

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

ADVERTISING AND THE MARKET ORIENTATION OF POLITICAL
PARTIES CONTESTING THE 1999 AND 2002 NEW ZEALAND
GENERAL ELECTION CAMPAIGNS

A THESIS PRESENTED IN FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR
THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY IN POLITICS
AT MASSEY UNIVERSITY, PALMERSTON NORTH, NEW ZEALAND.

CLAIRE ELIZABETH ROBINSON

2006

ABSTRACT

This thesis proposes an alternative way of establishing a link between market orientation and electoral success, by focusing on market orientation as a *message* instead of as a management function. Using interpretive textual analysis the thesis examines the advertising messages of the highest polling political parties for evidence of voter orientation and competitor orientation in the 1999 and 2002 New Zealand general election campaigns. Relating manifest market orientation to a number of statistical indicators of electoral success the thesis looks for plausible associations between the visual manifestation of market orientation in political advertisements and parties' achievement of their party vote goals in the 1999 and 2002 elections. It offers party-focused explanations for electoral outcomes to complement existing voter-centric explanations, and adds another level of scholarly understanding of recent electoral outcomes in New Zealand.

While the thesis finds little association between demonstration of *competitor orientation* in political advertisements and electoral success, it finds a plausible relationship between parties that demonstrated a *voter orientation* in their political advertisements and goal achievement. The parties that achieved their party vote goals in 1999 and 2002 tended to demonstrate an affinity for their target voter groups by showing images of voters and their environments and images of party leaders interacting with voters. They demonstrated concern for the satisfaction of the needs of existing voters by using words of togetherness and proving they had met their previous promises. They did not change their policy or leadership messages dramatically between campaigns. There was a visual consistency to their television, print and billboard advertising messages which rendered the messages easy to recognise and remember. They were clear about what they were offering in exchange for the party vote and recognised the need to offer something in addition to previous offerings in order to attract new voters.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to firstly acknowledge my father, the late Dr Alan Robinson, who was one of New Zealand's first psephologists, and my mother Marijke Robinson, a founder of the New Zealand Women's Electoral Lobby. They raised me in a household in which a fascination for New Zealand elections was assumed to be normal behaviour! I am indebted to my supervisors Drs Kerry Taylor and James Watson of the School of History, Philosophy and Politics at Massey University, who provided consistent support and essential feedback on this text, in its many iterations, over the past six years. Thanks go to the Rt Hon. Jenny Shipley, the late Rod Donald, another party leader who did not wish to be named, Doug Woolerton, Mike Williams, Mike Smith, Pat Webster, and Fraser Carson, whose personal reflections on the 1999 and 2002 election campaigns provided invaluable background context. Approval to interview these people was obtained from the Massey University Human Ethics Committee. I am grateful to Professor Jack Vowles of Auckland University for permission to use data from the 2002 New Zealand Election Study. At Massey University's College of Creative Arts, my thanks go to Professors Duncan Joiner and Sally Morgan, and Associate Professor Lynne Ciochetto, for their support throughout my studies. I was privileged to receive teaching release through the Massey University Academic Women's Award and the Massey University Advanced Study Award. Brett Lineham's many years of encouragement is gratefully acknowledged. My children's faith in my ability to complete this journey is humbling; thank you Anna and Thomas. I have had to confront many challenging personal moments over the past couple of years. Heartfelt thanks go to Mark McQuillan for holding my hand to the finish line.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of Terms and Abbreviations	v
List of Images, Tables and Figures	vi
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Political Marketing	3
1.2 Market Orientation and Political Communication	14
1.3 New Zealand Context	22
1.4 Summary and Research Aims	25
2. DECODING ADVERTISEMENTS	27
2.1 Data Collection	27
2.2 Interpretive Textual Analysis	30
2.3 Visual Criteria	34
3. 1999 CAMPAIGN	40
3.1 National 1999	40
3.2 Labour 1999	68
3.3 New Zealand First 1999	92
3.4 The Alliance 1999	107
3.5 ACT 1999	121
3.6 The Greens 1999	136
3.7 United New Zealand 1999	148
4. 2002 CAMPAIGN	161
3.1 Labour 2002	164
3.2 National 2002	185
3.3 The Alliance 2002	208
3.4 ACT 2002	220
3.5 The Greens 2002	236
3.6 New Zealand First 2002	254
3.7 United Future 2002	266
5. CONCLUSION	277
5.1 Advertising and Electoral Outcomes	279
5.2 Theoretical Contribution	281
5.3 Applied Contribution	285
Bibliography	287

