

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

ASSESSING THE PORTABILITY OF THE STANDARD SHIFTWORK INDEX:  
THE IMPACT OF SHIFTWORK ON A NEW ZEALAND  
TELEVISION PRODUCTION SAMPLE.

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree  
of Master of Arts  
in Psychology  
at Massey University

Teresa Anita Goddard  
1997

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost I would like to extend a sincere thankyou to my supervisor, Dr. Hillary Bennett. Her intellectual guidance, support and encouragement was invaluable during the course of this research.

To Dr. Philip Voss, I also say a big thankyou for his assistance with the analysis. His contribution definitely played a major role in maintaining my sanity during the past year.

I extend my appreciation to the Massey University Graduate Research Fund for the financial assistance to conduct this research.

I am grateful to my family and friends for their encouragement and support. In particular I thank my dear friend and mentor, Dr. Jeannie Wolfenden for her encouragement and understanding.

To my dear friend Helen Barry, I say thankyou for encouraging me to take on this intellectual challenge.

My sincere thanks goes to my best friend and partner, Charles. I am grateful for his unconditional support and for his unrelenting belief in me.

Lastly, I pledge my deepest thanks to my mother, Ruby Goddard, for instilling in me the courage and strength to succeed.

## CONTENTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Acknowledgments.....                                       | i   |
| Table of Contents.....                                     | ii  |
| List of Tables.....  | vii |
| List of Figures.....                                       | ix  |
| Abstract.....  | x   |
| <br>   |     |
| Chapter One: Introduction.....                             | 1   |
| 1. Introduction.....                                       | 1   |
| 1.1 Shiftwork Defined.....                                 | 1   |
| 1.2 A Brief History of Shiftwork.....                      | 2   |
| 1.3 The Positive and Negative Nature of Shiftwork.....     | 2   |
| 1.4 The Prevalence of Shiftwork.....                       | 3   |
| 1.5 The Actual Prevalence of Shiftwork.....                | 5   |
| <br>   |     |
| Chapter Two: Research Rationale and Background.....        | 6   |
| 2. Introduction.....                                       | 6   |
| 2.1 Researching Shiftwork.....                             | 6   |
| 2.2 Theoretical Framework.....                             | 8   |
| 2.3 Categorisation of Potential Effects of Shiftwork.....  | 9   |
| 2.4 Potential Effects of Shiftwork: Outcome Variables..... | 10  |
| -The Individual  |     |
| 2.4.1 Sleep.....   | 10  |
| 2.4.1a Sleep and Circadian Rhythm Disturbance...           | 11  |
| 2.4.1b Sleep and Shift Type.....                           | 12  |
| 2.4.2 Alertness.....                                       | 13  |
| 2.4.3 Napping.....   | 15  |
| 2.4.4 Chronic Fatigue.....                                 | 15  |
| 2.4.5 Physical and Psychological Ill-Health.....           | 16  |
| 2.4.5a Physical Health.....                                | 16  |
| 2.4.5b Psychological Health.....                           | 18  |

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 2.4.6 Social and Domestic Disruption.....                     | 19 |
| 2.4.7 Job Satisfaction.....                                   | 22 |
| 2.5 Potential Effects of Shiftwork: Organisational Outcomes.. | 24 |
| 2.5.1 Turnover.....   | 24 |
| 2.6 Potential Effects of Shiftwork: Moderator Variables.....  | 25 |
| 2.6.7 Individual Differences.....                             | 25 |
| 2.6.1a Gender.....  | 25 |
| 2.6.1b Marital Status.....                                    | 26 |
| 2.6.1c Age.....   | 26 |
| 2.6.1d Habitual Sleep Need.....                               | 28 |
| 2.6.2 Personality.....  | 28 |
| 2.6.2a Morningness.....                                       | 28 |
| 2.6.2b Circadian Type.....                                    | 28 |
| 2.6.2c Neuroticism and Extraversion.....                      | 29 |
| 2.6.3 Coping Strategies.....                                  | 30 |
| 2.7 Shiftwork Research: Methodology and Measurement.....      | 31 |
| 2.8 The Standard Shiftwork Index (SSI).....                   | 32 |
| 2.8.1 Authors.....  | 32 |
| 2.8.2 Rationale.....  | 33 |
| 2.8.3 The U.K Study.....                                      | 35 |
| 2.9 Research Justification.....                               | 38 |
| 2.10 Thesis Objectives.....                                   | 39 |
| Chapter Three: Research Design and Methodology.....           | 40 |
| 3. Introduction.....  | 40 |
| 3.1 Study Area.....   | 40 |
| 3.2 The Sample.....   | 40 |
| 3.3 Survey Procedures.....                                    | 41 |
| 3.4 Measurement Instrument.....                               | 42 |
| 3.5 Questionnaire Origin and Development.....                 | 43 |

