Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# An ecological economics of eco-efficiency

# - theory, interpretations and applications

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in ecological economics

At Massey University, Palmerston North

Nigel Alan Jollands





School of People, Environment and Planning Resource and Environmental Planning Programme GIS Programme Private Bag 11 222, Palmerston North,

Telephone: 64 6 350 4343 Facsimile: 64 6 350 5689

New Zealand

#### **CANDIDATE'S DECLARATION**

This is to certify that the research carried out for my Doctoral thesis entitled "An ecological economics of eco-efficiency – theory, concepts and applications" in the School of People, Environment and Planning, Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand is my own work and that the thesis material has not been used in part or in whole for any other qualification.

Candidate's Name

Signature

Date

7/1/03

A Company of innovation E any American





School of People, Environment and Planning Resource and Environmental Planning Programme GIS Programme

Private Bag 11 222, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Telephone: 64 6 350 4343 Facsimile: 64 6 350 5689

#### **CERTIFICATE OF REGULATORY COMPLIANCE**

This is to certify that the research carried out in the Doctoral Thesis entitled "An ecological economics of eco-efficiency – theory, concepts and applications" in the School of People, Environment and Planning, at Massey University, New Zealand:

- (a) is the original work of the candidate, except as indicated by appropriate attribution in the text and/or in the acknowledgements;
- (b) that the text, excluding appendices/annexes, does not exceed 100,000 words;
- (c) all the ethical requirements applicable to this study have been complied with as required by Massey University, other organisations and/or committees which had a particular association with this study, and relevant legislation.

Please insert Ethical Authorisation code(s) here: (if applicable)

Candidate's Name: Nigel Jollands

Signature:

Date: 17/1/03

Supervisor's Name: Durra

Signature:

Date: 17/1/03





School of People, Environment and Planning Resource and Environmental Planning Programme GIS Programme Private Bag 11 222, Palmerston North, New Zealand Telephone: 64 6 350 4343 Facsimile: 64 6 350 5689

#### SUPERVISOR'S DECLARATION

This is to certify that the research carried out for the Doctoral thesis entitled "An ecological economics of eco-efficiency – theory, concepts and applications" was done by Nigel Jollands in the School of People, Environment and Planning, Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand. The thesis material has not been used in part or in whole for any other qualification, and I confirm that the candidate has pursued the course of study in accordance with the requirements of the Massey University regulations.

Supervisor's Name

Murray

2 Hessin

Signature

<u>Date</u>

7/01/03



#### **Abstract**

Eco-efficiency emerged onto the world stage as the business input into the 1992 Rio Earth Summit. The concept has served to bring the business community into the sustainability debate and enabled businesses to demonstrate significant environmental improvement. The concept is also beginning to play a key role in national sustainable development policy. However, the recent interest in eco-efficiency has highlighted several unresolved and sometimes contentious issues which are addressed in this thesis.

The overall aim of this thesis is to contribute to the understanding of the eco-efficiency concept and its analytical application by situating the research within an ecological economic framework.

This thesis begins by arguing that conventional 'eco-industrial épistémé' interpretations of eco-efficiency are developed within the narrow confines of a world view that is committed to business-as-usual. This assumes controllability of production processes, sees technology as a fix for environmental problems and assumes independence of economic and environmental production processes. This thesis then proposes to broaden the notion of eco-efficiency by applying an ecological economic theoretical framework. This thesis recommends a nested-hierarchy framework of three tiers for interpreting eco-efficiency. The thesis uses ecological economic theory to argue that eco-efficiency must be embedded within physical scale (first tier) and social considerations (second tier). The third (eco-efficiency) tier is interdisciplinary and pluralistic. It encourages a view that perspectives of eco-efficiency are context dependent. It also promotes tolerance and acceptance that all perspectives of eco-efficiency provide important insights into eco-efficiency.

