

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**THE ROLE OF THE MILITARY WITHIN OFFICIAL  
DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE:  
POLICIES, PARAMETERS AND PROCEDURES**

A THESIS PRESENTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE  
REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY  
IN  
DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

AT MASSEY UNIVERSITY, PALMERSTON NORTH, NEW ZEALAND

VERNON NOEL BENNETT

2009

This thesis has been completed as private study undertaken by the author. Except where explicitly stated and cited, the views expressed in this thesis are the author's own and do not reflect the views or policy of the New Zealand Defence Force, the New Zealand Government, or any agency thereof.

## **ABSTRACT**

This thesis explores the relationship between development, Official Development Assistance (ODA) and the military in order to determine both the nature and effects of that relationship, and how the involvement of the military within ODA can be conducted in the most appropriate manner to support development. This study was conducted with regard to the current links between security and development within international relations and concerns that ODA is being drawn from a primarily development role to one that more explicitly supports national foreign and security policy ends instead. This issue is explored by defining development, ODA and the military as separate variables and then employing a grounded theory approach to develop an understanding of the relationship between them. The results of the study show that the involvement of the military within ODA and development may occur throughout the full range of operational contexts in which the military may be employed and can encompass activities throughout the scope of the functions of development. This involvement can in turn create a range of positive and negative impacts upon the conduct of ODA and development as the military serves to moderate the direction and strength of the relationship between the two. From this, the role of the military within ODA is identified as potentially an enabling, implementing and coordinating agency – primarily during times of crisis and conflict. The study then relates this role back to the wider context through considering the management of the military's role and identifying the policies, parameters and procedures that may help to ensure that this role is conducted in the most appropriate manner for development.

To Kathryn

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I would like to acknowledge the support and advice that I received from a number of people during the research process. In the first instance my initial research supervisor, Dr Manuhua Barcham, and his successor as my supervisor, Associate Professor Glenn Banks, greatly assisted the conduct of the research. I was fortunate to also receive further supervisory guidance from Professor John Overton and Doctor Beth Greener. Furthermore, Lieutenant Colonel Richard Taylor, my sponsor officer within the NZDF, offered his support and the benefit of his experience from completing both theses and dissertations.

I was fortunate in that I was employed at the Centre for Defence Studies, Massey University when I commenced the thesis. The Centre not only provided the physical location and support for this part of the research but the staff also offered pertinent advice and opinions on a regular basis. The New Zealand Army also supported my research through both the Army Education Assistance programme and in my appointment as a Chief of Army Scholar in 2006.

I would particularly like to acknowledge the willing assistance of Rae Julian and Suzanne Loughlin who assisted me by participating in my initial scoping interviews, commenting upon my interview content and technique (which helped greatly in avoiding any overt interviewer bias during the interviews themselves), and providing a range of contacts for the subsequent formal research interviews. Rae Julian also kindly invited me to attend a Civil-Military Seminar hosted by the Council for International Development which provided the opportunity to develop a wider understanding of the issues surrounding security and development.

Finally, I would also like to acknowledge the Massey University Human Ethics Committee who authorised elements of the data collection under Massey University Human Ethics Committee (Southern B Application - 06/11).

# **CONTENTS**

	<b><u>Page</u></b>
<b>Title Page</b>	i
<b>Disclaimer</b>	ii
<b>Abstract</b>	iii
<b>Dedication</b>	iv
<b>Acknowledgements</b>	v
<b>Contents</b>	vi
<b>List of Figures</b>	x
<b>List of Tables</b>	xi
<b>List of Abbreviations</b>	xii
<b>Preface</b>	xiii
<b>Chapter One: Introduction</b>	1
The Context for Modern Development	4
Shaping Modern Development	10
Resolving the Issue	15
<b>Chapter Two: Methodology</b>	17
Purpose of Research	17
Research Design	20
Data Collection and Analysis	24

<b>Chapter Three: Development</b>	<b>29</b>
Introduction	29
The Concept of Development	30
Establishing the Construct	31
Representing Development	34
Circumstances	35
Actors and Stakeholders	38
Approaches to Development	40
Methods of Development	41
Considerations	42
Forms	43
Achievements and Effects	45
Model of Development	47
An Operational Definition of Development	48
Spectrum of Development	49
Appropriate Development	51
<b>Chapter Four: Official Development Assistance</b>	<b>55</b>
Introduction	55
Official Development Assistance as a Construct	56
The Relationship between Official Development Assistance and Development	59
The Factors of ODA	59
ODA and the Conduct of Development	63
The Effect of Official Development Assistance upon Development	67
The Theoretical Baseline between Official Development Assistance and Development	70



<b>Chapter Five: The Military</b>	<b>72</b>
Introduction	72
The Military as a Construct	73
The Role of the Military	73
Military Forms, Structures and Employment	76
Assessing the Effect of the Military	81
The Relationship between the Military, ODA and Development	82
The Context of the Relationship	83
The Nature of the Relationship	85
The Factors that Shape the Military's Involvement	85
The Conduct of Military's Involvement	90
The Effect of the Military within the Development Process	98
The Legitimacy of the Military's Involvement	99
The Sustainability of the Military's Involvement	103
The Wider Effects of the Military's Involvement	107
<b>Chapter Six: The Role and Management of the Military within ODA</b>	<b>110</b>
Introduction	110
The Role of the Military within ODA	111
Relating the Constructs	112
The Employment of the Military within the Spectrum of Operations	113
The Employment of the Military within the Spectrum of Development	116
The Levels and Types of Military Involvement within ODA	118

