subsequently, acknowledged by success in examinations, has been nudged out of place by a music genre which is noticeably different *and* presented as an equal.

The two genres of music cannot remain as they were because, either a climate of postmodernity has brought into focus new norms, or reinforcements of the climate of modernity have dislodged some old norms and widened the perspective. Whichever way the argument is framed, old norms of classical music, steeped in absolute truths as perceived by a mentality with roots in modernity and enlightenment thinking, have lost the poignancy of their focus.

It is through the piano, specifically, that jazz music has been placed on *au pair* with classical music within the ABRSM. However, the piano (fortepiano[1]), invented in 1732, is preceded by the origins of both classical and jazz music. This instrument became major in the expression and performance of classical music in the 19th century and of jazz music in the 20th century although the following for each genre appears to be separated by major divisions both socially and culturally. For example, in Europe in the 19th century the piano:

> betokened the self-satisfaction with which the well-to-do ... regarded themselves. The object was an unquestioned occupant of every *salon*, drawing room, living room, or parlour' (Loesser, 1954:430).

[1] Fortepiano: Early name for the piano. Later to become the pianoforte (Hurd, 1979:264-265).

On the contrary, the 20th century popularity for jazz piano may be traced to the piano players found in:

> 'brothels, gambling joints, saloons, and clubs of the big city ghettos ...' Collier, 1978:44).

1.5 Thesis Structure

Chapters Two and Three look at the worlds of classical and jazz music historically from the 9th century in Europe and from the arrival, in the 17th century, of the black African people as slaves in the United States of America. A discussion about these genres of music is meaningless without being located within this wide and expansive view. The historical account is pushed forward by social, religious, political and institutional influences. Alan Hunt's concept of *modes of regulation* (1993) will be used as an analytical tool in order to look at these influences. They will be used in this thesis to identify motivating conditions for the development of both forms of music.

Whilst, for a long period within a climate of modernity, the idea that an absolute truth about 'music' may have been considered to exist, the climate of postmodernity, embracing a plurality of logics, offers new perspectives. Chapter Four attempts to understand recent changes within the world of music by looking at both classical and jazz music as they may be understood within these logic systems. Commercialism as it affects the development of music induces a major leap in understanding priorities about music as an artistic expression. Embracing the imagery of 'gate-keeping', the social implications of music as a commodity in the market place are considered.

Strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices are two major interlocking concepts considered in this thesis to hold the motivating conditions for the development of music in place. They are identified as being religious and institutional in character. Chapter Five discusses these concepts in order to isolate some motivating factors which have propelled the teaching and learning of

classical music. A particular focus is made of the contribution to music teaching in New Zealand by the religious communities of the Catholic sisters in this country from the time of the arrival of the first European settlers. These women played a large part in the teaching of the piano since they arrived here in the 1830s (Lovell-Smith, 1998:45). The contention is that the philosophical foundations of their religious practises based on personal self-discipline and believing in the absolute existence of 'God', carried over into their music teaching. This, it is argued, is evident in their attitude to teaching which projected a mentality that a 'truth' also existed about the absolute nature of music. The discussion about music teaching by the Catholic sisters in this country in this thesis demonstrates the modes of regulation which still exist, in the world of music teaching and learning.

The concepts of *strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices* are also employed in order to consider the world-wide success of the ABRSM as an institution which reinforces its own knowledge to amateur musicians, in the main, through its own examination system. These concepts also invite a consideration of social class and music preferences. It will be argued that the institutionalisation of jazz music itself will affect music preferences in society, and consequently, social class imagery. This idea is discussed further in Chapter Six.

Chapter Six considers *credentialism and prestige* as concepts which formally create and control the institutionalised world of classical music teaching and learning. The implications for jazz music teaching/learning under this formal system of control are considered because hitherto, this world of music *has* functioned successfully, albeit, informally.

The concepts of *strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices* and *credentialism and prestige* are seen as underlying forces in society which hold the motivating conditions for the development of music in place.

Chapter Seven presents an overview of the discussion whilst making some concluding observations. It also presents insights from two major jazz musicians/educators into the direction which they think 'classical' and 'jazz' music may be heading in light of the institutionalisation of both genres.

This thesis clings to chronology, where appropriate, but leaps geographically and conceptually. Cross-cutting time are the two separate developments of classical and jazz music understandings. Located within the timeframe is the presentation, or visibility, of these two music genres as their development has been experienced in New Zealand. This thesis also leaps temporally and spatially in Chapters Five and Six when the development of music is considered generally in relation to forces and factors which bring about, or have brought about, religious, personal and/or social-class identity. These ideas are exemplified within local New Zealand teaching practices.

1.6 Methodology

As a theoretically driven narrative, this thesis has been informed by specific ideas from a number of theorists. Of particular significance is the concept as presented by British socio-legal theorist Alan Hunt (1993) of 'modes of regulation'. Hunt's concept provides a framework within which a scrutiny has been made of the historical forces and factors which provided the motivating conditions for the development of both classical music and jazz music. The complexities of institutionalisation of music, a late influence in the world of music, is also analysed according to Hunt's framework of modes of regulation.

The works of other theorists are used to bring some understanding to how the motivating conditions for the development of classical music generated and regenerated themselves. For example, in Chapter 5, Max Weber's (1958) description of a religious 'calling' presents an understanding of an era of music teaching in this country which lasted for over one hundred years. Similarly, the works of Michel Foucault (1995) and Nikolas Rose (1990, 1999) on group subservience have been incorporated into this theoretical framework. A mentality beneficial to the acceptance of knowledge as presented by institutions to the point that examinations are a desirable ordeal may explain the teaching methods of the Catholic sisters as well as the successful functioning of the British institutions of music.

Zygmunt Bauman's (1987, 1992) ideas about the construction of 'knowledge' within the climates of modernity and postmodernity are useful in this thesis. His theories are considered in order to understand the nature of the knowledge as presented by the ABRSM, both before and after the presentation of the new jazz piano syllabus. Bauman also introduces the idea of market forces as modern gate-keepers of knowledge within the arts. Of interest to this theory-driven thesis is Bauman's suggestion that reality has a place within shared imagery which comes into existence as a result of constructed understandings about knowledge. This idea is used to demonstrate the construction of meaning about examination success.

French theorist, Pierre Bourdieu, (1984) with his focus on the obtaining of various 'capitals' offers much to the understanding of why people might learn a musical instrument and/or subject themselves to the stress of sitting music examinations. Brint, (1994) Witz, (1992) Etzioni, (1969) and Weber, (1978) all offer definitions in relation to perceptions of occupations. Music teaching as an occupation is considered in light of their theories.

These theorists and their theories offer explanations about the generation and regeneration of the motivating conditions which contribute to the development of music.

In order to gauge the appropriateness of these theoretical explanations for the development of music, a number of interviews were carried out. Excerpts from sixteen interviews conducted locally have been included in order to highlight possible explanations to propositions as well as to illustrate particular points. The discussion may represent music teaching and learning in any number of countries of the world. The geographical immediacy of the interview participants *is* considered to be representative of that wider world.

Interviews, specifically, have been conducted with, firstly, four sisters from various orders of Catholic religious communities. The reasons why the sisters, in general, taught music was discussed. The sisters were personally contacted. Three sisters are referred to as Sister Mary A, B, or C. Sister 'Mary Joan' agreed to the

using of her name. Secondly, five pupils personally known to be former pupils of the sisters were asked for their opinions. Although all agreed to be identified, given names only have been used.

Contact was made, anonymously, with jazz teachers through the New Zealand Examinations Administrator of the ABRSM. Four interviews, subsequently, took place with teachers who had submitted candidates for the first jazz piano examinations which were conducted in Auckland in October 2000. One jazz teacher known personally, was interviewed. Pseudonyms are used in all cases in order to protect anonymity.

Jazz piano examiner from the ABRSM, Charles Beale, and jazz musician and university lecturer in jazz music, Phil Broadhurst, agreed to be interviewed and to be personally identified.

Three people of significance within the world of music teaching in Auckland showed little interest in being interviewed whilst not actually refusing. The idea was dismissed after two or three failed attempts to secure an interview time.

Permission to interview was formally obtained from all who responded to the invitation to take part. The invitation was on official Massey University-headed paper and indicated the area of research and the appropriate conditions. All interviews were conducted within the stipulations and guidelines as set out in the *Code of Ethical Conduct for Teaching and Research involving Human Subjects,* by the Massey University Human Ethics Committee. Written permission to record each interview was gained from each interviewee. All interviews were subsequently transcribed by the writer before being erased to ensure confidentiality.

1.7 Abbreviations

The British institutions of music, the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music[2] and the Trinity College of Music London, which feature significantly in this thesis, are referred to in full at each first mention in each chapter. Thereafter that are referred to as the 'ABRSM' and the 'TCL'.

[2] The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music is comprised of the Royal Academy of Music, the Royal College of Music, the Royal Northern College of Music and the Royal Scottish Academy of Music and Drama

Chapter Two

Classical Music

2.1 Introduction

Specific motivating conditions within which classical music developed will be identified in this chapter. An argument is presented that composition and performance of music as understood by 'classical' has been hedged on all sides by these motivating conditions. The hedge, it will be argued, has been created, firstly, as a result of religious philosophies and practices up until the late Middle Ages. Secondly, partially concurrent to this influence, that is, from the later Middle Ages, the hedge consisted of the aristocracy who acted as patrons. Finally, it will be argued that music was hedged as a result of intellectual rationalisation, from within educational institutions.

The location of music within these perimeters contradicts imagery of musical composition and performance enjoying endless freedoms bounded only by the human imagination. Salmen (1983:3) describes this imagery:

> (M)ore than all other arts, music has for centuries been expected to possess a dignity which borders on the absolute. Philosophers, past and present, have attempted to ascribe music to a world removed from all tangible things, a sphere of self-sufficient abstract expression.

Perhaps the idea that the human mind, through aural perception alone, can respond to something without the decoding of verbal language invites this ethereal type of explanation about music. The great European musical works of the classical era from the early 18th century and of the romantic era from the early 19th century, augment the supernatural imagery of music to include the composer as:

> ... a "prophet," an extraordinary person who in some mysterious way receives inspiration and guidance from beyond this world ... (T)he artwork ... is not *of* human life but *above* human life ... it transcends life ... (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:122).

The compositions of Mozart, Beethoven, Schumann, Chopin and others are often accorded these supernatural qualities as a means of explaining the wonderment of their works. The works of these great composers and their contemporaries epitomise classical music.

In former times, specifically until the time of Mozart, those in post-Christian society who opined, performed and set standards about music were either associated with, or affiliated to, the Christian churches. Pre-Christian influence from the 'stoicism' of Greek philosophical thought, the 'discipline' of Jewish religious worship and the 'frivolous' nature of Roman public life, came together with the advent of Christianity to create music which was intended to take the mind, both intellectually and emotionally, into the realms of the spiritual (Routley, 1978:37-40). This brief location of music in over two thousand years of time is to emphasize the historical, philosophical and spiritual significance of classical music.

In the late Middle Ages in Europe, the rituals of the Christian churches which had provided the setting for music since approximately the 3rd century (Ward, 1977:112) gave way to secular settings whereby music told non-religious stories - known to this day as 'operas' (Russell, 1957:59). The nobility who posed as patrons of the arts (Lovelock, 1953:18) made way for this secularisation of music whilst the musicians themselves retained the essence of all that had developed in knowledge about music over the centuries. From the mid 18th century in Europe, the end of the patronage system of financial support for musicians and composers brought musical freedoms, hitherto unknown, for these people.

But what might 'musical freedom' for musicians and composers mean to them, and furthermore, freedom from what? Whilst grand words have been, and still are, spoken about the spirituality of music and the purportedly inexplicable qualities of

musicians and composers, the world of music as represented by the music, the creators and the performers may be as empirical as a scientific laboratory. Indeed the following may offer some perspective:

> (T)he difference between the arts and the sciences with regard to human invention is that the arts have exalted and proclaimed it, while the sciences have taken it for granted (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:123).

This is not to say that music is not creative or that science is not rational. It is to say that both are both and neither can progress, or even exist, without rules and regulations about their intrinsic characters.

Briefly, music may be defined as:

> an art form of sequences in time, esp. tones of definite pitch organized melodically, harmoniously and rhythmically (Adams, 1992:877).

However, music depends on people agreeing about what it ***is***, in the same manner that people agree about any socially constructed norm such as language use, playing tennis or conducting experiments in a laboratory. The idea of music having 'gatekeepers' who, or which, occupy positions of authority in society that enable judgements to be passed about the 'worthiness' of music will be discussed in Chapter Four. Briefly, for the present, music may be seen as existing on a continuum with 'folk' music[1] of any local culture existing at one end and the centralised sound of several local cultures existing at the other end in the form of 'classical' music. Musical behaviour may be regarded as yet another learned phenomenon involving 'intellectual awareness and human feelings' (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:122).

---

[1] Folk music: 'music, usually of simple character and anonymous authorship, handed down by oral tradition and characteristically chiefly of rural communities' (Webster's Encyclopedic Unabridged Dictionary, 1983:551).

Whilst much is written about whether or not music is enjoyable or is performed well, most people probably imagine that they are free to choose the type of music which they enjoy. Personal preference may change over time as the energetic reaction of youth is replaced with contemplative appreciation of more than the obvious melody line and pulsating beat. However, it may be fair to suggest that, to varying degrees, perceived freedom in relation to musical preference is restricted by *modes of regulation* (Hunt, 1993) which may be found in the world of music, wittingly and/or unwittingly.

By using Hunt's (1993) framework of modes of regulation as an analytical tool, the aim of this chapter is to identify motivating conditions which have existed with varying degrees of formality in the world of classical music. These *modes of regulation,* put in place by those in positions of influence or power, are likely to have moulded and restrained, as well as shaped and inspired the music which is composed, performed and/or listened to. As Elias (1994:137) puts it:

> (T)he notion of the totally independent individual, of the absolutely autonomous but therefore also absolutely free single human being, forms the centrepiece of a bourgeois ideology that has a very definite place in the spectrum of contemporary social and political creeds. Whatever it is called, it is an ideal or a utopia that does not correspond, and cannot correspond, to anything in social reality.

An argument is made here that modes of regulation in the supposedly free world of music originate in other fundamental aspects of life – that is, in the religious, political and/or social forces which, wittingly or unwittingly affect, or have affected, the life of every person at all times.

The development of classical music is discussed in three sections through the lenses of Hunt's concept. The first major consideration involves the informal development of music as a result of the inspirations and restrictions which emanated from the Christian churches. For practical purpose the discussion begins from the 11th century in Europe when musical sounds became physically symbolised, or codified (Hurd, 1979:242). The aristocracy, by the late Middle

Ages joined the Christian churches as patrons of musicians. The informal nature of the development of music under the influences of both the Christian churches and the aristocracy is considered to end with institutionalisation of musical knowledge in the 19th century. The second part of the discussion looks at the centralisation of musical knowledge within institutions from the 1800s. The formal structures of education demarcate a turning point in the overall understanding of classical music. Finally, expectations by influential authorities as well as personal expectations of the composer about 'music' are considered in order to understand how 'knowledge' about this subject is formalised.

2.2 Three Dimensions of Modes of Regulation

Modes of regulation for British socio-legal theorist Alan Hunt (1993:315-316) have three dimensions. Firstly:

> (R)egulation is always intentional even though its results may be unintended ... .

Secondly, regulation:

> ... always involves the designation, identification, or creation of *regulatory agents* who are charged with a range of functions ranging from the collection and recording of information, inspection, surveillance, reporting, initiation of enforcement action, and a host of other activities.

The final dimension of Hunt's regulatory process refers to the identification, or even construction, of the knowledge which will become regulatory in the circumstances. He says:

> ... the regulatory process revolves around the production of *regulatory knowledge*. The identification, acquisition, and deployment of knowledge are central features, in the first instance, of the construction of objects for regulation. Only after some social phenomena or social practice has been constructed in such a way that it can be studied, quantified, and measured

> does it become possible for it to be treated as a suitable candidate for regulation. The collection of knowledge plays a central role in formulation of regulatory policies and strategies; and once some regulatory mechanism, is in place then further collection and manipulation of data are important in the assessment and evaluation of the regulatory instrument.

These modes of regulation may be formal or informal. For example, they may be set in the constitutions of a country, they may be understood as a result of conventional social behaviour, or they may be ingrained into the moral mentalities through religious dogma.

With the three dimensions in mind, Hunt's (1993:316) statement that

> (T)here are no ready made social objects of regulation. Their existence is always the outcome of some active process that creates that which is to be regulated ...

is perhaps an invitation to take his theories beyond his exemplified areas of 'the economy' or 'population'. The world of musical composition and the performances of these compositions may be seen as 'constantly active processes' involving battles between conformity and the creatively new. As such, the three general criteria for modes of regulation may be found, discreetly or conspicuously depending upon a degree of awareness, through religious, social and institutional powers and influences in Europe. It was through these powers and influences that Western music was cradled as an art form, as a means of religious worship and as a social activity, throughout the ages.

2.3 Modes of Regulation: The First Dimension

Music as a discipline, has not always enjoyed the luxury of objective criticism which institutionalisation may provide. Philosophical attitudes based on religious beliefs and whimsical desires of the aristocracy informally put in place conditions which affected the works of composers and performers in former times. This section considers the idea that whilst there was a certain amount of intended

regulation taking place, much of the development of music happened unintentionally. The following analysis is based on Hunt's first mode of regulation.

2.3.1 Christianity

Catholicism had dominated European religious philosophy from approximately the 3rd century (Ward, 1977:112) until the time of the Reformation in the 16th century. Church music had, intentionally, been influenced during these centuries by this single religious philosophy. Folk music was shunned because of its '... powerful associations with debauchery and immorality' (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:28) whilst music which reflected the glory of God and inspired the human mind to spiritual praise and worship was nurtured.

Classical, or 'serious', music had developed up until the Reformation and the subsequent reforms by the Council of Trent[2] through the intentional restraints or inspirations (depending upon effect at the time) imposed by authorities of the Catholic Church, on attitudes towards composition and performance. Under this influence, a religious congregation did not participate in the music-making, but listened only to the works of the respected and approved composers as they were performed either by these composers themselves, or by the best available musicians (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:81). Church music therefore, perhaps *intentionally* became increasingly more elaborate. Indeed, by the time of the Reformation, and the Council of Trent, music in the Catholic Church had become so elaborate that it was:

[2] Council of Trent, 1545-1563: '... 19th ecumenical council of the Roman Catholic Church highly important for its sweeping decrees on self-reform and for its dogmatic definitions that clarified virtually every doctrine contested by the Protestants' (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B), X, 1980:110).

> ... impossible for a lay congregation to sing, and so it became the property of the trained choirs of monasteries, cathedrals and college chapels (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:42).

In contrast, a period of secular influence between 1200 and 1500 resulted in criticisms, in the 1500s, from the authorities within the Catholic Church of the religious music being 'profane', 'lascivious' and 'impure' (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:74). This secular influence had come when the former control of the Catholic Church in relation to religious music had been superseded, during the 13th, 14th and 15th centuries, by the influence of the knights and the nobility (known as *troubadours* in southern France, as *trouvères* in central and northern France and as the *Minnesingers* in Germany). Their music, melodic and romantic in character, had social significance as opposed to religious significance.

Although the music of the knights and the nobility withered in popularity in the 1600s as a result of complex and apparently nonsensical rules and customs in relation to performance, it *unintentionally* influenced a secular aspect of music – that is, composition of music *without* spiritual necessity (Russell, 1957:37-38).

The Catholic Church in Europe, through the Council of Trent, scrutinised every doctrine contested by the Protestants after the excommunication of Martin Luther in the 16th century. The complex reforms and doctrinal clarifications directly related to religious dogma (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B), X, 1980:110) included judgements about the lack of reverence caused by both *elaborateness* of composition and performance and the *simplicity* of folk music (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:74). Consequently, direction came, during the Council of Trent, from Pope Clement VII, to differentiate, musically, between Christian worship and artistic creativity:

> (I)n the case of those Masses which are celebrated with singing and with organ, let nothing profane be intermingled, but only hymns and divine praises. The whole plan of singing ... should be constituted not to give empty pleasure to the ear but in such a way that the words may be clearly understood by all ... and thus the hearts of the listeners may be drawn to the

> desire of heavenly harmonies, in the contemplation of the joy of the blessed (Hayburn, 1979:25-31 cited in Wilson-Dickson, 1992:74).

The standards and controls in relation to music for worship which were implemented by the Council of Trent as a general reaction to the Reformation (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:74) came close to prohibiting polyphony[3] because words of praise had become near-inaudible through the increasingly complex arrangements of polyphonic settings of the Mass (Ward, 1977:112).

Of particular significance to the intentional rulings about music by the Catholic Church at this time is the *un*intended effects of these rulings as seen in the compositions of Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina (1525-94), composer, organist, singer and choirmaster of the Julian Chapel at the Vatican (Hurd, 1979:258). Palestrina composed in order to please the Popes of his time including Pope Clement VII who had presided over the Council of Trent and set the new standards for music within the church. Palestrina's compositions of masses, motets, and unaccompanied choral music won the approval of authorities within the Catholic Church (Ward, 1977:424). His compositions (which also includes secular music in the form of madrigals), are regarded by some, to this day, to rank among the 'greatest music ever written' (Ward, 1977:424-425). They were composed as a result of directives from the Catholic Church, about how spiritual music should sound (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:75-76).

When other Christian churches came into existence during the Reformation, that is, when Catholicism was joined by Lutheranism and Calvinism in the 16th century, the centralised sound of music which existed as a result of the influence of the Catholic Church alone, began to reflect the differing religious attitudes and expectations (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:81). An outline of these particular motivating conditions follows.

---

[3] Polyphony, Polyphonic: 'Terms applied to 'many sound' (i.e. 'many voice') music, in other words music of the contrapuntal type' (Ward, 1977:454). (See also footnote page 22).

The German leader of the Protestant Reformation, Martin Luther (1483-1546) believed in a return to less elaborate musical religious performances in order to reflect the humility of Christ. He encouraged folk-melodies to be 'reformed and redeemed' for worship having observed:

> ... music's capacity to comfort, to terrify, to encourage, to humble ... (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:81).

The conservative wing of Lutheranism preferred the music of Catholicism in order to make a spiritual offering of their acceptance of the power of God. The extreme reformers preferred less complex music which could be understood by worshippers whilst not only attending a religious ceremony but also away from this formality, for example, in the home (Webber, 1996:13). The degree of 'complexity' of music was judged either by the use of complex counterpoint[4] and technical execution on a musical instrument or by the use of memorable, and/or easily recognisable and straight-forward melodies, unaccompanied, as found in folk music. Thus, the music of the Lutheran reformers absorbed all spheres of pre-Reformation religious music culture, that is, the music of the Catholic Church, as

[4] Counterpoint: '... A single 'part' or 'voice' added to another is called 'a counterpoint' to that other but the more common use of the word is that of the combination of the simultaneous 'parts' or 'voices' each of significance in itself and the whole resulting in a coherent texture. In this sense, Counterpoint is the same as polyphony. ... Combined Counterpoint ('strict' or 'free') is that in which the added notes voices are in different species. Invertible Counterpoint is such as permits of voices changing places (the higher becoming the lower, and vice versa), the effect still remaining happy. ... Double Counterpoint is Invertible Counterpoint as concerns two voices. Triple Counterpoint is that in which 3 voices are concerned which are capable of changing places with one another, so making 6 positions of the voices possible. Quadruple and Quintuple counterpoint are similarly explained, the first allowing 24 positions and the second 120. Imitation is common in contrapuntal position – one voice entering with a phrase which is then more or less copied by another voice. When the imitation is strict it becomes *Canon'* (Ward, 1977:135).

well as the local German folk song[5] (Blume, 1974:3). Therefore, music developed through the Lutheran Church music where the congregation were intentionally encouraged to participate, through singing, in the performance of music. Unlike Catholicism at the time, Protestantism was acknowledging, or perhaps permitting, the power of music over human emotions. The third dominant religious denomination of the Reformation, Calvinism, offers little to the development of music. This religious sect has been described as:

> ... completely devoid of decoration; there were no pictures, vestments, candles or images of any kind. ... In such surroundings the presence of music caused some misgivings ... (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:65).

For the Calvinists, the grand performances of the Catholic Church threatened the soul, and the music with folk tendencies of the Lutheran Church threatened moral behaviour. As such, they were both deemed to be inappropriate to reflect the austere religious beliefs of the Calvinists. Harmonious singing and playing of any musical instruments in church was, in consideration of these beliefs, forbidden (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:65). Reference in this text to the absence of music in Calvinism is made in order to highlight the significance of the intentional regulations to music of Catholicism and Lutheranism.

To summarise, from the time of the Reformation, intentional modes of regulation within dominant religious practices in Europe *unintentionally* created a divergence within perceptions of music which were deemed to be appropriate for spiritual worship.

Of particular significance to the unintended results may be the development of music in the 16th century as a result of the religious philosophy of Martin Luther.

---

[5] Folk song: '(S)ong which has grown up amongst the peasantry of any race, being transmitted orally from generation to generation and sung without accompaniment. Its idiom commonly expresses racial characteristics, so that its source can be identified or guessed at when it is heard. Folk songs are always verse repeating ...' (Ward, 1977:206).

His encouragement of elements of local folk music into church music, may be considered as a prelude to the music in the middle 1500s which came to be known as opera, that is, secular stories (as opposed to religious worship) told in a dramatic manner and set to music (Ward, 1977:408; Russell, 1957:59). Further works which were deemed appropriate for spiritual worship are the organ compositions of J. S. Bach (1685-1750) which can be traced to the encouragement by the Lutheran Church to the development, on the organ, of congregational melodies (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:87).

To digress a little, it was not for approximately another 450 years after the time of the Reformation, that the Catholic Church, under the major reforms in the 1960s by the second Vatican Ecumenical Council, provided for more active congregational participation in music by placing less importance on the need for music to be highly developed, compositely and technically. Vernacular languages as well as the use of local music based on folk traditions were permitted within the religious ceremonious (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:223). Referring to this issue, Hayburn, (1979:384 in Wilson-Dickson, 1992:223) says:

> (I)n certain countries, especially in mission lands, there are people who have their own musical tradition, and this plays a great part in their religious and social life. For this reason their music should be held in proper esteem and a suitable place given to it.

Furthermore, music instruments local in character, were permitted at this time. The reformed attitude of the Catholic Church in Rome made way, at this time, for composers to create, or to include existing, music local in character. However, by the 1960s, the 'gatekeepers' of 'appropriate music' had long since moved from the Christian churches to formal institutions of music. This idea will be discussed in more depth in Chapter Four.

The idea that Catholicism dominated the development of music from approximately the 3rd century until the time of the Reformation has been discussed. The major philosophical changes which took place in Europe at the time of the Reformation have been considered to be readily recognisable in the

development of classical music. Both Catholicism and Protestantism, it has been argued, have enriched the world of classical music spiritually, intellectually and emotionally.

2.3.2 The Aristocracy

To return to the former times, the system of patronising support for musicians by the Christian churches was joined in the later Middle Ages by patronisation from the aristocracy (Lovelock, 1953:18). It is perhaps through the unintended consequences of this aristocratic patronisation that classical music developed as it did. Joseph Haydn (1732-1809) may be regarded as a major example of unintended consequences. He was employed for thirty years at the country residence of Prince Nicholas Esterhazy at Eisenstadt, Austria. During this time Haydn composed music for musicians of haphazard instrumental capabilities who happened to be passing through the locality. The unintended consequences of the conditions under which Haydn composed may be seen in what we now understand to be the symphony[6] and the string quartet[7]. These musical forms came into existence as Haydn experimented with combinations of instruments and with musical form itself (Russell, 1957:95-97). Mozart, *intentionally* developed Haydn's *un*intended ideas and Beethoven, also *intentionally*, took the ideas of both these composers even further. These 'ideas' now form the knowledge which is fundamental, if not regulatory, at certain levels of musical education.

To return to Hunt's first dimension of his concept modes of regulation, 'regulation is always intentional even though its results may be unintended', may reveal the idea that creativity, in musical composition, cannot only exist in regulation but that it is also dependent upon **de**regulation, or the spontaneous and the

[6] Symphony: '...sounding together of instruments of an orchestra in a composition in several movements ... ' (Hurd, 1979:320).

[7] String Quartet: Any piece of music composed for two violins, a viola and a violincello' (Ward, 1977:467).

unintended. The *intentional* regulations, therefore, exist overtly; the *unintentional* regulations exist covertly.

2.3.3 The Effects of Intentional Regulation

To be a musician under the system of patronisation was to be a domestic servant. Whilst an appointment with a church or with a wealthy patron may have provided a steady income, the servile circumstances appears, at times, to have been humiliating and frustrating. Some personal effects of the intended modes of regulation on the musicians who had to succumb to the wills of their patrons in order to earn a living may be seen by a glimpse at the attitude of Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart (1756-1791) and his father, Leopold, who were both servants to the Archbishop of Salzburg. Leopold Mozart wrote the following, in 1778, to the *'Hieronymus Colloredo'*, Archbishop of Salzburg, when appealing for promotion from a Deputy Kapellmeister to Kapellmeister at the Salzburg Court after the death of the previous holder:

> (Y)our Most Gracious Highness! [sic]
> Most Worthy Prince of the Holy Roman Empire!
> Most Gracious Prince of the Realm and Lord Lord! [sic]
> I prostrate myself most humbly at Your feet, Your Most Gracious Highness, and seeing that *Kapellmeister* Lolli, has passed over into eternity, that he drew only the salary of a Deputy *Kapellmeister*, that, as Your Most Gracious Highness is aware, I have been serving this worthy Archbishopric for thirty-eight years, and that since the year 1763, that is, for fifteen years, I have been performing and still perform without reproach as Deputy *Kapellmeister* most of the services required, and indeed nearly all of them, I humbly beseech Your most Gracious Highness to allow me to recommend myself to you and to remain with the deepest homage
>
> the most humble and obedient servant of
> Your Most Gracious Highness,
> Most Gracious Prince of the Realm,
> And Lord Lord

Leopold Mozart (Elias, 1996:27).

Twelve years later in 1790, Wolfgang Mozart, aged 34, penniless and a year before his death and burial in a pauper's grave (Hurd, 1979:234), wrote the following to Archduke Francis of Salzburg:

> (Y)our Royal Highness
>
> I make so bold as to beg your Royal Highness very respectfully to use your most gracious influence with His Majesty the King with regard to my most humble petition to his Majesty. Prompted by a desire for fame, by a love of work and by a conviction of my wide knowledge, I venture to apply for the post of second Kapellmeister, particularly as Salieri, that very gifted Kapellmeister, has never devoted himself to church music, whereas from my youth up I have made myself completely familiar with this style. The slight reputation which I have acquired in the world by my pianoforte playing, has encouraged me to ask His Majesty for the favour of being entrusted with the musical education of the Royal Family. In the sure conviction that I have applied to the most worthy mediators who, moreover, are particularly gracious to me, I am full of confidence and ... (Anderson, 1966:938-939).

The formal style of the day may suggest that this letter is not exceptional between a servant and master. The following letter however, from Mozart to his father about two organists who had, within a few months of the previous letter, played in the locality of Mozart, reveals Mozart, it is argued, as a *person*. It states:

> (T)o watch these gentlemen is enough to make one die of laughing (Anderson, 1966:356).

Mozart postscripts the description of the performance with:

> (T)his is what I would like. A short man with fair hair, shown bending over and displaying his bare arse. From his mouth come the words: 'Good appetite for the meal'. The other man to be shown booted and spurred with a red cloak and a fine fashionable wig. He must be of medium height and in such a position that he licks the other man's arse. From his mouth come the words: 'Oh there's nothing to beat it' (Anderson, 1966:357-358).

When considering modes of regulation and music education, Elias (1996:443) suggests that much of the literature in the 19th and early 20th centuries have glossed over Mozart's habitual references in correspondence to matters as in the earlier quote:

> ... since they did not really fit in with the ideal image of a German genius.

The point here is that Mozart *was* a servant and Mozart *was* restricted in his musical expression because of the servile modes of regulation for musicians and composers which were put in place by the aristocracy and, notably, which were the norm at the time. Mozart's apparent politeness and humility, is not necessarily indicative of Mozart the person but of his role in society. Mozart, and maybe others, is depicted in historical literature according to desired imagery and based on a perception of his skills and position in society at the time. This imagery, according to Elias, favours national identity. It is, therefore, likely that historians intentionally leave out other interesting and perhaps less socially attractive aspects which are likely to have had a major input on creativity because they either detract from, or are irrelevant to, imagery of musical genius.

Several centuries of *intentional* regulation, often with *unintended* consequences, culminated in the 19th and 20th centuries with both the church and the aristocracy, especially the monarchy, relinquishing much of their power and influence in the arts in general. From this position has developed the, more or less, religiously and politically free capitalist-bourgeoisie educational institutions of regulation. These institutions will be analysed in the next section based on Hunt's (1993) definition of the second dimension of his modes of regulation.

2.4 Modes of Regulation: The Second Dimension

Central institutionalisation of musical knowledge is a relatively late phenomenon in the development of classical music. It is part of a wider and more general centralisation of knowledge which took place in the 1800s in Europe. Of particular interest here is the institutionalisation of musical knowledge which took place in

Britain at this time and which, from the onset, influenced classical music understanding and, consequently, its development in several parts of the Western world.

The second dimension of Hunt's (1993) concept of modes or regulation may be recognised in the practical arrangements of the formal institutions, and the teaching professions in the world of music. The practical arrangements are anchored in regulation in order to ensure that the knowledge which has been identified and acquired as the result of its gaining some social significance, is enforced. In former times, the difficulty of communication itself is likely to have resulted in localised regulatory agents. As discussed in the previous section, these localised regulatory agents were the local Christian churches and, in the later Middle Ages, the local aristocracy. The composers themselves also caused temporal and spatial differentiation of the understanding of intricacies such as ornaments[8], in codified significations. They are meaningful only under the intentions of the composers. For example, trills[9] as indicated by J.S. Bach and his contemporaries until the time of Haydn and Mozart, that is, from early to mid 1700s in Germany, have different intentions of interpretation to later composers. Grace notes[10] as intended by Chopin, composing several decades later in France, differ in interpretation from those intended by his contemporary, Mendelssohn, composing in Germany (Taylor, 1989:92).

Practical arrangements and agreements have objectified musical knowledge and, consequently, removed the arbitrary nature of the codification of music.

---

[8] Ornaments: '... melodic decorations such as are not given in full in the notation ...' (Ward, 1977:419).

[9] Trills: Essentially an 'alternative repetition of the note written and the note above' (Ward, 1977:xxiv).

[10] Grace notes: 'Another way of showing arpeggiation, which is the notes of the chord are to be played one after the other as quickly as possible ... ' (Taylor, 1989:91-92).