|               |  |    |
|---------------|--|----|
| 3.5.1         | The U.K Study.....                               | 43 |
| 3.6           | Questionnaire Format and Content.....            | 44 |
| 3.7           | Psychometric Properties of the SSI Scales: ..... | 45 |
| 3.7.1         | Outcome Variables.....                           | 45 |
| 3.7.1a        | General Job Satisfaction.....                    | 45 |
| 3.7.1b        | Sleep Questionnaire.....                         | 45 |
| 3.7.1c        | Chronic Fatigue Questionnaire.....               | 46 |
| 3.7.1d        | Physical Health Questionnaire.....               | 46 |
| 3.7.1e        | General Health Questionnaire.....                | 47 |
| 3.7.1f        | Cognitive-Somatic Anxiety Questionnaire..        | 47 |
| 3.7.1g        | Social and Domestic Survey.....                  | 47 |
| 3.7.2         | Moderator Variables.....                         | 48 |
| 3.7.2a        | Coping Questionnaire.....                        | 48 |
| 3.7.2b        | Composite Morningness Questionnaire....          | 48 |
| 3.7.2c        | Circadian Type Inventory.....                    | 49 |
| 3.7.2d        | Eysenck Personality Inventory.....               | 49 |
| 3.8           | Deleted Questions.....                           | 49 |
| 3.9           | Data Analysis.....                               | 50 |
| Chapter Four: | Results.....                                     | 51 |
| 4.            | Introduction.....                                | 51 |
| 4.1           | Data Analysis.....                               | 51 |
| 4.1.1         | Cleaning the Data.....                           | 51 |
| 4.1.2         | Dealing with Missing Values.....                 | 51 |
| 4.1.3         | Analytical Techniques.....                       | 52 |
| 4.2           | General Shiftwork Statistics.....                | 52 |
| 4.3           | Content Analysis.....                            | 62 |

|               |   |    |
|---------------|---|----|
| 4.4           | Descriptive Statistics.....   | 64 |
| 4.4.1         | Composite Scores.....   | 65 |
| 4.5           | Inferential Statistics.....   | 66 |
| 4.5.1         | Correlation matrix - outcome and moderator variables.....   | 66 |
| 4.6           | Statistical Significance.....   | 69 |
| 4.6.1         | Effect Size.....  | 69 |
| 4.6.2         | Comparison correlation matrix for U.K and current sample.....   | 70 |
| 4.6.3         | Significant Differences in demographic characteristics of current sample.....                             | 71 |
| Chapter Five: | Discussion.....   | 72 |
| 5.            | Introduction.....   | 72 |
| 5.1           | Objective One: Assessing the Portability of the SSI.....  | 72 |
| 5.1.1         | Comparison of Alpha Levels of the SSI Scales...   | 72 |
| 5.1.2         | Comparison of Mean Scores on Outcome and Moderator Variable of the present sample and the U.K sample..... | 73 |
| 5.1.3         | Comparison of Significant Correlations and Effect Size.....   | 74 |
| 5.1.4         | Comparison of Directions of Correlations.....   | 75 |
| 5.2           | Objective Two: Determining the Impact of Shiftwork on the Television sample.....                          | 77 |
| 5.2.1         | General Shiftwork Statistics.....   | 78 |
| 5.2.1a        | Health Characteristics.....   | 78 |
| 5.2.1b        | Sleep Characteristics.....  | 79 |
| 5.2.1c        | Social and Domestic Characteristics.....  | 79 |
| 5.2.1d        | Perceptions of the Shift System.....  | 80 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 5.2.1e Turnover Intention.....  | 80  |
| 5.2.2 The Overall Impact of Shiftwork on the Sample... ..                           | 81  |
| 5.3 Objective Three: Assessment of Individual Differences<br>within the Sample..... | 84  |
| 5.4 Items Not Suitable For Analysis.....  | 85  |
| Chapter Six: Conclusions and Recommendations.....                                   | 87  |
| 6. Introduction.....  | 87  |
| 6.1 Conclusions of the Study.....   | 87  |
| 6.2 Recommendations.....  | 89  |
| 6.3 Limitations of the Study.....   | 90  |
| 6.4 Future Research Considerations.....   | 90  |
| References.....   | 92  |
| Appendices.....   | 103 |
| A1 SSI Questionnaire.....   | 104 |
| A2 Information Sheet.....   | 118 |
| A3 Reminder Letter.....   | 119 |