Assessing the Influence of the Military	119
The Role of the Military	123
Managing the Role of the Military within ODA	124
Opportunities and Threats	125
Tasks, Resources and Coordination	129
The Conduct of the Military Role in ODA	132
Policies	133
Parameters	134
Procedures	135
<b>Chapter Seven: Conclusion</b>	138
The Conduct of the Research	138
The Results of the Study	140
Outcomes of the Study	141
Relevance of the Study	146
<b>Appendix 1: Model of Development</b>	149
<b>Appendix 2: Spectrum of Development</b>	150
<b>Appendix 3: NZDF Spectrum of Operations</b>	151
<b>List of Interviews</b>	152
<b>Bibliography</b>	153

## **LIST OF FIGURES**

<b>Figure</b>		<b><u>Page</u></b>
3.1	The Key Parameters of the Development Construct	35
3.2	Effects of Development	46
3.3	Model of Development	47
3.4	Spectrum of Development	50
3.5	Natsios' Nine Principles of Reconstruction and Development	53
5.1	NZDF Spectrum of Operations	75
6.1	SWOT Analysis of the Relationship between the Military, ODA and Development	126

## **LIST OF TABLES**

<b>Table</b>		<b><u>Page</u></b>
3.1	Circumstances of Development	37
3.2	Actors and Stakeholders in Development	39
3.3	Forms and Techniques of Development Activity	44
3.4	Functions in Development	45

## **LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS**

3D	defence, development and diplomacy
AusAID	Australian Agency for International Development
CERP	commander's emergency response program
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CIMIC	civil-military cooperation
CMO	civil-military operations
CSO	civil society organisation
CSP	country strategy paper
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
DFID	Department for International Development (United Kingdom)
EU	European Union
IASC	Inter-Agency Standing Committee
IDA	International Development Association
IDEA	Integrated Development Entrepreneurial Advice
IGO	international governmental organisation
ISAF	International Security Assistance Force
JIMP	joint, interagency, multinational and public
MASD	military assistance, security and development
MDG	millennium development goals
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
NGO	non government organisation
NZAID	New Zealand Agency for International Development
NZDF	New Zealand Defence Force
OCHA	United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
ODA	Official Development Assistance
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PRT	Provincial Reconstruction Team
PSO	peace support operation
QIP	quick impact project
RAMSI	Regional Assistance Mission Solomon Islands
RRD	relief-rehabilitation-development
SFOR	Stabilisation Force
SWOT	Strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USNS	United States Naval Ship

## **PREFACE**

My interest in the relationship between the military and aid was first sparked when, as a United Nations Military Observer in Angola, the team site that I was attached to was tasked to monitor and report on both the conditions of displaced person camps and the conduct of aid agency food distribution in our Area of Operations. My next involvement occurred in Dili, Timor Leste, in October 2001 when as a staff officer on Headquarters Dili Command (and an extramural development studies student) I attended the inaugural meeting of the Dili Reconstruction Committee and witnessed the interaction between military and civil personnel, and between the various intervention agencies and the prospective recipients. The conduct of development assistance by the International Force East Timor was a key line of operations with certain nations deploying specialist civil-military cooperation (CIMIC) and/or humanitarian assistance capabilities into the theatre of operations, and others retasking units as required, while the tremendous interest by the international community was reflected in the large number of aid and development agencies present. As a staff officer on a formation level headquarters it was readily apparent that comprehensive peace support operations of this type did require effective coordination and cooperation between military and civil agencies.

In 2001 I was deployed as a CIMIC projects officer with a Multinational Division Headquarters in Bosnia i Herzegovina with responsibility for the Division's conduct of DFID, CIDA and certain EU development programmes and projects. These activities differed markedly from the imperatives of immediate assistance that occurred during my time in Timor Leste as the NATO mission in Bosnia had by and large moved to a rehabilitation and development focus. The relatively established nature of the mission in Bosnia at that time was also reflected in an acceptance of the military's role in the development arena by the military forces that I worked with. This was to some extents in contrast to my experiences in the Solomon Islands in 2003 when, as the Deputy Commander of the military forces in the Regional Assistance Mission to the Solomon Islands (RAMSI), I witnessed some of the tensions that can develop between military

and civil actors and, in particular, a resistance by certain elements of the military to the conduct of these non-core roles. RAMSI was also notable for its focus as a Whole of Government approach that would address a wide range of factors to assist a failing state. My next deployment after the Solomon Islands also included the Comprehensive or Whole of Government approach. In 2007 I worked as a plans officer on the ISAF Headquarters in Afghanistan where I had to opportunity to observe the work of the Force's CIMIC staffs and participate in coordinated strategic planning with other agencies.

The key realisation from these experiences is that the military is being employed in a variety of missions and roles that differ from the traditional focus on conventional operations and that, as a result of their association with a variety of actors and processes in the development field, they may have the potential to achieve a wide range of effects or, conversely, negatively affect the conduct of activities by others. Furthermore, as the New Zealand Defence Force (NZDF) in RAMSI did complete tasks on behalf of the New Zealand Agency for International Development (NZAID), it was apparent that the military could (and did) interact with a state's ODA. These were some of the main reasons why I selected this topic for further study and, to some extent, should explain the reflexivity that may be present within the research process itself.

Vern Bennett  
Wellington  
March 2009