Historically, this dimension of a mode of regulation relating to regulatory agents may be identified as being within the powers of the church and the aristocracy although 'inspection, surveillance and reporting' would have been more arbitrary in nature compared with the inspection, surveillance and reporting of music examination situations as currently understood, in this country, and others. Musical knowledge in former times, it is argued, would not have been as uniformly constructed nor as readily accessible as it is today. For example, although Emperor Joseph II told Mozart that there were 'too many notes' in his opera *The Abduction from the Seraglio,* (Goudsblom & Mennell, 1998:251) the authority for making such a statement came from the Emperor's aristocratically social position and not necessarily from his knowledge about music. The 'authorities', about music within modern educational institutions, it is argued, draw upon different qualifications in order to pass judgements about musical composition or performance.

2.4.1 Educational Institutions

Formal institutions of music are considered in this thesis to be the presently practising regulatory agents who are responsible for the collection and recording of information about musical knowledge. They are identified to be the ABRSM and the TCL. Through the examination systems of these two institutions, an enforcement is made, it is argued, of the knowledge which they deem to be correct and proper. The background of these institutions may be seen as follows.

From the 19th century, as a result of the knowledge gained during the periods of the Enlightenment and Industrialisation, economic and political power as well as court style and taste moved from the church and the aristocracy into the hands of the capitalist-industrialist bourgeoisie (Goudsblom & Mennell, 1998:27). Specialised and independent institutions of knowledge in relation to music formed in Britain, in particular, in the 1800s although the concept of their existence was not new. Their precursors can be traced to the 1500s in Italy when the Catholic Church formally offered training in plainsong for the express purpose of having it

performed well in the rituals of the faith (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:6). These 'schools' were, in fact, orphanages and came to be known as *musical orphanages,* the first, for boys, being established in Naples in 1739 (Venice was the centre for girls). The earliest school of music in Europe not associated with orphans was the Paris Conservatory founded in 1784. Small conservatories of similar philosophy developed throughout France from this time. Prague Conservatory, founded in 1811, is the earliest known in Central and Northern Europe followed by the founding, in Vienna, of the *Musikakademie Hockscule für Music* in 1817, the Leipzig Conservatory in 1843 and the Berlin Conservatory in 1850. The idea of specialist schools for music made its way to London with the Royal Academy of Music being formed in 1822 (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:6-7) and the Trinity College of Music London, (TCL) in 1877. The Associated Board of The Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) was formed in 1889 (ABRSM, http://www.abrsm.ac.uk/welcome 4 September 00).

Educational institutions specialising in music developed, as discussed, in Europe particularly from the first half of the nineteenth century. They became dominant as the gatekeepers of the abstract body of knowledge comprising the world of music. From this time the church and the aristocracy no longer held the key positions of control (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:6-7).

Compared with their precursors, the ABRSM and the TCL operated from their beginnings, beyond their immediate locality. Indeed, at the present time their influence has spread to countries within the five continents. The *regulatory agents,* as defined in Hunt's (1993) modes of regulation, are recognisable in the bureaucracy of music examinations in 95[11] countries around the world where the

[11] **The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music** operates in Abu Dhabi, Anguilla, Antigua, Australia, Austria, Bahamas, Bahrain, Bangladesh, Barbados, Belgium, Belize, Bermuda, Bophuthatswana, Botswana, Brunei, Canada, Cayman Islands, China, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, Dominica, Dubai, Eire, Egypt, Falkland Islands, Faroe Islands, France, Germany, Ghana, Gibraltar, Greece, Grenada, Guyana, Hong Kong, Hungary, Iceland, India, Indonesia, Israel, Italy, Jamaica, Japan, Jordan, Kenya, Korea, Kuwait, Luxembourg, Macau, Malawi, Malaysia, Maldives, Malta, Mauritius, Mexico, Namibia, Netherlands, Nevis, New Zealand, Norway, Oman, Philippines, Portugal, Qatar, St Kitts, St Lucia, St Vincent, Saudi Arabia, Sharjah,

ABRSM and the TCL operate. These regulatory agents are charged with 'the collection and recording of information, inspection, surveillance', (examining) and 'reporting' results to candidates and to the formal institutions of music. Modern communication systems facilitate such organisation.

What may be described as a satellite regulatory agent in New Zealand is the Institute of Registered Music Teachers (IRMT), membership of which depends upon the standards of teaching as set by the ABRSM and the TCL. The IRMT has 'regulatory agents' who are 'charged' with the 'collection and recording of information, inspection' and 'surveillance' of teachers. Formal occupational status, therefore, set in law, embellishes the regulatory knowledge of these institutions. Hunt (1993:299) sees this type of situation, prevalent in late modernity, not as *more law* but as *more regulation.*

Hunt (1993:317) suggests that:

> (O)ne of the characteristic features of modernity is the rise of the quest for objective knowledge that replaces reliance on the unsystematic knowledge through personal impression that is characteristic of the aristocratic production of knowledge of premodernity. Independent scholarly research, ..., interventions by "reformers" and most important of all, the data collection and processing agencies ... quasistate institutions all play their part in the production of regulatory knowledge.

Sierra Leone, Singapore, South Africa, Spain, Sri Lanka, Swaziland, Sweden, Switzerland, Taiwan, Tanzania, Thailand, Trinidad & Tobago, Turkey, Turks & Caicos Islands, Uganda, United Kingdom, USA, Virgin Islands, Zambia and Zimbabwe (ABRSM, http://www.abrsm.ac.uk/around.html 28 August 00) **The Trinity College of Music London** operates in Australia, Bahamas, Bahrain, Belgium, Canada, Cyprus, Egypt, Fiji, Hong Kong, India, Indonesia, Jordan, Korea, Malaysia, Malta, Namibia, Nepal, New Zealand, Portugal, Singapore, South Africa, Spain, Sri Lanka, Taiwan, Thailand, United Emirates, United Kingdom and Eire, United States of America and the West Indies (Trinity, Music Diplomas, 1998:69-77).

These factors may be recognised, in the second dimension as described in Hunt's modes of regulation, in the world of music through its bureaucratic organisation.

2.5 Modes of Regulation: The Third Dimension

Musical knowledge has to be produced. 'Production' itself requires endless scrutiny (Hunt, 1993:318). This section considers how knowledge about classical music may have come about.

If the composing and performing of music is learned behaviour (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:122) as inspired by motivating conditions, it would not be exaggerating to suggest that musical knowledge has been accumulating for thousands of years in all cultures on Earth. The following is a glimpse at some events in European music which have impacted on the wealth of knowledge which is bound in regulation as described by Hunt (1993) in this final dimension.

The first one thousand years of Western culture were dominated by the rise of the Christian church, that is, Catholicism. Plainsong or Gregorian Chant, the chanting of prayers and hymns in unison, dominated worship until approximately the year 800 when the voices of men and boys were musically separated spatially and temporally with each still singing the same melody. This was the beginning of polyphony (or counterpoint) which was to become more and more complex until the 1700s and the works of Palestrina (see page 21). Johann Sebastian Bach took polyphony to another place of particular significance which has, since Bach's revival by Mendelssohn approximately one hundred years after his death (Wilson, 1962:33), accorded him a place in musical history. Among his many great works, his polyphonic compositions entitled *Das Wohltemperirte Klavier*[12]- 'The Well

[12] *Das Wohltemperirte Klavier* 'was written to demonstrate the advantages of tempered tuning. It contains 48 preludes and fugues – two in every major and minor key. ... Although written for the harpsichord, this work has become the cornerstone of all piano study' (Wilson, 1962:34).

Tempered[13] Clavier', (commonly referred to as 'The 48') demonstrated the interchangeability of the harmonies of major and minor keys. Mathematical ability, literally and musically, is fundamental in these works.

But what was the attraction to approaching musical composition through mathematical calculation? Religious attitudes perceived that the:

> ... wrong sort of music sends people straight to ... sex and the Devil (Stevens, 1979:64).

An equation existed in religious circles in the Middle Ages between mathematics and theoretical mathematical balance in the music of the rituals of the mass. The equation was based on Copernicus'[14] (1473-1543) astrological theories on the heavenly spheres. Relevant here, is the idea that it was believed, at that time, that a theoretical balance was in accordance with God-given rules. The aim of music composition, therefore, was for mathematical balance. Stevens (1979:64) says:

> (I)f the composer's proportions were aesthetically (which meant metaphysically) right, then it followed as a matter of course that the moral results would be good.

The following may exemplify church criticism about music which was not considered to be theoretically balanced and therefore not in accordance with the perception of God-given rules. The words were directed at a choir by church

---

[13] Temperament is 'adjustment in tuning (to avoid in keyboard instruments an unmanageable number of finger-keys) such as pairs of notes as B sharp and C, or C sharp and D flat are combined instead of being treated as individuals, a compromise being effected which leaves neither note of the pair accurate but both sufficiently near accuracy for the ear tolerantly to accept them' (Ward, 1977:568-569).

[14] Copernicus, Nicholas, (1473-1543), was a Polish astrologer who stated that the Earth spins, every 24 hours, around the stationary Sun and travels round the Sun once a year (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (A), 5, 1980:145).

musician and composer *John of Salisbury*, as polyphony developed in the early 1300s:

> (M)usic sullies the Divine Service, for in the very sight of God, in the sacred recesses of the sanctuary itself, the singers attempt, with the lewdness of a lascivious singing voice and a singularly foppish manner, to feminise all their spellbound little followers with the girlish way they render the notes and end the phrases (Weiss & Taruskin, 1984:62).

As a result of the Catholic Church taking a serious interest in the music which was to be performed at its religious ceremonies for its own philosophical reasons, it held the power to declare which sounds were appropriate for religious worship. This power existed in their hands during the most of the first millennium and for approximately two hundred of years into the second. It is from:

> ... the Mass and the other 'Offices' – that the first developments which have led to the music of the present day are to be traced (Lovelock, 1953:22).

With this history in mind, music composition and the production of regulatory knowledge developed from the sounds which the Christian churches wanted their faithful to hear and the sounds which the aristocracy themselves wanted to hear. However, suggestion or even acknowledgement of interference by religious authorities and the aristocracy, is not to imply that severe restrictions on musical creativity existed. Whilst it may be fair to say that *some* restrictions may have been attempted and *some* may have succeeded, the demands of both the church and the aristocracy are likely to have also provided challenges and inspirations for composers and musicians alike.

Between the requests, challenges and criticisms, composers like Mozart who broke away from the patronage system and consequently lived in poverty, were relatively musically free as the following may suggest. At the time of the production of his opera *The Abduction from the Seraglio*, Mozart took the liberty of creating a shift in power in musicians of the court. A singer, consequently, complained that the notes were too high for her. However, Mozart had intended

that the orchestral instruments be heard at this particular point above her – a sound not considered conventional at the time (Goudsblom & Mennell, 1998:251). The point which may be taken from this is that regulation was, and is not, absolute. On the contrary, regulation grows out of new ideas being deemed as 'better' than former ideas. In this particular instance, regulation was in the process of changing as *Mozart,* the respected authority *at the time*, decided that the human voice was not superior on *all* occasions. Without wishing to labour the point, the human voice had, it is told, only been superior at Mozart's time for approximately one hundred and fifty years, that is, since music had moved from the primal position of church performance to secular performances as *opera* (Routley, 1978:146; Russell, 1957:59).

Mozart was, in light of this story, either being innovative or was implementing regulations of the past. It is likely however, that Mozart did precisely what *he* wanted to do at the time. It is from the insight of composers like Mozart, who do what they want to at the time and in full knowledge of the conventions, that rules and regulations develop about what is 'better', or what is even 'the best'. It is not, simply, a matter of agreement by, for example, a committee.

However, committee-type agreement in principle in the rudiments of music can be traced to the 9th century when an effort was made to standardise the chant or plainsong (Abeles, Hoffer, & Klotman, 1994:6) from the modes (Dorian, Phrygian, Lydian, and Mixo-lydian) of ancient Greece (Bacharach, 1957:26-27). The inspiration to standardise was pragmatic in order that the same music could be sung throughout Europe in churches of similar faith and practice. It has also been suggested that from this standardisation, a formality of musical knowledge and formal musical instruction began in Europe (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:6).

The modes had come to Rome and the Christian church from Greece and the Byzantine church. Each was purported to have held 'a definite aesthetic, even moral, character of its own' (Bacharach, 1957:402-403). Bacharach suggests that this factor may have:

> ... been the reason underlying during many centuries the Church's severe attitude towards tampering with the modes ... that from them eventually sprang our minor and major scales (Bacharach, 1957:403).

The rationalisation of musical theory and harmony in the formal institutions and into their examination system has taken the knowledge of the *pleasing* harmonies[15] and pleasing *progressions*[16] to warrant, to varying degrees, a 'pass' result for participating candidates. The lack of knowledge which reveals the *unpleasant* (or inferior) harmonies and unpleasant (or inferior) *progressions* which the better composers in former times would have discarded, warrant a 'fail' result. Indeed statements like the following - intended as hints for examinations of harmony and its progressions - reveal the absoluteness with which the *pleasing* has become regulated:

> (W)ith crotchet beats do not use quaver chords: with minim beats do not use crotchet chords. In compound times do not be too fond of using consecutive one-pulse chords. In 6/8, for example, continuous quaver chords are undesirable: in any case, never use separate semiquaver chords (Lovelock, n.d.:7).

Thus, 'classical' music developed slowly as a result of philosophical, intellectual, emotional and religious contributions over several centuries. It was driven by pragmatic attitudes which existed in religious philosophy and in society. It may not be surprising that the art of music eventually came to be regulated in official institutions of music. Institutions as 'carvers' of regulatory knowledge will be discussed in Chapter Four under the concept of 'gatekeepers' of knowledge.

---

[15] Harmony: 'Any combination of notes sounded simultaneously' (Adams, 1992:589).

[16] Harmonic Progression: 'The motion of one note to another or one chord to another' (Ward, 1977:252).

2.6 Conclusion

The ethereal notion of composers as extraordinary people creating music as a result of divine inspiration has been offered, throughout the ages, as an explanation for the composition of 'beautiful' music. This discussion has considered the pragmatic development of music as a result of religious, social and institutional modes of regulation which have affected and moulded musical development throughout the ages. An argument has been presented which suggests that classical music has developed, not only as a result of the creatively artistic inspirations of composers, but according to inspirations, constraints, demands and challenges from the spiritual, secular and intellectual expectations of those in positions of power and/or influence.

Furthermore, an argument has been presented suggesting that the practicality of performing the compositions of a court composer, in the classical period of the 1800s, created perimeters around a work in hand as exemplified by 'Papa Haydn', (Joseph Haydn) 'father of the symphony', at the time when he composed much of the work for which he is remembered. Moreover, Haydn's creative ability, like that of any composer, was either diminished or augmented according to his own understanding of all the available instruments and also of the skill of each available player *as well as* the expectations of his patron.

The argument is made that a composer was not/is not free to indulge in the fantastic. A piece of music does not exist in a codified state on paper. It exists in performance only, and therefore, like any construction, it is confined to its own practicalities and mediums of execution.

The rules and regulations which dominate the institutions of music today developed significantly during the decades between the compositions of Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven, and their contemporaries. What is considered to be pleasant-sounding harmonies and pleasant-sounding progressions of harmony can be traced, fundamentally, to their era in the 18^{th} and 19^{th} centuries. Most importantly however, the development of music has relied upon each composer

understanding the works of their predecessors and, as a result of that understanding, contributing to the wealth of knowledge about musical sounds.

Considering these ideas, arbitrariness in music is likely to be directly as a result of agreement by the 'knowledgeable' and the 'influential' on what is 'best' even if that is inspired by a single person. The knowledgeable and the influential have come from different spheres of power over the centuries. Initially the Catholic Church had power which caused much *unintented* development of music as a result of the *intentions* of religious demands on compositions and performances. This power was joined by Lutheranism which invited, indeed encouraged, the secular sounds of folk music to embellish its religious ceremonies. Patronisation by the aristocracy witnessed the development of music away from religious controls and into the social world of secular events and attitudes. From aristocratic patronisation, regulation by formal institutions of music centralised and intellectualised appropriate sounds away from religious philosophical controls and away from the practical restrictions of providing entertainment for the aristocracy. It has been argued that classical music has developed as a result of the pragmatic boundaries of religious and social demands, intellectual rationalisation and creative inspiration. An explanation for its development has been considered to *not* exist in the ethereal divine although such an explanation befits the inexplicable joy of the wondrous music which has come from the quills and pens of the great composers.

Chapter Three

Jazz Music

3.1 Introduction

> Jazz will never be respectable. It was born in the misery, brutality, and degradation of slavery, and it grew up in the hands of great artists who, however, often lived subhuman lives of drink, drugs, and squalor (Russell, 1957:191).

This statement in a general history of music written a little over forty years ago, whilst reflecting an aspect of the origins of jazz, condemns the entire genre forever because of it. It is, perhaps, an unfortunate statement but only with hindsight. To isolate, in the 1950s, one ethnocentric music style and envisage that by the end of the century its qualities would be considered alongside the already highly revered European 'classical' music may have been to fantasise. Perhaps a postmodern mentality in society, generally, in the latter part of the 20th century may have offered new perspectives on formerly sacrosanct grounds in the world of music. Whatever the explanation, less than forty years later, in the early 1990s, another history of music recorded that:

> (T)oday, all the countries of Europe, Great Britain, the former Soviet Union, Japan, Africa, Canada and several South American countries can claim musicians on the roster of significant jazz artists. Jazz is becoming a world music (Tirro, 1993:3).

It is purported that jazz music came to the attention of people in Europe in 1917 when American troops joined the battlefields in Belgium and France during World War I. Some of the black soldiers used the military instruments to experiment with

their own jazz music and others had with them the first gramophone recordings of jazz. European ears were already accustomed to ragtime[1] and cakewalk[2] music and the similar vibrancy of jazz music was welcomed in the trenches (Perry, 1996:8-9). A concert tour in Europe in 1919 of the thirty-five piece orchestra of Will Marion Cook included the black New Orleans musician, Sidney Bechet. The distinguished Swiss conductor, Ernest Ansermet, having attended a concert, wrote afterwards in a periodical Revue romande [sic] :

> (B)echet is the first of his race to have composed perfectly formed blues on the clarinet ... their form was gripping, abrupt, harsh, with a brusque and pitiless ending like that of Bach's Second Brandenburg Concerto ... His art is perhaps the highway the whole world will swing along tomorrow (Perry, 1996:9).

Whilst it is unlikely that Bechet was 'the first of his race ...' perhaps Ansermet was among the first European musicians of significance to recognise publicly, that this music was particularly interesting.

To track, in detail, the path which has brought jazz music from the commonly held perception as described in the first quote into mainstream Western European music in the latter 20th century is not pertinent to this text. What is pertinent is that in forty years, jazz music has traversed brothels, night clubs, recording studios, legislation restricting its performance, concert halls and continents to take its place alongside classical music in the formal curricula of the Associated Board of

---

[1] Ragtime: 'The ragtime era began in 1897. As distinct from Jazz which is an art of improvisation, Ragtime was essentially composed music, usually played on the piano, with many printed and published examples: characteristically piano ragtime consisted of regular melodic lines, simply syncopated over a four-square march-style bass. Its popularity with an enormous international audience lasted until the early 1920s by which time it had been replaced by jazz' (Ward, 1977:469).

[2] Cakewalk: 'a dance based on a march with intricate steps originally performed by American Negroes for the prize of a cake' (Adams, 1992:185).

the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM). In the general history of Western European music, this is unique.

Hunt's (1993:315-316) framework of 'modes of regulation' usefully assisted an understanding of the development of classical music. This chapter locates jazz music within the same framework of, firstly, regulation with intention, secondly, of the tasks of regulatory agents and finally, the production of regulatory knowledge, in order to understand how jazz music moved from 'Tin Pan Alley'[3] in the early part of the 20th century to the ABRSM at the end the century. However, the difficulty in finding *modes of regulation* within the jazz genre is perhaps a signal that this music is 'new'. It is *so* new, it would appear, that modes of regulation are in the process of forming – or, at least, of becoming obvious. This state contrasts strongly to the centuries of domination, influence and control, and of inspiration, challenge and provision which brought classical music through the ages from the lofts of the Christian churches in the first and second millennia to the chambers of the aristocracy and concert hall platforms in the second.

The following brief history looks at the origins of jazz music in order to provide some understanding of the cultural, religious and political complexities which culminated, at the beginning of the 1900s in the United States, in the beginnings of what is now understood to be 'jazz'. This music, with roots in both West Africa and Europe and coming together in the United States, in Virginia, in the 1600s, (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:8) cannot, without a historical understanding, be easily identified within Hunt's (1993:315-316) framework of modes of regulation.

[3] Tin Pan Alley: 'A generic term for the commercialism associated with the song publishing and writing industry. It was commonly used in the mid 19th century, particularly in the United States. It has vaguely derogatory associations' (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B), IX, 1980:1023).

3.2 History

In the 1700s when Johann Sebastian Bach, Joseph Haydn and Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart were composing and performing for the Christian churches and the aristocracy in Europe, music which was eventually to be known as 'jazz' was developing in the United States. Whilst both genres of music have origins in the ancient Greek modes, one of the major differences between 'classical' European music and the indigenous music from non-European cultures was that the former, only, had developed a system of written notation. This system, devised in order that the same music could be sung throughout Europe in churches of similar faith and practice (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:6) provoked, provided for and inspired increasingly complex compositions. In turn, music was expected to be performed according to instructions, that is according to the score. The demands, challenges, restrictions and inspirations of the patrons from both the church and the aristocracy were bound into prescribed compositions. On the contrary, the Afro-American music which eventually became jazz, was characterised by spontaneity, that is, nothing was written on a score or played with replicative accuracy.

In 1619, the first African slaves arrived in Virginia from the West Coast of Africa, specifically from the Ivory Coast, the Gold Coast and the Slave Coast. The West Africans had rich musical traditions with musical improvisation being a part of the rituals of religious worship as well as oral renditions of 'myths, tales, riddles, proverbs and lyric poetry' which comprised their history (Tirro, 1993:10).

The West African slaves were obliged, however, by their captors to modify their music. For example, the drums which had been an integral part of their music were legislatively outlawed in most areas of the South prior to the Civil War (1861-1865). The absence of the drum beats encouraged much hand clapping and foot stomping of their complex rhythms[4] (Tirro, 1993:5) These rhythms

[4] Complex rhythms: '... at its simplest it can be two beats on one drum against three on another. However, the normal complex rhythm is more likely to be between three and six instruments with each playing a complex rhythm and all ultimately creating another rhythm. These rhythms also

were, eventually, to become an integral element in jazz music-making. Perry (1996:10) emphasises this point by saying that the West African musical traditions had:

> (A) highly developed sense of rhythm and counter rhythm, more complex than that heard in most European music ... .

Further modification to the African music in the United States came about by the captors who, not wanting to be excluded from the messages exchanged through singing in the plantations, demanded that the slaves sing in English (Taylor, 1983:5). As early as the 17th century therefore, links were forming between African, European and American folk music.

3.2.1 European Influences

Following European custom, the Christian churches became the gatekeepers of musical knowledge in the United States. The first Catholic missionaries, the Franciscan friars who settled in Florida in 1603, paid little attention to the existing music of those whom they set about 'educating', that is the indigenous people of the American continent as well as the newly arrived West African people. Instead they offered instruction in Christian music and Gregorian chant, *'a cappella'*, (unaccompanied) in order to accompany the religious ceremonies which were part of the education (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:8). The newly imposed Protestant Christianity saw that Jesus replaced the king of the former African society, for the slaves in the United States in their musical story telling (Tirro,

---

involve syncopation (displacement of either the beat or the normal accent) which in itself is another major defining factor of jazz music' (Ogren, 1989:13).

1993:10). The West African slaves responded with enthusiasm to the religious stories and music rituals of Christianity, purports Tirro (1993:10). They prayed and sang hymns in large excited crowds. Their cultural tradition of improvisation brought much repetition of words, in particular *'Hallelujah'*, and phrases, along with feet stomping and hand clapping. Russell (1957:189) tells us that this musical celebration eventually led to the playing of musical instruments which sounded like the human voice. For example, the trombone resembled the low voice, the trumpet resembled the medium voice and the clarinet resembled the high voice.

From the musical rituals of religious services and from the work songs which broke the drudgery of work in the plantations began the 'black-American folk music' known as 'slave music' (Collier, 1978:17). Away from the plantation, West African people began to gather in cellars or in open spaces to play their instruments together, using European harmonies (Gridley, 1991:42). The highly developed aural awareness and the complex rhythmic tradition of the West African people continued to develop as their ears became accustomed, also, to European harmonies and strict, if less complex, European rhythm. The new sounds combined with their own traditional sounds and practices and created, eventually, the music they called 'jazz'. Improvisation itself was an accidental, or incidental, element. Having never needed a score, the Afro-American musicians improvised on well known American songs which did have a score - *somewhere.*

Slavery itself and the insistence of the captors on the modification of their captives' music pushed the development of the music of the West African people in the United States into specific directions. Birth was given to Afro-American 'ragtime' defined as:

> ... the attempt by American blacks of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries to replicate in their music something of the cross-rhythms that were at the heart of African music (Collier, 1978:43)

and to 'blues', black folk songs which developed from the descendants of slaves, (Tatchell, 1992:8) from elements of European dance music such as 'mazurkas,

waltzes, polkas' and 'quadrilles' (Gridley, 1991:37). As Leonard (1970, 11-12) describes, jazz borrowed from:

> ... (P)rotestant hymns, British ballads, Spanish songs and Afro-Spanish rhythms, French quadrilles and marches, various West African rhythms, and melodic elements found in spirituals, the blues, work songs and field hollers[5] (Leonard, 1970:11-12).

Jazz music also owes its heritage to the diverse music which existed in the State of Louisiana as a result of wide cultural influences from the time of the arrival of Europeans. History tells us that it was ruled by the Spanish for approximately four decades from 1762 and subsequently ruled by the French from 1800. It also had a sizeable German population and a large population of black slaves (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (A), 11, 1980:125). New Orleans, seaport and centre of commerce for Louisiana, therefore, became the birthplace, at the beginning of the 20th century, of the new form of music - jazz, as a result of the conglomeration of music ideals jostling for prominence (Leonard, 1970:11-12).

3.2.2 The Place of the Piano

Jazz begins with the piano, contends Berendt (1982:220). The instrument is purported to have become a 'craze' in the latter part of the 19th century in the United States, becoming a focal point of family life. For the black people who could afford it, a piano was one of their first major purchases. Its music was frequently heard in churches which were the centre of community life, and in the urban 'tonks' and 'juke' houses - the ancestors of the jukebox (Lyons, 1983:19).

---

[5] Holler: 'Also known as a 'shout' or a 'call'. A holler is a dance before the giving of a blessing in black Christian ceremony of Negro men and woman to the accompaniment of their own voices. Origins can be traced to the communicating of the slaves with each other in the plantations' (Wilson-Dickson, 1992:194).

Feather (1965:57) suggests that the piano was the first instrument 'mastered' for jazz. These bands:

> ...relied on their "professor"[6] to keep up a rolling, tumultuous background of rags, stomps and blues while the customers were entertained - upstairs or down[7] (Feather, 1965:57).

The first jazz music, known as *ragged* in reference to a highly syncopated melody set against a regular bass rhythm, was played primarily on the piano. *Ragged* music became nominally corrupted to *ragtime* music and was the preferred musical style which the 'well-educated' black people played and composed during the late 1890s. Unlike the sad stories of exile, physical misery and unrequited love as told in the lyrics of blues music, this lively dance music was uplifting in spirit (Perry, 1996:12-13).

Ragtime music became well known at the turn of the century, initially in Missouri, through the compositions and performances of its 'King' - Scott Joplin (Curtis, 1994:1). It is likely, suggests Perry (1996:12-13) that Joplin (1868-1917) took the banjo music of 'privileged' slaves who provided entertainment in the homes of the plantation owners as the base for his 'ragged time' music and combined it with his understanding of European classics. Ragtime music, thus, has its distinct place in the development of jazz.

---

[6] Professor: A ragtime pianist playing in saloons and bars (Berendt, 1982: 221).

[7] Upstairs or down: Reference to parts of a building in the big city ghettos used upstairs as a brothel or downstairs as a gambling joint, saloon or a club (Collier, 1978:44).

3.2.3 Summary

Jazz music developed from the cultural music traditions of both West Africa and Europe as well as the folk and popular music of America (Leonard, 1970:7) as the Afro-Americans were brought together, from the 1600s, in the southern United States (Tirro, 1993:3). African rhythms and European harmonies as well as disciplinary attitudes towards music-making eventually gave birth to 'jazz' music.

The 'disciplinary attitudes' refers to both improvisation and sensitivity towards fellow musicians, an integral part of African music, as well as adherence to *regular* rhythm, an integral part of European music. The journey which brings African and European music together as jazz music appears to follow a haphazard path with various cultural influences shaping its destiny at random. However, some of this apparent randomness may be bound by Hunt's framework of 'modes of regulation' (1993, 315-316) enabling identification of motivating conditions for the development of jazz music. This idea will be discussed as follows.

3.3 Modes of Regulation

By using Hunt's (1993) framework of modes of regulation as an analytical tool, the aim of this chapter is to identify motivating conditions which have existed with varying degrees of informality in the development of jazz music. As the brief historical account of jazz music may have indicated, jazz music itself, separated from its origins, may be considered to be a relatively new musical style when compared with classical music. *Unintended* results from modes of regulation which have determined its path of development are, perhaps, likely to be in early formation. Those modes of regulation which are identified in the following discussion appear to have been held in place, until recently, by unofficial, or socially pressing means as opposed to the rules and regulations of powerful and/or influential authorities, for example, the Christian churches, the aristocracy and/or formal institutions.

Improvisation, the defining characteristic of jazz music, has been intentionally formalised by formal institutions of music in recent years. This idea is discussed using the ideas of the first dimension of Hunt's modes of regulation. The absence of positive regulatory agents in relation to jazz music until recently may have been obvious in the background discussion. Perhaps not so obvious are the negative regulatory agents which have affected the development of this musical genre. This idea is discussed under Hunt's second dimension of his modes of regulation. Finally, jazz music is discussed in relation to the construction of knowledge about its essential character. Hunt's third mode of regulation is helpful in this search for the production of regulatory knowledge about jazz music.

3.4 Modes of Regulation: The First Dimension

The defining characteristic of jazz music considered to be improvisation has recently been intentionally regulated upon within formal institutions of music, the ABRSM in particular. However, as improvisation itself came into existence incidentally and accidentally, it developed, to this point, informally. Both nature and nurture, it is argued, have cradled jazz music to the point whereby its defining feature is improvisation. In this respect, it differs little from the development of classical music. An absolute image about how 'classical' or 'jazz' music *should* be has never existed and is unlikely to, regardless of regulation. The search for this state may be regarded as part of the development of both classical and jazz music.

To reiterate from Chapter two:

> (R)egulation is always intentional even though its results may be unintended (Hunt, 1993:315).

Regulation, it is assumed, must be based upon some preconception of an ideal. Therefore it is necessary at this point to reconsider the definition of jazz music as understood in this discussion. The ABRSM has defined jazz in its syllabus to include 'Blues, Standard and Contemporary Jazz' (Beale, 1998:151). It appears

that rock and roll and pop music have been intentionally excluded regardless of the arguments which place this music into the broader definition of jazz (Berendt, 1982:371-377; Shuker, 1998:173). Therefore it would appear that the factor in common within the specific jazz styles as selected by ABRSM is the element of improvisation. This essentially characterising element also sets these prescribed styles apart from classical music. Thus, rock and roll music and popular music in general may exist within the coded system of written classical music whilst jazz, as defined by the ABRSM, strictly speaking, may not. It is possible that the move by the ABRSM to isolate one specific form of jazz and fix it into a set of examinable rules is the most *intentional* official regulation which jazz music has experienced to date. But how does regulation go about constructing rules about spontaneous music-making?

3.4.1 Improvisation

The characterising element of jazz music as defined by the ABRSM is 'improvisation' (also known as *ad lib, ride* or *jam).* At the simplest level improvisation means to 'compose and perform simultaneously' (Gridley, 1991:4). It relies on 'emotion, mood, atmosphere and intuition ...' (Beale, 1998:53). Whilst it may *appear* that improvisation is rather like the description provided by Kofsky (1970:65) of a black musician whom he calls "Malcolm X" - 'blowing some sounds ... never thought of before', it is more likely that improvisation, even as far back as when the West Africans were improvising during their rituals of religious worship in West Africa, has rules which are understood, albeit subconsciously, by the participants. A leading authority on African music, J.H.K. Kwabena Nketia, says that in Africa, music-making is learnt informally (but nevertheless, *learnt*) by participating in musical situations. He says:

> ... it is believed that natural endowment and a person's ability to develop on his [sic] own are essentially what is needed ... The principle seems to be that of learning through social experience' (Kwabena Nketia cited in Collier, 1978:45).

This learning through 'social experience' which appears to have developed the sensitivity towards that which others do musically, may be the kernel of jazz musicianship. Indeed the conventionally trained Creole cornetist, Peter Bocage who heard the first notes of jazz in the streets of New Orleans in the early 1900s, believed that the then new musical idiom came into existence because there were, firstly, many players and secondly, the players could not read music and thus, 'relied on their wits' - they *'improvised'* (Perry, 1996:15). It is likely that jazz music could not have developed out of the calculated and coded system as understood in classical music because the subtleties and complexities crucial to the essence of jazz music, as well as the spontaneous communication between the musicians themselves cannot be codified, or symbolised, within the confines of this system. Jazz music therefore, must be learnt, not by visually interpreting physical codes into musical sounds, but rather by spontaneously repeating a sound and a rhythm with variation and/or embellishment using aural perception - in other words, instantly individualising the common sound (Collier, 1978:45) *and* being able to share this understanding with fellow musicians. It would appear that jazz music has been informally regulated from as far back as it can be traced; it is the *unintended* result of specific musical socialisation.

Formal rules and regulations however, have developed, and continue to develop, around this musical phenomenon. Up until the 1920s in New Orleans, improvisation was the spontaneous playing together of *all* the players in a band. This derived from the piecing together of bands and musicians made up of classically-musically 'uneducated' black musicians who would meet - incidentally (Gridley, 1991:41). Although improvisation was not *intentionally* an essential element of jazz music, the general popular success of the sound created was such that by the 1920s, improvisation had *unintentionally* become its major identifying characteristic. Consequently, the striving for improvisation, or intention to improvise, became a centrally characterising feature of the music (Gridley, 1991:41).

In the 1920s, improvisation based on a solo performance became the norm after the skills of well known jazz musician Louis Armstrong (Daniel Louis Armstrong,

1901-1971) took it to heights hitherto unimagined (Tatchell, 1992:10). From this time not all musicians in a jazz band needed to be able to improvise (Gridley, 1991:5). For example, in a 'big band' only the tenor saxophone or the trumpet might actually improvise within the context of the performance. Otherwise, all the other music was 'arranged' to be played as it was heard - as in the classical music style (Gridley, 1991:5).