Previously, little attention has been devoted to measuring and analysing eco-efficiency for national policy purposes. This thesis develops and applies three promising analytical techniques to aspects of New Zealand's eco-efficiency; Divisia decomposition analysis (for isolating structural and technical components of change), inverse-Leontief based multiplier analysis (for measuring indirect effects) and principal components analysis (for reducing the number of indicators to a manageable level). All three empirical chapters identify the road transport sector as having relatively low and decreasing energy and CO<sub>2</sub> efficiencies. This is of concern as the sector has proven to be one of the most difficult to influence from an environmental perspective. Several other sectors warrant attention by virtue of their low eco-efficiency measures; 'other mining', 'other farming', dairy farming, meat products and dairy products. Urgent attention is required to improve the environmental behaviour of these sectors.

#### Acknowledgements

I would like to offer my profound thanks to my two supervisors Dr Murray Patterson and Dr Jonathan Lermit. This thesis would not have been possible without their expertise, encouragement, guidance and support throughout the research process. For these I am truly indebted. I have also benefited from the technical expertise of Dr Siva Ganesh. His guidance on the Principal Components Analysis was invaluable.

My love and gratitude must also go to my partner Veronica Lysaght and my daughter Ella Jollands. They have provided constant support over the past three years. I am grateful that they have stood by my side through the (often difficult and frustrating) PhD process and reminded me that an ice cream is just a walk away.

My thanks also to my extended family and friends – especially Judith Morgan, Peter and Cath Jollands, Paul Lysaght and Jo McKenzie, Dr Patrick Hesp and Kathleen Hastings – all of whom have had supported and encouraged me through the research process (not to mention having to put up with me and my entourage of books on several occasions).

A special thanks to Sue Edwards and the staff of the Resource and Environmental Planning Programme at Massey University. They have all been very generous in their support of my research and teaching endeavours.

Finally, I would like to thank the anonymous markers for taking the time to examine this thesis.

## **Table of contents**

1 Introduction	1
1.1 Origins of the eco-efficiency concept	1
1.2 Previous studies into eco-efficiency	3
1.3 Research aims and objectives	9
1.4 Research method	9
1.5 Thesis outline	11
2 Ecological economic foundations for investigating eco-efficiency	12
2.1 Ecological economics – epistemological roots	12
2.2 Contemporary ecological economics	14
2.3 Main tenets of ecological economics  2.3.1 Integration of economics and ecology.  2.3.2 Biophysical approach  2.3.3 Systems approach  2.3.4 Sustainability  2.3.5 Pluralism and transdiciplinarity	15 15 18
2.4 Limitations of ecological economics for the analysis of eco-efficiency	34
2.5 Conclusions	36
3 Eco-efficiency – a critique of the eco-industrial épistémé interpretation	38
3.1 Eco-efficiency – emergence and popularity	38
3.2 Interpreting the eco-efficiency concept	40
3.3 The epistemology of eco-efficiency: the eco-industrial épistémé	42
3.4 Critique of the eco-industrial épistémé and its interpretations of eco-efficiency	45 53
3.5 Conclusions	58
4 Disciplinary approaches to eco-efficiency	60
4.1 Origins of the efficiency concept	61
4.2 Thermodynamic approaches to eco-efficiency	64 66 74
4.3 Neoclassical economic approaches to eco-efficiency	
4.3.1 The role of efficiency in neoclassical economics	79
4.3.2 Neoclassical economic interpretations of efficiency and insights into eco-efficency.  4.3.3 Assumptions underlying neoclassical economic approaches to eco-efficiency.	80 89
4.3.4 Summary of neoclassical economic efficiency interpretations and insights into	eco