## LIST OF TABLES

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Table 1. Demographic information of the U.K study sample.....  | 35 |
| Table 2. Statistics Associated with the Distribution of Scores for the U.K Study.....  | 36 |
| Table 3. Correlation Matrix showing the relationships between moderator and outcome variables for the U.K sample.....            | 37 |
| Table 4. Demographic information of the study sample.....  | 41 |
| Table 5. Personal Health Characteristics of the Sample.....  | 52 |
| Table 6. Respondent's use of Medications.....  | 53 |
| Table 7. Habitual Sleep Need of Respondents.....   | 53 |
| Table 8. Respondent's consumption of stimulants.....   | 54 |
| Table 9. Social and Domestic Data.....   | 54 |
| Table 10. Employment Patterns.....   | 55 |
| Table 11. Shift System Structure.....  | 56 |
| Table 12. Perceived Control and Flexibility of Shift System.....   | 56 |
| Table 13. Travel to Work.....  | 57 |
| Table 14. Ratings of Workload Compared to Others Performing Similar Job.....   | 58 |
| Table 15. Shift System Rotation.....   | 59 |
| Table 16. Respondent's Reasons for working Shifts.....   | 60 |
| Table 17. Opinions of Shiftwork, the Organisation and Turnover Intention.....  | 61 |
| Table 18. Perceived Advantages of Current Shift System.....  | 62 |
| Table 19. Perceived Disadvantages of Current Shift System.....   | 63 |
| Table 20. Additional Comments on Sleep and Fatigue.....  | 63 |
| Table 21. Additional Overall Comments Regarding Shiftwork.....   | 64 |
| Table 22. Statistics Associated with the Distribution of Scores.....   | 65 |
| Table 23. Correlation Matrix Showing the Relationships Between Moderators and Outcomes for the Television Production Sample..... | 67 |

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Table 24. Correlation Matrix Showing Relationship between ‘intention to leave’ and Outcome Variables.....    | 68 |
| Table 25. Correlations Matrix Showing Relationship between ‘intention to leave’ and Moderator Variables..... | 68 |
| Table 26. Probability Values for the U.K Sample and the Present Sample.....                                  | 69 |
| Table 27. Effect Size Values for the U.K Study and the Present Sample.....                                   | 70 |
| Table 28. Analysis of Variance Results for Gender and Engagement.....  | 71 |

## LIST OF FIGURES

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Figure 1. Theoretical Framework on which the SSI was based.....                    | 9  |
| Figure 2. Model of the three Interactive Factors Determining Shiftwork Strain..... | 19 |

## ABSTRACT

The portability of the Standard Shiftwork Index (SSI) and the impact of shiftwork was assessed on a sample of television production employees in Auckland, New Zealand. Sixty three respondents completed the SSI and reported a moderate impact of shiftwork on physical and psychological health and moderately high sleep disturbance. Social and domestic life yielded the greatest detrimental impact. Gender related coping strategies was the only significant difference within the sample. Chronic fatigue, somatic anxiety, general job satisfaction and disengagement were significantly related to intention to leave the organisation. Statistical analysis of effect size indicated equivalent levels of power in both the U.K and the present sample. Overall, the results for the present sample were comparable to the U.K sample, indicating the portability of the SSI to the present sample. Organisational restructuring was considered a potential moderator of the overall moderate impact of shiftwork on the sample.