As with classical music, therefore, modes of regulation - *intentionally* developed as a result of the 'talent' of specific individuals. Improvisation, as a means of music-making, had become a sophisticated practice for those who were best at doing it. Indeed the recognised master of improvisation, Duke Ellington, is purported to have said:

> (N)o one ever played a good solo without thinking about it first (Perry, 1996:24).

To leap ahead approximately seventy years, the following prescription for jazz piano examinations from the ABRSM may illustrate a present mode of regulation which, *intentionally*, has been devised around the art of improvisation:

> (P)erhaps the most distinctive feature of the jazz piano syllabus is that improvisation is required in every piece from Grade 1, as well as in the aural tests and quick study. The idea of 'performing' a piece in jazz therefore includes not only the ability to *reproduce* accurately given material (heard from notation), but also the ability to *embellish* given material and to *improvise* ... to fill in a musical space of a particular length and in a particular rhythmic and harmonic context (Beale, 1998:151).

Of significance in these guiding words is the idea that the black people of the West Coast of Africa and their descendants did not need this direction. It would appear that the directives serve to oppose the mental discipline which the classical music *intentionally* deemed correct and proper for its genre to the extent that those trained in this field must overcome this nurtured attitude in order to play jazz music. An *unintended* consequence, therefore, of mastering the philosophical

approach necessary for classical music playing is perhaps the inhibition of natural rhythmic movement whilst making music. It may be important to note, at this point, that the practice of musicians making up music as they go, or *improvising*, has been and still is the norm in cultures other than West African or Afro-American. For example it exists in Asian, African, Chinese and Japanese music (Russell, 1957:193) and it existed in former times for Maori (Thomson, 1991:2). It also existed in former times in classical music[8]. Music made by formal and accurate codification is only one form of music-making although its popularity has taken it, probably, to every country on earth. Similarly, jazz is only one form of music-making using improvisation.

3.4.2 Nature or Nurture?

Classical music composers look to the great composers for knowledge and inspiration. Burke (1989:99-100) suggests that some composers may imitate the work of Beethoven, but Beethoven had encapsulated all the knowledge of music that had gone before him. To imitate, therefore, suggests Burke (1989:100) is to:

> ... create sound similar to a child who imitates a workman [sic] by simply making the same kind of noise (Burke, 1989:100).

The intended regulations as set out in the new syllabus of the ABRSM may, but not necessarily, produce the musical equivalent of some 'hammering children'. To cite Malcolm X in Kofsky (1970:65-66) again:

> (I)'ve seen black musicians when they'd be jamming at a jam session with white musicians – a whole lot of difference. The white musician can jam if he's got some sheet music in front of him. He can jam on something that he's heard jammed before. But that black musician, he picks up his horn and

[8] The chief form of keyboard music in improvisatory style in the latter half of the [16th]century was the *toccata*. This word comes from the Italian verb *toccare* (to touch) and carries the suggestion of an organist improvising at the keyboard (Grout and Palisca, 1988:297).

> starts blowing some sounds that he never thought of before. He improvises, he creates, it comes from within. It's his soul; it's that soul music. It's the only area on the American scene where the black man has been free to create. And he has mastered it. He has shown that he can come up with something that nobody ever thought of on his own ... .

There is a suggestion of innate, that is, existing from birth, ability here. This ability is distinct from 'inherent' - meaning a separate and learned ability (Adams, 1992:185). Therefore, what may be an obvious explanation of jazz music-making to 'Malcolm X' may be considered a racist explanation by others. The story of white jazz musician, Dave Brubeck as told to Lyons (1983:103-105) contradicts Malcolm X's belief in innate cultural ability by suggesting that Brubeck's socialisation is responsible for his talents in jazz music-making. Brubeck exemplifies his personal socialisation saying that as his mother was a classical pianist of considerable repute, he was exposed to formal piano tuition, at her side, from an early age. He says:

> I wasn't a good student anyway because I had a lot of trouble with my eyes. One eye was crossed, pulled all the way over to the side. I wore glasses from the age of two, and this problem discouraged me from reading music. My mother didn't know I couldn't read while she was teaching me. I could play whatever she put in front of me because I had heard it so often from her other students. But I couldn't get too far, and I missed out on a very good education. I use only one eye most of the time now, although they don't look crossed anymore. ... I went through College ... as a music major without being able to read music ... There are a lot of us that way, although the public doesn't realize it. ..... People seem to think I'm a classic pianist and composer who turned to jazz. It's not true ... (Lyons, 1983:105).

When considering regulation about knowledge, this section has discussed the contribution which socialisation itself has on the development of jazz music. It would appear that circumstances and socialisation contribute significantly to the ability to play music in the jazz genre. Therefore, regulation itself may be intentional. However, this in itself cannot control outcomes.

3.4.3 Significance of Lack of Influence

Just as Lutheranism had permitted local music to be part of the music of religious ceremonies after the Reformation in Europe in the 16th century, Protestant authorities in the United States were not interested in attempting to negatively control or influence the spiritual music of the Negro people (Stevenson, 1970:92-105). Indeed, Protestantism in the United States encouraged Negro participation in religious services by allowing their versions of Christian hymns. Stevenson (1970:98-99) notes that there was no part singing (polyphony) in the religious worship even in the 1800s. On the contrary the Negro people performed a:

> ... "rhythmical barbaric dance" accompanied by "chanting, often harshly, but always in the most perfect time ... [with a] monotonous refrain" (Higginson cited in Stevenson, 1970:98).

Of significance here may be the idea that the *lack* of harmony as understood in European music was not important. Rhythm and *new* harmonic sounds, which were to become the identifying feature of jazz music, were either not discouraged or were ignored in the early times of Christianity in the United States, as Christianity was practised among the descendants of the plantation slaves. Thus the absence of *intentional* regulation, *unintentionally* led to the development of jazz as we understand it today.

A further influence of significance on the development of jazz music may be found in the music as it was played in New Orleans. 'Congo Square', in this city, was exempt from the laws which had outlawed drumming in most areas in the South. It was a designated area where black musicians could gather without the fear of offending the white masters, to play or listen to:

> the unreconstituted [sic] rural folk music with unsubdued [sic] African elements, sung and played by plantation workers (Perry, 1996:15).

The music-making in Congo Square may be seen as another accidental, or incidental - or *unintended* result of the earlier negative regulation affecting

drumming and which, in turn, affected the development of jazz music. Drumming, as opposed to clapping and foot stomping, made its way into jazz music.

3.4.4 Summary

Music-making may be encouraged by, or reduced to, sets of rules which may form the basis of regulation in order to learn 'how to' play an instrument in a specific genre. *Unintended* consequences may form as a result of the actual process of regulation suggests Hunt (1993:315). To re-create the philosophical base which gave jazz music its characterising essence may not be possible in a codified set of rules. The *unintended* results of the regulation may represent something like Bach's music, written to be played on either a harpsichord or an organ in the 1600s in a church or an aristocratic dwelling, being played on a piano in an examination room or a concert platform in the 20th and 21st centuries. This is not to say that the outcomes are inferior. It is to say that circumstances induce irrevocable change which is *sometimes* understood as 'development' and *always* understood to be controversial.

3.5 Modes of Regulation: The Second Dimension

To reiterate from Chapter Two, regulation

> ... always involves the designation, identification, or creation of regulatory agents who are charged with a range of functions ranging from the collection and recording of information, inspection, surveillance, reporting, initiation of enforcement action, and a host of other activities (Hunt, 1993:316).

The rules and regulations which developed around classical music teaching and learning as discussed in the previous chapter could not have come into existence without general respectability for the genre itself. Classical music represents the

epitome of respectability. Whilst jazz music slowly gained respectability as it developed throughout the 20th century, it has taken several decades to be considered for its own musical rationality, that is, considered without judgement about its origins.

Jazz music as performed in New Orleans at the beginning of the century was associated with taverns, dance halls and the well known brothel district of Storyville (Gridley, 1991:37-38). In its infancy and well into the 1960s, it was considered a 'naughty novelty' (Chevigny, 1991:40. The general lack of respect associated with jazz music has hindered the development of formalised rules and regulations. However, it has not *prevented* development. Whilst, historically, the powers of the church and the aristocracy created some modes of regulation which *inspected, surveyed* and *reported* classical music - albeit in an arbitrary manner, it was ultimately the institutions of modernity which formalised the presence of regulatory agents. Of relevance here is the idea that approximately eighty years after jazz music began to become a significant part of white popular culture, a British institution, the ABRSM, rationalised the music and by doing so declared itself to be the 'regulatory agent'.

3.5.1 Negative Regulation

Rules and regulations restricting jazz performance have been significant. For example, in the 1960s in New York City, local regulations known as 'the cabaret laws' affected not only cabarets but any place where live music could be performed. The Cabaret laws provided for prohibition of jazz music in specific zones of the city. Thus, jazz music was restricted by law to specific neighborhoods. In effect, jazz musicians, usually black, who learnt their music in the clubs were shunted by the law from 'white society' to the black districts of the city (Chevigny, 1991:1-7; Wicke, 1990:17). A small number of cabarets in the specific zones designated for jazz music playing catered exclusively for white people but most had mixed patronage (Chevigny, 1991:41). Regardless, however, the Afro-American music preserved its spirit of communal music-making with

active audience participation (Wicke, 1990:17). Part of improvisation itself was 'the call and response' between the performers and the audience. This was a direct link with the Afro-American tradition in the sacred and secular songs whereby the leader and the chorus interacted in the creation of the music (Ogren, 1989:13). However, the performances and interactions, and the rhythms and improvisations, new to white listeners, became to be experienced as "abandonment" as Chevigny, (1991:42) tells us:

> (I)t turned out to be a historic misfortune that the forces of respectability identified the music with sexual abandon in a crude sense and that the purveyors capitalized on it; they played into the hands of early critics who condemned jazz as cacophonous on the one hand and insidiously immoral on the other (Chevigny, 1991:42).

The restrictive laws may have come into effect through an apartheid-type mentality. However, it was the misinterpretation of the music itself by white listeners, which caused either the audiences to be attracted to, or the authorities to reject, performances. We are told that:

> ... the word "jass" referred to sexual intercourse – and with their white patrons the Harlem clubs were to trade on the suggestive innuendo through their dancing and floor shows as well as hot music. Lena Horne recalls, "[t]he shows had a primitive, naked quality that was supposed to make a civilised audience lose its inhibitions. The music had an intense, pervasive rhythm - sometimes loud and brassy, often weird and wild. The dances were eloquently provocative ...." Many white people went Uptown with a shiver of adventure, supposedly to abandon the restraints of respectability ... (Chevigny, 1991:40).

The 'regulatory agents' who ensured the prohibition of this music except in specific zones, and who *surveyed* the respective restrictions, put in place a mode of regulation which caused jazz music to continue to exist under negative conditions.

3.5.2 Summary

Negative modes of regulation as exemplified by the 'cabaret laws' in New York City in the 1960s serve to highlight a perception of lower socio-economic values and racist attitudes towards jazz music and jazz musicians. Effective negative regulation controlling and restricting performances and audiences alike affected the performance of jazz music at this time in this place. Under these conditions, rules and regulations to nurture its development were not forthcoming. Although forty years had passed from the time jazz music had been identified with the taverns and brothels of New Orleans, little growth had occurred in its status. The following forty years, however, brought enormous changes to the imagery of jazz music and jazz musicians.

This second dimension of Hunt's (1993:315-6) modes of regulation, referring to regulatory agents, is presently readily recognisable in the world of jazz music teaching and learning as practised in this country, New Zealand. In October, the first pupils, whose details had been 'collected and recorded' by the 'regulatory agents' (of the ABRSM) were examined ('inspected') on the 'regulatory knowledge' (third dimension). It turn, other 'regulatory agents' (examiners) 'reported' on the findings - and all was 'recorded'.

Given that the music had developed from the communications of black slaves on plantations in Virginia, in the 1600s (Abeles, Hoffer & Klotman, 1994:8), it may not be so surprising that its journey into the teaching studios, the examination rooms and the concert platforms of the Western world has taken some interesting, if not some hideous, turns. The negative regulations which affected jazz music, *not necessarily* negatively, have been replaced by positive outcomes. The effects of the newly rationalised jazz music in the world of music generally, and its associated audiences, are yet to be experienced. The present may thus be seen as an exciting time for jazz music and jazz musicians.

3.6 Modes of Regulation: The Third Dimension

To reiterate from Chapter Two in relation to Hunt's framework of modes of regulation (1993), the third dimension suggests that:

> ...the regulatory process revolves around the production of *regulatory knowledge*. The identification, acquisition, and deployment of knowledge are central features, in the first instance, of the construction of objects for regulation. Only after some social phenomena or social practice has been constructed in such a way that it can be studied, quantified, and measured does it become possible for it to be treated as a suitable candidate for regulation. The collection of knowledge plays a central role in formulation of regulatory policies and strategies; and once some regulatory mechanism, is in place then further collection and manipulation of data are important in the assessment and evaluation of the regulatory instrument (Hunt, 1993:317).

The 'regulatory knowledge' which has recently been 'produced' in the jazz genre of music by the ABRSM has not necessarily 'produced' anything new. It has taken jazz music in its present form at the end of the 20th century and re-presented aspects of its rationale, in a graded series, for teaching and learning purposes. The move itself to formal teaching studios and to the examination room is taking jazz music *out* of its original context and *re-placing* it into an environment of new meanings. Therefore the regulatory knowledge is adapting Afro-American jazz music of the past to middle class European tastes by rationalising its content and its apparent informality.

Whilst knowledge may be produced and regulated upon and about, philosophical attitudes which are at the heart of the music-making are likely to be difficult to reduce to a set of rules. For example, the formality of the examination room and the relationship between the examiner and the candidate is unlikely to resemble the informality of a night club or even a jazz concert. Furthermore, an entire performance, solo, cannot be considered a 'norm' within a general understanding of the genre of jazz music which relies upon considerable interaction between, not

only the musicians but between the musicians and the audience (Ogren, 1989:12). The point here is that the regulatory process, as it may operate within the ABRSM, which produces the knowledge cannot, necessarily, produce it in context.

Besides the regulation by the ABRSM of improvisation in jazz music, attempts are, however, in place to regulate a philosophical approach to jazz music-making. The following quote from the official guide to teachers and students of the piano jazz syllabus from this school states:

> (F)rom the very start always be physically and mentally positive and energetic in your rhythm. Don't hold back! Consciously put aside any inhibitions, and move your body gently but positively and dance along with the pulses and rhythms you make. Try to get the rhythms into your body as well as your head, literally to feel the rhythm through the movement of your limbs ... learning to let go bodily is as much part of the process in jazz as developing musical self-discipline, and the ideal jazz musician achieves both ... (Beale, 1998:3).

Whilst the ABRSM stipulates that candidates must consciously 'put aside any inhibitions' and move their bodies in time to their own music-making, the following excerpt from a chapter about classical piano playing technique provides a contrast in the production of regulatory knowledge.

> (A)s the pianist is seated at the piano ready to play, the height of the bench or chair should be such that the elbow is on a level with the top of that part of the piano frame which is just below the front of the keys. This will bring the wrist about level with the top of the second finger joint. The position at the piano should be such that the upper arm inclines slightly forward so that the elbow is somewhat in front of the body. (If the upper arm were allowed to remain vertical, the body would be too close to the piano, and only the forearm weight would be available for use in the tone production. This would mean that the relation of the arm to general technique and tone production would be greatly restricted). ... this normal condition [is] ... the use of just enough muscular tension to maintain the position and do the job in hand (Ahrens and Atkinson, 1973:37).

These quotations have been included to emphasise the existence of detailed regulatory knowledge in the world of music learning. They provide a vivid contrast between the philosophical attitudes necessary in order to play classical or jazz music. Most importantly, however, in this section they illustrate how the regulatory process produces regulatory knowledge.

3.6.1 Regulatory Knowledge has its Founders

Jazz musicians of repute like 'Satchmo' (Daniel Louis Armstrong) and 'The Duke' (Edward Kennedy Ellington) are not 'great' in the same manner as their classical contemporaries, for example, Shostakovich or Schoenberg, are understood as 'great' composers (Perry, 1996:15). The former are considered 'great' as *performers* only - *because* their works are not replicable. Neither the concert halls nor the institutions of music could function in the presently understood manner without the codified music of Bach, Mozart, Beethoven and many others. This music *is* replicable. Therefore, the major difference which invites 'greatness' is that the jazz musicians performed their works *without* writing down what they were doing; the classical composers *did*. One is a 'great' performance, the other is a 'great' composition. This is not to imply, however, that Duke Ellington and Louis Armstrong could not read music. They both could, with the former having formally studied piano (Feather, 1960:191) and the latter, the horn (Feather, 1960:103). The point is that jazz improvisation *cannot* be written down and if it is, its essential quality has been destroyed. Therefore, the 'greatness' of jazz musicians *cannot* be compared to the 'greatness' of classical musicians as the body of knowledge, the *expertise,* which they both create has differing amounts of accessibility.

Although the performance element is crucial to how jazz was formed and how it developed, the performances of musicians like Louis Armstrong and Duke Ellington neither had nor have, the opportunities to reach the vast audiences which the musical score of classical music composers provides. Therefore, classical and jazz music regenerates itself differently. Classical music may be replicated

according to musicians and conductors of expertise. Jazz music is dependent upon the originality of performance of players. Therefore 'greatness' is achieved in these genres of music, in different ways because the regulatory knowledge itself does not have a common denominator.

Whilst the institutional regulatory knowledge is founded on the works of the 'great' performers and composers, it requires long, complex and not necessarily verbal negotiations between composers, performers, the audience or congregation and, as in the past, the patrons in order to be acceptable. Indeed Hunt (1993:317) suggests:

> (T)he processes through which regulatory knowledge is produced reveal a complex interplay between official and unofficial mechanisms.

The silent processes may be those events in the development of classical music which happened because of the circumstances. For example, the effects which occurred as the result of the randomness of musicians who passed through the country residence of Prince Nicholas Esterhazy at Eisenstadt during Haydn's thirty years of employment when he composed according to the availability of musicians and their specific instruments. Similar events, albeit less formal, may be recognised in the development of jazz music as described by Levine, (1977:233):

> In the frequent "bucking contests" that took place between bands, it was the crowds of onlookers that decided when one band had fallen noticeably behind the other in quality. When that happened the people watching would crowd around the victorious musicians cheering and encouraging them to go on. The process by which the audiences determined which band was superior intrigued [Sidney] Bechet. He concluded it had to do with the fact that the audience was more than an audience, it was participating: "how it was they could tell – that was the music too. It was what they had of the music inside themselves." It was always the people who made the decision. "You was always being judged.".

Hunt (1993:317) suggests that in modernity, objective knowledge is sought through independent scholarly research as opposed to former times when

'unsystematic knowledge through personal impression' by influential aristocratic individuals bestowed worth on knowledge. These ideas in relation to knowledge about music will be discussed in Chapter Four. Within this chapter, the idea that whilst there is subjectivity involved in the knowledge which constitutes classical music, this subjectivity itself is actually part of the objectivity of the genre.

Exemplification of subjectivity which has been objectified may be seen in the understanding of how to interpret a trill, as discussed in Chapter Two. The subjectivity may appear to be subjective. The isolating of rules however, which anchor such quandaries into norms of specific time epochs (Taylor, 1989:87-97) confirms the idea that a rationality exists. Therefore, the 'unsystematic knowledge through personal impression' to which Hunt (1993:317) refers, has no place in the knowledge of classical music after it has been objectified by 'independent scholarly research'. Of interest here however, is that jazz music, until it was objectified by independent scholarly research was, obviously, based on 'unsystematic knowledge through personal impression'. The impression Louis Armstrong made in personalising improvisation (Tatchell, 1992:10) may well fit into this category. However, so might Beethoven's ideas about harmony and classical music. Therefore, it is argued that both Armstrong and Beethoven have contributed to the body of knowledge of their respective genres 'unsystematically through personal impression'. The objectivity towards their contributions to the bodies of knowledge has come, as Hunt suggests (1993:317) through the 'independent scholarly research' as carried out by formal institutions.

In summary, the values of modernity have isolated and sanctioned specific pieces of information and/or knowledge which came about both accidentally and incidentally. By encasing this knowledge in regulations, commodities have been produced, that is - the 'commodity' of classical music and the 'commodity' of jazz music. These commodities are marketed (not necessarily for financial profit), by the formal, educational institutions of music.

3.7 Conclusion

In African societies, music-making was the means by which individuals adjusted to moral and spiritual group norms. Music, for the newly enslaved Africans in the United States in the 1600s, subsequently, defined all areas and occurrences of their lives. There was music for:

> ... working, for playing, for waking up, for washing, for hunting, for reaping, for festivals and their preparation, and for important events such as births, initiation rights, marriages, deaths, wars, and victories (Taylor, 1983:3).

Jazz music, it has been argued, emerged from the sounds made by the first black African people as a result of their need to express themselves freely in musical terms, in a new and foreign country under the social conditions of slavery (Feather, 1960:23; Taylor, 1983:3). Jazz music is thus derived from traditions and attitudes non-European in concept and origin (Taylor, 1983:3). It emerged in the first half of the nineteenth century from the rituals, three hundred years prior, of African voodoo ceremonial dancing, work songs, spiritual songs and a variety of rhythm instruments from black traditions in the United States. Sacred and secular American folk songs and European harmonies and forms of music combined with philosophical elements of restriction from European influence of post-Civil War mentality to culminate in the conglomeration of musical sounds which constituted 'jazz' music at the beginning of this century (Tirro, 1993:3-6).

This, and the previous chapter, have identified modes of regulation which have had determining influences on the bodies of knowledge which constitute either classical or jazz music. In classical music, it is evident that the Christian churches and the aristocracy were the controlling authorities on its development until approximately the 19th century when major shifts in power - political, social and religious - occurred in Europe as a result of the 'dual revolutions', that is - the British Industrial Revolution and the French Revolution. 'Rationalisation' which characterises modernity as an intellectual climate, was in place. This idea will be discussed in Chapter Four. In jazz music, it appears that political influences based

on racist attitudes and, to a lesser degree, religious tolerance of, or disinterest in, the black African sounds, contributed to the apparently haphazard development of this music.

By using the framework of modes of regulation as presented by Hunt (1993), different motivating conditions for both classical and jazz have been identified. Classical music development was guided, moulded and inspired as a result of the patronisation of the church and the nobility whilst jazz music developed because it was ignored by these authorities. The production of regulatory knowledge, the task of educational institutions, has taken the genre of jazz music, in the late 1900s, into its intellectualising process to recognise, organise and formalise the special qualities of this style of music alongside classical music.

Chapter Four

The Gatekeepers

4.1 Introduction

The previous two chapters have traced the creation and development of classical and jazz music. Various forces and influences have been identified in order to understand the journey which has exposed these music forms to the pushing and pulling, to the luring and enticing as well as to the dictatorial attitudes from both the Christian churches and other authorities, both aristocratic and political. At the beginning of the third millennium it appears that neither the Christian churches, the materially wealthy, nor local and/or national political forces, have controls comparable to those of former times on the essence of that which may be considered correct and proper about music. Independent institutions such as universities and specialised institutions of music have, since approximately the middle of the 19th century in the Western world, created and promulgated the now diverse bodies of knowledge on the subject.

This chapter will attempt to outline some reasons why and when the gatekeepers of the knowledge moved from those who controlled with alternative motives in mind, to those who produced regulatory knowledge (Hunt, 1993:317) as a specialty in itself. In other words, the gatekeepers moved from the Christian churches which controlled with spirituality in mind, from the aristocracy who controlled as a result of their own tastes and whims, and from political forces which controlled jazz music with wider concepts of class and cultural values and practices in mind. From these influences the gate-keeping moved to those who

produced the regulatory knowledge, that is, the 'intellectuals' of educational institutions.

In this chapter the Bauman (1987, 1992) works among others, will be drawn on to help explain these shifts in control of musical knowledge. Bauman's critique of postmodernity illuminates, firstly, the demise in the 19th century in Europe of religious, social and political influences and powers, and secondly, the rise in the 20th century of institutions of specialised knowledge. Concepts of 'intellectuals', 'modernity' and 'postmodernity' as described and defined by Bauman (1987, 1992) will be used in order to bring some understanding to why and how institutions of music select what they deem to be appropriate knowledge on the subject. The framework thus established, will be used to address the following questions. Firstly, the question of why the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) has recently introduced a syllabus on jazz music when, since its establishment in Britain in 1889, they have exclusively nurtured classical music, in the broad sense of this term. Secondly, the strata of society from which the people who follow each syllabus are explored. These questions relating to construction of knowledge and to individual music preferences are considered to reflect wider issues in society which involve market forces and consequent standards of living as well as attitudes towards social life.

4.2 Authorities of Modernity

At the beginning of the 19th century British traders were visiting New Zealand shores in search of whale oil to lubricate the machines of the newly industrialised British factories (Belich, 1996:127). The music of, for example, Vivaldi, Bach, Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven, well known at this time in Europe, was unlikely to have been heard in this country to any great extent. Schubert would have been three years old. Chopin, Schumann and Wagner were to be born within the decade. It is likely that Scott Joplin's great grandparents would have been children of black slaves somewhere in the United States of America. The French

Revolution was in the process of up-heaving, forever, the *ancien régime*. The historical period which came to be known as the Enlightenment was well under way. Political, religious and social values in Western Europe were affected as a result of Enlightenment thinking to the extent that towards the end of the 19th century, time itself was nominally differentiated from the past - the word modernity[1] signalled the existence of a different mentality, a different intellectual approach to life and to living.

4.2.1 Effects of the Intellectual Climate of Modernity.

In the latter part of the 18th century, the monarchy, the nobility and the Christian churches in Europe and particularly in France, had reached their maturity as political and social forces of control. A belief - a *modern* belief, was developing that order could be man-made only [sic] (Bauman, 1987:25-27). The divine rights of the nobility and the Christian churches had been totally and bloodily rejected over a period of sixty years of political and social revolution in Europe emanating from France (Hobsbawn, 1962:283-286). Philosophers and scientists, that is, 'thinkers', considered that, as nature itself was unruly, artificial imposition of order was necessary to affect order on the 'natural' chaos (Bauman, 1992:xv-xvi). As human beings were considered to be in a constant state of vulnerability to reverting into the natural chaos, constant supervision and policing was required to maintain this desired order. It was a time of searching, in Europe, for structured knowledge to explain the nature of the world through scientific investigation as opposed to previous explanations which looked to religious beliefs, magical powers and mythical stories. Localised forms of knowledge which attempted to explain human existence were viewed by the 'enlightened' as a social order to be discarded. Local knowledge was considered to be:

[1] Modernity - From the Latin word 'modo' meaning *just now* (Appignanesi & Garratt, 1995:6).

> ... grounded in error, passion–ridden, infested with animal drives, and otherwise resisting the ennobling influence of the truly human - shortly to be dubbed 'enlightened' - order (Bauman, 1992:7-8).

The centralised order, Bauman (1992:xvii) tells us, was brought about by means of 'licensing authorities' which were:

> ... prisons, houses of detention, houses of correction, workhouses, poorhouses, hospitals, lunatic asylums, schools, military barracks, dormitories and factories.

4.2.2 Institutionalised Education

Of particular significance for the centralised and structured knowledge about music is the concept of 'licensing authority' and schools. If music was not to be patronised by either the aristocracy or the Christian churches it followed that, in the search for structured knowledge in modernity, formal institutions developed and earned, through their objective investigations, the power of a 'licensing authority'. This power could be legal in form and/or knowledge-as-truth. For schools, the latter is appropriate.

The 'enlightened' elite of Europe who became the licensing authorities saw themselves as distinguished from the ignorant and superstitious working classes whose knowledge was derived from 'the clergy, old wives and folk proverbs' (Bauman, 1992:9). The self-confidence of the enlightened elite with their knowledge was such that they believed that it was necessary to impose:

> ... disciplining, training, educating, healing, punishing and reforming aimed at categories other than itself (Bauman, 1987:111).

The secular licensing authorities which held the 'knowledge-as-truth' power, that is the schools and institutions, reflected the new scientific regime of truth declared to be 'rational' and 'normal'. They operated as responsible experts in their specialist fields of knowledge. The knowledge, in turn, as power, determined the

understanding of any field (Bauman, 1992:10). Thus, rationalisation of the Enlightenment period shaped that which was to be taught and thus generally known and understood by those considered to be 'in the know' (Bauman, 1992:10). Authorities about knowledge held the right to formalise and, under circumstances, legalise knowledge in light of their own 'superior' knowledge (Bauman, 1992:11).

4.2.3 The Place of Music

Bauman (1992:11) suggests that the knowledge of the licensing authorities was 'uncompromising', 'self-confident', and 'universally binding'. Furthermore, it was vigorously administered by newly found bureaucratic means (see also Foucault, 1991:87-88). These ideas perhaps describe the attitude and mood of the British institutions of music as they were set up in the 1800s. This is not to suggest that the knowledge of music which was identified, bound and presented as absolute was not worthy of special consideration but rather to offer some explanation as to why culturally different understandings of music and their knowledge systems were excluded. By aspiring to a universality of knowledge about music, European institutions generally did not, at this time, recognise their own cultural particularities in relation to musical knowledge. In the wider context, the mono-logic with which knowledge of music was perceived differs little, if at all, from the self-confident manner with which European conquerors, that is, the nobility and the Christian churches, approached all culturally different peoples (Bauman, 1992:13).

The educated European elite, suggests Bauman, (1987:111) used their newly discovered knowledge as the benchmark against which all other classes and races were to be judged, measured and/or classified. Past and the then-present existence of life outside the worlds of this 'elite and enlightened' were considered as either:

> ... retarded, underdeveloped, immature, incomplete or deformed, maimed, distorted and otherwise inferior stages or versions of itself ... (Bauman, 1987:111).

Thus, continues Bauman, (1987:111) the rest of the world was seen as:

> ... problematic ... understandable only in terms of its distinction from the western pattern of development, [which was] taken as normal.

The 'monologic addiction of modernity', suggests Bauman (1992:xxiv), demanded a surrendering of some freedoms of knowledge in order to elevate others. This idea may be recognised in the rules and regulations which made intellectually rationalised classical music more respectable than music which was understood within local knowledge schemes of cultural particularity.

The musical forms of the 'sonata[2], the 'concerto[3] and the 'symphony[4] had developed theoretically, or rationally, through the ideas and inspirations of the major composers throughout the ages. Ballroom dance music, for example, the *minuet, gavotte, bourrée, gigue* and *saraband,* also developed rationally, in form, through the ideas of these composers (Lovelock, 1953:121). Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven and others used a dance style in a particular movement, usually the third, of a sonata, concerto or symphony. (Sets of instrumental compositions, each in the style of a dance became known as the *suite).* Enlightenment reasoning, subsequently, in the licensing authorities of modernity isolated these specific forms of music as worthy of intellectual consideration. The theoretical knowledge in turn became the benchmark, the '*truth*', about music and its form. Other forms of non-European music were deemed by the expert authorities to be less worthy, that is, to have significance only at the level of local culture. Thus, a hierarchy of sounds, form and style was created and, in turn, isolated the knowledge of the

---

[2] Sonata: '... an instrumental work in several movements , arranged like a suite' (Hurd, 1979:305).

[3] Concerto: '... commonly known as a composition in which one, or a small group of soloists show off their skill against an orchestral accompaniment' (Hurd, 1979:98).

[4] Symphony: '... 'sounding together' of the instruments of an orchestra in a composition in several movements – as an orchestral sonata' (Hurd, 1979:320).

dominant European culture based on intellect, from the simple understandings of music based on emotional reaction by the local, 'uneducated' working classes or peasantry and/or non-European societies. This is not to undermine the intellect and musical beauty of the major and relatively minor European forms and styles of music. It is to suggest that the mentality to believe that the 'truth' about music could be found in particular European forms was a Eurocentric view of dominant European cultural norms.

Not only musical form experienced dichotomous segregation of knowledge under Enlightenment scrutiny. Musical instruments were also deemed as 'appropriate' or 'inappropriate' for an approved centralised cultural sound. For example, the balalaika in Russia, the concertina in Europe, the guitar in Europe and North America and the banjo in North America were, and are, instruments of local folk music[5] (Tatchell, 1992:14). Of particular interest is the violin which was, in former times an instrument of gypsy and folk music-making (known as the fiddle) in the Near East, South India, Europe and North America. The fiddle/violin teetered for several decades in the 1700s between classical and folk music before having solo music written for it in the orchestral music of Mozart, Beethoven, Schumann, and others (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B) X, 1980:449). This instrument now has its place in folk, popular and classical music. 'Socially pertinent properties', thus, were attached to the instrument originating in the social image of music composed for them (Bourdieu, 1984:19)

---

[5] Folk Music was defined in Chapter Two as: 'music, usually of simple character and anonymous authorship, handed down by oral tradition and characteristically chiefly of rural communities' (Webster's Encyclopedic Unabridged Dictionary, 1983:551). 'Folk music' in this chapter refers also to the common musical experience of local inhabitants. Folk music may be recognised in the *comparatively* local music of people in, for example, Poland, Russia and Western European countries generally. It is usually monophonic (only one melodic line) with accompaniment of melody by musical instruments (Encyclopaedia Britannica (A) 7, 1980:468) It is likely to involve 'folk dancing', that is, the dances of the ordinary people within the localities, for example, the maypole dance in Eastern Europe or the sword dance in Great Britain (Hurd, 1979:140-141).

4.2.4 Cultural Particularities

To be a 'gatekeeper' of 'appropriate' music requires not only knowledge about music but an awareness of cultural particularities. For example, there is a certain predictability in the music in examination syllabi which is presented each year by the ABRSM and the TCL. Similarly, there is predictability in the instruments which are included in the syllabus. The balalaika or the French accordion, for example, have never been part of the syllabus. Cultural particularities as such, have, in turn, created norms in *this* world of music.

Bauman (1992:3) suggests that cultural norms are affected by three premises. Firstly, human beings are 'essentially incomplete'. By this, it is meant that it is necessary, from birth, to bridge the gap between 'inherited insufficiently and acquired completeness'. Secondly, humanisation is a learning process of acquiring knowledge and repressing animalistic reactions - or, in other words, distinguishing between 'reason' and 'passions'. Thirdly, for Bauman, learning and teaching are inseparable elements in the ongoing reproduction of the human race. In view of these three premises, Bauman argues that human beings are what they are taught to be, and consequently, they exist culturally in large groups in 'a plurality of ways to be human' (Bauman, 1992:3).

This 'thoroughly modern vision of the world', continues Bauman, can be recognised in European thought in the later part of the 17th century and during the first half of the 18th century. It coincided with the 'institutionization of the modern intellectuals' (Bauman, 1992:3). In the European world of music, 'institutionization of the modern intellectuals' did not occur with any significance until the 19th century, as discussed. Nevertheless, knowledge *was* identified and defined as being an absolute truth about music. It distinguished between reason and passion. The resultant knowledge guided musical development. It therefore, put in place cultural norms.