efficiency	94
4.4 Ecosystem ecology approaches to eco-efficiency	95
4.4.1 The role of efficiency in ecosystem ecology	
4.4.2 Ecosystems ecology interpretations of efficiency	97
4.4.3 Assumptions underlying ecological approaches to eco-efficiency	102
4.4.4 Summary of ecosystem ecology interpretations of efficiency and insignifications of efficiency and insignifications.	•
4.5 Conclusions	
5 Towards a pluralistic framework - an ecological economic approach to eco-e	fficiency .111
5.1 The role of efficiency in ecological economic theory	111
5.2 The concept of efficiency in ecological economics	113
5.2.1 Current usage of the efficiency concept in ecological economics	
5.2.2 Daly's "overall ecological economic efficiency" concept	
5.3 Proposed ecological economic framework for interpreting eco-efficiency 5.3.1 A three-tiered framework	
5.3.2 Describing the third tier: the eco-efficiency space	
5.4 Conclusion	131
Part II Empirical applications	132
6 Decomposition of eco-efficiency indicators: a case study using New Zealand	's energy:GDP
ratio	0.
6.1 Rationale	13/
6.1.1 Policy relevance	
6.1.2 Understanding the role of technology	
6.1.3 The role of energy in the economy and energy quality	
6.1.4 Decomposition as a tool in ecological economics	
6.2 Methodological considerations in decomposition analysis	
6.2.1 Selection of aggregate of interest and decomposition factors	
6.2.2 The decomposition method	
6.2.3 Other choices	
6.2.4 Final selection of decomposition approach used in this paper	144
6.3 A decomposition methodology to quantify the effects of key factors on c	
energy:GDP ratio.	
6.3.1 Notation	146
6.3.2 The static description of the energy:GDP components	147
6.3.3 The dynamic description of the energy: GDP components	147
6.3.4 Derivation of the weighting function for the extended refined Divisia	decomposition
method	150
6.3.5 Quality equivalent methodology	152
6.4 Results of the decomposition of New Zealand's energy:GDP ratio, 1987-	- 2000 155
6.4.1 Changes in New Zealand's energy: GDP ratio, 1987 – 2000	
6.4.2 Summary of the effect of the key factors on changes in New Zealand	
ratio, 1987 – 2000	0.
6.4.3 The technical effect	
6.4.4 Structural effects	
6.4.5 The energy quality effect	

6.5 Conclusions	164
7 Measuring system-wide eco-efficiency in New Zealand	166
7.1 Rationale - the importance of system-wide eco-efficiency assessment in an eco-	cological
economic context	
7.1.1 System focus and "indirectness"	
7.1.2 Accounting for environment-economy interactions	
7.1.3 Policy relevance in ecological economics	
7.2 Ecological multipliers as measures of system-wide eco-efficiency	
7.2.1 Approaches to calculating ecological multipliers	
7.2.2 Approach used in this thesis to calculate system-wide eco-efficiency	
7.2.3 Methodological issues associated with calculating ecological multipliers	
of system-wide eco-efficiency	
7.2.4 Assumptions and limitations of the use of ecological multipliers as measu	ires of
system-wide eco-efficiency	178
7.3 Application of the inverse Leontief matrix-based approach to measuring syste	
efficiency for New Zealand	
7.3.1 Economic data used	
7.3.2 Ecosystem service data	
7.3.3 Overview of the results	
7.3.4 Water input and water discharge eco-efficiency multipliers	
7.3.5 Water pollutant eco-efficiency multipliers	
7.3.6 Land input eco-efficiency multipliers	
7.3.7 Mineral inputs eco-efficiency multipliers	
7.3.8 Energy input eco-efficiency multipliers	
7.3.9 Energy-related air pollutant eco-efficiency multipliers	
7.4 Conclusion	
8 Aggregate eco-efficiency indices for New Zealand	210
8.1 Rationale - the importance of aggregate indices for eco-efficiency in an ecolo	gical
economic context	211
8.1.1 Policy relevance	211
8.1.2 Indicators in ecological economics	211
8.1.3 Aggregation and commensuration	212
9.2 Methodological considerations for aggregating and officiency indicators	217
8.2 Methodological considerations for aggregating eco-efficiency indicators	
8.2.1 A general mathematical structure of an eco-efficiency index	
8.2.2 The aggregation process	
8.2.3 Selecting subindices for inclusion in the aggregation function	
8.2.4 Selection of appropriate aggregation functions for eco-efficiency indicate	
8.2.5 Weighted-sum aggregation function: the challenge of setting the weights	
8.2.6 Final selection of weighting scheme for this research	
8.3 Principal components analysis as an aggregation approach for eco-efficiency	
8.3.1 A description of principal components analysis	
8.3.2 Critique of principal components analysis	
8.4 Using principal components analysis to determine aggregate eco-efficiency in	
New Zealand	
8.4.1 Choosing variables for inclusion in the principal components analysis	
8.4.2 Identification and description of the principal components	
8.4.3 Overall scores for New Zealand	
8.4.4 The principal components and sector clusters	
8.4.5 Sector eco-efficiency scores	248

