Environmental evaluation of energy efficiency refurbishment in New Zealand's commercial office buildings

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Science

in

Life Cycle Management

at

Massey University, Manawatū, New Zealand

Agneta Ghose

2017

Executive summary

In New Zealand, 80 % of existing commercial office buildings are more than 20 years old and consume approximately 40 % more energy than newer counterparts. Moreover, nearly 38 % of the energy-related emissions in New Zealand's cities are due to the heating and cooling requirements of commercial office buildings. Therefore, energy efficiency measures in office buildings are recommended to reduce operational energy related costs, provide better working conditions, and enhance business value. An energy efficiency refurbishment which involves adoption of multiple energy saving measures such as thermal insulation, improved glazing, air conditioning and lighting systems, can reduce the energy consumption of existing buildings by nearly 60 %. However, such a refurbishment also involves substantial construction work associated with the demolition and replacement of several building components, and this is associated with additional environmental impacts. It is therefore important to evaluate if the environmental benefits associated with reductions in energy demand can outweigh the environmental impacts of refurbishment.

This research investigated the comprehensive environmental impacts of energy efficiency refurbishments in New Zealand's office buildings using Life Cycle Assessment (LCA). The research used existing data collected for Building Energy End-use Study (BEES) by the Building Research Association of New Zealand (BRANZ). In particular, this research used the information on building design and annual energy consumption of existing and refurbished building prototypes. These building prototypes provided - construction details adopted in buildings of different sizes; and the operational energy performance based on typical climatic conditions found in New Zealand. The environmental performance of the buildings was calculated for Global Warming Potential (GWP), Ozone Depletion Potential (ODP), Photo-chemical Oxidation Potential (PCOP), Acidification Potential (AP), Eutrophication Potential (EP), Abiotic Depletion of resources (AD_r), Abiotic Depletion of fossil fuels (AD_{ff}), Human toxicity carcinogenic (HT-carc), Human toxicity non-carcinogenic (HT-non carc), Eco-toxicity freshwater ($ET_{freshwater}$), Particulate Matter Formation (PMF), and Ionizing Radiation (IR).

A series of studies were performed to: (i) assess the environmental impacts and identify the environmental hot-spots of energy efficiency refurbishment, (ii) assess the influence of building's service life, energy, resource and waste management on the environmental performance of energy efficiency refurbishment, (iii) assess the influence of building size, design and location on the environmental performance of energy efficiency refurbishment, and (iv) to evaluate the contribution of energy efficiency refurbishment to New Zealand's 2050 climate change mitigation target compared to the environmental performance of existing office building stock.

The results showed that at energy efficiency refurbishments can reduce emissions for environmental impact categories affected by energy demand particularly for global warming, acidification and photochemical oxidation. However, the refurbishment is also associated with increase in environmental impacts affected by resource demand such ozone depletion potential, abiotic depletion of resources, human toxicity (carcinogenic) and ionizing radiation. Service life of over 25 years is required to compensate the embodied environmental impacts of refurbishment for most of the impact categories, particularly if the electricity is sourced from renewable energy sources.

Refurbished components such as- on-site photovoltaic (PV), aluminium framed windows, façade components and heat pumps were identified as the major environmental hot-spots for most impact categories. The embodied environmental impacts to most categories could be reduced by 20 - 40 % if the waste recovery and recycling at construction site is improved. However, the overall environmental impacts of refurbished office buildings are highly sensitive to the choice of energy supply.

Energy supply from grid electricity generated from renewable resources should be prioritised over the use of on- site PV. Benefits from on-site PV is limited if the grid electricity supply is mainly from renewable sources; moreover, the production of photovoltaic panels is energy and resource intensive. It can increase nearly 50 - 100 % of the embodied environmental associated with building refurbishment. If on- site photovoltaic is installed, it should be prioritised in buildings with large roof area located in regions with long sunshine hours. The results also show that in large buildings- efficient heating, ventilation and lighting equipment; and smaller wall to window ratios should be prioritised to reduce environmental impacts. In small buildings, the choice of façade materials with low embodied impacts should be prioritised to reduce environmental impacts.

With respect to New Zealand's 2050 target for the existing office building sector 60 - 90 % greenhouse gas emissions reductions is possible only if the office building stock refurbishment is combined with a renewable energy supply. Nearly 60 – 70 % of the greenhouse gas emissions can be reduced if the refurbishment of the existing office building stock is limited to existing large office building stock (>3500 m^2) or to buildings in Auckland and Wellington.

The main conclusions based on the results of this research are to prioritise better resource and waste management, to prioritise strategies for maintenance of refurbished buildings to promote longer service life, to support national level policies on increased use of renewable sources for grid electricity generation, and to prioritise refurbishment for a share of the building stock based on size and location which contributes to maximum energy reduction and minimal environmental impacts. The outcomes of this research can support national policy makers and independent building stakeholders (e.g. architects, owners, and engineers) who are keen on promoting energy efficiency refurbishments in New Zealand's office buildings.

Acknowledgements

"It is not the mountain we conquer, but ourselves."- Sir Edmund Hillary

Working towards my PhD has been an initiation towards self-discovery. I am truly grateful that I had this fantastic opportunity for my personal and professional development. This would not have been possible without the invaluable academic, social and emotional support provided to me by my supervisors, colleagues, friends and family.