The understanding of cultural norms existing as a result of cultural particularities gave rise to a 'sensitivity to differences', specifically as Europeans travelled and anthropologists documented other cultural existences (Bauman, 1992:4). For

Bauman, the perception of cultural diversity should be seen, not as it was in premodernity when Europeans either ignored or dismissed other cultural particularities as uninteresting, but rather to see other cultural particularities as *induced* differences as opposed to 'God-given' *absolute* differences. In Bauman's (1992:3-4) words, cultural variety should be seen 'as man-made and brought about by the teaching/learning process'.

The 'sensitivity to differences' of other cultural particularities to which Bauman (1992:4) refers has its place in knowledge-schemes. Bauman specifically identifies anthropology and sociology suggesting these disciplines illustrate the idea that Europe:

> ... suddenly opened its eyes to the diversity of cultural modes of life previously unnoticed or considered uninteresting (Bauman, 1992:3).

It has been argued here that other specialised areas of discipline, for example music, have turned a 'blind eye' to music other than that of its own culture, leaving the broader perspective of culturally diverse music to be dealt with under the generic heading of 'ethnomusicology'. The term, by rendering other music forms into a specific field, keeps classical music in a realm of sacrosanctity. This is not to say that there is no place for specialisation in music as exemplified by both the ABRSM and the Trinity College of Music London (TCL) during their approximately one hundred and fifty years of operation. It is to suggest that sensitivity towards other cultural particularities to which Bauman refers, would have prevented classical music as defined by institutions like these, being considered as, or presenting as, the 'absolute truth' about music.

Centralised and institutionalised knowledge, whether sensitive to cultural particularities or not, contrasted with localised knowledge of former times. For example, the modes of regulation (Hunt, 1993:315-316) of premodernity as they were identified within the Christian churches and within the influence of the aristocracy (as discussed in Chapters Two and Three), were localised. By this it is meant that no central force or governing body controlled a main body of knowledge with expected conformity to an understood set of rules. It is with the

modern state, suggests Bauman (1992:7) that centralisation of power was brought about and which, in turn, affected the weakening of localised power, that is, the local power of the Christian churches and the nobility. The modern state and its centralising impetus throughout Europe, the result of the overturning of the *ancien régime* during the French Revolution (1789-1815), marked the beginning of centralised and institutionalised knowledge.

The 'superior' cultural forms survived, suggests Bauman (1992:7). In the world of music the 'superior' cultural form is classical music. It survived without the patronisation of either the Christian churches or the aristocracy *because*, it has been argued, of institutionalisation. It would appear that, except for some forms of European folk-music which accompanied folk dancing, folk music generally - as well as the music of non-European cultures (retrograde from the perspective of the centralised power of institutionisation) - remained in their localities.

To summarise, accepting Bauman's argument that cultural particularities were/are 'man-made' in the first place, musical knowledge as it had been shaped by the influential in society, that is, the Christian churches and the aristocracy in premodernity, became intellectually rationalised within the formal institutions of learning by the 'enlightened', in modernity. This music, 'classical', was the music of the dominant culture. The gatekeepers of the regulated knowledge of music in the centralised institutions of modernity fixed classical music within a concept of truth, of absoluteness, by eliminating the haphazard and by annihilating the spontaneous features (Bauman, 1992:xi) of folk music.

4.2.5 Intellectuals: The Decision Makers

Intellectuals within the world of music are considered to be the gatekeepers of musical knowledge. Through careful scrutiny of the great works, decisions are made by the intellectuals about what will be taught. The educated become the great composers. Therefore, it appears that decision making is serious and

complex, and involves a degree of compromise. This section looks at the origins of intellectualisation and its place within knowledge schemes.

The word 'intellectual' was coined approximately one hundred years ago as an attempt to recapture the authority which the Enlightenment thinkers had held in society (Bauman, 1987:1). The word, says Bauman, was addressed to:

> ... a motley collection of novelists, poets, artists, journalists, scientists and other public figures who felt it their moral responsibility, and their collective right, to interfere directly with the political process through influencing the minds of the nation ...

It was a call, suggests Bauman (1987:1) to 'men of knowledge' [sic] who 'knew' about 'truth, moral values and aesthetic judgement'.

Specific reference has been made in the previous two chapters to one of the three modes of regulation (Hunt, 1993:315-316) that is, to the regulatory process which produces regulatory knowledge. Bauman (1987:4-5) describes the work of 'intellectuals' who produce this knowledge thus. Their work:

> ... consists of making authoritative statements which arbitrate in controversies of opinions and which select those opinions which, having been selected, become correct and binding. The authority to arbitrate is ... legitimized by superior (objective) knowledge to which intellectuals have a better access than the non-intellectual part of society. Access to such knowledge is better thanks to procedural rules which assure the attainment of truth, the arrival at valid moral judgement, and the selection of proper artistic taste. Such procedural rules have a universal validity, as do the products of their application. The employment of such procedural roles makes the intellectual professions (scientists, moral philosophers, aesthetes) collective owners of knowledge of direct and crucial relevance to the maintenance and perfection of the social order. ... Like the knowledge they produce, intellectuals are not bound by localized, communal traditions. They are, together with their knowledge, extra-territorial. This gives them the

> right and the duty to validate (or invalidate) beliefs which may be held in various sections of society.

This lengthy quote emphasises, firstly, the likely seriousness the 'intellectuals' of the ABRSM *needed* to have in order to intellectualise classical music into a graded series of steps, from beginners level to that heard on the concert platform. Secondly, the same degree of seriousness would have been required in order to intellectualise jazz piano music to Grade Five level, as the ABRSM has recently done. Thirdly, this quote suggests that the reason for the necessary sense of responsibility when undertaking such a task is because the rules (about harmony, form, style and technique) surrounding the knowledge which the ABRSM has deemed to be correct and proper are expected to have 'universal validity' (line eight). Therefore these rules are *power* (Bauman, 1992:10). This 'power' is visible in the seriousness with which examination preparation and passing is taken in the many parts of the world where the ABRSM and the TCL operate. This idea will be discussed in Chapters Five and Six.

The lengthy quote has also been included in order to suggest that the actual translation of statements, or knowledge, from one community to another, as has been done with jazz music, must not only be accurate and without distortion as it leaves the alien system, but must also be *understood* within the new knowledge system (Bauman, 1987:5). In order to be understood, it is likely that the jazz music as presented by the ABRSM has been modified between its appropriation from the alien culture and its insertion into the new knowledge system. The question might then become - does the likelihood of modification matter? Perhaps the answer is yes *and* no, as a compromise is the best that can be hoped for anyway. This compromise itself, whilst out of place within the knowledge systems of modernity may have its place in knowledge systems of the 'intellectual climate' of postmodernity. These ideas will be discussed in the next section.

This section has looked at the influences on the development of classical music as affected by the intellectual climate of modernity. The former authority of the Christian churches and the system of patronisation of the arts by the aristocracy,

have been seen to give way to knowledge about music as it has become intellectually rationalised under conditions of central institutionalisation. Cultural particularity, specifically, has been identified as being problematic.

4.3 Gate-keeping within the Postmodern World

The ABRSM and the TCL operated from the onset until recent times, with a 'modern' mentality. This is not to suggest that the classical syllabus is, or has been, problematic. It is to suggest that the invention of the jazz syllabus to exist alongside the classical syllabus may be explained by forces in society which provoke *other* views about what music *is*, and its place in society. It is suggested here that postmodern thinking itself, wittingly or unwittingly, may explain this radical move by the ABRSM.

Postmodernity is described by Bauman (1987:118-119) as:

> ... a distinct quality of intellectual climate ... [which] proclaimed the end of the exploration of the ultimate truth of the human world or human experience.

Its distinction is relative to the absolute nature of knowledge in modernity in the sense that, in postmodernity, objectivity and the 'supracommunal', or the over-arching view of society which aims to explain 'everything', so treasured in modernity, are dissipated in favour of a plurality of logics. Hearing is, thus, given to all the 'local' logic systems (Bauman, 1992:35). The world, continues Bauman, is accepted as being composed of an:

> ... indefinite number of meaning-generated agencies, all relatively self-sustained and autonomous, all subject to their own respective logics and armed with their own facilities of truth-validation.

With a postmodern view of the world of music, classical music may no longer be seen as embodying the absolute truth about music. In the intellectual climate of the

postmodern, classical music must take its place within a plurality of logics about musical sounds. Its superiority, therefore, may only be argued in relative terms. This relativity of superiority invites, indeed demands, not only a surrendering of the dominant position with which the West sees, or perhaps saw, itself, but also an acceptance of the existence of local and parochial significance (Bauman, 1992:35).

It may be difficult to deny, from Bauman's ideas, that the recognition which the ABRSM has given to jazz music is postmodern in essence. However, in view of the similarities between the two genres of music it could also be claimed that the move by the ABRSM to rationalise jazz music according to its own teaching and learning system has some postmodern elements, but the move also parallels the logic with which the centralised institutions of music rationalised classic music in modernity.

Whilst the questioning of the supracommunal perspective of classical music may be a postmodern attitude, the invitation to music of another culture is simply that - 'an invitation to music of another culture'. It is not an opportunity or an invitation to all localised music or to all ethnocentric musics to have their 'alien' logic systems translated into another logic system, as a postmodern view by definition necessitates. In other words, jazz music as it exists in the late 1990s has earned its way into the centralised music of the ABRSM. Other local music forms have not.

The following section discusses some factors in society which may have provoked the acceptance of jazz music within educational institutions which, hitherto, had not only *ignored* its existence but had, subtlety, *deplored* its existence.

4.3.1 Market Forces as Gatekeepers

The self-confidence which came in modernity with the rationalisation which empowered intellectuals, the gatherers of knowledge in the centralised institutions, as the 'collective guardians of societal values', was dispelled during the 20th century. It was dispelled by the rationality of the state and its legal powers

(Bauman, 1992:14). This passing of power from the intellectuals, that is, from the gatekeepers of knowledge to the legal rational powers of the state, is of little interest in this discussion. What is of interest is that Bauman sees this step as different power - power which is moving from the legitimised power of the state to power which emanates from the market place. The power of the market forces as the new rulers of the cultural domain, in Bauman's view, is a variation of the power of the state. This 'market force' power says Bauman (1992:17) is particularly apparent in literature, visual arts and music. Consideration is given here as to *how* 'apparent' are market forces in the world of music.

When cultural particularities were defined and centralised within institutions of education, Bauman (1992:18) argues, it was generally considered 'better' to have a uniformity of cultural knowledge as opposed to localised and diversified cultural knowledge. However, since the market forces comprising publishers, record producing companies and art galleries have centralised an understanding of culture in the worlds of music and art *away* from the intellectuals, the argument for uniformity of cultural knowledge has, within *these* forces, paled. The reason it has paled is because market forces thrive on cultural diversity. Therefore, uniformity is unlikely to be *allowed* to develop (Bauman, 1992:18). It is the materialist face of economic power which is significant here in a gate-keeping role in the world of music. Jazz music, reflecting another cultural particularity, it is argued, has benefited by its promotion through market forces.

Market forces, including electronic recordings, have brought wealth to areas of the classical music world which have hitherto simply survived. For example, to identify a composer or a performer prior to the 20th century who had gained enormous material riches from these occupations is difficult, if not impossible. On the contrary, the last fifty years have witnessed enormous earnings by composers and virtuosos such as Kiri Te Kanawa, Daniel Barenboim, Dave Brubeck and Ella Fitzgerald. Whilst acknowledging the popularity and wealth gained by 'pop[6]'

[6] Popular music is 'produced by professionals for consumption by an urban, nonparticipating mass audience' (Encyclopaedia Britannica (A) 7, 1980:467).

musicians, life at the financial top for most of them is relatively fleeting. For the aforementioned classic and jazz (including popular folk-rock[7]) music performers and composers, popularity and subsequent wealth has been built up and sustained over decades. Mozart and the prima donna (first lady) or the primo uomo (first man) of his performances did not experience this personal or financial success.

An argument has been made that market forces, not the institutions, instigated the popularity of jazz music. However, the popularity in the market place is such that the institutions *became* interested. The question then arises about the extent to which the expansion of the ABRSM to include an entire syllabus covering several years of teaching/learning might be prompted by this institution's need to survive in the market place. If music forms and styles are commodities in the market place, what does this mean for intellectual objectivity? On the other hand, can educational institutions, of either a modern or postmodern persuasion, afford, financially, to not be sensitive towards popular forces, in this case - popular music forces, in society?

Charles Beale, jazz piano examiner from the ABRSM and jazz musician, educator and researcher, when asked if the ABRSM intends, at present, to extent the new jazz piano syllabus replied:

> (W)e're going stage by stage and a lot will depend on how financially successful it is - how far it will go. There's absolutely no reason why it shouldn't go all the way up to diploma level and I can see strong reasons from the organisation why it should.

[7] 'Folk and popular music tended to merge in the 20th century with folk becoming a subcategory within popular music. It is the product of urban professionals who appropriate authentic folk music styles for concert and recorded purposes. ... Folk-rock music arose in North America in the 1960's ... it is modern urban folk song, with topical subject matter, often on social and moral issues. Musically, however, it has the characteristics of rock in its electrified string band and percussion accompaniment' (Encyclopaedia Britannica (A) 7, 1980:467-468).

The 'strong reasons' why it should, Beale implied, were educational in essence but dependent upon financial viability. Financial viability, in turn, is dependent upon market forces as follows.

4.3.2 Leisure and Pleasure

Generally speaking, market forces in the 20th century have come into existence in the Western world as a result of changing economic arrangements which affect philosophical attitudes to work and leisure. For example, in modernity, work, or the contribution to the local community through personal skills of a specific occupation, was the cementing bond of society, opines Bauman (1992:49-50). In postmodernity however, values in relation to work and personal contribution to a community have been replaced by consumer freedom and choice as an identifying characteristic.

The path of work has traversed the early capitalist conflicts between owners and workers, and management and the right to self-management, as well as reflecting increasing expectations of workers to avail themselves of the products which they produce. Freedom from work, in recent times, and the enjoyment of leisure time is reflected in the widespread seeking of pleasurable activities.

In the world of music, if classical music is not a 'socially inherited' cultural norm (Mandelbaum, 1949:309) then, in a postmodern climate, the learning of a musical instrument in the classical manner is likely to be insufficiently pleasurable to pursue as a leisure activity. If the learning of a musical instrument in a jazz, or in a general contemporary manner, fills leisure time pleasurably, then its appeal as a pastime is justified. It may be in the same category as the:

> ... sensual joy of tasty eating, pleasant smelling, soothing or enticing drinking, relaxing driving, or the joy of being surrounded with smart, glittering, eye-caressing objects (Bauman, 1992:50-51).

Michael, a contemporary music (including jazz) piano and keyboard player and teacher perhaps summed up this attitude, by saying:

> (W)ith the experience I've had operating this business - and we've been going for seven years - what I've observed over that period of time is a real shift away from mums and dads and kids wanting to learn a classical instrument. We've got some who are just following the [jazz] syllabus - who are not interested in sitting the exam. A lot of parents make inquires to us - they just don't want their kids to sit exams - they just want them to come and enjoy and learn the language of music - learn how to communicate with it - to express it but not to have an institution placed on it. I think that's very valid. I think that music has to be spontaneous.

Attitudes towards leisure activities, like those expressed by Michael, may be seen as a force within the market place which affects the gate-keeping of the abstract body of knowledge about music. The primary, if not only, function, of these institutions is to examine candidates for musical competency. Therefore, these institutions rely on a general mentality within the world of music which embraces a *need* for *their* credentials. There must be some pleasurable reward in place because - whilst most pupils learn a musical instrument as a leisure activity, examination taking at any level requires personal commitment beyond that which may be found at the level of 'enjoyment'. This idea will be discussed in Chapters Five and Six.

It is possible, furthermore, that musicologists, among other cultural experts, are unable to maintain a singularly rational abstract body of knowledge against the market forces of, for example, the publishers, the record producing companies and the concert promoters. These market forces influence the knowledge sought by the general public who, in turn, patronise the education programmes as offered by the institutions of music. The educational programmes create, firstly, the musicians, secondly, the teachers and most importantly in this argument, the listeners who buy recordings and attend concerts. Therefore, market forces are affected by institutionalised teaching programmes and institutions are affected by market forces.

It has been argued, in this section, that the commercial world, as it operates in market forces, binds the gatekeepers of the knowledge into commercially pragmatic decisions. However, market forces, perhaps fleeting in essence, are influential - not dictatorial. They are, in turn, dependent upon learned 'norms' in society as gained or acquired through education, formal and/or informal. These norms may be identified within imagery of social class.

4.3.3 The New Middle Class: the De Facto Gatekeepers

This section looks, historically, at attitudinal changes in social class which may influence present market forces. In turn, present market forces, it will be argued, affect who, ultimately and conditionally, are the gatekeepers of what may be known about music.

Life in Europe after the 18th century Industrial and French Revolutions offered opportunities for the lower middle class, the *petite bourgeoisie*, which were hitherto impossible under the *ancien régime*. A space between the *bourgeoisie* and the *petite bourgeoisie* was filled, thus, from approximately the middle of the 19th century by the 'new middle class' (Mokrzycki, 1996:186). This social class, at times, is referred to, disparagingly, as the *nouveaux riches* (Adams, 1992:913). It comprised an:

> ... enormous and constantly growing group of increasingly better paid, better educated and efficient managers, technicians, administration employees, scientists, specialists of various kinds and other hired employees with the highest qualifications. ... representatives of professionals, managers, upper- and middle-class officials, teachers and specialists of all kinds (Mokrzycki, 1996:186-187).

This new middle class was not the middle class as understood by the term *'petite bourgeoisie'* - being those who owned a small means of production, for example, a hotel or a shop (Mokrzycki, 1996:187). The common definition of this class of people identified them by income alone and not by lifestyle, education or by the

role played in production. The *petite bourgeoisie* was characterised by its lack of education which, in itself, prompted theoretical explanations based upon practical experience and/or personal empirical observations. Sophisticated explanations, for the *petite bourgeoisie*, were avoided. They were practical people, suggests Hobsbawn (1962:223). Therefore, the intellectualism of classical music is likely to have been of little interest for this group of people. Folk music, fun and emotional sentiment, would have sufficed, generally speaking.

After the dual revolutions of the 18th century in Europe, education and examination-taking by the new middle class, the activities which occupied a prestigious place in traditional society for the *bourgeoisie*, were sought in preference to the anti-social, money-making ventures of the *petite bourgeoisie* (Hobsbawn, 1962:227-228).

Attitudes and priorities of the *nouveaux riches* as well as the *bourgeoisie* may be seen as a controlling influence on the financial success of institutions of musical knowledge and consequently, of the abstract body of knowledge guarded by the gatekeepers within these institutions. The taking of examinations *may* be a priority for both social classes. Leisure and pleasure without stress however, may be a priority for the *nouveaux riches*. This attitude is regarded here as a compromise between embracing *bourgeoisie* values of formal education but without the stress of confronting an examiner.

It is also feasible that the two priorities, that is - the taking of examinations or formal learning without examinations - will exist from time to time within the same stratum of society depending upon personal circumstances. Former attitudes of the *bourgeoisie* which embraced examination passing as the *only* way to respectably learn a musical instrument may, therefore, no longer have respect from *all* teachers, parents and pupils.

These attitudes and priorities themselves, furthermore, are likely to reflect a preference for either classical or jazz music as offered by the ABRSM. Socialisation is likely to affect individual attraction to a particular genre of music. Socialisation itself, therefore, as visible in social class, may invite consideration of

a perception of inequality between the two genres of music within this institution. In other words, it cannot be argued that the *nouveaux riches* and the *bourgeoisie* see each other as social equals. By definition they are socially unequal. The perception of inequality is likely to be reflected in, or bestowed upon, their musical preferences and practices. Consequently, classical and jazz music may be seen as unequal in status, both in society in general as well as understood within the examination syllabus of the ABRSM.

4.3.4 Social Class Priorities

The new opportunities made available through the ABRSM may suggest that the two genres of music, classical and jazz, are equal. This idea is based on the fact that the examination structure and the related credentials which have existed for classical music for over one hundred years has been replicated for, or mirrored by, the jazz music syllabus. An argument is presented here that the two music genres cannot be socially equal because the jazz music syllabus is likely to attract the increasing new middle class, the *nouveaux riches* whose 'socially inherited' (Mandelbaum, 1949:309) cultural norm is likely to include local folk and/or popular music. This social class, it is argued, is more likely to be more interested in the *apparently* less complex and the *apparently* quicker rewards of jazz music as opposed to the *apparently* more intellectually obscure and *apparently* more time-consuming rewards of classical music.

This is not to suggest that either the playing of, or the composition of, jazz music is easier than the playing of, or the composition of, classical music. It is to suggest that jazz music may *appear* to be easier. Perhaps the foot-tapping, 'natural' rhythm of jazz music may lure a would-be musician into some securities, some *false* securities. They are 'false' because lurking behind the obvious rhythm and the not so obvious harmonies, are the centuries-old, highly developed rhythms, and the centuries old, highly developed attitude of improvisation of the African people combined with the African-American 'modes of regulation' (as discussed

in Chapter Three) which caused this music to develop in particular and specific ways.

Charles Beale, jazz piano examiner from the ABRSM, said in an interview which I conducted with him, that he saw the learning of classical and jazz music as intellectually and technically equal. He said:

> (T)here's a big danger [with the jazz piano syllabus] ... a lot of teachers say 'I'm using the music to go on to when they [the pupils] get fed up with classical music' - as though it's the carrot. Actually, it's no easier to play *well* than classical music is and it's just as much work. So if it motivates them why not do it properly - this is my view.

Social class norms and priorities reflected in leisure and pleasure expectations may be visible in how the two music programmes as presented by the ABRSM are patronised. Those parents and pupils who are looking for immediate enjoyment may be disappointed at the slow pace by which the learning of any musical instrument proceeds regardless of the genre. On the other hand, for those who choose the jazz syllabus with dedication, another world of musical rewards awaits.

4.3.5 Teachers in the New Market Place

Although Charles Beale's ideas as presented in the previous section suggested that if jazz music motivates a pianist, then *that* course of learning should be followed, it appears that for some pianists, it is music *per se* which appeals and not necessarily a specific genre. All four jazz teachers who had submitted candidates for the first jazz piano examination in Auckland this year and who agreed to be interviewed for this thesis claim a background of several years of classical music training before showing an interest in jazz music-making. At this point, to recognise social class priorities and attitudes within the world of music becomes confusing. Perhaps it is simply fair to say, firstly, that classical training may be a good basis for jazz music and secondly, none of the teachers interviewed for this

thesis had a choice earlier in their lives between learning jazz or classical piano because the opportunities were not readily available. The following excerpts from interviews which I conducted with classical music teachers who are using the new jazz piano examination syllabus all have in common a specific trait; a curiosity for jazz music-making during the formative years of learning music classically. Michael describes his past:

> (I)'m a contemporary musician. I went through to Grade Seven, Trinity College though as a child. I didn't really enjoy it at all and the love of contemporary music took over - and jazz has always been an influence. When I was about sixteen I had the choice of stopping piano. I didn't have the choice for about eight years or so. At that stage I found a teacher who was prepared to teach me what I was hearing on the radio - showed me how to do transcriptions and those sorts of things and that was the best thing that could have ever happened to me as a musician. I studied classical composition at Victoria [University] for three years so classical music was never the big bad boy - not at all. I never wanted to be a classical musician - even as a child I wanted to be a rock star - as you do ...

Rodney, contemporary music (including jazz) piano and keyboard player and teacher of both classical and contemporary (including jazz) music elaborated on his past:

> (I)'m a jazz-contemporary and a classical pianist - I've always had a foot on either side. I got up to Grade Eight ABRSM - theory also. Mum enjoys music but she is totally non-musical from the point that she's never had any desire to perform. Dad was different. He played the trumpet in the Air Force band and he's always had a great natural feel. He plays a bit of piano - ham-fisted piano because he never had any proper lessons. But he was able to negotiate his way around and get something meaningful out of the piano. So I guess I took my cue from him. I could see him *doing* it - then it takes away the barrier. Nobody actually showed me anything. Just about everything I found out in the early days was discovered by listening and emulating what I heard. I'd think - that's an interesting chord change or sequence of chords so I'd set about trying to work out what it is that they were actually doing. The motivation to do that is basically what enables you to advance as a jazz player. And no teacher can give you that. They can only guide you if you've already got it and point you in the right direction.

Rodney emphasised his point by concluding:

> It's something that you've got to want to do yourself. We've actually got a need to do it because it involves as much listening, sitting at the piano and writing things out and most people can't see the point of it.

Susan, classical music piano teacher with some jazz music training said:

> (I) had done Associated Board [ABRSM] exams all the way along and I switched to Trinity College for the diploma [ATCL]. Yes, I have ATCL. There wasn't much jazz in my background. I'd listened to it but I was quite classically based. But I then went on a course run by the European Piano Teachers' Association which has a faction in London doing improvisation and composition. So I'd come from a place where I'd never done any improvising at all - I was very stuck with the notes and I was very reserved about trying things out myself. But having done that course, it broke the ice. It was like starting from scratch ...

Maria, classical piano and keyboard teacher with some jazz music training, had a similar story to tell:

> (I)'m a classical pianist - classically trained. ... My father was a bit pro jazz ... he sent me for a course of lessons in jazz when I was about fifteen - so I did have a course on jazz for about a year. I've taught classical all my life but I've had some idea of jazz but it wasn't my love. I'm a Suzuki teacher as well. I've done the first unit of teaching and I'm three quarters of the way through the second ... so the aural stuff is familiar to me as well ...

The fifth person who was interviewed for this thesis is presently using the ABRSM jazz piano music as a supplement to other jazz music. Phil Broadhurst, jazz musician, teacher and university lecturer said however, that he intends to enter candidates for the exam next year. Broadhurst also claimed a background in classical music. He said:

(D)id classical for seven years. Yes I did. Then when I got to the teenage years I started fiddling about a bit but I never had a great ear to start with. I wasn't one of those people who was able to pick out whole pieces and just play them as some people seem to be able to do. But I could always pick the tune out very easily and I had a bit of trouble with the chords and the harmonies and stuff so I ended up trying trumpet for a couple of years and then went back to piano at university when the university jazz group needed a piano player.

...There were some jazz records around home and my father was - still is - a dance band piano player - a jazz pianist. So it came from him. He had classical lessons to start with. If you asked him to play the Moonlight Sonata in the style of Oscar Peterson he'd do it. That was never one of my talents.

... I was a jazz enthusiast from about the age of fourteen - it became my passion - helped by the availability of a few discs around the home. I was running into pop music at the time as well as a teenager. I used to listen to Radio Luxembourg late at night and it wasn't until later that I definitely leaned towards the jazz thing. I guess there were no fellow enthusiasts so you were very much on your own. If anything my father was the closest.

... I decided to go to a jazz summer school in Wales after my first year at university - it was heaven - the best two weeks of my life up to that point. Full of people with similar interests playing and talking jazz.

... I gave classical music away for jazz when I tried to play a Chopin Ballade that I loved and - in my mid 20's - and a classical music pianist friend of mine laughed at me and said 'you play it with a jazz feel'. So I gave it away after that. Plus I'm not a very good sight reader - that was always a struggle.

All five contemporary/jazz music teachers not only have a considerable background in classical music, but they have also had exposure, either formally or informally, to jazz/contemporary music in their youth. This group of people may be seen differently to the *nouveaux riches* who, in the main and by definition, without any significant background of classical music, chose to have their children learn to play the piano following the *apparently* easier jazz syllabus.

4.3.6 What is the Product Anyway?

Gatekeepers are forming around two specific genres of music. Market forces have been seen to commodify musical knowledge and appreciation. Attention is thus drawn to the similarities and differences which identify classical and jazz music as sufficiently different in order for the existence of two separate systems of teaching and learning.

Scrutiny of jazz music, particularly as the teaching and learning format is presented by the ABRSM, may reveal it to be ideologically closely related to classical music whilst being historically and philosophically different. Good technique and theoretical knowledge of music remain unaltered expectations of the ABRSM. Rhythmic and improvisational expectations for the jazz syllabus are fundamentally different from the classical syllabus, as would be expected. However, the coming together of classical and jazz music under the auspices of the ABRSM is evolutionary in nature. That is, these two genres are sufficiently similar and also sufficiently interestingly different for both to be intellectualised in separate systems of closely-related knowledge. These separate systems of 'closely related knowledge' are based on the differences which are apparent only through their relative relationship. For example, they are similar instrumentally and relatively different harmonically, rhythmically and philosophically.

4.3.7 Summary

This section has considered music as presented in the examination syllabi of the ABRSM in relation to an intellectual climate of postmodernity. The similarities and differences between the two genres of music as well as the manner with which these factors have been dealt with by the institutions of education, specifically the ABRSM, makes categorical analysis within intellectual climates of either modernity or postmodernity difficult. However, Bauman (1987:119) suggests that it is debatable whether the thinkers of this time actually:

> ... ever articulated to everybody's satisfaction the foundations of the objective superiority of Western rationality, logic, morality, aesthetics, cultural precepts, rules of civilized life ...

Bauman suggests that these thinkers pursued the idea that the objective superiority of Western rationality *would* be found. The question considered, therefore, has been - is the ABRSM still looking for an objective superior rationality about the essence of music even if it has included the music forms, styles and harmonies of another culture? Postmodernity, as an intellectual climate (Bauman, 1987:119), as discussed, characterised by the abandonment of the search having recognised its futility, *may* be the present intellectual climate of some academics at the ABRSM. The inclusion of jazz music on their syllabus *may* therefore suggest that the ABRSM have abandoned their search for the truth about music.

Market forces as a phenomenon existing in postmodern times have been considered in relation to who may be identified as the dominant gatekeepers of the abstract body of knowledge which constitutes 'music'. It has been argued that market forces do not exist independently of factors which may be recognised within social class expectations and identities. The institutions, by informing and educating, bring about critical audiences. Therefore, market forces, social class expectations, and the institutions, functioning on a continuous round-about, all affect the development of music.

4.4 Conclusion

Classical and jazz music have been created and, subsequently, developed throughout centuries of bombardment from authorities which were alien to music as a discipline. But when authorities which specialised in knowledge about music were formed, the process of selection involved specific values which, by essence, excluded most musical forms and styles and elevated a minority of sounds - elite sounds. The centralised institutions nurtured the sounds of the dominant culture to

the point of excluding the majority, that is, the local. The music of the elite dominant culture, by definition must exclude the majority.

Discourses were created, however, in former times by hierarchies of power which still exist, opines Bauman (1987:140-141). These 'hierarchies of power', in the world of music, may be seen as the British institutions of music, the ABRSM and the TCL, as they were formed in the 19th century. After two centuries, Bauman (1987:141) continues, former hierarchies of knowledge are now being threatened because of a general belief in 'plural versions of the truth'. Might the inclusion of jazz music in the syllabus of the ABRSM be a response to a perception of a 'threat' of not considering 'plural versions of the truth'?

This chapter has presented an argument which has suggested that the simultaneous withdrawing of admiration and/or respect for the abstract body of knowledge created by the hierarchical intellectual structures, that is - the ABRSM and the TCL which, wittingly or unwittingly, deemed classical music as superior - and the rise of treasured leisure-pleasure time which encourages satisfaction at an emotional level, has forced these hierarchical structures to broaden their definition of 'music'. It has also been argued that the abstract body of knowledge about jazz music has been created - not simply to justify its presence in the hierarchical institutions, but that its intellectual content was there all the time. As with classical music, jazz music had to be formally rationalised in order to hold a place in an educational institution.

The passing of power from the intellectuals, the gatekeepers of knowledge in the institutions, in the 20th century, to the market forces may be considered to have unintended consequences for the abstract bodies of knowledge which constitute intellectualised music. Mokrzycki (1996:187) suggests that the new middle class, in developed countries, has been estimated to be over 50 per cent of the population. It is this middle class who control the market forces. It has been argued here that jazz music *may* have been institutionalised as a result of some postmodern views by the gatekeepers, the intellectuals, but of equal significance,

jazz music *may* have been institutionalised as a consequence of market forces and the increasing amount of leisure/pleasure time of the new, dominant, middle class.

Chapter Five

Strategies of Socialisation and Disciplinary Devices

5.1 Introduction

A glimpse at the history of classical music in Chapter Two has shown that it developed largely as a result of influences and regulations, both negative and positive, from the Christian churches, European aristocratic society and, as discussed in Chapter Four, from the more recent centralised musical knowledge of institutions. Jazz music, on the contrary, appears to have been nurtured from the despair of the bondage of the African people in the United States of America. The dislocation of the music of the African people to that new land, laws there which prohibited drumming and restricted areas of performance, as well as classist and racist attitudes in general, have not prevented this music from coming to the forefront of Western musical tastes towards the end of the 20th century.

This chapter considers the concepts of *strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices* in order to understand, firstly, how European cultural practices manifested themselves, with ease, into the cultural norms of this country, New Zealand, from the time of the arrival of the first European settlers. Secondly, these concepts are used in order to bring some understanding to the successful operation in this country, of the British institutions of music, the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) and the Trinity College of Music London, (TCL). Thirdly, the concepts of strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices are considered in relation to the motivations and inspirations of music teachers and pupils in this country at the present time. Of significance here, is the recent introduction of the jazz piano examination syllabus from the ABRSM.

5.1.1 Relevance of These Concepts

Strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices within any society may be seen as major forces by which cultural identity is passed on from one generation to the next. Strategies of socialisation exist in the form of education, both formal and informal, which creates and reproduces the 'norms' of any society. In this context, all music-making is culturally specific according to socialisation. The learning of a musical instrument may also be influenced by disciplinary devices which exist specifically and generally in society, as a result of moral beliefs induced through religious philosophies or by mass 'moral' control by political regimes.

The habits and presuppositions which are reproduced through strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices as 'norms' within any culture may be considered as:

> ... tastes, manners, attitudes and life style, their moral codes, religion, stores of knowledge, beliefs and values ... a group sense of common history, identity, future destiny ... stories and symbols that allow people to make sense of the world and their place in it (Beatson & Beatson, 1994:12).

Chapters Two and Three presented the idea that both classical and jazz music have developed throughout the centuries as a result of specific and authoritative modes of regulation. Within these modes of regulation as identified, exist motivating factors, or powers, which enable these regulations to reproduce themselves *ad infinitum*. The concepts of strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices help identify forces which hold in place motivating conditions for the development of both classical and jazz music.

An understanding of 'culture' is necessary in order to identify these two concepts within living practises. Culture may have at least two different meanings. Firstly, 'culture' may refer to:

> ... any socially inherited element in the life of man [sic], material and spiritual (Mandelbaum, 1949:309).

The major 'socially inherited elements' are understood, in this text, to be the key features which provide a general cultural identity for large populations of people. Two of these key features are considered to be particularity of language and affiliation with major religious philosophy. For example speaking Arabic and living in a country where Islam is the dominant religion makes a cultural identity distinct from those who speak English and where Christianity is the dominant religion. Music, in this text, however, is considered to be a major 'socially inherited element of life'. The backgrounds of classical and jazz music as discussed in Chapters Two and Three, distinctly located classical music within Western European cultural identity and jazz music within black American cultural identity.