8.5 Conclusion	.256
9 Conclusions	.259
9.1 Theoretical arguments	.259
9.1.1 Achievements of this thesis	
9.1.2 Future research	. 262
9.2 Method development	. 263
9.2.1 Achievements of this thesis	
9.2.2 Future research	. 264
9.3 Empirical findings	
9.3.1 Achievements of this thesis	
9.3.2 Future research	. 269
9.4 Concluding reflections	.269
References	.270
Appendix 1 – What is an eco-efficiency indicator?	.303
Appendix 2 – Data used in the decomposition analysis	.316
Appendix 3 – Assumptions behind the Energy Quality Coefficients	.317
Appendix 4 - A description of input-output matrices and mathematics	.319
Appendix 5 – Details of input-output data and calculations used in estimating ecological	
multipliers	
Appendix 6 – Principal components analysis	.399
Appendix 7 – Sector scores from the principal components analysis conducted in this the	esis

# **List of Figures**

Figure 2-1: A simplified depiction of the energy and matter flows through the economy16	
Figure 3-1: A depiction of the environmental Kuznets curve	
Figure 4-1: A schematic representation of a generic steady flow process66	
Figure 4-2: A stylised heat engine	
Figure 4-3: The efficiency of reversible and irreversible heat engines	
Figure 4-4: Interrelationships between thermodynamic efficiency concepts78	
Figure 4-5: Graphical presentation of production efficiency	
Figure 4-6: Graph showing x-inefficiency as the distance between the current operating positio and the outermost production possibility frontier (PPF)	n
Figure 4-7: An allocative efficiency criterion that explicitly accounts for positive and negative environmental externalities	
Figure 4-8: Indifference curves and budget constraints used for identifying intertemporal efficiency	
Figure 4-9: Interrelationships between neoclassical economic efficiency concepts94	
Figure 4-10: A simplified energy flow diagram depicting three trophic levels in a linear food chain98	
Figure 4-11: A simplified diagram of forest log production showing the flow of emergy and energy100	
Figure 4-12: Odum's environmental window boundary	
Figure 4-13: Interrelationships between ecosystem ecology efficiency concepts106	
Figure 4-14: The interrelationships between the multiple efficiency concepts from classical thermodynamics, neoclassical economics and ecosystem ecology110	
Figure 5-1: Number of efficiency-related articles in the journal <i>Ecological Economics</i> by type efficiency concept and discipline	of
Figure 5-2: The concept of a steady-state economy	
Figure 5-3: Diagrammatic representation of (a) the standard economic production function and (b) Daly's implicitly redrawn production function including NK services	
Figure 5-4: Daly's scale, equity and efficiency hierarchy	
Figure 5.5: The two-tiered interactive decision process	
Figure 5-6: A proposed three-tier ecological economic framework for locating eco-efficiency within wider social and biophysical scale issues	
Figure 5-7: A depiction of the third, eco-efficiency tier showing different interrelated perspectives (spheres) embedded in context	
Figure 6-1: A schematic presentation of the methodological process for decomposition analysis	3
Figure 6-2: Decomposition framework	
Figure 6-3: New Zealand's energy:GDP ratio, 1973-2000 (MJ/\$)	
Figure 6-4: Decomposition of New Zealand's energy:GDP ratio, 1987-2000156	
Figure 6-5: Technical effect by major sector groups in New Zealand, 1987-2000	