First I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my main supervisor Prof. Sarah McLaren, who granted me this unique opportunity. With her keen eye for detail, immense patience and optimism Sarah has constantly motivated my work harder and pursue high quality standard in my research. On my "bad days" when I expressed my cynicism, frustrations, insecurities and tears, she extended her optimism, kindness and friendship. I will always remain grateful for all her encouragement and support.

I would also like to extend my gratitude my co-supervisors Dr David (Dave) Dowdell and Prof. Robyn Phipps. They have both been cheerful motivators who with their discussions have broadened my perspectives and helped me connect with key people working in the construction sector. Special thanks to Dave's wonderful and affectionate family members -Lenka, Lucas and Joshua who hosted me several times in their home in Wellington.

A critical thread for research is to have necessary funds to carry out the work. I would like to acknowledge the support of the Building Research Association of New Zealand and the New Zealand Life Cycle Management centre for supporting me financially during the course of this study.

Big thanks to Shaan Cory and his supervisor Assoc. Prof. Michael (Mike) Donn from Victoria University, Wellington. Shaan's comprehensive work on transforming New Zealand's buildings was a foundation for my research. Without their co-operation and generosity this work would not have been possible. I would also like to extend another big thank you to Assoc. Prof Massimo Pizzol and Prof Jannick Schmidt. They graciously hosted me at Aalborg University for an entire year. They are amazing teachers as well as wonderful office mates. Both of them have a special skill to explain rather difficult concepts with clarity and ease. I have learnt a lot from them especially with respect to complementing LCA with other methodological techniques to improve the quality and validity of my research. I would also like to thank Randi Daalgaard, Jens Fisker, Michael Pederson, Annelle Riberholt, Morten Skou Nicolaisen, Anne Bach, and Nina Vogel for making me feel welcome in Aalborg University and helping me integrate with the Danish lifestyle. Many thanks to Laima, Hao Yinh, Edith Liu, Antonio Sticchi, Giorgo, Ivo, Viktoria and Ivailo for numerous dinners and social evenings during my time there.

I would like to extend my thanks to the PhD community at the Institute of Agriculture and Environment. In particular I would like to thank Khadija Malik, Aniek Hilkens, Flo van Noppen, Julia Bohorquez, Liz Daly, Yenh Dinh, Ackim Mwape, Davood Roodi, Dimitris Rados, Soledad Navedad, Angela Merino, and Sally Coughlan. I have shared my office space with most of them as well as countless coffee breaks, PhD stress, jokes, dilemmas, research tips and most importantly chocolate ☺. Special thanks to staff members – Prof. John Holland, Dr Mike Joy and Sharon Wright for timely encouragement and enthusiasm.

Thank you Anushree Sengupta for the numerous times you hosted me, and the lovely memories of exploring Wellington and its finest eateries. Thank you Bhawana di and Khadija, I am so glad to have across such strong and independent women like you. Our friendship is really close to my heart. Thanks to Saba and Junaid for being such fun and helpful neighbours. Thank you to all the residents of 15 Glasgow Street- Sandeep, Aniek, Ermanno, Stefi. Thank you for the much needed social life with experimental cooking and share my love of Indian movies especially with Sandeep.

Thank you to my wonderful neighbours who made me feel no less than a family member- Shraddha di, Pranav da, Beulah, Ben Anna and their lovely children Praisy, Elyon and Hridaansh. Thank you to the members of Prantik - Debraj da, Tamalika di, Shampa di, Debjit da, Mamta aunty, Sen uncle, Tanu, and Sandeep. Thank you for taking the efforts of organizing our beloved festivals and cultural events which ensured that I don't feel too nostalgic about home.

A thank you is very small expression for the gratitude I feel for my family. Ma, Baba and Dada are my pillars. Everything I have achieved wouldn't have been possible without their constant encouragement. Living far away from them has been difficult for all of us. Despite this not once did they allow me to feel disheartened or discouraged about my decisions. During my PhD, I also met my partner- Michele De Rosa. My thanks to him are endless. Michele had seen me face my worst insecurities and yet it was his love and faith on my abilities that rekindled my motivation and enthusiasm for my research.

I dedicate this work to Michele and my family.

List of Abbreviations

AD_{ff}	Abiotic Depletion (fossil fuels)
AD_r	Abiotic Depletion (resources)
AP	Acidification Potential
AISI	American Iron and Steel Institute
BAU	Business As Usual
BRANZ	Building Research Association of New Zealand
CCANZ	Cement and Concrete Association of New Zealand
CIS Russia	Commonwealth of Independent States (Russia)
EP	Eutrophication Potential
$ET_{freshwater}$	Eco-toxicity (freshwater)
FAO	Food and Agriculture Association
GWP	Global Warming Potential
GHG	Greenhouse gas emissions
HT carc	Human Toxicity (carcinogenic)
HT non carc	Human Toxicity (non- carcinogenic)
IAI	International Aluminium Institute
IEA	International Energy Agency
IR	Ionizing Radiation
LCA	Life Cycle Assessment
LED	Light Emitting Diode
MBIE	Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment
NZ	New Zealand
ODP	Ozone Depletion Potential
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
PCOP	Photochemical Oxidation Potential
PET	Polyethylene Terephthalate
PMF	Particulate Matter Formation
RoW	Rest of the World
REBRI	Resource Efficiency in the Building and Related Industries
UNCOMTRADE	United Nations international COMmercial TRADE statistics
UN FCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNEP	United Nations Environmental Program
USGS	United States Geological Survey

Table of Contents

List of Figures

List of Tables

Chapter 5

Chapter 6

Chapter 7