However, 'culture' is also understood to mean 'refinement' (Bauman, 1992:6) or a deeper understanding and appreciation of some of the *socially inherited elements* which, for whatever reasons, have been deemed worthy of such consideration (Mandelbaum, 1949:309). This concept comes from an imagery of, for example, a farmer cultivating the land in order to produce better crops (Bauman, 1992:8). The suggestion is that something is 'consciously regulated and given deliberately selected shape'. It refers to something that people *do.* 'Culture', in this context, is the presence of specific standards of behaviour, spheres of understanding and appreciation of knowledge, and/or the possession of specific material assets. This understanding of culture pinpoints the idea of *acquisition* as opposed to inheritance. In this context, associations may be made with achievement as the result of educational institutions. These institutions may be both formal and public, for example, a school or tertiary institution, and informal and private, for example, the family.

Within the broad and inescapable *inherited* cultural identity as described, exists, in sharper and narrower focus, 'culture' or refinement which may be *acquired.* By this definition, a 'cultured' person is likely to be:

> well educated, polished, urbane, enriched above his [sic] 'natural' state, ennobled (Bauman, 1973:6-7).

The discussion in the following section is based on the premise that European music is the dominant music of New Zealand culture. A broad distinction is made between 'European' music which may include all forms of music which are able to be codified in the system of musical notation and jazz music and its defining element of African-American improvisation.

5.2 Cultural Dominance

The concept of *cultural dominance* as discussed in this chapter, looks at European 'classical' music as a music 'norm' in New Zealand because it is a major 'socially inherited element' (Mandelbaum, 1949:309) of cultural identity. The teaching and learning of the piano in particular, since approximately 1850, is discussed because of its constant popularity as a musical instrument. The premise of the discussion is to consider the different philosophical attitudes which have occurred as a result of strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices in order for the learning/teaching of classical music, and recently, of jazz music to have occurred.

5.2.1 Historical Context

The centralisation of musical knowledge within the two British institutions, the ABRSM and the TCL, in the 1800s, set non-localised standards for teaching and learning about music. They were 'non-localised' because, unlike other formal institutions of musical knowledge in Europe at the time, they operated from their beginnings, beyond their immediate locality. For example, the first examiners from the ABRSM visited New Zealand in 1889, the first year of its operation in Britain. This was a little more than 40 years after the first Catholic women missionaries arrived in this country from Ireland and initiated teaching methods

and attitudes which made them the gatekeepers of musical knowledge in New Zealand from that time until approximately the 1970s.

Why should women who came to this country from Britain for the purpose of introducing Christianity to Maori, whom they deemed as 'heathen', have knowledge of music to the extent that they became the gatekeepers of the musical knowledge from their arrival here in 1836 until recent times? Music, alcohol, tobacco and similar narcotics are purported to be the most used aids to mental devotions to higher spirits in former times (Weber, 1965:1-3). Whilst it may be of dubious meaning to define music as a narcotic, it is useful to note that alcohol and tobacco were not a choice for these women. Music only, aided the otherwise emotionless spiritual practice of worshipping 'God'. Hence, music as taught by the sisters carried with it duties of striving for an understood state of perfection in all aspects of performance and presentation.

At the time of the arrival of the first Catholic missionaries to New Zealand in the 1840s, the piano was at the height of its popularity as a domestic instrument in Europe. The piano for the early settlers in this country represented middle-class European values which they had either left behind or, perhaps, aspired to. Loesser (1954:429) describes the attraction to the piano thus:

> (B)y the mysterious magnetism of success - people in other parts of the world felt urged to imitate the habits of Northwest European city dwellers. Southern Europe, Eastern Europe, Russia, Latin America, Australia, South Africa, India, Japan and the Philippines bought pianos from France and England ... from Germany. (E)very family that considered itself above "working class" level owned one, or aimed to own one and to let its daughters learn to play a little.

Indeed, the first Mother Superior (Mother Cecilia) of the Mercy Sisters in this country stipulated that a music room furnished with a piano had to be part of every new convent (Clausen, 1993:9). This stipulation however, does not necessarily reflect a love of music which the sisters may have had. It reflects their need to earn

a living. As the religious communities of the sisters[1] were not paid to teach at school, which was their main activity as missionaries, they depended on a stipend from the local parish. Income was derived soon after their arrival, from taking girls as boarders into their communities and from teaching them, and others, about music, painting and needlework (Burke, 1978:7). Music teaching was to become their speciality.

The following excerpts from recent interviews (indicated as anonymous where referred to as Sr Mary 'A', 'B' or 'C') are intended to illustrate that the Catholic sisters taught music from their arrival until approximately the late 1950s, in order to support themselves physically. Sr Mary A, who taught piano for approximately forty years in the mid 20th century recalls their attitude in earlier times as follows:

> (W)e depended on the income in the early days. Most convents had at least one music teacher, and maybe four or five school teachers. But the music teachers also helped with the music at the school and with the church music - of course. Music was our life. It wasn't just a job. It was part of your religious life and your job. And you were helping people as well. The early sisters also taught tapestry. That's how they made money.

Sr Mary B, retired piano teacher explained:

> (W)e used to say we were the breadwinners - then it went to the dripping because the school started earning more money. We had to buy everything - food, maintenance. So they depended on music and the boarders for an income.

[1] Sisters and Nuns: 'Within Roman Catholicism vows of poverty, chastity, and obedience are taken by women entering the religious life. According to Roman Catholic canon law, only women living under solemn vows are nuns; those living under simple vows are more properly called sisters. Nuns in the strict sense, normally live a strictly enclosed, or cloistered, life, while sisters normally are engaged in non-cloistered, active work (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B) VII, 1980:442).

In a similar vein, Sr Mary C, retired piano teacher said:

> (T)he sisters practically lived on what was earned through music teaching. School teachers earned a small fee. Many sisters taught in the schools in the early days without any qualifications. But in the last thirty years or so all our teachers have been qualified. We were a pioneering country - we had to start right from the ground.

5.2.2 Obedience: A Way of Life

In order to understand why the women who came to this country from Britain for the purpose of introducing Christianity to Maori became the gatekeepers of musical knowledge, an attempt is made here to understand their attitude to music teaching. The way of life of the professionally religious women relied upon the uniform obedience of all the sisters in order for the community to function. Obedience itself was one of the professional vows of their religious community[2]. The minds of the sisters were self-disciplined to reject worldly distractions which affected their 'soul' or inner self. The self-discipline was put in place by their spiritual faith as well as the religious rituals which encouraged constant scrutiny of conscience in order to maintain the vows. The sisters thus, strove to give their soul or inner self over to fulfilling the obligations imposed upon it by authoritative figures, that is - by the Catholic Church and ultimately 'God'. The discipline which the sisters displayed in their dedication to teaching music among their other duties, may be explained by Weber's (1958:80) concept of 'the calling' whereby every-day worldly activities are given a religious significance which, it is believed, has rewards in an after life (Weber, 1958:109-112).

[2] 'Religious communities in the Roman Catholic Church are groups of men or women who live a common life and pronounce vows of poverty, chastity and obedience' (Encyclopaedia Britannica (A) 15, 1980:991).

Sr Mary Joan, teacher of piano and singing, discussed the importance of the idea by pointing to the case of a former colleague of hers, Sr. Mary Leo[3]. Uniform obedience for the benefit of the religious community as a whole, is illustrated by the story of this internationally renowned music teacher who was already a school teacher when she entered the convent at the age of twenty-eight, but had hoped to become a nurse. However, Sr. Mary Leo's talents resulted in instructions from the Mother Superior of the convent to specialise in music teaching. Sr. Mary Joan added that she too had hoped to become a nurse when she entered the convent. However, she already held an Associate of the TCL (ATCL) diploma and was also instructed to teach music. Sr. Mary Joan said:

> (I)t was a matter of the need of the Convent as a whole. I just accepted that I was going to teach music.

This concept of discipline through self policing dislocates effective past in favour of effectual future through socialising tactics which create new norms. In other words, the individual capabilities of the sisters as they entered the convent were reviewed by their superiors with a wider perspective of the community in mind. In turn, discipline through self-policing ensured that the wisdom of the superiors was given every chance to succeed. It may be useful here to consider Foucault's (1995:195-227) concept of 'panoptic' discipline which focuses on 'the gaze' through which authoritative forces peered, in the 17th century, at the lives of citizens in an attempt to constrain or confine the insane, the wicked or the physically ill. This concept sees authoritative knowledge as a controlling device whereby new norms are imposed as a result of the power of knowledge itself. It invites an understanding of the authority of the superior sisters, that is - the

[3] Sr. Mary Leo, (1895-1989): New Zealand national icon and an internationally renowned teacher of singing (Lovell-Smith, 1998:173).

'mothers' of the religious community. Their knowledge about the functioning of the religious community may be recognised thus as a controlling device whereby new norms for the incoming sisters were created. Furthermore, discipline through self policing may describe the higher authority of the Catholic Church. Based on its own belief of infallibility (Encyclopaedia Britannica (A) 15, 1980:995) the Catholic Church declared that it possessed arcane knowledge about life and death and, consequently, used the knowledge to discipline the lives of practitioners of the faith in general. Life after death, it was taught, was either in 'heaven', 'purgatory' or 'hell' according to the state of a 'soul' at death. As the moment of death could present at any second without a chance to confess one's sins and receive absolution[4], self discipline in order to be sin-free was important (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (A) 15, 1980:995-996).

This rationality of discipline has its origins in Europe in the Middle Ages where the search for freedom through rationalised disciplined behaviour and habits as a result of being free of 'irrational impulses' became the fundamental religious philosophy for those who took monastic vows (Weber, 1958:118-119). Weber argues that it was believed that only a life guided by constant moral thought could achieve conquest over the state of nature.

5.2.3 Discipline: Effects on Music Teaching

Weber's concept of 'rational discipline', as described, may be recognised in the manner with which the Catholic sisters taught music as remembered by those who were pupils during the middle years of the 20th century. For the sisters, teaching the subject of music involved following the examination system as prescribed and presented by the respected and centralised authorities, the British institutions of

[4] Absolution: 'In Roman Catholicism, ... absolution grants release from the guilt of sin to the sinner who is truly contrite, confesses his [sic] sin to a priest, and promises to perform satisfaction to God' (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B), I,1980:32).

music. There was no place for 'irrational impulses' (Weber, 1958:118). These may be described, in this context, as the learning of frivolous and/or popular music *simply* for personal pleasure or leisure; or, perhaps worse, playing the approved music aurally, that is - playing without carefully observing the codified system of notification and ornamentation.

It is argued here, that the sisters obediently followed the syllabus as provided by the British institutions of music in the same manner that they adhered to their religious vows and to the expectations of moral living as decreed by Catholicism itself. In turn, the sisters expected their pupils to obey their instructions about 'how to play' a musical instrument. A flaw, it is argued, lay in the belief that the knowledge as presented by the institutions of both music and religion was absolute and thus, not open to the subjectivity of individual interpretation. It could also be argued, however, that the belief of the sisters in the absoluteness of the knowledge as presented by the institutions of music was their strong point. The sisters achieved excellent examination and public performance results with many of their pupils as judged by the British institutions and the wider world of music.

It is noted here that it appears that non-religious music teachers taught in a similar manner. The sisters are referred to in this text because it was they, as a community, who dominated music teaching for approximately one hundred years from the time of their arrival in the 1830s.

The following excerpts from recent interviews illustrate some perceptions of both teaching and learning under these circumstances. Sr. Mary Joan, teacher of piano and singing, said that the success of performers was something which brought 'special joy'. Sr. Mary Joan described a particular occasion:

> (O)ne of my pupils, Tracey King has sung at Convent Garden with Malcolm McNeil and Kiri Te Kanawa when they had a New Zealand night.

Doreen, former prize winning pupil, national singing performer and teacher of singing and classical piano interpreted some memories:

(I)n boarding school the sisters were quite severe with discipline and you learned to discipline yourself. Eventually I think that if you've never been disciplined then you don't know how to do it. If you were told to learn something by next week you'd be anxious all the time until you thought it was all right. They were not performers themselves. Therefore, when their pupils performed well they were so proud of you - and of what they could produce. They put everything into teaching. Your success was their success.

Sally, former pupil of Sr. Mary Leo and teacher of singing also looks at the sisters with fond hindsight:

(T)he Nuns were focused. They didn't have 'phone interruptions, or meals to worry about ... jumping into the car with kids to go here and there, cleaning the toilet. They were breadwinners but they'd get up every morning, pray to God and teach singing and be a bit of a psychological person to all of us. But they were totally focused on teaching.

Sr. Mary Joan indicated how the sisters regarded the subject of music teaching in its entirety. She described how the sisters took, and still take, an interest in every detail including the physical presentation for an examination or a concert. Sr Mary Joan said:

(I) always say to them 'you look nice in your school uniform if you like - as long as it's clean and pressed.' Otherwise I say 'you can wear your party frock or your Sunday best.' Sister Leo and I would both want to see what the girls would wear for their performance exam. Sister Leo would always say that girls should never wear short frocks up on a stage when they're singing. And if they couldn't afford it she'd get one for them. I sometimes teach them how to dance, for example, the minuet. I think they've got to know these things. How can they interpret them if they can't dance themselves? It's the same with performance diploma students [defined on pages 136-137). I have one who is also a medical student. I say to her you have to be a performer. The way you walk out and the way you address the examiner and the way you stand up and give your little talk about whatever items you're going to play - it's all important - it's part of the exam.

Although the sisters taught music for financial reward, their personal religious beliefs based not only in Catholicism itself, but in the disciplines of their lives as professionally religious people, is evident in these excerpts. The purpose of Catholic religious music was to reflect the glory of God and inspire the human mind to spiritual praise and worship (as discussed in Chapter Two). In turn, music was taught by the sisters in this country, perhaps others, embracing similar values. Neither time nor energy was afforded to the frivolous. The pupils who were taught by the sisters, either in the music studio or the class-room, were conditioned in all areas of life to endure difficulties in order to grow spiritually. For those pupils who responded to the standards expected by the sisters, all was well. The necessary discipline of the self which 'requires a training in the minute arts of self-scrutiny, self evaluation, and self regulation ...' (Rose, 1990:222) was in place.

If, however, self-monitoring and self-disciplining as a result of 'the gaze' (Foucault, 1995:195-228) succeeded in relation to musical instrument learning, most people who attempt this activity would succeed to some degree. This does not appear to be the case. For those pupils who did not enjoy the prescribed music, both teaching and learning appears to have been an unpleasant experience. For others, these methods of teaching provided the platform from which they were launched into the competitive world of being a musician.

Former pupils of the sisters recall memories of learning experiences with the sisters as follows. All interviewees are teachers of either singing or piano.

Anne, teacher of piano, emphasised the discipline imposed by the sisters upon their pupils stating that *this* factor, in their teaching methods, is what made them unique. Anne's opinion is:

(T)hey used the same method for everybody whether it suited them or not. It was a system whereby exams were prepared for - one after the other. That system was in place and pupils either survived that system or dropped out. The Convents had the reputation for teaching well. But in fact many of the teachers were not good, not even qualified. They used cynicism and sarcasm as a way of teaching. Praise was not part of their methodology - they believed this would lead to contentment or even a big head. This has left Convent girls with constant feelings of guilt based on personal inadequacies ... especially in musical performance.

Anne returned to have music lessons with the sisters when she was 21 (in the 1960s) in order to prepare for her first diploma. Remembering the experience, Anne said:

(T)hat old Nun had me in tears and I was 21. She couldn't believe what I didn't know. She got so angry with me one day... more frustrated I suppose. I remember thinking - what a dip stick I am. I'm 21 and the Nuns have got me crying.

Sally, (former pupil of Sr. Mary Leo and teacher of singing) described the discipline which she experienced as an adult pupil:

(K)iri and I were together - Malvina was a couple of years ahead. But there were no big stars among us. We were all in the choir - Sister Leo's choir was for the training, the discipline. If you moved, touched your nose for example, you'd have to apologise ... 'Sally, come out here ... apologise to the choir. You disrupted that entire performance.'

When asked if she, in turn, has taught like Sister Leo, Sally replied:

(V)ery much so. I can hear her over my shoulder constantly - the remarkable training and the discipline that we were taught was a wonderful thing but it's rather hard to pass on to the young ones now. They don't realise the strictness and the good training that we were given - not just in singing but in performance, appearance, walking onto a stage. I can remember - I used to get three buses to my lesson - then the entire lesson might be just listening to somebody else. Nowadays the pupil would probably say - 'I'm paying for this lesson.'

Sally reminisced further on her experience of learning music with the sisters in the 1950s:

> I can remember all the top international artists that used to visit Auckland in those wonderful days when there was a lot of live theatre and they all used to go up to Sister Leo's - and I'd get a message - a phone call to the hospital - I was a Karitane nurse, 'Would Nurse Rush come' ... then [Sr. Leo would say] 'I want you to come here at ten o'clock tomorrow morning'. There was no mucking around. You didn't say 'I'm tired, I'm busy, I've got an exam' - you just went. So the discipline that she instilled into you was for your own good. It was wonderful. And you'd turn up and it would be Rita Streich or Elizabeth Schwarzkopf. And you were allowed to sit down on the ground and watch them sing or they'd talk to you. Such wonderful opportunities like that which I could only dream about providing for my pupils nowadays. Malvina [Major] - or other star pupils - would sing and it would be part of my lesson to offer criticism - then I would have to sing and somebody would criticise me - all of that sort of thing made me very self-disciplined and it made you very aware of this criticism as **helpful**.

Fran, singing teacher and local performer also had support for the sisters when she said:

> They were wonderful spiritually - they were so in touch with their souls. People criticise them but it was only the odd one who hit the kids - and there were hundreds who did not.

Gabrielle, teacher of piano, had some positive and negative memories of music tuition with the sisters:

> (M)other [X], a darling, with gnarled old fingers. But she'd hit my little finger if it wasn't curved - she'd pull at it - she'd hit it with a ruler or a pencil - and I learnt. It also got my general attention. They were disciplinarians and had very high standards. You were terrified of them if you didn't practice. But their quiet persistence and patience kind of rubbed off on you.

To summarise, it appears that whilst the sisters were personally fixed into self-disciplining habits as a result of the effects of uniform *obedience* as described by Weber, (1958:118-119) they were also attempting to *control* others as a result of *their* gaze through *their* knowledge (Foucault, 1995:195-199) about 'how to' play a musical instrument.

Within this mentality springs the need for rules and regulations, for rationalised discipline which will ultimately lead to self discipling and self monitoring in order to be deemed 'normal'. It may not be surprising, therefore, that some authority, in this case the British institutions of music in the 19th century, devised a structured framework for the teaching and learning of musical instruments involving the most dignified or intellectual of compositions as well as studies, scales and arpeggios to be played in a manner which would not provoke human emotion in the form of spontaneous rhythmic movements of, for example the feet or the head. The world of classical music teaching/learning at the time, whether professionally religious or secular, welcomed this structured system of learning as well as the regular examining possibilities as offered by the institutions. The system confirmed the idea that *absolute knowledge* ***existed*** and ultimately, if a person did the 'right' thing, that person would be able to 'play' a musical instrument.

The recollection of teaching methods and attitudes of the Catholic sisters, has been presented to emphasise their exceptional effect upon, and contribution to, classical music development in this country. It is not to ignore the teaching by Protestant or non-religious teachers who also aspired to the expectations of the British institutions of music. However, unlike the Catholic sisters, they are not identifiable as a group.

5.2.4 The Present Time

In the 1990s, approximately one hundred and fifty years after the establishment of the ABRSM and the TCL, the rules and regulations from the British institutions changed noticeably for the first time. Firstly, in 1996 the TCL included the

electronic keyboard and appropriate music for that instrument in its examination syllabus[5]. (Discussion about this syllabus has not been included in this thesis). Secondly, however, and of more significance in this text, is the ABRSM's presentation, in 1999, in this country, of the first series of examination syllabi for jazz piano. The electronic keyboard syllabus and the jazz music syllabus are, in effect, an acceptance by the British institutions of music, of music-making through improvisation as opposed to imitation. It is a major philosophical change from that which has been deemed as appropriate music by these institutions since their inauguration in the mid 1800s.

The philosophical differences between the two music genres represent the different class, ethnic and religious origins of each music. For example, classical music represents European middle/upper class Christian values and aristocratic expectations, whilst jazz music represents African, lower class, secular life styles with connections to European Protestant Lutheran musical preferences.

Socialisation, which creates cultural diversity in the first instance, is reflected in values placed on these different music genres by those who have some authority on the subject of music. A chasm does exist between the intellectually controlled interpretation of respected composers and the non-existence of originality within each performance (unless it can be justified within the intention of the composer) in classical music and the emotional and composite freedom within a performance which instigates originality on every occasion in jazz music. How then, was it to be decided, and by whom, that classical music was appropriate within formal education whilst jazz music, until recently, was not?

[5] An electronic keyboard is a technical variant of the piano. The pushing of buttons affects accompanying electronic sounds. As such, one may learn to play the piano in a conventional manner, whether classically or in the jazz genre, and learn to push the appropriate buttons to create a desired sound. Electronic keyboards differ enormously from each other in their electronic capabilities. They have not been included in this discussion because they are considered to be musically tangential.

It may not be surprising that the British institutions of music nurtured the music dominant in the upper echelons of society, that is, classical (as defined on page 4) for over 150 years (Bourdieu, 1984:14-18). It must be understood that in this context 'classical music' refers broadly to music of the eras known as baroque[6], romantic[7] and the 'classical' compositions of the 20th century[8] as well as the 'classical' era of the 1700's. Bourdieu, in his discussion about the 'aristocracy of culture' says that - as any society must have one dominant culture, a person's social success will depend on his/her relationship to that dominant culture (1984:11-18). By this, Bourdieu is suggesting that the closer one is to embracing, understanding and/or appreciating the 'best' of the dominant culture the more status, or personal success one is *seen* to have. In Britain, music, which as a result of socialisation was to be understood as 'the best', was to be found in the formal institutions.

However, Bourdieu also suggests (1984:2) that:

> (A) work of art has meaning and interest only for someone who possesses the cultural competence, that is, the code, into which it is encoded.

---

[6] Baroque music: '(A)pplied to the elaborately fanciful 17th and 18th century architecture of Germany and Austria and, by association, nowadays to the German and Austrian music of the same period (e.g. that of Bach ...)' (Ward, 1977:48).

[7] Romantic music: '(T)his word is applied in music to the works of the period of Weber, Mendelssohn, Schumann, Chopin, Wagner, Berlioz, Liszt, and so on, in which the expression of emotion takes precedence over the element of beauty of form (though this is not necessarily or generally absent).' ... (Ward, 1977:491).

[8] 20th Century 'classical' music: includes music which expresses international tensions between the two world wars, economic depression, fascism, rebellion, experimentation towards moral, political, social and economic issues. In latter years of the twentieth century contemporary classical music was heard as film music by first-rate composers in all countries. Technological advances improving the fidelity of recordings and increasing the size of the audience are significant to the success of 20th century classical music (Grout and Palisca, 1988:807-808).

Jazz music has been ignored in Western cultural practices until recently because Western culture has had little interest in 'decoding' it. However, jazz music, as a result of those in Western culture who have decoded it, has come to the fore of music enjoyed by the dominant class. The ABRSM, as a major international institution of music among other localised institutions of tertiary music education, has, recently, been doing the 'decoding'.

But the ABRSM, or any institution, cannot simply make a declaration about the 'worth' of any music. Within society as well as within institutions, the 'left-bank intellectuals' (Bourdieu, 1984:291-292) that is, those who show a preference for the new, are likely to be 'decoding' the phenomenon for considerable time before the essence of its content it presented as a commodity of intellectual significance.

The logic behind the attitude which nurtured classical music and dismissed jazz music as being irrelevant or inferior may have foundations in racism itself as well as in cultural habits as seen in the concept of social class. For example, the racist 'black' versus 'white' cultural perceptions of what is 'progress' (hooks [sic], 1992:1) and classist images of the concert hall being perceived to be a socially superior music venue (Small cited in White, 1987:8) to a night club may have influenced perceptions about musical worth of the two genres. Music which has been intellectually analysed and accurately transcribed onto paper, fits with the rationality of Enlightenment thinking and may shroud classical music with the prestige of intellectualisation as opposed to music which gave the general air of spontaneity and which had associations with 'drug addiction, alcoholism, venereal disease, gambling ...' as jazz music had in the 1920s in New Orleans (Tirro, 1993:140).

5.2.5 Summary

From a perspective of cultural particularities, an understanding has been made of the changing attitudes to music teaching and learning in this country since the arrival of the first European settlers. Strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices which exist within particular cultural norms *outside* the world of music

have been seen to have had a considerable effect *inside* this world. The recent formal presentation of jazz music in the examination syllabus of the ABRSM has highlighted the idea that cultural particularities as they are normalised by strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices, have far reaching effects in the world of music.

5.3 The Formal Institutions of Musical Knowledge

The major British institutions of music, the ABRSM and the TCL, promote classical music through their educational programmes in many parts of the world (see pages 31-32). Strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices, as concepts, are considered in this section in order to understand the successful functioning of these institutions as examining bodies and as gatekeepers of the abstract body of knowledge about music in Western culture. It is argued here that these institutions rely on certain social norms and certain methods of inculcation in order for knowledge, as constructed within this institution, to perpetuate itself. This perpetuity is discussed as it relates to both teaching practices and learning habits in the following related sections.

5.3.1 Reciprocal Understandings

The occupation of classical music teaching, largely dependant upon and influenced by the British institutions for its structured learning programmes, is controlled by specific values which have been deemed worthy by these schools. For example, rules, instructions and musical interpretation of the set works must be followed, within reason, otherwise invalidation, disqualification or failure of the candidate will occur. Choices within the set pieces in the chosen grade must be observed. The system of the institutions, thus, replicates itself by teachers who obey the directives of the schools by imparting selected knowledge to students - some of whom eventually become the obeying teachers.

But how might the institutions ensure that their programmes are sought after by the teachers? Rose's (1999:3) reading of Foucault's (1991) work on 'governmentality' may aptly describe the ABRSM's strategy for the new and major change in its teaching programme as well as the success of the programmes of the past. For Rose (1999:3) the concept of 'governmentality' refers to:

> all endeavours to shape, guide, direct the conduct of others, whether these be the crew of a ship, the members of a household, the employees of a boss, the children of a family or the inhabitants of a territory.

Rose sees conduct-shaping strategies, which ultimately lead to governing oneself, as taking place through:

> ...invention, contestation, operationalization and transformation of more or less rationalized schemes, programmes, techniques and devices which seek to shape conduct so as to achieve certain ends.

Here, the entire functioning of the ABRSM is described from the 'invention' of an examination syllabus, the 'contestation', that is - the creation of syllabi acceptable in the public sphere, its predictable and reliable 'operationalization', its 'rationalised schemes' or stratified framework of diverse origins, for a graduated path of learning and with the 'conduct shaping' resulting in some sort of musical performance skills. This observation is made to suggest that attractive and worthwhile programmes of learning are in place. Consequently, a satisfactory relationship exists between the teachers and the institution and, in turn, the conditions are set for a satisfactory relationship between the teachers and their pupils. 'Imbrication', (Foucault, 1991:93) or overlapping of power of the institutions, the teachers and their pupils, is required in order for the whole system to function. The relationships, therefore, are reciprocal in essence.

There is also a direct relationship, albeit a brief but intense one, between a pupil and an examiner in a practical examination. This relationship is formal, objective and, most importantly, judgmental on the part of the examiner. However, examinations are usually regarded as unpleasant ordeals as Michael, who sat

classical music examinations to Grade Seven approximately fifteen years ago remembers:

> I think that for the student getting over the threshold is enough. It was for me. It wasn't a case of passing - there were times when I was just bloody relieved to have got through it. It was revolting. I didn't enjoy it at all.

When asked about how he thought that his pupils were going to cope in the examination room playing jazz piano, Michael replied:

> (I)'ve got concerns about that. I don't know. I hope they've put some thought into that because it's hard for me having gone through the classical system and knowing the way to behave and what to do and what not to do. I hope they don't apply many of those rules to this setting because the music is so different. That crossed my mind with a bit of a concern and it's very hard. It's an exam though, and it's to be graded on something. At the concert hall you don't get this stamp of 65% or whatever - it's so spontaneous - that's the whole tradition - and you're now putting a framework on it.

Susan, who sat classical music examinations to ATCL level approximately ten years ago and who sat the jazz piano ABRSM exam recently in England, had some insights:

> (I) can remember taking classical exams when I was younger. It was such a nerve-wracking experience. It [the jazz exam] was great fun. It was much more relaxed [than classical music exams]. You didn't have to dress up quite so formally [for the jazz exam]. I actually wore my jeans. It was so different. They were really nice - they made an effort. The examiner was relaxed and smiling and said - 'When you're ready'. The whole demeanour of the examiner was different. The pieces were great fun.

Rose (1999:73) locates, historically, a number of disciplinary devices in society which may be considered as the forerunners to examination taking - the seeking of approval from authority. He says 'government through the calculated administration of shame' as a result of self-disciplining through the imposition by guards and attendants of specific standards of dress and behaviour in public places

such as 'museums, exhibitions and departmental stores' provokes self-awareness. This self-awareness may be to the point of anxiety for those who recognise that, for whatever reason, their dress, demeanour or behaviour does not conform. To take this idea into the world of music, the anticipation of *not* performing well in front of an examiner from 'the institution', that is - the perceived if not the *actual* guardian and upholder of 'the' knowledge, is likely to cause a pupil to either practice more diligently and excel, or to not play well in the examination because of the state of 'nerves', or, ultimately, to not present for examination at all.

It appears that the ABRSM is aware of the stress which is induced by the examination procedure and has taken specific steps to make the event a fair assessment of the candidate's ability at the same time as giving the candidate every opportunity to perform well. The following is from an interview with the ABRSM's jazz piano examiner, Charles Beale, who examined the candidates for the first jazz piano examinations, in New Zealand, in October 2000.

> (W)e spend a lot of time at the Board working on inter-personal skills. We literally have analysts come in and work with us specifically on verbal and non-verbal contact approaches to making the exam more welcoming. And it's very rare that a candidate will come out without a smile these days - even with the classical exams. There was a phase about ten - twelve years ago when anybody who examined like that [in an excessively formal manner] were literally ***out***. They were simply not asked to do the work anymore. So that's the general context that the Board [ABRSM] is working in now.
>
> ... As far as the jazz is concerned I'm responsible for the examiner training. I do a lot of work specifically with the jazz examiners on things like counting in. We count them [the candidate] in to all the tests. ... Everything from where to put the desk in the room, how to dress, it's casual dress and I always take my jacket off... . The classical exams are no different in this respect. The main thing is that when a candidate comes out of the exam room they've done their best and if we've done *anything* to get in the way - then we're not doing a good job. So if we're creating an environment where the candidate feels that there's hostility or that the examiner is bored with what they're doing ... . There are certain areas when you're examining that you have to be very careful about. One is eye contact, for example - at the end of a piece it's very, *very* important to look up and smile and acknowledge the person.

Beale elaborated on the complexities of the situation:

> At the same time we've got the problem that it's an objective exam - so, for example, we always tell the examiners ... you are not allowed to give positive reinforcements - not allowed to say 'good' because, supposing they fail - supposing they've really not done very well, however much **I**, as a *teacher*, would want to say 'well done' they're going to come out and say ***'the examiner*** said well done' and then when the mark comes, they'll appeal because - it doesn't fit with their perception of how **they** *thought* the exam went. So you've got the problem that you have to maintain an objectivity and a rigour to the exam. The fact that you're examining everybody in the same manner - it doesn't matter whether it's 4.30 in the afternoon or 9.00 in the morning or whether you've heard that piece fifteen times already that day or whether it's the first time...

Beale shared one of his practices for helping examination candidates to perform to the best of their ability. He said:

> I make a point of going out and wishing the candidates good luck at the beginning of the day, before I start. I always shake the first couple [of candidates] by the hand because - what that does is creates an - 'oh, he's alright' - 'he's' you know, 'nice' and then that person waiting in the waiting room will talk to the next person who arrives ... and it goes on down the line and then, when they come in you're half way there.

Beale continued, however, by saying that some candidates cannot be helped. He expressed concern, for some, as follows:

> The other phenomenon that I worry about is that some people are determined to be nervous - determined that they're going to have a horrible time and it's going to be like - going to the dentist, and, there's *nothing* you can do. If somebody comes in and they're *determined* to be nervous and have a bad time - you can be the most encouraging person in the world but they'll be like that [physical indication of body shaking]. They come in like that and there's *nothing* you can do because they're in their own world. So being an examiner is really hard ... You've got to create an atmosphere whereby you've got to draw things out of people but it's got to be one that is consistent and one that is objective. You have to do a lot of non-verbal smiling and a lot of listening and nodding and acknowledging and thanking - *however* they've done.

Further to the personal impact which examiners may have on candidates, Beale generalised about examinations as follows:

> There are a lot of prejudices around about what goes on for an exam. One of the jobs that the jazz syllabus, I hope, is doing, is breaking those down in terms of just saying - look - we are - you know - a 21st century organisation. The age of the examiners is a major misconception. There are lots of young examiners, like me, now. There is a team ***here*** of four examiners now and one is younger than me. There's a mixture of ages. And as far as jazz is concerned - you've got to maintain your objectivity and you've got to create some air of authority - you can't have somebody **so** relaxed that they come up and look at the marks while you're still writing. They'll get the mark they deserve and everything else is kind of irrelevant. But if they don't feel there's someone in charge, then there's a problem because you've got to get the tests done and you've got to be able to say 'Listen carefully - I'm going to play this three times and then I want you do this ' - and if they then say 'Can I have it again' you've got to be able to say 'OK but there's going to be a penalty'. You've got to make the rules clear in a comfortable way.

This lengthy quotation, perhaps, suggests that *equal* but *different* powers exist between the institutions and the examination candidates. Subtle disciplinary devices are put in place by the examiner in order to enable a candidate to achieve what he/she wants to achieve, that is, to pass the examination. Threatening conditions as, apparently, experienced by some examination candidates in former times as a result of unfriendly formalities, have been deliberately removed, in recent times, by the ABRSM. The idea that the ABRSM looks critically at its own examination techniques perhaps confirms the concept of music education as a commodity in the market place. As such, it must attract consumers in order to keep the institutions commercially viable. It is the candidates who hold *this* power. The institutions have to do the enticing.

5.3.2 Some Consumer Appeals

The British institutions of music have successfully operated in the business of musical education for over one hundred and twenty years. Besides the educational aspect which will be discussed in Chapter Six, why might the product as marketed by these institutions have an appeal in society? In other words, what strategies of socialisation are in place in society which ensure the on-going success of these institutions? Bourdieu suggests that commodification of art is responsible for

making accessible cultural artworks and activities and ensuring, through 'symbolic capital', that they are always in high demand by the lower middle class, the *petite bourgeoisie* (Fowler, 1997:81) or the *nouveaux riches* (as discussed in Chapter Four). 'Commodification' of music teaching/learning with ease of appeal to specific members of society may be seen in the operations of these institutions` as follows.