Figure 6-6: Expected level of investment approvals on new plant and machinery158
Figure 6-7: Capacity utilisation of manufacturing plant and equipment in New Zealand, 1987-2000
Figure 6-8: Auction prices for wool categories, 1988-2005
Figure 6-9: Technical effect by energy type in New Zealand, 1987-2000160
Figure 6-10: GDP contributions from sectoral groups in New Zealand, 1987-2000161
Figure 6-11: Structural effect by major sector groups of the New Zealand economy, 1987-2000
Figure 6-12: The energy quality effect by energy type for New Zealand, 1987-2000162
Figure 6-13: Energy shares in New Zealand (as a percent of total consumer energy in emjoules), 1987-2000
Figure 7-1: A simplified depiction of the results of Patterson and McDonald's (forthcoming) work estimating total (direct and indirect) CO <sub>2</sub> emissions in the New Zealand tourism sector for 1997/98 (million tonnes)
Figure 7-2: Diagram listing the 23 major categories of ecosystem services identified by de Groot et al (2002)
Figure 7-3: The boundaries of the inverse Leontief matrix based approach to calculating ecological multipliers using butter production as an example
Figure 7-4: Diagram showing the ecosystem services and proxies covered by this study (shaded) and their links to the major ecosystem service groups as identified by de Groot et al. (2002)
Figure 7-5: Water inputs to, and outputs from, the New Zealand economy covered by the <i>Eco</i> link database
Figure 7-6: The 10 sectors with the highest water-use multipliers in New Zealand in 1997/98 (m <sup>3</sup> /\$000)
Figure 7-7: The 10 sectors with the highest water-discharge multipliers in New Zealand in 1997/98 (m³/\$000)
Figure 7-8: Illustration of water pollutant multipliers – the 10 sectors with the highest water-pollutant (ammonia) multipliers in New Zealand for 1997/98 (kg/\$000)193
Figure 7-9: The 10 sectors with the highest land multipliers in New Zealand in 1997/98 (ha/\$000)
Figure 7-10: Ironsand input multipliers for New Zealand (1997/98)
Figure 7-11: The 10 sectors with the highest energy multipliers in New Zealand for the 1997/98 (emjoules/\$m)
Figure 7-12: The 10 sectors with the highest CO <sub>2</sub> multipliers in New Zealand, 1997/98 (tonne/\$000)
Figure 8-1: Information flow process in an eco-efficiency index
Figure 8-2: A generic process for calculating aggregate indices
Figure 8-3: Plot of weighted linear sum aggregation function showing underestimation regions for which a subindex exceeds 100 without the index exceeding 100223
Figure 8-4: Plot of multiplicative aggregation function in the $\varepsilon_1$ , $\varepsilon_2$ space for selected values of $l$ showing underestimation region for which a subindex exceeds 100 without the index exceeding 100

Figure 8-5: An illustration of how to interpret the principal component scores (and percent changes) using the <i>mixed livestock</i> sector	_
Figure 8-6: Graph of total principal component scores for New Zealand (and percentage changes), (Prini/\$), 1994/95 vs. 1997/98	245
Figure 8-7: Cluster tree diagram showing the six sectoral clusters	247
Figure 8-8: Diagram showing sectors with high scores on three or more principal components.	
Figure 8-9: Sectoral scores on Prin1 (water pollutant intensity) for the most water-pollutar intensive sectors in New Zealand (1997/98)	
Figure 8-10: Diagram of five principal components (and percentage change) for the person services sector in New Zealand (1994/95 vs. 1998/98)	
Figure 8-11: Highest sectoral scores on Prin2 – energy and energy-related air emission int (1997/98)	_
Figure 8-12: Highest sectoral scores on Prin3 – material intensity (1997/98)	253
Figure 8-13: Highest sectoral scores on Prin4 – land intensity (1997/98)	254
Figure 8-14: Highest sectoral scores on Prin5 – water-input intensities for water users (199	
Figure A1-1: Dow Europe's eco-compass	304
Figure A1-2: Semiotics and signs (Adapted from the classification by Clarke (1987))	306
Figure A4-1: A simplified input-output matrix	320