Although the graded syllabi is revised every two years ensuring that new music must be bought, the necessary music books as published by the schools are small and narrowly relevant to the purpose for which they are intended. In recent years renditions of the examination music have become available on compact discs. These have appeal to both teachers and pupils. Michael, contemporary music (including jazz) piano and keyboard player and teacher, perhaps summed up the appeal of the new jazz piano syllabus and appropriate learning devices by saying:

> (W)e'll be pushing it [the syllabus] next year - even if there wasn't an exam - we've got people doing it, that is, following the syllabus who are not interested in sitting the exam. We've got a couple of adults who have got all the books and materials and they're just loving the music. They're loving that whole side of things ...they have no desire to have the pressure of an exam. They've got the CDs [compact discs] - they are wonderful - really, really good.

Therese, classical piano teacher confirmed Michael's ideas of the attraction of the new teaching materials:

> (I) had a 15 year old boy come to me this year who was about Grade 5 piano and he wanted to try the new jazz syllabus. I told him that I wasn't a jazz pianist but he felt OK that we would both experiment with it together. The CD is excellent - lets me off the hook for how it should sound. I've now got two Asian women who just love learning the piano in this manner - we're using the books. They romp things out. It's so much fun. They come together for their lessons and each one claps the other from time to time and we all have a laugh.

The teaching materials made available by the ABRSM may have appeal to teachers and pupils alike. However, the British institutions of music *invite,* or *attract* patronage of their teaching/learning programmes at another level. Unlike a university conservatorium of music, no formal entry qualifications are required in order to use these examination systems. As the only fees paid to the institutions are the examination fees, music learning with any teacher in any location is negotiated independently and examination centres are created according to demand. Hence, the institutions neither concern themselves with problems directly associated with rising and falling numbers of candidates, nor the scarcity of candidates in a particular location.

It is argued here that the ABRSM has devised a product of commercial value as well as cultural value, aimed at those who wish to learn a musical instrument but who do not have proven ability, who wish to have local convenience and finally, who have the adequacy of a middle-class income.

The second point which may explain why this product may have an appeal in society concerns the association made with instrument learning and/or the appearance of specific musical appreciation, and the gaining of symbolic capital as described by Bourdieu (1984:291-292). A good professional reputation, according to Bourdieu, which has triggered an accumulation of 'economic capital' usually holds elements of respectability in non-related areas of life. This respectability in non-related areas - 'symbolic capital' has a 'moral order' with 'intellectual or left bank taste' showing a preference for 'contemporary works of art' and 'bourgeois or right-bank taste' showing a preference for 'older and more consecrated works'.

To elaborate on Bourdieu's concept, the Realist art works of French painter and the leader of the French realist movement - Gustave Courbet (1819-1877) were seen by the academicians at 'The Salon' in Paris during the 19th century as an attack on the romanticism of traditional concepts of what was appropriate subject matter for a grand painting (Fowler, 1997:58). Just as Courbet's representations of peasant life initially received support from the 'left bank intellectuals' whilst the

'right-bank bourgeoisie' barred them from The Salon (Laclotte, 1989:78-81), jazz music has had its following whilst being barred from formal institutions of music.

In both cases, 'symbolic capital' of a person may be calculated according to his/her approval, appreciation or 'taste' in painting or music compared to worth bestowed upon the artwork by authoritative sources. Thus, association *alone* with the education as offered by these institutions may accrue symbolic capital for those concerned.

The circumstances, that is - the norms of a social class, in which a person learns about or is exposed to commodities such as works of art, affect the legitimacy of symbolic capital (Bourdieu, 1984:68, 122-123). According to Bourdieu, (1984:19-20) for the *bourgeoisie*, the 'old rich', classical music as well as the learning of some instrument is likely to be a norm and hold little relevance to the bestowal of status. Indeed to *not* enjoy classical music and to *not* play an instrument, for the wealthy, does not suggest that the opportunities for appreciation and knowledge were not there. Therefore, the symbolism of this opportunity and its educational worth is unimportant. For the *nouveaux riches*, however, Bourdieu (1984:19) contends that the piano, because of its popularity as a classical musical instrument, is the 'instrument par excellence'. It provides endless opportunities for the gaining of, or display of, both symbolic and educational capital.

This 'symbolic and educational capital' is further stratified depending on whether knowledge about piano compositions is gained early in life through the playing of the piano, or later in life through recordings of its music (Bourdieu, 1984:19). In other words, symbolic and educational capital are affected by background and, consequently, for Bourdieu (1984:170), by 'habitus', that is, the understanding of cultural norms which comes as a result of their presence in informal or every-day living. This concept will be discussed more fully in Chapter Six.

The recent extension of the programme from the ABRSM to include jazz piano music alters the opportunities to gain symbolic and educational capital as defined by Bourdieu (1984:19). As the performance of jazz music requires different musical skills from those required for classical music, the ABRSM has redefined,

or perhaps broadened, their understanding of musical ability or talent and consequently - of musical appreciation. In doing so the ABRSM has also affected a new stance in how symbolic capital (Bourdieu, 1984:291-292) may be not only gained but also bestowed. The piano, popular with both classical pianists and jazz piano players, is firmly anchored as a safe instrument with which to entice musicians from both worlds of music. This meeting of two genres of music over the keyboard of the piano has the potential to create new social norms related to status based on musical preferences. New norms, it is suggested, are in the making as former perceptions of the superiority of classical music are challenged.

5.3.3 Jazz Music Problematised

If there are new norms in the making, challenges will be arising for those who accepted that classical music was 'the truth' about music and everything including jazz music was 'other'. In order for jazz music to create some of its own 'truths' however, it must be able to survive intellectual scrutiny. The intellectualisation process has caused the ABRSM to problematise jazz music in a manner which has hitherto been unproblematic in the world of jazz music. The ABRSM has intellectualised, or problematised, jazz music by firstly, analysing it into specific categories of 'blues, standards, and contemporary jazz' (Associated Board of The Royal Schools Of Music, Jazz Piano Pieces, Grades 1 to 5, 1998). Secondly, it has intellectualised, or problematised, jazz music by imposing certain standards of performance and by expecting certain techniques and knowledge about the subject. Rose (1999:131) describes these types of new bodies of intellectual knowledge, created through problematisation, as the elaboration of the:

> ... mundane, practical social knowledge of the habits, conducts, capacities, dreams and desires of citizens, and of their errors, deviations, inconstancies ...

He suggests that these new bodies of knowledge are 'calibrated, classified, ordered, shaped and moulded', and that the knowledge causes 'expert authority to

flourish'. Whilst Rose is referring to the power in the middle of the 19th century in Europe which was in the hands of the medical doctors he states that there is a 'host' of others who:

> ... can specify ways of conducting one's private affairs that are desirable, not because they are required by a moral code dictated by God or the Prince, but because they are rational and true.

Rose, in light of this, states that:

> (I)t is experts who can tell us how we should conduct ourselves ... the invention of the norm, is the linchpin ... .

The key point here is that new norms are in the making. At some point in the world of music, the new body of knowledge about jazz music which is taking place in educational institutions in general, will take on the air of a 'truth' about the subject. This is not to suggest that a stasis occurs. It is to suggest that once the intellectualisation or problematisation process is in place, the process is unstoppable.

The removal of jazz music from its former informal learning location and its relocation into the same structured rules and regulations of classical music learning may be seen as being simultaneously victorious and defeatist for pupils and teachers. For example, the passing of examinations itself, whilst *not* necessarily understood within the institutions as being of total significance in order to play a musical instrument, is often understood by the pupil and the teacher to be of *most* significance. It is frequently the *only* aspect which matters to a parent. Victories are enjoyed by those who pass examinations *as well as* learn to play a musical instrument outside the examination room. The defeated are perhaps those who are only concerned with passing examinations. Therefore, it is argued here, according to Rose, that the new 'experts' in jazz music, that is - the institutions, will problematize jazz music in areas hitherto not considered problematic by jazz musicians. Consequently, 'new norms' will be created for jazz music by re-presenting it in the same rationalised learning format and using the

same disciplinary devices of examination passing and credential gaining as has been in place since the latter part of the 18th century for classical music.

5.3.4 Summary

Making music by blowing, banging or scraping an object (or by producing vocal sounds) has probably existed since the beginning of human life. Intellectualisation of music, within the intellectual climate of modernity, considers the difference between unpleasant 'sounds' and pleasant 'music'. Having intellectualised musical sounds, it has been argued that strategies of socialisation which exist in society as cultural norms, are harnessed for the specific purpose of promulgating the knowledge. The knowledge, *consequently*, becomes desirable, or sought after. The complexity arises however, from the *creation* of the knowledge. Institutions of music depend on a market in order to survive. This market is comprised of teachers, pupils, students and, ultimately, the listening public. Therefore, the institutions of music are not free to intellectualise and educate *ad infinitum*. The links to the market place, as discussed in Chapter Four, are direct. Pertinent in this chapter has been specific factors which may be found within strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices which nurture the success of the institutions in the market place.

Disciplinary devices, such as time-frames and payment of fees, are perhaps obvious. Not so obvious are disciplinary devices that may be found in the self-discipling and self-monitoring skills which individuals impose upon themselves by the expectation to match some norms, imagined or otherwise (Rose, 1990:222). This idea is relevant to the following section.

5.4 Subject Positions

Strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices affect how teachers teach and how pupils learn. Individual music teachers may imagine that they are free to

choose *how* they teach and individual pupils may imagine that they are free to choose *how* they learn to play a musical instrument. Rose (1999:1-2) argues, however, that our freedom, that is our *imagined* freedom, is in fact, intrinsically linked to authoritative forces which systematically go about setting the framework within which our personal choices may be made. Therefore, music teachers and pupils, it has been argued, are part of a big and old authoritative scheme, the formal institutions. Similarly, these institutions are part of some other authoritative scheme. As discussed in Chapter Two, the authority of the institutions originated in Enlightenment philosophy and with roots in the authoritative forces of the Christian churches and the aristocracy of former times. So where might the authority to legitimise any musical knowledge find some foundations? Might it be found in values of social class, ethnicity and religion as held by society itself and set in place by strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices which enable certain authoritative forces to give legitimacy to some knowledge whilst condemning other forms of knowledge?

Derek Layder (1994:95) referring to Foucault's ideas in relation to 'de-centring the human subject' says

> '(T)he human subject was not inherently free but hedged in on all sides by social determinations. The very idea of the subject is a social construction, produced through social discourses which position subjects in a field of power relations and particular sets of practices'.

The relationship between the institutions and the teachers, and, in turn, between the teachers and their pupils may be described as a relationship where, at all times somebody is 'governed' (Rose, 1999:172). For Rose, 'governing' is not necessarily government of country, local bodies or services. Rather it is

> ... a moral field binding persons into durable relations. It is a space of emotional relationships through which individual identities are constructed through their bonds to micro-cultures of values and meanings (Rose, 1999:172).

Bourdieu, (1977:221-231) suggests that class itself is reproduced by the type of knowledge taught by and sought from educational institutions. He suggests that knowledge which is neither taught nor sought in order to gain employment, but knowledge for its own sake, reproduces an upper class mentality whilst vocational knowledge serves to promulgate the middle classes.

Although qualities, usually referred to as 'talents', are necessary in order to play any musical instrument without undue effort, socialisation as a result of class position is likely to play a major role in bringing any ability to the fore. Bourdieu (1984:13) suggests that whilst one may inherit cultural capital, educational capital may be acquired, although it is likely that cultural capital based within circumstances where economic capital exists will make educational capital easier. In other words, an appreciation of music through socialisation plus good economic circumstances will increase one's chances of accruing educational capital.

A common perception of musicians places them in some sort of communion with the class of people to whom their music has appeal. For example, although Mozart lived a life in poverty as a servant, he is generally perceived as having an upper-class demeanour. Bourdieu (cited in Fowler, 1997:65) argues however, that this is an oversimplified conception. Whilst this may be so, it is likely that the perception of jazz music emanating out of brothels and night clubs has been an obstacle to the recognition of its musical worth.

The world of music from the perspective of the subject positions, that is - the teachers and the pupils as well as any audience, have all been subjected to strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices which exist in wider society. Freedom to choose, therefore, is not limitless. It exists only within a prison of choices. That prison, as discussed, is constructed by the authoritative forces which create the knowledge and the forces in society which justify particular knowledge for a particular person.

5.5 Conclusion

Strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices, for better or for worse, are unavoidable forces in the lives of everybody. It may be fair to say that the world of music is generally perceived as a world of freedom from the worldly and the materialistic. However, on the contrary, it has been argued in this chapter that links forming binding chains exist between music and religion, politics and the human mind.

With specific reference to music teaching and learning in this country, New Zealand, strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices have been brought to the fore by the successful teaching, here, for over one hundred years by the Catholic sisters. Their particular life commitments and religious beliefs have brought to the world of music qualities which are unable to be replicated in a secular world. However, qualities live on in their pupils who are, largely, the present gatekeepers of the occupation.

The European cultural norms which were brought to New Zealand with the early settlers and which were nurtured by the Catholic sisters have recently been joined by the music with origins in Africa - 'jazz'. To claim that jazz has come to these shores through Europe may be arrogant. However, the influence of the ABRSM cannot be denied. The same strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices which have existed in the world of classical music in this country, since the arrival of the first settlers is about to be superimposed onto this music form.

Chapter Six

Credentialism and Prestige

6.1 Introduction

Jazz and classical music came together, for the first time, within the formal educational institutions of music of Western European cultural traditions in the final decade of the 20th century. This 'coming together' is an *academic*, or an *intellectual* meeting whereby both genres exist alongside each other but retain all their identifying particularities. An amalgamation of these two musical forms which goes beyond this coexistence is unthinkable. *Or is it?*

This chapter will explore the concepts of *credentialism and prestige* which, along with *strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices* (as discussed in Chapter Five), appear to have kept these two genres of music apart. Specific reference is made in this chapter, as in the previous chapters, to jazz and classical music as they exist, for the first time together, within the institution of Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM).

The separate journeys which trace some major influences in the development of both classical and jazz music have been discussed in Chapters Two and Three. The motivating conditions which may be recognised by using Hunt's framework of modes of regulation as an analytical tool helped to identify, in Chapter Four, how knowledge has been formulated and fixed into practical procedures of inculcation. Whilst the concepts of strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices helped to identify specific attitudes towards the teaching and learning of music, the concepts of credentialism and prestige are considered, in this chapter, in order to bring some understanding of the successful functioning of the British

institutions of music, that is, the ABRSM and the Trinity College of Music London (TCL).

6.1.1 Recognisable Qualifications

Successful performing musicians are, by definition, 'successful' - that is, 'having obtained fame' (Adams, 1992:1344), a small minority compared with amateur musicians. 'Successful' classical musicians have usually excelled in formal musical education and are likely to be, in this country, New Zealand, able to claim credentials from the ABRSM, and the TCL among other tertiary institutions of musical education. On the contrary, until the recent introduction of the ABRSM's new jazz piano syllabus in New Zealand and other countries, formal credentialism and associated prestige in jazz music playing for those who see themselves as either amateurs or 'professionals' was relatively non-existent. Jazz musicians, in this country, who earned their living from performing had few opportunities to gain formal qualifications[1].

This chapter looks at some reasons why a system of graded examinations may be in place and why it forms a major part of the learning of a musical instrument regardless of the fact that most pupils who follow the system consider their playing to be a hobby. Considered here, are the motivating strategies which have

[1] A full-time jazz programme at Wellington Polytechnic evolved from 1975 to 1989. From 1975 to 1985 students were able to take a course which was basically classical in essence but which could include some elements of jazz music. From 1982 to 1989, students could major in jazz but they still had to include elements of classical music in their course. From 1989 onwards, students could take a course consisting entirely of jazz music resulting in a B.Mus (Perf) (S. Tipping, personal communication, 27 September, 2000). Christchurch Polytechnic Institute of Technology offered a Diploma course in jazz music from 1991 with the first students graduating in 1993 (N. Pickard, personal communication, 30 September 2000). Massey University, Albany Campus introduced jazz music courses as part of a B.Mus (Perf) for the first time in 2000 (Massey University, personal communication, 11 March 2000).

been put in place in order to lure a music pupil through at least eight years of learning before a step is made onto a path which may lead to either a formal credential or which may indicate a stage of 'professionalism'.

The concepts of credentialism and prestige are discussed specifically in this chapter in relation to, firstly, philosophical differences based on the 'socially inherited' cultural norms (Mandelbaum, 1949:309) which form the kernels of both classical and jazz music and secondly, in relation to the influence of the formal institutions of music. Finally, these concepts are considered in relation to the subjective positions of those who either teach or learn music.

6.1.2 Definitions

An understanding of 'culture' as either a specific 'socially inherited' identity (Mandelbaum, 1949:309) or as a reference to some particular aspect, or aspects, of daily life which is/are refined and consciously regulated (Bauman, 1992:8) was defined in Chapter Five (pages 97-99). It is considered, in this chapter, that the obtaining of formal credentials in musical knowledge and instrument playing is a part of Western cultural practice. It is, therefore, considered to be a 'socially inherited' cultural norm (Mandelbaum, 1949:309). The associated prestige which may result from the obtaining of these credentials may be considered to be part of how a 'cultured', or a refined person is viewed by others. A perception of prestige, therefore, may come into existence according to value judgements made, by others, about the worth of the acquired knowledge. This understanding of the meaning of culture, when located inside the first, invites views of the concepts of both credentialism and prestige.

The following definitions form the basis of the discussion based on these concepts. Firstly, 'prestige' may be defined as:

> ... high status or reputation achieved through success, influence, wealth ... (Adams, 1992:1058).

Whilst any acquired attribute may have the potentiality of prestigious value, only some may be represented by credentials. A credential is defined, in this text, as:

> something that entitles a person to confidence, authority, or letter or certification giving evidence of the bearer's identity or competence (Adams, 1992:307).

A credential may be symbolic of the level of knowledge or experience a person may have in any specific field. Credentials, in this text are considered as heuristic devices which people may use in order to understand another person's place in society. The prestige of a credential rests on a general perception of the worth of the knowledge or technical skill as represented by that credential. Credentials, therefore, may be seen as pragmatic devices by which major decisions are made about occupations whilst actually not knowing a person or understanding their expertise.

6.2 Cultural Dominance

The philosophical differences between classical and jazz music which locate these two genres at far ends of a continuum of music familiar in Western society have, until recently, been held even more steadfastly by differing 'socially inherited' cultural concepts (Mandelbaum, 1949:309) of credentialism and prestige in relation to music composition and performance. The formal nature of classical music is such that it cannot exist outside clearly defined boundaries which impact on both composition and performance of that composition. In other words, classical music is *always prescribed.* 'Prescription' means, in this instance, that classical music can neither be composed nor performed without the education which decodes the rules of its very essence. This education invites, almost entices, the existence of the concepts of credentialism and prestige. It would appear, therefore, that the formal nature of classical music cannot avoid courting, to varying degrees, credentialism and prestige. On the other hand, the informal nature of jazz music has not, until recently, attracted the formalities associated

with institutional rationalisation. Consequently, formal credentials have not been available. The origins of jazz music, anchored in African music and transported to the United States of America where it existed under conditions of bondage, prostitution and night-club conditions, has ensured that prestige *per se,* could not exist. This is not to say that *informal* credentials and associated prestige could not be, and have not been, gained.

Differing cultural attitudes to credentialism may be highlighted by the following:

> ...assumptions about the 'European' approach to composers like Duke Ellington, and with them the resultant problem of explaining their jazz credentials, are ... askew. When Duke's son, Mercer, went through his father's papers after the great man's death, he was hoping to find some of the arrangements for the hundreds of numbers Duke had put his name to. To his astonishment, Mercer found that there were none, just a few primitive jottings on yellowing score paper (Perry, 1996:24).

In the world of music teaching/learning in this country since the arrival of the first European settlers, the major credentials in relation to musical knowledge and performance have been accredited according to achievement as calculated by the British institutions of music, the ABRSM and the TCL. Until recently, formal credentials in jazz music, in this country, could only be gained, in the main, by pleasing an audience in a public space. The audience however, unlike a classical music examiner, did/does not, necessarily, have to be informed, knowledgeable, or even sober or interested. Therefore, credentials gained in the two music genres have carried prestige to varying degrees according to the origin of the qualifications of those who make, or pass, the judgement. The prestige obtained from the passing of an examination as decreed by the British institutions of music differs from the prestige obtained from a concerted, albeit night-club, audience. This is not to ignore the performances, in recent years, by talented jazz performers to educated audiences in respected venues. The missing element has been the sole scrutiny of the official examiner culminating in some sort of officially, perhaps even internationally, recognisable certification of performance.

6.2.1 Music Preference is Not Static

A glance at the history of both classical and jazz music may reveal the socially inherited cultural differences which, in turn, affect the opportunities to gain credentials and prestige through musical composition and performance as a result of changes in taste of style of music.

From the beginning of the 18th and into the 19th century, there was a move away from polyphony (many independent voice-parts - known as *contrapuntal* music) to homophony (voices moving together - known as *harmonic* music) (Mellers, 1946:110). This is a significant change in appreciation of that which was deemed correct and proper in mid-European music circles at that time. The music of the Bach family, mainly Johann Sebastian Bach (1685-1750), slowly gave way to the music of Ludwig van Beethoven (1770-1827) having traversed the musical grounds of the other Bach family members, (C.P.E., J.C.F., and J.C.) Franz Joseph Haydn (1732-1809), Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart (1756-1791) and arriving, but not stopping, at Beethoven.

The essence of the change is coined in the following:

> (F)rom about 1730 onwards there was a ... swing away from the contrapuntal style to music in which the stress was on the vertical aspect rather than on the horizontal. Besides this, a lighter, less generally serious style evolved, usually known as the *style galant*, which aimed chiefly at grace and elegance. Broadly speaking, such music was of a kind to be heard rather than carefully listened to; it required but little of the mental concentration which was needed for the appreciation of, say, a Bach concerto (Lovelock, 1953:147).

Lovelock is not suggesting, of course, that the music of Beethoven does not require intellect. He is suggesting that the aurally and emotionally satisfying sound of the harmony itself, without an intellectual understanding of composition and structure, may suffice general audience appreciation. In contrast, J.S. Bach's music is somewhat nonsensical without *any* intellectual understanding.

By way of another contrast, jazz music, as a result of its aural tradition as opposed to the physical codification of a score, has existed primarily in performance mode. Whilst complex harmonies and rhythms exist in this music genre, its characterising feature has been improvisation.

The general European cultural view that intelligent consideration is superior to emotional reaction gives the music of J.S. Bach, to be specific, much intellectual prestige. To elaborate on this view, the group of people who distinguished themselves during the 18th century Enlightenment period in Europe by stressing the importance of reason (Hobsbawn, 1962:37-38) saw themselves as:

> ... decidedly superior in relation to their own ignorant and superstitious working classes or villagers. ... (Bauman, 1987:110).

In the world of music, the sounds and structures of music composed of complex rationalities are considered to be more prestigious than music which has appeared to have had little intellectual development. Jazz music and its propensity for improvisation *appeared* to be based on emotional reaction and *appeared* to be based on uneducated musical intuition. Consequently, it received little attention from the main institutions of classical music.

However, although improvisation based on emotional reaction and musical intuition may suggest thoughtless spontaneity and therefore, lack of reason, this is not necessarily so. The recent intellectualisation of jazz music in formal educational institutions of music has brought to the fore its specific and identifying rationality. Just as Bach's music lay unappreciated for over 100 years until revived by Mendelssohn (1809-1847) (Encyclopaedia Britannica, (A), 11, 1980:901; Wilson, 1962:33), the 'discovery' of jazz may be the beginning of respect and understanding as well as credentialism and prestige in this genre.

The point of reiterating attitudes to music as existed in former times is to illustrate that the present interest in revered circles of music hitherto considered wayward is not new. Major swings, moderate sways or even minor leanings of musical taste

may be nonetheless perplexing in nature when they are in the process of gathering some momentum.

To formally elevate jazz music which has its roots in African, is unique and perhaps, the kernel of this perplexity. Values beyond musical appreciation may be in question. Racism itself may be evident within musical appreciation.

6.2.2 Equality in Jazz and Classical Music?

Prestige may be bestowed on classical music compositions and performers because of recognisable and understood credentials which represent a depth of knowledge and/or performing ability. For example, the ability at a level which is recognised by diplomas from the ABRSM[2] for teaching, performing and/or

[2] Main structures of the Diplomas for the ABRSM are '**DIPABRSM The Diploma of the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music** ... is a very approachable qualification which provides access to the Licentiate diploma. All holders of the DipABRSM will have demonstrated performance competence beyond that required to achieve ABRSM Grade 8. They are likely to have reached standards of achievement that are broadly comparable with those typically attained by students studying for a music degree at the close of the first year of study. Recognising the diversity of performance and academic requirements within the United Kingdom Higher Education sector, as well as the different duration of degree courses, this general benchmark sets the minimum expectation.

LRSM The Licentiate of the Royal Schools of Music builds on the skills and understanding required for the DipABRSM and provides access to the fellowship diploma. Holders of this award are likely to have reached standards of achievement at least comparable with those typically attained after three years of Higher Education study in music. Recognising the diversity of performance and academic requirements within the United Kingdom Higher Education sector, as well as the different duration of degree courses, this general benchmark sets the minimum expectation.

FRSM The Fellowship of the Royal Schools of Music is the highest of the Associated Board's Diplomas and carries the greatest prestige and status, Holders of this award are likely to have reached standards of achievement at least comparable with a graduate award typically taken after four years of Higher Education study in music. Recognising the diversity of performance and academic requirements within the United Kingdom Higher Education sector,

directing and by the TCL[3] for teaching and/or performing would be minimum justification. To consider equality between jazz and classical music, is to consider *how* **fair** comparisons between knowledge about, and performance of, music of both genres may be made. In other words, credentialism is well established within classical music. What are the similar recognisable and understood credentials, which represent a person's depth of knowledge and/or ability to perform jazz music?

But can music with known origins disconnected to Christianity, Judaism and/or Islam, in other words, connections to paganism (as judged by Western culture) and black Africa *really* occupy the same strata of prestige as music of Europe and Asia? Or might the journey itself which has taken jazz music from black to white culture and from peasantry, working class, lower/middle-class to then leap to the

---

this general benchmark sets the minimum expectation' (Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music Syllabus of Diploma Examinations from 2000, 2000:4).

[3] Main structures for the Diplomas for the TCL are **ATCL, (Associate of Trinity College of Music)** is a first-level diploma in which the standard of performance is equivalent to the performance component of the first year in a full-time undergraduate course at a conservatoire or other Higher Education establishment. Performance must demonstrate technical assurance and a sense of style and creative flair in a programme of pieces drawn from the standard repertoire for the instrument/voice.

LTCL, (Licentiate of Trinity College of Music) LTCL in Performance is a higher-level diploma in which the standard of performance is equivalent to the performance component on completion of a full-time undergraduate course at a conservatoire or other Higher Education establishment. Candidates must demonstrate well projected performance with full technical control of the instrument and evidence of a mature musical personality in a programme of pieces drawn from the standard repertoire for the instrument/voice.

FTCL (Fellowship of Trinity College of Music) FTCL in Performance is a professional diploma in which the standard of performance is equivalent to the performance component on completion of a full-time postgraduate course at a conservatoire or other Higher Education establishment. Performance must demonstrate authority and originality in interpretation of a recital programme of more demanding works' (Trinity Music Diplomas 1999-2003, 1998:v).

formal institutions of music have created some form of music which cannot take its cue from the prestige of classicism of music? Might the genres of music be incomparable? Credentialism as understood in 'socially inherited' culture norms of Western culture (Mandelbaum, 1949:309) may not be sufficient to construct perceptions of equality between the two genres within educational institutions and audiences alike.

Bauman (1992:xx) describes a concept which might be usefully considered in this situation. For Bauman, specific events or shared experiences in society may create a sense of an 'imagined community'. It is the 'symbolic significance' (Bauman, 1992:xx) of the specific or shared experience for Bauman which creates this 'imagined community'. In the world of credentialism and prestige as constructed by the ABRSM and the TCL, there is an understanding of the 'symbolic significance' of, for example, to have played a Bach Two-part Invention at Grade 5 level with a 'Distinction'[4] pass. This would be meaningless to J.S. Bach, of course, as well as to anybody else who is not familiar with the significance of the symbolism which creates the 'imagined community'. Similarly, what might it mean to pass 'Jamming With Jools' by Brian Priestley (ABRSM, Jazz Piano Pieces, 1998) Grade 5 level with a 'Merit'[5] pass?

The point of this illustration is to consider that a new 'imagined community' for teachers and pupils of jazz music, based on *mutual* understanding of the significance of credentialism and prestige, may be obtained through adhering to

---

[4] Pass with 'Distinction' means achieving between 85 and 100 marks out of a possible 100 marks in a **TCL** examination in the Grades 1 to 8. (Total marks of 70 are required in order to pass the examination) (Trinity Keyboard Syllabus from 2001, 2000:129). Pass with 'Distinction' also means achieving 130 or more marks out of a possible 150 marks in **ABRSM** practical examination in the Grades 1 to 8 (where the minimum marks required for a Pass are 100) (These Music Exams, 1999:23-24).

[5] Pass with 'Merit' means achieving between 75 and 84 marks in a **TCL** practical examination in the Grades 1 to 8 (Trinity Keyboard Syllabus from 2001, 2000:129). Pass with 'Merit' also means achieving between 120 and 129 marks in an **ABRSM** practical examination in the Grades 1 to 8 (These Music Exams, 1999:23-24).

the new examination syllabus of the ABRSM. This 'imagined community' may bring jazz music into the 'surveillance' of the ABRSM. The reference to *surveillance* comes from Foucault's (1980:39) discussion on 'mechanisms of power' which refers to:

> ... its capillary form of existence - the point where power reaches into the very grain of individuals, touches their bodies and inserts itself into their actions and attitudes, their discourses, learning processes and everyday lives.

Foucault's suggestion is that power has separated from the original source (the ABRSM in this case) to have its own life within the mentality of individuals. For Foucault, power is perpetuated by those whom it was designed to control.

Perhaps any examination system could be seen in this light. However, to return to Bauman's concept of an 'imagined community' it is argued in this chapter that the imagined community is established once power is in the self-perpetuating place of driving the individuals who share this mentality. Thus, a new 'imagined community' is presently in the making - the 'imagined community' of jazz musicians as moulded by credentialism and associated prestige by the ABRSM. This community will have a 'language' not readily understood by jazz musicians outside of the community and not easily understood by the 'imagined community' comprised of classical musicians, either inside or outside the framework of the British institutions. This community would understand the 'symbolic significance' (Bauman, 1992:xx) of a rendition of '*Jamming With Jools by Brian Priestley at Grade 5 level with a merit pass*'.

Credentialism and associated prestige within the examination system of the ABRSM exists only within an understanding of the structures of the syllabus. It will take time for the new jazz syllabus to be generally understood and consequently, to be, generally meaningful. The question of what happens to the essential nature of a music genre after it has been institutionalised may, perhaps, only be considered as time passes.

Cross-cutting the obtaining of prestige by the gaining of credentials is an argument which stratifies prestige according to the mode of inculcation of knowledge. The contention is that not all knowledge can be learned by following the procedures of educational institutions (Bourdieu, 1984:80-83). Bourdieu distinguishes between the modes of acquisition whereby knowledge is gained either as a result of familiarization in the home or as a result of attempting to put into practice that which is taught in formal situations. The latter, without the former, for Bourdieu, is lacking in social prestige.

To understand Bourdieu's argument, it is necessary to define his concepts, albeit briefly, of 'cultural capital' and 'educational capital'. 'Cultural capital' refers to

> (D)istinction within the autonomous fields of art and science (Fowler, 1997:31).

'Educational capital' refers to educational and intellectual qualifications (Fowler, 1997:31).

Bourdieu's concept of 'culture' refers to both

> ...any socially inherited element in the life of man [sic], material and spiritual (Mandelbaum, 1949:309)

as well as somebody who is

> ... well educated, polished, urbane, enriched above his [sic] 'natural' state, ennobled (Bauman, 1973:6-7) (as defined in Chapter Five).

For Bourdieu, knowledge about music and art *may* be indicators of 'cultural capital'. But formal acquisition of this knowledge without an ease of familiarity of music and art *away* from a formal learning institution is a socially inferior form of 'cultural capital'.

The circumstances, or the background in which cultural activities develop as a norm and bear upon prestige *because* they *are* a norm within (what Bourdieu calls) one's *'habitus'*, (Bourdieu, 1984:170) affect cultural capital. *Habitus* for

Bourdieu is a mentality which springs from, or is nurtured by, one's unavoidable habitat. Within one's *habitus*, practices are:

> ... internalized, and converted into a disposition that generates meaningful practices and meaning-giving perceptions (Bourdieu, 1984:170).

The learning in a familiar and informal habitat, is verified by the learning of the institution, and vice versa (Bourdieu, 1984:14). *Habitus* may also reflect social class, described by Bourdieu as *'class habitus'* or:

> ... the internalized form of class condition and of the conditioning it entails 1984:101).

Those with inherited 'cultural capital' as a result of their *habitus* are considered to be more at ease with *refined* cultural practices than those who gained *refined* 'cultural capital' through a schooling situation (Bourdieu, 1984:13-14). Inherited 'cultural capital' thus fixes:

> (P)ractices and works into a system of distinction (Bourdieu, 1984:170).

In this context, Bourdieu's ideas would suggest that those who learn classical music and come from a background of jazz music or contemporary music in general, and vice versa, lack an understanding of the *essence* of the specific music of learning. Prestige may only be obtained when the specific music exists in one's life, both informally and formally. Accepting differing cultural norms, social class itself is, therefore, likely to determine the exposure to specific cultural activities as well as educational opportunities.

The informal gaining of knowledge, however, has a longer history than the formal gaining of knowledge. Bauman's description (1987:69) of education in the wake of revelations brought about in the Enlightenment suggests that education is:

> ... an afterthought ... a desperate attempt to regulate the deregulated, to introduce order into social reality which had been first dispossessed of its own self-ordering devices.

In view of this definition, education from the Enlightenment period may be considered to have become associated with formal schooling. This was followed by appropriation into the division of labour and the total functioning of society according to *formally* learned knowledge (Bauman, 1987:69). Bauman makes a comparison to former times when the acquisition of knowledge took place within the experiences of life, each day, and was consequently considered to be knowledge gained *informally*.

It may not be surprising that if formal education could affect one's position in the division of labour, formal education became a desirable aspect of life. Thus educational capital may be desired by those who have the economic means to acquire as much as may be deemed necessary in order to secure a particular place in the division of labour (Bourdieu, 1984:13,53).

From the desirability to hold credentials from the formal institutions of learning developed an anxiousness to obtain them. The credentials themselves were becoming symbolic of prestige, or *symbolic capital* (Bourdieu, 1984:291-292) as discussed in Chapter Five (pages 119-123).

With ideas of differing socially inherited cultural norms in mind, it is difficult to imagine that those who chose to learn classical music and those who chose to learn jazz music are going to see each other as equals within perceptions of cultural norms. The vision of equals within perceptions of cultural norms becomes even more problematic when considering the differing accessibility to cultural refinement. For example, social class itself is likely to offer either privileges or deprivation of educational opportunities. This is not to judge who, in the worlds of jazz and classical music, will see whom as superior or inferior. Rather it is to suggest that the backgrounds which form the *habitus*, which, in turn, affects inherited 'cultural capital' will bear upon and somehow merge with the musical cultural image and, consequently, stratified perceptions of prestige will become inherent in both genres of music.

6.2.3 Summary

The concepts of credentialism and prestige as understood by different cultural interpretations are evident in the worlds of both classical and jazz music. The absolutism of the credentials and associated prestige in classical musical circles is presently being challenged by the new rationalisation of the jazz genre by the formal institutions of music. The new boundaries which are forming around new knowledge and understandings of jazz music are contesting the validity of the boundaries which have protected the absoluteness of knowledge and understanding of classical music since the very foundation stone of these institutions was laid.

Cultural concepts which bestow credentials and prestige simultaneously remain the same *and* change - as jazz music will continue to exist in its original state and retain its own forms of informal credentialism and localised prestige *as well as* exist in a formal state as a result of the intellectual rationalisation of its sounds and structures.

6.3 Role of Institutions

As noted in Chapter Two, the British institutions of music, the ABRSM and the TCL, influence music teaching/learning with centres in 95 countries around the world (footnotes, pages 31-32). They have devised a progressive framework for musical development which has been cemented into an invented system of status-related credentials based upon examination results. Credentialism itself, in the form of formal and regular acknowledgement of achievement, is paramount to the on-going success of these institutions.

The progressive framework for musical development for classical music consists of the examination curricula. It is designed around approximately eleven examination syllabi which may take a pupil, initially, from the first stages of learning a musical instrument at 'Grade One' to advanced learning at 'Grade

Eight'. Each Grade is expected to take approximately one year. Professional qualifications may then be gained with the ABRSM by the passing of their 'diploma' examinations. Each grade exists in two forms, practical and theoretical. The instruments and groups available for examination are, broadly; piano and bowed strings, woodwind and brass instruments, harpsichord, organ, guitar, harp, percussion, singing, ensembles. and choral singing. Jazz piano and jazz ensembles practical examinations are available from 'Grade One' to 'Grade Five' (ABRSM Syllabus of Examinations, 1998:cover).

6.3.1 The Lure of Examination Success

It appears that a cultural norm developed early within the existence of both the ABRSM and the TCL whereby success within their rationalised framework of learning was rewarded by a sense of personal pride for both the pupils and the parents as well as the teachers. From this developed a status hierarchy according to, not only the difficulty of the exam passed, but whether or not that pass deserved to be awarded with merit or distinction (as defined on page 138). The personal sense of pride of achievement reflects onto the parents (of young pupils) who provide the opportunity, and to the teachers who attempt to bring out the best in a pupil. The British institutions of music created a system within which pride was taken in achieving success according to their rules. By bestowing prestige to varying degrees upon all whom they depend for survival, these institutions maintain control of the knowledge which they deem to be correct and proper.

Their power, social in essence, is recognisable in Bourdieu's description (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977:142) of examinations:

> (A)s much as or more than through the constraints of curriculum and syllabus, the acquisition of legitimate culture and the legitimate relation to culture is regulated by the customary law which is constituted in the jurisprudence of examinations and which owes its main characteristics to the situation in which it is formulated.

Whilst Bourdieu is suggesting that examinations actually *construct* culture which, subsequently, comes to be regarded as 'legitimate', he is also implying that examinations are sought in order to measure personal identity against a perception of the existence of status-stratified and absolute, cultural norms.

6.3.2 Jazz Music and the ABRSM

The British institutions, being business enterprises, need not only to keep their product at the forefront of the world of musical education, but to compete in the leisure and pleasure industries which have also commodified desirable products for middle class amusement and/or have provided for 'educational' and 'symbolic capital' (Bourdieu, 1984: 291-292).

The ABRSM, in 1998, when announcing their prospectus for the new syllabus described jazz music as follows:

> '(J)azz is one of the most important musical genres of the twentieth century. Its vibrant mix of spicy, harmonic language, rhythmic complexity, humour and opportunities for being musically creative make jazz a rich and rewarding world to explore' (Mundey, 1997:6).

There is a suggestion of the enthusiastic spirit of commerce in the slightly extravagant language which, in itself also tends to reflect the comradely ambience, enthusiasm and informality of jazz music. The ABRSM has not previously operated on the premise that there are 'rewards' to be found through 'musical exploration'. Indeed, to replace the word 'jazz' for 'classical' in the above quote would, in former mentalities, render it to be vulgar. Hitherto, the most which could be expected has been a gentle persuasion by an adventure into uncharted territories with the choice of the third piece in each syllabus having been selected from the compositions of a person likely to still be alive and to hold some sort of local cultural identity. The prescribed music has been essentially, if not totally, European and inseparable from concert-going practices of the dominant culture. The new jazz syllabus, therefore, is not simply 'a new syllabus', but rather, a reflection of a *different* philosophical approach to music as a result of *different*

cultural and ethnic origins. What this might mean for credentialism and prestige within the formal institutions of music and the world of music teaching/learning is yet to be understood.

Regardless of future possibilities, jazz music may *now* be considered to be in the upper echelons of a hierarchical structure as a result of a intellectual rationalisation of its forms and structures.

A slow metamorphism affecting credentialism and prestige as previously understood by two different belief systems may be occurring within the formal institutions of music resulting in a *new* cultural norm. Eventually this *new* cultural norm may create a *'habitus'* (Bourdieu, 1984:170) or, in other words, a unique environment is forming as a result of the cultural norms which have come or are coming, into place through the 'imagined community' (Bauman, 1992:xx).

Ultimately, in a postmodern world, classical and jazz music as presented by the ABRSM would not be perceived as having developed from two separate and different cultural philosophies with *one* of these being perceived as *culturally* superior. Rather, jazz and classical music would be perceived as two different music forms existing equally but as a result of two different intellectual rationales.

6.3.3 Summary

The British institutions of music have devised a comprehensive system for the teaching and learning of music. It has been argued in this section that these schools stimulate participation in their learning programmes and examination system by making the experience attractive to teachers and pupils. This attraction comes, firstly, from the challenges offered in order to pass a specific examination. Secondly and perhaps more importantly, attraction comes, through a seeking of a personal and a socially prestigious image which achieving a pass, or a pass which acknowledges effort and ability, in any examination invites. This image is based on an understanding of personal identity as it is measured against a perception of

cultural norms. It is not invalidated because it exists *only* within either a personal and familial situation or within an immediately local social environment.

The rationalisation of jazz music and the related new teaching syllabus may appear, however, to be a radical move by the ABRSM because it is challenging all that the ABRSM has stood for in over one hundred years of its operation. However, accepting that the playing of jazz music requires a different philosophical approach as well as different skills, little has changed. Lurking in the background to the point of dependence upon, are similar, if not the same devices of a carefully devised stratified framework for teaching and learning and a reward system which instills a sense of achievement through its credentialism and related prestige.

6.4 Subject Positions

The subject positions of the teachers and the pupils rely on the credentialism of the world of music in order to function in a competitive world. It is through the process of striving for credentials that teachers follow a rationalised path of learning. The subsequent credentials provide heuristic devices for prospective pupils, should they be interested, to make decisions about relevant teachers. Associated prestige is likely to be accredited to those teachers who have excelled with credentialism by those who have an understanding of the symbolism of the credentials.

Without credentials which reflect qualifications of general capability, there are no common means by which any occupation may be understood. Collins (1979:90-91) says:

> (E)ducational credentials have been the means by which much of the sinecure sector has been built up. It has provided the means of building specialized professions and technical enclaves, elaborated bureaucratic staff divisions, and in general has served to monopolize jobs for specialized

groups of workers and thus insulate them from pressures for directly productive work.

The occupation of music teaching may, arguably, be located within the definitions of a 'semi-professional' and a 'professional' occupation according to their knowledge as represented by their credentials. Both definitions of semi-professional and professional draw on distinct credentials and related prestige.

6.4.1 The Occupation of Private Music Teaching in New Zealand

The Institute of Registered Music Teachers of New Zealand (IRMT) gained its powers from the Music Teachers Act 1981. The Act provided for elected members of the newly formed Institute in New Zealand to admit members in general, to insist on their adherence to a formulated code of ethics through its own self-disciplining powers and to provide opportunities for on-going education in its specific body of knowledge (Harris, 1989:4). Private music teaching, thus, had fulfilled criteria which had been deemed necessary by those who fought for its existence, to be considered a 'profession'.

It may be curious that the occupation which had been dominated by the professionally religious Catholic sisters for over one hundred years had, among its members, not only those who saw themselves separate from other teaching occupations, but also separate from other occupations which earned a living by practising some sort of skill from the convenience of the home.

The British institutions of music are likely to have created the opportunities for the knowledge and the respective credentialism which gave birth to the idea that private music teaching was more prestigious than general school teaching let alone other back-room occupations, such as dressmaking (Belich, 1996:388), which brought in a little extra income.

6.4.2 Professions and Semi-professions

The holding of credentials and the associated status and prestige of those credentials is directly related to whether or not any occupation is viewed, not only by its own members but by society in general, as a profession or a semi-profession. The following descriptions are intended to distinguish between a profession and a semi-profession in order to understand why music teachers succeeded in creating their own self-governing and self-discipling Institute as opposed to other nurturing occupations such as general school teaching and nursing which are controlled by the state.

The established professions are considered to be law, medicine and the Church Their origins are linked to ancient times. A particular set of characteristics, when combined, distinguished these occupations from traders and artisans (Brint, 1994:26). These characteristics, according to Brint (1994:27) are:

> ... (1) high traditional social status based on direct links to the upper classes, (2) specialized occupational tasks in the division of labor that are centrally connected to the fates of individual clients, (3) the requirements of trust and full disclosure between practitioners and their clients, and (4) (usually) significant levels of formal book learning, beginning with a classical education.

Professions are also described as being able to command high incomes (Brint, 1994:66-67) and as having exemption from outside regulatory controls which, in turn, puts in place a market shelter for the specialised services. The necessity for a formal code of ethics creates the sense of collegiality recognisable within - and without - a profession (Brint, 1994:43). They are also male dominated (Witz, 1992:39-69).

Of particular significance when considering the place of the female-dominant occupation of private music teaching in the professions is Brint's observation that:

> '(O)f the four characteristics by the original professions, the element of "gentlemanly" background appears to be decisive' (Brint, 1994:27).

If music teaching is to be considered as a profession, then it is either an exception to this observation or it is not a typical 'profession'. Analysis of the register of members during 1998-99 of the IRMT who reside in the wider Auckland region shows that from a total of 316, 269 are female, 39 are male and 8, because of no identifying title, were indistinguishable. Analysis has been calculated according to titles of Mrs, Ms, Miss and Mr (Year Book, IRMT, 1998/99,1-15).

The new professions as defined by Etzioni, (1969:143) in the 1960s were:

> ... engineering, chemistry, accounting and the natural and social sciences.

Brint's (1994:49-50) definition includes people:

> ... who apply scientific knowledge to practical problems of production. This sphere includes nearly all engineers, physicists, chemists, geoscientists, biotechnology and product related medical scientists, production-centered computer scientists, mathematicians, statisticians, and economists and organizational psychologists working on practical problems of production.

Furthermore, 'professionalism' as a result of 'a mix of status anxieties and a quasi-evangelical sense of mission ...' (Brint, 1994:33) extended to include the 'helping professions' - defined as 'teaching, social work, and librarianship' (Brint, 1994:33). Music teaching may be considered within the category of 'helping professions'.

An occupation is classified as a semi-profession if it lacks one or more of the qualities which define a profession (Etzioni, 1969:144). Specifically, a semi-profession has been defined as having a shorter training period, lower status, has a less specialized body of knowledge and hence requires less formal qualifications and attracts less income, has less social power and less autonomy (Etzioni, 1969:v-xv). Members are usually employed by, and have salaries and wages set by schedules within large organisations, for example, state schools (Etzioni, 1969:7-

8). Practitioners are generally female and have shorter expectations of full-time careers for entire life (Etzioni, 1969:203-228).

6.4.3 Private Music Teaching: A Profession or a Job?

Private music teaching officially falls within the definition of a profession according to Brint (1994:27) because firstly, the occupation has direct links to the upper classes; secondly, occupational tasks, that is - tuition, takes place on an individual basis; thirdly, the occupation cannot function without trust between the practitioner and the client (pupil); fourthly, significant learning takes place before a teacher sets up in practice; fifthly, music teachers, compared to school teachers command a high hourly rate which is not regulated by a central force and finally, a code of ethics has been formulated within and affecting the practising of the occupation. Private music teaching is not, however, 'male dominated' (Witz, 1992:39-69).

Weber (1978:280) suggests three dimensions of reward in relation to an occupation: economic, social and power. The extremes of these three dimensions set up a continuum upon which professions and semi-professions may be placed. How might the occupation of private music teaching register on the Weberian dimensions of economic, social and power? Firstly, the economic dimension of the occupation is controlled by the practical aspect which restricts teaching times to before and after regular school hours and within the school teaching term. This major practical hindrance almost automatically disqualifies the occupation from being considered full-time - although teachers who have no other income and who work many, but irregular, hours including Saturdays and Sundays are likely to consider their job to be 'full-time'. Related to this dimension is socio-economic status which, for a private music teacher, is usually taken from the perspective of the primary income earner in a two-income situation unless the practitioner is male. In this case, anecdotal and hearsay evidence suggests that male music teachers hold exceptional qualifications, work longer hours and charge higher fees, all of which are reflected in a more prestigious image within the occupation.

The following excerpts from recent interviews with presently practising or retired music teachers offer some insight into Weber's first and second dimensions of reward in relation to the occupation of being a music teacher. Therese, qualified secondary school music teacher and registered teacher of classical piano, teacher of keyboard and using the new jazz syllabus spoke negatively about some practical aspects (economic) of earning a living but, in general appeared to enjoy private music teaching (social aspect). Therese describes her perspective of being a music teacher thus:

> I have twelve pupils - two are for violin, two are using an electronic keyboard and the others are all for piano. Five are following a conventional method of teaching and three are interested in the new jazz piano syllabus although two of those are more or less beginners.
>
> ... I charge $17 per half hour. It's the norm for my qualifications [BMus, ATCL (Piano), ATCL (Violin) Dip Tchg[6], AIRMT[7], DELE[8]] plus a minimum of ten years teaching experience. Some of the parents struggle to pay me I think. But I don't make a lot of money. The parents cancel for holidays abroad, for sickness or for *any* reason and I make up those lessons during the holidays - when I don't earn anything anyway. It's not easy to teach before school in the morning and then to teach after school again. A normal day's work would be better. Actually I'm relief school teaching too because I haven't got enough pupils to earn a living. I only started this year after being out of the country for several years. But I prefer individual tuition to relief teaching. The school classes can be really stressful - especially third formers who *have* to take music and who aren't interested in it anyway. The more advanced classes are good because they're there by choice. But with individual teaching it's such a buzz when a pupil understands and achieves each little thing. The worst bit is when they *don't* want to learn but the parents just think that if they keep at it they'll eventually be able to play the piano. Of course if they don't make the effort ...

[6] Dip Tchg: Diploma of Teaching from Auckland College of Education *Te Kura Akoranga O Tamaki Makaurau*

[7] AIRMT: Associate of the Institute of Registered Music Teachers of New Zealand

[8] DELE: Diploma de Español como lengua extranjera (Diploma of Spanish as a Foreign Language)

Sr Mary C. has not taught music for about 15 years and said that she does not miss music teaching. She indicated that the fragmentation of teaching into small segments of time was stressful. This concept may be understood in Weber's (1978:280) third dimension of rewards of an occupation as a form of 'powerlessness'.

> I didn't particularly want to be a music teacher. I started school teaching but after a couple of years it was clear that I wasn't suited as a school teacher so I gave music tuition ... and initially I wasn't qualified to teach music. One of the things [that] I found difficult with music teaching was having to slot my life into segments of twenty minute and half hour and forty minute and one hour ... all the time... and watching the clock six days a week. Until the last year I had about fifty pupils per week. That's why I don't miss it now. I'm so glad to not be watching the clock.

On the contrary, Maria, classical piano and keyboard teacher with some jazz training who is using the new jazz piano syllabus from the ABRSM enjoys music teaching. Maria said:

> I love teaching. I don't teach every day now. I have Mondays off. I like raw beginners. I like to get them as far ahead as possible and really make them enthusiastic. I love seeing somebody who doesn't really know anything, sort of flower into something that really can do something with music. Of course it depends on the pupil - sometimes it never happens. I do have a failure group but they are unusual.

Susan, classical piano teacher with some jazz training who is using the new jazz piano syllabus from the ABRSM, when asked if she enjoyed teaching, also replied affirmatively:

> I love it, it's great. I really do. I'd done lots of other things, taught classes, worked in Kenya then worked as a welfare officer in a college and done all sorts of different things but I finally settled on piano teaching - tuition. I love it one to one.

Whilst Maria's description of her occupation does not rank highly on Weber's economic rewards of an occupation, both Maria and Susan, like Therese, appear to enjoy 'social' rewards associated with the 'helping professions' (Brint, 1994:33).

Weber's (1978:280) social dimension of reward in relation to an occupation may also be considered in relation to imagery associated with music teaching. Because the subject which is being taught is *music* and 'spiritual' in nature (Bourdieu, 1984:19), the occupation tends to be perceived as practised by those who are slightly detached from an awareness of every day needs of food, warmth and shelter. Socially, therefore, the occupation is perceived as 'Bohemian', or slightly unconventional, in character. For example, it is generally understood that the Catholic sisters taught music because it was part of their spirituality. On the contrary, however, the sisters openly claim that they taught music to earn money and support their own communities.

Weber's economic and social dimension of an occupation as illustrated in these excerpts, appears to be dependent not only upon the individual teacher's credentials but also his/her reputation. Reputation, in this sense, may also reflect prestige as perceived among the teaching fraternity and those who patronise.

Finally, with Weber's third dimension of an occupation - 'power' in mind, private music teachers are free of state control of their income and free to control the number of hours worked - per week, per term and per year. Whether this established qualification for a profession or a semi-profession is still relevant is perhaps debatable. Music teaching as an occupation, qualifies as a profession as defined by Brint (1994) and Etzioni (1969). However, contrary to the well known professions of medicine and law, the profession of private music teaching is unquestionably dominated by female practitioners. This factor disqualifies it as a

profession according to Witz (1992). In this respect, the occupation is similar to the semi-professions of school teaching and nursing. Furthermore, unlike the professions of law and medicine, and semi-professions of school teaching and nursing, it is not illegal to practise music teaching without either any formal qualifications or formal registration. The benign nature of the abstract body of knowledge is likely to explain this situation. This 'benign nature' refers to knowledge about music being subjective and non-life threatening.

In conclusion, although registered private music teachers believe their occupation to be a profession (Jennings, 1982:16-18; Harris, 1989:4) it does not tidily fit with formal definitions of a profession as offered by Etzioni (1969), Brint (1994), and Witz (1992). The inconvenient and restricting of hours of work, the general lack of social significance of its abstract body of knowledge outside the world of music, as well as its female dominated membership detract from an overall prestigious image associated with a professional occupation. However, where the occupation *does* neatly fit within definitions of a profession makes consideration of the occupation as a semi-profession, problematic.

6.4.4 Foregone Conclusions?

For Bourdieu, the ease with which the dominant classes operate in the world because of their *'habitus'*, affects their chances of success as their behaviour is recognised, understood and approved of by those in power - that is, by other members of the dominant class. Thus, claims Bourdieu (1977:152-162), professions self-recruit as a result of self-elimination by those who feel alienated by the understood procedures of the dominant class.

Long before the stage of self-recruitment in the world of music teaching/learning however, paths of learning are put in place as a result of value-judgements made by the teacher about a pupil's *'class habitus'*. The criteria by which a teacher is likely to make a decision which will enable a pupil to follow either the classical or the jazz syllabus is likely to differ little from decisions made in the past about whether or not a pupil should follow the structured path of classical learning as

devised by the British Institutions - *or not*. Attitudes which the pupil brings into the music room from the home may bear upon the ultimate outcome of a pupil's pattern of instruction. The *possibility* or the *impossibility* of the pupil either succeeding to a notable level in the graded system or eventually becoming a 'professional' music teacher may be apparent from the onset of lessons *because* the teacher has already perceived the existence of that which cannot be taught, that is - attitude reflecting the understood values of the dominant class beyond the immediacy of playing the musical instrument itself. This situation is recognisable in Bernstein's (1977:82) observation of the 'screening' of school pupils by their teachers. He says:

> (P)upils and students are ... carefully screened to see who belongs and who does not belong. And once such screening has taken place, it is often very difficult, sometimes impossible, to change one's educational identity. With specialized education the sheep have to be very quickly separated from the goats and the goats are invested with attributes of pollution. Your membership category is established relatively early and your particular status in a given collection is made clear by streaming, examining and a delicate system of grades. Subject loyalty is systematically developed in pupils and students ... The system is self-perpetuating'.

For Bernstein, heuristic devices are used by the teacher in order to conclude upon an approach to teaching. They are based upon perceptions of the teacher, through imagery associated with social class, of both a pupil's intelligence and his/her expectations of knowledge. Maria, spoke of her observations within a family which reflect, in the private music teaching situation, Bernstein's observation in the classroom situation:

> The boy who sat Grade One [jazz piano] yesterday is finishing [lessons]. He came this morning. He's already done grade one classical - this [jazz piano] was just to keep him interested. He started off with enthusiasm - but his parents are away a lot and he didn't get much support. ... Their piano is not very good. The piano is untuneable [sic] because it's - the family have come from overseas - brought the piano with them - it's been in the family for quite a while. It's got a wooden frame and it is untuneable [sic] and certain notes don't even work. That makes it very difficult for a child to get an appreciation of what they're doing. And the parents are overseas right now - for the *exam.* These kids are looked after by a house-sitter that keeps the place going. And I know he [the pupil] did work under sufferance during the holidays. His parents aren't behind him. They seem to have some background of music - she can play the piano - but she's very busy and so often not there even. And you have to have a workable, in tune piano - at least that it makes a pleasant enough sound that if you do something it responds a little bit. And you have to have peace and quiet and some idea of structure [of time] - that you've got time to fit it in a regular way. They are a bit pushed for money but that wouldn't be a primary issue. There's no way that this historical instrument - and there's not room in the house for another one and there's no way they're letting the historical one they've brought from overseas go - it's from their homeland and it's been in the family for generations - the fact that it's terrible - untuneable [sic] and broken - doesn't seem to matter ....

Maria said that as she had a waiting list for pupils she did not encourage this boy to continue with his music lessons. Does not the attitude of a teacher passing a judgement about the norms, expectations and capabilities of a pupil in order to provide instruction reflect the pre-Enlightenment mentality when education was informal, that is, the acquisition of knowledge took place within the daily experience of life (Bauman, 1987:69) as discussed (pages 141-142). Are not music teachers simply *attempting* to enhance whatever cultural norm, or 'cultural capital' (Fowler, 1997:31) is already there – or already *obvious?* Indeed the new syllabus from the ABRSM opens up many opportunities to do this. Whilst music teaching in this country, and possibly others, in the early to late-middle years of the 1900s, as suggested in Chapter two, *did* attempt to teach the subject without regard for norms, abilities and expectations of the pupil, it appears that this attitude caused more frustration in both teachers and pupils than it created musicians. Therefore, the taking of music lessons may be considered as *formal* learning at one level whilst the judgements made about a person's *habitus* may be considered to

embrace qualities of informal education or education within the daily experience of life (Bauman, 1987:69).

Whilst expectations of *more* than Bernstein's suggestion of the perfunctory nature of the 'self perpetuating system' should perhaps always be a consideration, the practice of teaching that which has been deemed correct and proper by institutions of musical knowledge may be considered the *cause* of why jazz music was frowned upon in private studios of classical music teachers *until* the ABRSM, along with other institutions, for example, polytechnics and universities, acknowledged an existence of *complex rationali**ties*** – as opposed *to absolute rationali**ty***.

Considering Bernstein's (1977:82) words as quoted earlier '(P)upils and students are ... carefully screened to see who belongs and who does not belong', the following is a reply to the question 'What signs do you look for in a new pupil to decide whether or not he/she should learn classical music or try the new jazz syllabus, or indeed to follow an exam system at all? Therese spoke of the importance which she places on initial contact:

> You can almost tell from the first telephone conversation what to expect. The first give-away of a slack attitude is when the parent says they want little Johnny to 'just enjoy it' - because it's not that easy. A pupil has to be fascinated and enjoy really simple sounds for a long time. I can make lessons fun - non-threatening, but I can't make the practice in their home 'fun'. Other parents, usually those who have gone up to about Grade Five or Six or more - themselves - understand the benefits of having to sit an exam so they really want their children to do that too. You can work all this out pretty much straight away - during the first conversation. Then others surprise you because they've not come from a background of understanding much about learning the piano but they like the idea of sitting an exam and getting a certificate. I always encourage the exam system, it's a wonderfully safe system to follow and it means *I'm* in control - *not* the pupil or the parent. This new syllabus is such a bonus for teaching those kids who come from a home where nothing other than light or pop music is heard. But they still have to work day after day, you know, plod away. But you can never be sure. I always have an open mind of course because a new pupil - or the parents, have expectations about what they're going to learn. It's a matter of keeping them interested by fulfilling those hopes as well as working out how far I think they'll go on *any* path.

The following is a reply from Michael, to the question 'Who decided that your pupils would sit this jazz piano exam?'

> We took a look at the syllabus last year and we said - yes, this looks pretty exciting for some of our students. We advertised that we would do it as a trial for this year and see how it went. We got a large response initially but when it came to the crunch there aren't many going through it. At the end of the day we said - this isn't a pressure situation - it's totally up to you. But we really picked in our minds and we *knew* which families would be interested in it and sure enough - *they* are the ones who came forward - those families where milestones are important - recognition - good for CVs [curricula vitae] - those sorts of things. If somebody came forward who we didn't think would do well, we would have said 'no.' But at the end of the day, we were very clear - it had to be the pupil's and the parent's decision - if they didn't *want* to do it we wouldn't have forced them to do it.

The reply from Susan to the same question was:

> You tend to get parents who say - we want our child to do this - and *this* - and **this** - which is the classically based music. And obviously they don't know anything about this jazz syllabus or they'd think that this is not the right thing for my child. They just think - we want our child to be classically trained. But I had a couple of kids who were about 13 - 14, at a secondary school where I was teaching. They were doing fine with the classical but they were getting bored - they just wanted something a bit different. So I gave them some Christopher Norton Microjazz which I was able to convince the parents was good for their skills as well as just being a bit of fun - and then they went back to classical so we mixed it in together. But it depends upon the character of the parent and the character of the child. If the child is interested then they'll want to do it right - you can see who's the one who's doing the pushing.
>
> ... It is a social thing. You know, my child will do better at classical exams - we've got to get our *exams* - but *jazz* exam? It's not quite got the same cache. But I think that will come - now that they've formalised it.

Maria, Therese, Michael and Susan all indicated that they are alert to what they consider to be norms and expectations of their pupils and parents. Simultaneously, they appeared to be aware of the need to be open minded about methods of

teaching. In conclusion, it seems that these teachers would change the direction of their teaching following signs of specific interest and specific ability, or - on the contrary, the general lack of interest and overall, general absence of ability in and by the pupil. Bernstein's suggestion that pupils are 'carefully screened by their teachers to see who belongs and who does not belong' does not appear to be strictly true in the world of music teaching. It appears to be a matter of deciding *where*, on the continuum of knowledge about, and performance of, music, the pupil belongs - for the time being.

6.4.5 The Formal Credentials

The occupation of music teaching is shrouded in credentialism. Prestige may be bestowed by those who hold qualifications and by those who recognise some worth. For those who do not, credentialism is often evident simply by the amount charged for lessons given, or it is irrelevant. Susan and Therese were asked their opinions about their own qualifications. Susan replied:

> I had already started teaching when I did my ATCL. I was doing it as a modular thing over about three years in London. But it's amazing how many people don't ask you what your qualifications are. They just assume that because so and so has recommended you, that you're fine. But for myself - I wanted to know that I was good enough to teach. So I wanted my qualifications. They [the parents] can see the results - if the child hasn't been happy, hasn't been learning much after a term or two, there'd be some questions, but otherwise, no questions.

Therese's opinions differed little:

I started teaching again in this country after being away for several years. I advertised in the local paper and I arranged for a few hundred flyers to go around the neighbourhood letter boxes. I had all my qualifications on the flyer - abbreviated of course. I felt that they showed that I could teach and it probably did. But in the end they come to you firstly because you're handy - you know. Handy Andy the music teacher. I got about eight pupils this way and since then another four have made contact as a result of hearing about me through the first ones. Nobody actually asks me what my qualifications stand for. In fact one of the qualifications I use 'DELE' which stands for *Diploma de Español como lengua extranjera* or Diploma of Spanish as a Foreign Language - is quite irrelevant to music teaching. Nobody asks me what that or anything else means. I guess in the end they are judging my abilities by how I teach just like I'm judging theirs by how they learn ... .

Both Susan and Therese indicated that their credentials mattered little to parents and pupils beyond their proven ability to teach in the practical teaching situation. However, as they are both well qualified to teach, it is assumed that their teaching ability is apparent to both parents and pupils. Judgements about the capabilities of teachers are likely to be made as intuitively as the judgements were made by Maria, Therese, Michael and Susan, in the previous section, about their pupils' expectations and ability to learn.

6.4.6 The Future of the Occupation

Now that jazz music has been incorporated into the teaching framework of the formal educational institutions of music, new perceptions of professional identity are likely to create tensions and challenges as well as opportunities for the teachers of both genres of music. As Bauman (1992:29) notes when discussing the fragmented relationships which grow from the climate of postmodernity:

> (T)he combined effect of all these departures from the axioms and canons ... is the overall impression of disorientation and chaos.

The 'disorientation and chaos' is likely to spring from a sense that musical knowledge is threatened by the divisions which will come into existence as a

result of the two distinct perceptions of how to go about making music. They are both specialist areas. Bernstein (1977:82) refers to this situation thus:

> ... it is not uncommon to find border disputes between subjects as to what does and does not belong. If knowledge is regarded as *sacred* under collection, it also appears to be very similar to *private property* with various kinds of symbolic fences, and the people who own the knowledge look rather like monopolists.

Might these words aptly describe the situation in which teachers of both classical music and jazz music now find themselves? Until the recent incorporation of jazz music into the curriculum of the ABRSM, neither groups of teachers had need to question their place in the order of musical knowledge. So what might the effects be now? Perhaps those teachers who are exceptionally knowledgeable about classical music will be the least likely to be either attracted to the new syllabus or threatened by the innovations in the institutionalised world of music. At another level, some music teachers who struggle to make a living from dwindling numbers of pupils may welcome the opportunity to expand their music teaching practice. A third group is likely to be teachers who have always had a curiosity to understand jazz music and who have the time to make the effort to relearn. Finally, jazz musicians/teachers who have never been subjected to the rules and regulations of these formal institutions may also evaluate, or re-evaluate their place in the order of 'things'.

Rodney, contemporary music (including jazz) piano and keyboard player and teacher of both classical and contemporary (including jazz) and a music retailer, when asked about this cross-road in music teaching replied:

> There are quite a few people who are established as classical teachers who are showing a great interest in it - and to their credit, they are finding out about it and anybody who can give them some insight into it is going to be in hot demand - people like Charlie Beale [jazz piano examiner from ABRSM and educator for teachers] who can make them feel comfortable about it. A lot of people are quite afraid of the whole concept. It's a challenge for classical teachers.

Michael, contemporary music teacher stated categorically:

> I would imagine that the classical teachers are under-equipped to work with the new jazz piano syllabus.

Therese, a hitherto, classical music teacher who is using the new jazz syllabus for teaching purposes, when asked 'why did you want to try the new syllabus?' replied:

> I had passed my ATCL practical piano at 16 when I was in the seventh form. Everybody seemed to think I was so clever but when somebody wanted me to play something I couldn't really play anything for fun. I had played a Beethoven sonata and a Bach prelude and fugue and a Rondo by Bartok virtually from memory but I wouldn't play the piano informally so to speak. So I've always wanted, in a way, to be a different kind of pianist. This syllabus is giving me the opportunity to do that. But it's not to be taken lightly - work, *work and work.*

Rodney, Michael and Therese all acknowledged that the new syllabus is a challenge to classical music teachers. However, it appears that, for those who are interested, it is a welcome challenge.

The teaching/learning of a different music genre may operate independently and therefore, somewhat invisibly to those teachers and pupils who hold steadfastly to traditional teaching and learning practices. On the contrary, one may set the tone of the other in some sort of uncompromising marriage. It is imagined that it will be a matter of time until diplomas for teaching and/or performing jazz music are available in this genre. Should this eventuate, formal recognition of musical abilities and capabilities will culminate in specific qualifications for jazz musicians which will, in turn, enable these teachers to register in New Zealand as jazz music teachers according to the Music Teachers Act 1981. This is not to say that it is not possible to register as a music teacher without formal qualifications but with proven ability to teach, it is to say that registration *with* accompanying

formal qualifications may take place. Ultimately, perceived prestige associated with professional registration within the Institute of Registered Music Teachers (IRMT) may begin to form within the jazz teaching fraternity itself.

However, prestige, within this format may not necessarily be desired as the following excerpts from two jazz musicians and contemporary music teachers indicates. Michael elaborated:

> I'm not a registered music teacher. I have no particular desire to be. I don't see it as particularly important in today's society. I don't think in all the years of teaching and running a business I've ever been asked if I'm a registered teacher - no, I haven't, ever. I would never have a problem saying I wasn't. I presume a registered teacher has gone through the classical system. So assuming you wanted to be a classical music teacher, there is an argument for that but I think that to be a piano teacher today - because the piano is certainly ***not*** just a classical instrument I don't see any reason why a piano teacher should have registered status - not at all. Having gone through that system one might be a very good classical musician - no doubt the ability to teach in the latter grades. I've come across teachers who are registered and are very good musicians, and I would class my teacher in this as well, that couldn't teach or communicate knowledge to save themselves. What is more important - the ability as a musician or the ability as a communicator? I think that there is a very delicate balance - the ability to inspire, to educate, has to be weighted up against the ability of a musician. They both have to have a very high level. We use the name of our company for prestige.