### List of tables

Table 2-1: The relevance of ecological economics' main tenets to eco-efficiency37	,
Table 4-1: Comparison of eco-efficiencies for electricity generation71	
Table 4-2: Summary of the insights and lessons from eco-efficiency from thermodynamics	
Table 4-3: Insights and lessons for eco-efficiency from a neoclassical economics perspective	e
Table 4-4: Ecological efficiencies between and within trophic levels98	,
Table 4-5: Selected transformities for plant products and fuels	0
Table 4-6: Insights and lesson for eco-efficiency from an ecosystem ecology perspective 10	7
Table 4-7: Summary of insights and lessons for eco-efficiency from classical thermodynamine neoclassical economic and ecosystem ecology theories	
Table 6-1: Estimated energy quality coefficients (in oil emjoules/joules) for New Zealand, 1 to 2000, relative to liquid fuels in 198715	
Table 7-1: List of 46 sectors of the New Zealand economy used in this analysis18	3
Table 7-2: Estimates of ecosystem-service inputs into the New Zealand economy18	6
Table 7-3: Selected eco-efficiency indicators for selected sectors (physical units/\$000)18	7
Table 7-4: Selected fuel multipliers, direct and indirect for the New Zealand transport secto 19945/95 and 1997/98 (GJ/\$000)	
Table 7-5: Energy-related air pollutant multipliers for selected sectors in New Zealand for 1994/95 and 1997/98 (tonne/\$000)	2
Table 7-6: Rankings of all sectors' total system multipliers for 1997/98 for each ecosystem services with the two worst-performing sectors shaded20	6
Table 8-1: Summary of the findings on the appropriate aggregation functions for increasing-scale eco-efficiency indicators	
Table 8-2: Final variables used in this Principal Components Analysis for determining aggregate eco-efficiency indices for New Zealand23	6
Table 8-3: Mean, standard deviation and correlation matrix of eco-efficiency sub indices selected for PCA	8
Table 8-4: Eigenvalues of the correlation matrix	9
Table 8-5: Weights (eigenvectors) of the correlation matrix	0
Table 8-6: Overall principal component scores for New Zealand, (Prini/\$), 1994/95 vs. 1997	
Table 8-7: Sectors that merit special eco-efficiency policy attention by virtue of the relativel high principal component scores	
Table A2- 1: Sectoral aggregation used in the decomposition analysis in Chapter 631	6
Table A5-1: Table showing how each ecosystem service is addressed to remove double counting	14
Table A5-2: Details of disaggregation process for energy sectors	5

#### List of abbreviations used in this thesis

BAU Business as usual

BOD Biological oxygen demand

CO<sub>2</sub> Carbon dioxide

DRP Dissolved reactive Phosphorous

EECA Energy Efficiency and Conservation Authority

EIE Eco-industrial épistémé
EKC Environmental Kuznets Curve

EPIP Environmental Performance Indicators Programme

GDP Gross Domestic Product ID Index decomposition ILM Inverse Leontief matrix

IO Input-output

IOD Input-output decomposition

IPCC Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
ISEE International Society for Ecological Economics
ISEW Index of sustainable Economic Welfare

kJ Kilo Joule
MB Marginal benefit
MC Marginal cost

MEC Marginal external cost
MK Manufactured capital
MPP Maximum power principle

MRPT Marginal rate of product transformation

MRS Marginal rate of substitution

MRTS Marginal rate of technical substitution

 $\begin{array}{ll} MSB & Marginal\ social\ benefit \\ MSC & Marginal\ social\ cost \\ N_2O & Nitrous\ oxide \end{array}$ 

NH<sub>4</sub> Ammonia

NHS British National Health Service

NK Natural capital

NZBCSD New Zealand Business Council for Sustainable Development

NZSIC New Zealand Standard Industrial Classification

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

OPEC Organisation of Petroleum Exporting Countries

PCA Principal components analysis
PPF Production possibility frontier
QEM Quality equivalent method

sej Solar emjoule

TKN Total Kjeldahl Nitrogen

UN United Nations

WBCSD World Business Council for Sustainable Development WCED World Council on Environment and Development

WTP Willingness to pay

ΔG Gibbs free energy change