When asked 'How do you think jazz musicians feel about the Institute of Registered Music Teachers?' Rodney, unregistered teacher of classical and jazz piano with a Grade Eight qualification said:

> I think there are so many teachers out there who are not part of that whole scene - the registered side of things. It must have its advantages. You have to have certain qualifications to be part of it - it's like having a Masters Builders Association - it does give people a certain guarantee that teachers have got certain qualifications. Jazz musicians are probably more interested in being acknowledged among themselves. It's a bit of a dichotomy because musicians have a fear of organisations. The attempt to form a musicians' union would be a good example of that - everybody pays lip service - yes, that would be a great idea to have a musicians' union because you could then use your mass to improve conditions for musicians and for rates of pay and so on but when it comes to the crunch it's every man and woman for himself or herself.

Maria, well qualified and registered music teacher, agreed with Michael and Rodney by saying that it appears, to her, that nobody is interested in whether or not she is a registered music teacher. Maria explained:

> I never advertise, I get recommendations. I've got my qualifications hanging on the wall in my studio but nobody asks. But the diploma and things are a learning process - becoming registered is quite a mammoth task. I'm very glad I did those big exams - and registered ... .

Therese, like Maria, sees the value of obtaining registration. Therese said:

> It was hard work becoming registered. It involves three years of provisional membership during which time you have to present a lot of info to the IRMT about the exam passes of your students and prove that you are taking an interest in on-going education - seminars and things. All this is *after* you've completed the three exams for the diploma [ATCL comprising performance, musical knowledge and principles of teaching]. But having been through all that, I know I learnt a lot. I've got the confidence to deal with parents especially those who have done a few exams themselves and think they know everything - not so much now but that was a bit of a problem when I was teaching in my teens and early twenties.

To summarise how the occupation of music teaching may be affected by the introduction of the new jazz piano syllabus, it appears that personal and cultural qualities of a teacher may create a dichotomy within the teaching circles with the most talented, most educated teachers and most capable of each genre firmly located each end. A continuum may appear between the two genres of music created by the intellectually curious, the musically frustrated, the hard working and those with an entrepreneurial business sense. To be a 'registered' music teacher as understood by belonging to the IRMT cannot be a sought credential by jazz pianists until the passing of an appropriate diploma from either the ABRSM or the TCL provides the qualifying credential as well as the framework within which a teacher proves his/her teaching abilities. Susan and Therese, who are registered teachers are both pleased to have had the experience of becoming

registered even if the qualification of AIRMT after their name is not understood by parents or pupils. On the contrary, for Rodney and Michael, registration itself is of little importance to their personal identity of presenting as a jazz music teacher. Indeed Charles Beale, jazz examiner from the ABRSM, claimed that registration itself, whilst offering some proof of musical knowledge and ability to teach does not necessarily make one a good musician. The question might then become - does that matter? The sisters themselves with fine reputations as successful teachers are not known as performers. It would appear that performing was neither considered appropriate to their religious life nor necessary for their skills of music teaching. This is not to say that the sisters did not perform in religious services. It is to say that performing itself was not a priority within their world of music teaching.

Charles Beale, when asked if the reasons for considering extending the present jazz piano programme to diploma level are to do with enabling a profession qualification replied:

> That's certainly what it's about, at one level. But I think there's a danger that we end up with qualified teachers who can't play. You could argue that that's already happened in classical music teaching.

6.5 Conclusion

To be known to be knowledgeable about music might be a prestigious thing because music, as Bourdieu (1984:19) succinctly describes it:

> ... is the most 'spiritual' of the arts of the spirit and a love of music is a guarantee of 'spirituality'.

It may not be surprising that not only are credentials which represent musical knowledge readily available, they are relentlessly sought by those for whom the holding of credentials is important. However, continues Bourdieu (1984:19) :

> ... musical culture is something other than a quantity of knowledge and experiences combined with the capacity to talk about them. ... For a bourgeois world which conceives its relation to the populace in terms of the relationship of the soul to the body, insensitivity to music doubtless represents a particularly unavowable form of materialistic coarseness.

Recent as Bourdieu's words are, there appears to be an assumption that the 'music' to which he refers is 'classical'. Sixteen years later jazz music appears to be nudging classical music out of its prime position of being the credential bestowal and the prestige earner.

Credentialism and associated prestige, it has been argued firstly, are pragmatic devices for the on-going success of the formal educational institutions of music. The initial idea that credentialism and prestige differ according to socially inherited norms was evident in the different ways that credentialism and prestige are obtained within classical and jazz music teaching and performing. Scrutiny of institutionalised motivating conditions for the development of classical and jazz music confirmed, secondly, that a rationalised and structured framework is in place for the purpose of teaching and learning. Reference was made specifically to programmes of teaching/learning as offered by the ABRSM and the TCL. The success of this graded system of teaching has been accredited to the strength gained from the bestowing of credentials by these institutions. Finally, it was evident that the gaining of credentials and the obtaining of associated prestige makes the structured framework for teaching and learning purposes attractive to both teachers and pupils.

An argument has been presented in this chapter that the teachers, the pupils and the parents all seek, for differing reasons, credentials and its associated prestige as offered through the structured music teaching/learning programmes of the British institutions of music.

Chapter Seven

Conclusion

7.1 Context of the Thesis

The musically brilliant like Mozart and Beethoven are likely to be understood, even outside the world of music, as having made major contributions to the development of classical music. Similarly, names like Louis Armstrong and Ella Fitzgerald are likely to be recognised outside the world of music for bringing jazz music to the fore in the Western world. This thesis has *not* been about these individual contributors. It has been about forces and factors in every day society which have hedged and buffered, nurtured and nourished, the development of music regardless of the quills and pens, fingers and voices, of the musically brilliant.

This thesis has identified motivating conditions which have affected the development of both classical and jazz music. The isolation of specific conditions in which the musically brilliant have composed and performed is not to undermine the genius of their contributions. It is to suggest that the conditions themselves provided stimulus and consequently, had enormous influence on their musical compositions and/or performances.

Reference to 'development of music' in this thesis has not been to suggest that music got better and better as, for example, the 'development' of the motorcar or brain surgery. It was, on the contrary, suggested that musical preference is not static. This idea was exemplified by the major change of style by composers, in the 1700s, from *polyphony*, or contrapuntal, to *homophony,* or harmonic. Neither style has ever been considered superior to the other. Similarly, discussion about

the development of jazz music in the 20th century does not necessarily imply continuous improvement causing abandonment of former ideas. Discussion of 'development' is to suggest that preference causes change - and change in turn affects preference. This was evident in the development of jazz music in the 20th century. Exemplification of criticism, ridicule and negative legislation of jazz music up until the 1960s was presented in order to highlight the former low status of this music genre. It appears that it was *society* which had changed by the 1990s and *not* this style of music, when it was being considered for and finally accepted alongside classical music within educational institutions of musical knowledge.

7.2 Rationale

For more than a century from the late 1870's, the British institutions of music, the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) and the Trinity College of Music London (TCL) introduced knowledge about 'classical' music only. It was believed that the absolute 'truth' about music could be found in this style and form. In recent years, however, the popularity of jazz in the Western world is such that the ABRSM has created an entire syllabus, separate and distinct from the classical syllabus. Trying to understanding the circumstances of the creation of this syllabus provoked questions around the construction of knowledge in general - that is, how, why, where and by whom is knowledge constructed?

7.3 Theoretical Framework

The ideas which informed the search for motivating conditions for the development of music were Hunt's (1993) *modes of regulation*. This concept offered a framework within which specific motivating forces and factors within religious, social, political and institutional regimes were able to be identified. It was by looking at *where and under what conditions classical music became prevalent*, that various modes of regulation were identified. Firstly, the Catholic

Church, by making direct associations between music and spirituality was seen to control and influence the development of this form and style of music for several centuries from the 9th century onward. Catholicism, by the 16th century, was no longer accepted by the populace as being the absolute authority on spirituality. The consequent Reformation in the 16th century not only divided attitudes and beliefs about Christianity but provided another major context within which composers of classical music were able to express themselves at a more earthly-recognisable level. Concurrent to the Reformation were changing social conditions in Europe which saw musicians, with the status of servants, invited to live in the homes of the aristocracy in order to provide entertainment. The system of patronage had been the domain of the Christian Churches. However, patronage, by expanding into secular life, altered the motivating conditions for musicians yet again. Institutionalisation of musical knowledge in the 1800s, it was argued, altered the motivating conditions to the point where they are recognisable in the year 2000. The ABRSM and the TCL were considered using Hunt's three dimensions of his concept of modes of regulation in order to understand how these institutions of musical knowledge successfully function in the 95 countries of the world where they operate.

To consider the same question - *where and under what conditions did jazz music become prevalent* invited consideration of different motivating conditions. Whilst classical music has a long history set within the perimeters of the powerful and influential in European society, the story of the development of jazz music is set within negative social forces of bondage, racism and musical illiteracy. It has been argued that it was upon this musical style, as it developed in the world of black musicians without the sophistication of rationalised knowledge, that imagery of musical worthlessness was cast by 'educated' musicians.

Whilst an abundance of modes of regulation was identified in the development of classical music in Europe, not so obvious were modes of regulation in the development of jazz music in the United States of America. Of significance here, however, was the idea that the *absence* of motivating conditions, or the *presence*

of negative conditions, for this genre of music with connections of lowly social status, contributed to its development.

Hunt's (1993) framework of modes of regulation provided a useful analytical tool with which to search for motivating conditions in the world of musical composition and performance. It helped to identify major influential factors in the development of both classical music and jazz music.

7.4 Supporting Theoretical Considerations

This thesis was led by a search for supporting theories which offered an explanation for music *per se* to be accredited with perceptions relating to spirituality, sexuality, entertainment, prestige, credentialism, personal identity, and cultural and social class norms. It was considered that these perceptions about music generated and regenerated the motivating conditions. The following theories were presented as possible explanations for attitudes which may exist within the confinements *and* within the freedoms of musical development as understood by the concept *motivating conditions.*

The idea of musical knowledge having 'gatekeepers' was informed by Bauman's theories and ideas in relation to how *anything* may be *known* to be *'right'* (1987, 1992). The 'superiority' of classical music as it has been understood in Western culture was considered in light of the intellectual climates of modernity and postmodernity as discussed by Bauman. Institutionalisation of music in the 1800s in Britain was considered in this thesis to reflect all that is understood within a 'modern' mentality. It was concluded that the inclusion of jazz music under the administrative body of the ABRSM differs little in attitude from the rationalisation of classical music by this institution over one hundred years ago. Both rationalisations reflect an intellectual climate as understood in 'modernity'. That said, the argument that the ABRSM may be considered to be postmodern in its thinking about jazz music had attractions. What was perhaps more satisfying than concluding one way or the other on this topic was the idea that formal knowledge

about music requires enormous effort in order to be institutionalised *and* to hold respect in a society which also 'knows' about music.

The power of the market forces in the 20th century as the new rulers of the cultural domain, it was argued, affect and influence objective intellectual criticism in the world of music. However, it was concluded that while the new market forces have commodified music *per se*, they are not dictatorial. The institutions of music continue to influence the cultural domain of musical preference as they educate not only the composers and the performers but also the listening public who attend concerts and buy electronic recordings. However, it was suggested that market forces as opposed to the institutions, instigated the popularity of jazz music. The institutions, in turn, responded to the popularity by rationalising the essential character of this musical style and its forms, and by implementing structured programmes for teaching and learning purposes. This discussion was informed by the ideas of Bauman (1992).

The idea that musical preference may be understood in terms of social class norms and expectations was considered in relation to perceptions of which social class is likely to be attracted to what kind of music, and why. Of significance in this discussion was the rise of the *nouveaux riches* from approximately the middle of the 19th century in Europe and the subsequent intermingling of upper and lower middle class attitudes and norms. The ideas of Polish, 20th century sociologist Mokrzycki, (1996) provided a context within which ideas about musical preference may be recognised in social class norms and expectations.

Strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices, as concepts, were considered in order to understand the successful functioning for over one hundred years of the British institutions of music as examining bodies and as gatekeepers of the abstract body of knowledge about music in Western culture. It was argued that these institutions rely on certain social norms and certain methods of inculcation in order for knowledge, as constructed within the institutions, to be perpetuated.

Of significance in this country, New Zealand, was the idea that the Catholic sisters who came here as missionaries were the gatekeepers of musical knowledge for

over one hundred years from the time of their arrival in 1836. The idea of professionally religious women excelling at music teaching provoked consideration about discipline as it may be imposed by, and accepted from, authoritative regimes. Weber's (1958) theories about self discipline and *'the calling'* as a way of life offered explanations of the devotion of the sisters as they worked as music teachers in order to support their missionary communities. It was Foucault (1995) however, who was drawn upon in order to understand the focused attitude which the Catholic sisters showed in their teaching practices.

A curiosity arose about the appeal which the British institutions of music in general have in order to attract a clientele which not only pays for their structured learning programmes but which presents itself to be examined according to their standards. Rose's (1999) reading of Foucault's (1991) concept of *governmentality* was considered as an explanation for mental attitudes in society which accept the governance of authority for the common good to the point that individual self-policing in order to conform takes place. Rose's suggestion that governmentality comes about as certain knowledge is problematised by 'experts' in order to bring attention to some perceived worth helped to explain how knowledge about both classical and jazz is constructed within the British institutions of music. Furthermore, Rose's suggestion that knowledge is sought, subsequently, as individuals seek approval by these 'experts' in order to enhance self-identity in relation to a perception about cultural and social norms offered an understanding of why music teachers and their pupils consider examination success a vital part of learning how to play a musical instrument.

The key point of this discussion was to suggest that new norms about jazz music are in the making. It was argued that the new cultural norms, along with strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices, increasingly imprison human subjects into seeking approval from the institutions of music by conforming, to their expectations about what *should* be known and understood about jazz music through the taking of examinations. Whilst the negative aspect of this perception of the construction of knowledge was acknowledged, it was suggested that the positive outcome of the constructed, or problematised, knowledge about music by

the British institutions of music is that a structured programme of learning about 'how to' play a musical instrument is in place for those who wish to take advantage.

Following on from the discussion which looked for strategies of socialisation and disciplinary devices as they were seen to affect the world of music were theories about *credentialism and prestige* as they contribute to the generation and regeneration of the motivating conditions for the development of music. The striving for credentials and associated prestige, it was argued, may be seen as influencing unwittingly, the development of music. This discussion invited consideration of how the two genres of music which have developed from different cultures and different social class norms and expectations, may *equally* reflect credentialism and prestige under the single new administrative locus.

Bauman's (1992) concept of an 'imagined community' led to a consideration of new meanings which are likely to develop within the world of music teaching and learning. The 'new meanings' are related to the understanding brought by the classical and jazz music fraternities to standards of playing and examination performances because of the different understandings about music-making as a result of the newly institutionalised jazz music. Credentialism and prestige, it was argued, rely on mutual understandings of meaning in order to be meaningful. Foucault's (1980) ideas in relation to mechanisms of power offered an insight into underlying controls as may function in the 'imagined community'. It was suggested that the shared meanings of the teachers and pupils within the classical and jazz music fraternities indicates that the power of the institutions has separated from its original source and is perpetuated by those whom it was designed to control. It was suggested that creation of an imagined community which will perpetuate the knowledge about jazz music as presented by the ABRSM, is forming wherever this institution operates.

The concepts of credentialism and prestige were also informed by the work of Bourdieu (1984). Bourdieu offered explanations for the seeking of credentials located within the striving for a 'good' or 'better' personal identity by

achievement within a world which demarcates cultural norms on an *actual* scale. The *invented,* or *imagined* nature of this scale does not, it was argued, detract from its respectability. The development of music, it was considered, depends upon those who seek and hold formal credentials. The following concepts as presented by Bourdieu were used in this thesis in order to understand *who* learns music and why.

Bourdieu's ideas about the 'aristocracy of culture' suggesting that, as any society must have one dominant culture, a person's social success will depend on his/her relationship to that dominant culture, led to a consideration of how the institutionalisation of jazz music will affect status within social class identity.

Bourdieu's concept of *habitus,* that is the *internalised* condition which enables an understanding to be made between structures which exist in society and personal practical activity 'being shaped by the former and regulating the latter', (Brubaker, 1985:758) offered an understanding of the ease with which the dominant classes operate in the world. In this thesis it offered an explanation for the ease with which pupils who are socialised in classical music respond effortlessly to understanding its body of knowledge whilst others respond more readily to the rhythms and sounds of contemporary music.

Continuing to argue that the motivating conditions for the development of music have been generated and regenerated by social forces and factors in society brought the occupation of music teaching into focus. Weber's (1978) theories informed this discussion. He suggests that there are three dimensions of reward in relation to an occupation - *economic, social and power.* The occupation of music teaching was examined using these dimensions in order to place it within broader concepts of an occupation. Brint's definition of a profession and a semi-profession, *conditionally* located music teaching within the category of being a 'profession'. This discussion highlighted the differing amounts of credentialism, status and prestige which are associated with the two different genres of music, classical and jazz.

7.5 Future Considerations

It was suggested, in this thesis, that the institutionalisation of jazz music creates a new style of music. The new style may embrace an atmosphere of a night club as classical music embraced an atmosphere of religious edifices and aristocratic homes. However, in a 20th and 21st century performing situations, churches, aristocratic homes and night clubs have been replaced, broadly speaking, by concert halls. This ***re***placement ***re***moves the aspect of religious affiliation, personal commitment and/or social interaction. The new musical experience may be, if chosen, reduced to an intellectual communication between the performer(s) and the auditor. This choice was not available in the aforementioned venues. Therefore the venue itself affects the actuality of the music, bringing something new.

It is concluded that the institutionalisation of music away from the church, private homes, albeit 'castles', and night clubs presents objective conditions for the development of music. However, this raises the question of whether or not coldly objective conditions which divide knowledge into segments of examinable material, are sufficiently motivating for a phenomenon like music to 'develop'. What the present motivating conditions are, besides the gaining of credentialism and prestige, is difficult to answer. It is also possible, however, that the cold objective conditions may offer more freedom to musicians than they have ever had before.

The coming together of classical and jazz music under one administrative regime, the ABRSM among other institutions of musical knowledge, has been presented in this thesis as a challenge to all that has been, hitherto, understood about the absolute nature of 'music'. Clearly, new opportunities and choices have become available within the world of music teaching/learning. An underlying question in this thesis has been - what happens to both genres now that they are considered musically and intellectually equal? The forces and factors which were identified as generating and regenerating the motivating conditions have been splintered as a result of the amalgamation of the two paths of musical development. Personal

identity as previously constructed out of credentialism and prestige, whether formal or informal, becomes smudged as the rules for obtaining them are altered. Similarly, perceptions of self within social class norms become vague.

In contemplation of the future, Charles Beale, who, among others, devised and implemented the jazz piano programme at the ABRSM, believes that jazz piano at the ABRSM will not topple classical music. In an interview held with him he indicated that the ABRSM, for practical reasons, will take its direction from the teachers who support its structured programmes. In light of that statement, it appears that it would take enormous amounts of energy by jazz music teachers in order to make an impact on the status quo. Beale offered his perception of teaching attitudes at the present time:

> I think teachers are stuck where they are - at the moment, and they've got their own images around clusters of the relationships between classical and jazz in a way. I have to start from ***there*** because that's where ***they*** are. As far as the syllabus is concerned, it's burrowing its own furrows somewhere else and trying to make sure the standards are comparable. We've thought very carefully about making them comparable.

That said, when asked 'How do you think that the classical music teachers who have taught for many years are enjoying the jazz piano syllabus'? Beale replied:

> They seem to have a ***need*** to do it - which I find very surprising. It certainly wasn't part of our original idea. We were looking for jazz musicians to teach jazz music - that's kind of - well, obvious. As it's turned out - but there is some future research to be done here, the ***need*** that classical musicians have to do jazz is a very strong one. I don't know where it originates. It might originate from the 1960s and the big social changes that happened then. The 'sin' as it were, of playing by ear or making up the rhythm - having your wrist slapped - that's exactly what changed in the 1960s. I think that anyone who was there in 1968-69, you know - all the big festivals and the moment when pop music became big business and the moment when it all became big progressive moral change and the music came to symbolise that. All the people who were teenagers then and who are in their forties now - they don't have a problem with jazz. It's the parents who are the key to who does which exams.

Beale described the success of the new jazz piano programme in the United Kingdom:

> We sold 100,000 jazz albums in the first six months to people on the Board's existing data base - that is to ***classical*** music teachers. There definitely aren't 100,000 jazz educators in the U.K. - they simply aren't there. But there are a lot of classical musicians, *amateur professionals,* whatever - who are curious about it - and who jumped on it and said this is the way in for me to do something that I've always wanted to do. This is what **I** get - oh ... I've always wanted somebody to give me the structure - the way in that felt comfortable. So the teachers themselves are sitting the exams as well as the kids - it's very exciting. It's surprising the ways it's being used - that we hadn't expected and it seems that it's meeting some kind of need that's been built up over a long time - a need for jazz in the classical fraternity and ***that*** is what interests me as a researcher and an observer and a reflector on jazz education on what's happening. And that's why it's **so** important - if we can get the seminars running in all the places where it's happening, it's suddenly this thing that is really quite small - jazz piano for goodness sake - it's not going to challenge the whole structure of classical music but it seems as though it might do something quite important - a questioning of the perspective of piano teachers. Because everywhere I go - I've done it here and I've done it in the States, in the U.K. and I'm off to Australia next week - the same thing is happening - ***'YES'.*** They're not just going - 'that's a good idea but it's not my bag' - which is what you'd imagine most classical teachers would do, you know. We had 400 teachers in Hong Kong in two half-day workshops, It's really surprising ...

Jazz musician and university lecturer of jazz music, Phil Broadhurst, also sees classical music as unlikely to be 'toppled' by jazz. However, he sees the new opportunities made available by the ABRSM as a big challenge to the world of classical music. He said:

> Classical music, because it's centuries old, has got a respect that jazz music is still striving for. It is significant that the institutions have finally got jazz in their syllabus. It is quite important and it's indicative of the respect that is coming but if you think of the classical world, they still get a lot more of the funding - a lot more kudos than the jazz world and yet it's the jazz world that is attracting the cream of the musicians because they see classical music as a bit of a dead-end because you're interpreting other people's music - churning out Mozart, Beethoven and Chopin and others again and again in order to attract people to the concert halls - the old favourites.

Michael, contemporary music (including jazz) piano and keyboard player and teacher who was interviewed for this thesis also expressed his enthusiasm for the new system:

> I would like to put more kids through next year because we've seen their musicianship develop - we've seen them go 'wow - this is pretty cool stuff'. And so it has been exciting to see how the kids have responded to it. It will be interesting to see if we've negotiated the right path with the tutors and with the students and obviously we're waiting to see how they go.

These opinions express how the system is perceived, presently, as well as how it may develop in the near future. The most exciting projection for the development of both genres of music came from Phil Broadhurst, jazz musician, teacher and university lecturer. With practical exemplification on the piano, he played a few bars of music which, without knowing that it was improvised, *could* have been modern jazz[1] and *could* have been 20th century classical music (as defined on page 112). This improvised performance, if codified, would have permanence. But the difference between being able to improvise and learning a piece, note for note, is enormous. The disadvantage is that jazz music, by definition or by its very nature, cannot be replicated. The disadvantage for classical music is that, by definition or by its very nature, it must be performed accurately on each occasion.

Jazz musician and university lecturer of jazz music, Roger Fox presents an easy answer for the talented by advocating to 'play the *instrument* - not the *style'*, or genre. On the contrary, Charles Beale, although a classically trained jazz pianist himself said:

[1] Modern jazz: 'any of various styles of jazz that have evolved since the early 1940's, and are marked generally by increasing harmonic and rhythmic complexity, a tendency to draw on classical forms and styles, and an increased use of written-out arrangements (*Webster's Encyclopedic Unabridged Dictionary*, 1983)

Do one or the other properly. The jazz syllabus is not there as an alternative when fed up with classical. So yes, do both well, or choose one or the other. Don't dabble in jazz for a break from classical.

Whilst contemplating the future of both genres of music as presented by the ABRSM, some final words from Tirro (1993:6) may bring an awareness of how *any* music may develop, given some motivating conditions:

> (T)he drummers of Place Congo were not jazz drummers, and the singers of the cotton fields were not jazz singers. Still, their heritage profoundly influenced music in America at the turn of the twentieth century, and jazz did emerge.

References

Abeles, H., Hoffer, C., and Klotman, R. 1994, *Foundations of Music Education*, second edition, Schirmer Books, Macmillan Publishing Company, New York

Adams, D. (ed.), 1992, *The Collins Concise English Dictionary*, third edition, HarperCollins Publishers, England

Ahrens, C., and Atkinson, G. 1973, *For All Piano Teachers*, The Frederick Harris Music Co. Limited, Canada

Anderson, E. 1966, *The Letters of Mozart And His Family, Volume I and Volume II*, second edition, Macmillan and Company, London

Appignanesi, R., and Garratt, C. 1995, *Postmodernism*, Icon Books Ltd, Cambridge

Associated Board of The Royal Schools Of Music, Jazz Piano Pieces, Grade 5, 1998, Caligraving Ltd, England

Associated Board of The Royal Schools Of Music, Jazz Piano Pieces, Grades 1 to 5, 1998, Caligraving Ltd, England

Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music Syllabus of Examinations, 1998, published by the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, London

Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music Syllabus of Diploma Examinations from 2000, 2000, published by the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, London

Bacharach, A. (ed.), 1957, *The New Musical Companion*, Victor Gollancz Ltd, London

Bauman, Z. 1973, *Culture As Praxis*, Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd, London

Bauman, Z. 1987, *Legislators and Interpreters*, Polity Press, Cambridge

Bauman, Z. 1992, *Intimations of Postmodernity*, Routledge, London

Beale, C. 1998, *Jazz Piano From Scratch: A How-To Guide For Students and Teachers*, The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (Publishing) Ltd, London

Beatson, P., and Beatson, D. (1994) *The Arts in Aotearoa New Zealand*, Sociology Dept, Massey University, Palmerston North

Belich, J. 1996, *Making Peoples*, The Penguin Press, New Zealand

Berendt, J. 1982, *The Jazz Book*, Lawrence Hill & Company, Westport, Connecticut

Bernstein, B. 1977 *Class, Codes and Control Volume 3: Towards a Theory of Educational Transmissions*, Routledge & Kegan Paul, London

Blume, F. 1974, *Protestant Church Music: A History*, W. W. Norton & Company Inc., New York

Bourdieu, P., and Passeron, J. 1977, *Reproduction: In Education, Society and Culture*, Sage Publications, London

Bourdieu, P. 1984, *Distinction, A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts

Brint, S. 1994, *In an Age of Experts: The Changing Role of Professionals in Politics and Public Life*, Princeton University Press, New Jersey

Brubaker, R. 1985, *Theory and Society*, Elsevier Science Publishers B.V., Netherlands

Burke, D. 1978, *Mercy Through The Years*, F.W. Larcombe, Christchurch

Burke, K. 1989, *On Symbols and Society*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago

Chevigny, P. 1991, *Gigs: Jazz and Cabaret Laws in New York City*, Routledge, New York

Clausen, L. 1993, *Institute of Registered Music Teachers Journal No 36*, Pro Arte Publications, Dunedin

Collier, J. 1978, *The Making of Jazz: A Comprehensive History*, Macmillan, Hong Kong

Collins, R. 1979, *The Credential Society: An Historical Sociology of Education and Stratification*, Academic Press, New York

Curtis, S. 1994, *Dancing to a Black Man's Tune: A Life of Scott Joplin*, University of Missouri Press, Columbia

Elias, N. 1994, *Reflections on a Life*, Polity Press, Cambridge

Elias, N. 1996, *The Germans*, Polity Press, Cambridge

Encyclopaedia Britannica, (A) Macropaedia, 5, 1980, Helen Hemingway Benton, Publisher, USA

Encyclopaedia Britannica, (A) Macropaedia, 7, 1980, Helen Hemingway Benton, Publisher, USA

Encyclopaedia Britannica, (A) Macropaedia 10, 1980, Helen Hemingway Benton, Publisher, USA

Encyclopaedia Britannica, (A) Macropaedia 11, 1980, Helen Hemingway Benton, Publisher, USA

Encyclopaedia Britannica, (A) Macropaedia 15, 1980, Helen Hemingway Benton, Publisher, USA

Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B) Micropaedia I, 1980, Helen Hemingway Benton, Publisher, USA

Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B) Micropaedia VII, 1980, Helen Hemingway Benton, Publisher, USA

Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B) Micropaedia IX, 1980, Helen Hemingway Benton, Publisher, USA

Encyclopaedia Britannica, (B) Micropaedia X, 1980, Helen Hemingway Benton, Publisher, USA

Etzioni, A. 1969, *The Semi-Professions and Their Organisation*, The Free Press, A Division of Macmillan Publishing Co. Inc., New York, Collier Macmillan Publishers, London

Exley, H. 1991, *Music Lovers Quotations*, Exley Publications Ltd, United Kingdom

Feather, L. 1960, *The Encyclopedia of Jazz*, Horizon Press, New York

Feather, L. 1965, *Book of Jazz, From Then Till Now, A Guide To The Entire Field*, Horizon Press, New York

Foucault, M. 1980, *Power and Knowledge*, Simon & Schuster International Group, Great Britain

Foucault, M. 1991, *The Foucault Effect: Studies In Governmentality*, The University Of Chicago Press, Great Britain

Foucault, M. 1995, *Discipline and Punish*, Vintage Books, New York

Fowler, B. 1997, *Pierre Bourdieu and Cultural Theory, Critical Investigations*, Sage Publications, London

Giddins, G. 1998, *Visions of Jazz: The First Century*, Oxford University Press, New York

Goudsblom, J., and Mennell, S. (eds.), 1998, *The Norbert Elias Reader*, Blackwell Publishers, United Kingdom

Gridley, M. 1991, *Jazz Styles, History and Analysis*, Prentice Hall Inc, Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey

Grout, D., and Palisca, C. 1988, *A History of Western Music*, J. M. Dent & Sons Ltd, London

Harris, R. 1989, *Institute of Registered Music Teachers of New Zealand Journal No. 24*, Outreach Press, New Zealand

Hobsbawn, E. 1962, *The Age of Revolution 1789 - 1848*, The New American Library, New York

hooks b. 1992, *Black Looks Race and Representation*, South End Press, Boston

Hunt, A. 1993, *Explorations in Law and Society*, Routledge, London

Hurd, M. 1979, *The Oxford Illustrated Dictionary of Music*, Oxford University Press, Melbourne

Jennings, J. 1982, *Institute of Registered Music Teachers of New Zealand Journal No. 3*, John Savage & Co, New Zealand

Kofsky, F. 1970, *Black Nationalism and the Revolution in Music*, Pathfinder Press, New York

Laclotte, M. 1989, *Larousse Dictionary of Painters*, The Hamlyn Publishing Group Limited, London

Layder, D. 1994, *Understanding Social Theory*, Sage Publications, London

Leonard, N. 1970, *Jazz And The White Americans*, The University of Chicago Press, United States of America

Levine, L. 1977, *Black Culture and Black Consciousness*, Oxford University Press, New York

Loesser, A. 1954, *Men, Women and Pianos*, Simon and Schuster, New York

Lovell-Smith, M. 1998, *The Enigma of Sister Mary Leo*, Reed Publishing (New Zealand) Ltd, Auckland

Lovelock, W. n.d. *Hints For Paper Work Candidates*, William Elkin Music Services, England

Lovelock, W.1953, *A Concise History of Music*, Bell & Hyman, London

Lyons, L. 1983, *The Great Jazz Pianists*, William Morrow and Company, U.S.A.

Mandelbaum, D. (ed.), 1949 *Selected Writings of Edward Sapir in Language, Culture, and Personality*, University of California Press, Berkeley

Mellers, W. 1946, *Music and Society*, Dennis Dobson Ltd, London

Mokrzycki, E. 1996, 'A New Middle Class?', in Kilminster, R., and Varcoe, I. (eds), *Culture, Modernity and Revolution: Essays in Honour of Zygmunt Bauman*, Routledge, London

Mundey, P. 1997, *Libretto, The Journal of the Royal Schools of Music*, (September) published by the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, United Kingdom

Ogren, K. 1989, *The Jazz Revolution, Twenties America and The Meaning Of Jazz*, Oxford University Press, New York

Perry, D. 1996, *Jazz Greats*, Phaidon Press Ltd, London

Rose, N. 1990, *Governing the Soul: The Shaping of the Private Self*, Routledge, London

Rose, N. 1999, *Powers of Freedom*, Cambridge University Press, United Kingdom

Routley, E. 1978, *The Church and Music*, Unwin Brothers Ltd, Great Britain

Russell, J. 1957, *A History of Music*, George Harrap & Co Ltd, London

Salmen, W. (ed.), 1983, *The Social Status of the Professional Musician from the Middle Ages to the 19th Century*, Pendragon Press, New York

Shuker, R. 1998, *Key Concepts in Popular Music*, Routledge, London

Stevens, J. 1979, *Music and Poetry in the Early Tudor Court*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge

Stevenson, R. 1970, *Protestant Church Music in America*, W.W. Norton & Company, Inc, United States of America

Tatchell, J. 1992, *Understanding Music*, Usbourne Publishing Ltd, England

Taylor, B. 1983, *Jazz Piano: A Jazz History*, Wm, C. Brown Company Publishers, United States of America

Taylor, E. 1989, *The AB Guide To Music Theory, Part 1*, The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (Publishing) Ltd, London

These Music Exams, 1999, published by the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, London

Thomson, J. 1991, *The Oxford History of Music*, Oxford University Press, Oxford,

Tirro, F. 1993, *Jazz, A History*, W.W. Norton & Company, New York

Trinity: Music Diplomas 1999-2003, 1998, Trinity College, London

Trinity Keyboard Syllabus from 2001, 2000, Trinity College, London

Ward, J. (ed.), 1977, *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Music*, Oxford University Press, London

Webber, G. 1996, *North German Church Music In The Age Of Buxtehude*, Clarendon Press, Oxford

Weber, M. 1958, *The Protestant Ethic and The Spirit of Capitalism*, Charles Scribner's Sons, United States of America

Weber, M. 1965, *The Sociology of Religion*, Methuen & Co Ltd, London

Weber, M. 1978, *Economy and Society*, University of California Press, Berkeley, California

Webster's Encyclopedic Unabridged Dictionary, 1983, Random Books Value Publishing Inc., New Jersey

Weiss, P., and Taruskin, R. 1984, *Music in the Western World*, Collier Macmillan, London

Wicke, P. 1990, *Rock Music, Culture, Aesthetics and Sociology*, Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge, England

Wilson-Dickson, A. 1992, *The Story of Christian Music*, A Lion Book, Oxford

Witz, A. 1992, *Professions and Patriarchy*, Routledge, London

White, A. (ed.), 1987, *Lost in Music: Culture, Style and the Musical Event*, Routledge & Kegan Paul, London

Year Book 1998/1999, Institute of Registered Music Teachers, Thames Publications Limited, Wellington

ABRSM http://www.abrsm.ac.uk/around.html 28 August 00

ABRSM http://www.abrsm.ac.uk/welcome 4 September 00