LIST OF TERMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

9/11	September 11, 2001, when New York City's Twin Towers were destroyed by Al Qaeda terrorists.
APEC	Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation.
FPP	First Past the Post electoral system.
GE	Genetic Engineering; the deliberate modification of the characteristics of an organism by manipulating its genetic material
Gestalt	An organised whole that is perceived as more than the sum of its parts.
MMP	Mixed Member Proportional electoral system.
MP	Member of Parliament.
NZES	New Zealand Election Study.
Sans Serif	A form of type without serifs, the slight projections which finish off each stroke of a letter; e.g., T.
Serif	A form of type with slight projections which finish off each stroke of a letter; e.g., T.
Still	A single image captured from a moving image sequence.
TVNZ	Television New Zealand.
URL	Uniform (or universal) resource locator, the address of a World Wide Web page.
US	United States.
UK	United Kingdom.
V/O	Voice over; narration in an advertisement not accompanied by a picture of the speaker.

LIST OF IMAGES, TABLES AND FIGURES

Figure 1.1	p. 16	NZES respondents viewing televised advertising and news in the 2002 campaign.
Table 2.1	p. 39	Visual criteria used to identify market orientation.
Image 3.1.1	p. 42	Stills from National's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.1.2	p. 43	Stills from National's 1999 television commercials.
Image 3.1.3	p. 43	Still from National's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.1.4	p. 44	Stills from National's 1999 television commercial featuring Treasurer, Bill English.
Image 3.1.5	p. 45	Stills from National's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.1.6	p. 45	Still from National's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.1.7	p. 46	National television commercial featuring Jenny Shipley, 1999.
Table 3.1	p. 47	Inclusive pronouns we/our per minute in 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.1.8	p. 48	Stills from National's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.1.9	p. 49	National party vote billboard, 1999.
Image 3.1.10	p. 50	Still from National's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.1.11	p. 51	National television commercial featuring Minister of Social Welfare Roger Sowry, 1999.
Image 3.1.12	P. 52	National television commercial featuring Deputy Prime Minister Wyatt Creech, 1999.
Image 3.1.13	p. 53	National television commercial featuring Prime Minister Jenny Shipley, 1999.
Image 3.1.14	p. 53	Stills from National's 1999 opening night address.
Table 3.2	p. 54	I-statements per minute in 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.1.15	p. 56	Stills from National's Creech and English television commercials, 1999.
Image 3.1.16	p. 57	National's commitment brochure, 1999.
Figure 3.1	p. 58	NZES tracking poll, 1999.
Image 3.1.17	p. 59	National newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.1.18	p. 59	National billboard, 1999.
Image 3.1.19	p. 60	National billboard, 1999.
Image 3.1.20	p. 61	National's 1999 postcard attacking the Greens.
Image 3.1.21	p. 62	National newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.1.22	p. 63	National Tax television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.1.23	p. 63	National Stable Government television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.2.1	p. 69	Clark in the Park Labour television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.2.2	p. 70	Stills from Labour's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.2.3	p. 71	Stills from Labour's 1999 attack television commercial.
Image 3.2.4	p. 72	Still from Labour's 1999 opening night address.

Image 3.2.5	p. 73	Stills from Labour's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.2.6	p. 76	Labour's 1999 party vote billboard.
Image 3.2.7	p. 78	Labour policy brochure, 1999.
Image 3.2.8	p. 79	Labour's 1999 commitment card.
Table 3.3	p. 80	Commitment card equivalence to NZ Values Study.
Image 3.2.9	p. 81	Stills from Labour's 1999 Future television commercial.
Image 3.2.10	p. 82	Labour Party vote billboard, 1999.
Image 3.2.11	p. 85	Labour newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.2.12	p. 85	Close-up of Labour newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.2.13	p. 86	Labour newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.2.14	p. 88	Labour party vote billboard, 1999.
Image 3.2.15	p. 88	Labour newspaper advertisement published on the day before the 1999 election.
Image 3.3.1	p. 93	Stills from New Zealand First's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.3.1	p. 94	Stills from New Zealand First's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.3.3	p. 95	Stills from New Zealand First's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.3.4	p. 96	Stills from New Zealand First's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.3.5	p. 96	Stills from New Zealand First's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.3.6	p. 97	Still from New Zealand First's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.3.7	p. 98	Final frame from 1999 New Zealand First television commercial.
Image 3.3.8	p. 99	New Zealand First's party vote billboard, 1999.
Image 3.3.9	p. 101	Stills from New Zealand First television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.3.10	p. 102	Stills from New Zealand First television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.3.11	p. 103	New Zealand First billboard, 1999.
Image 3.4.1	p. 109	Alliance billboards, 1999.
Image 3.4.2	p. 110	Stills from Alliance closing night address, 1999.
Image 3.4.3	p. 110	Still from Alliance closing night address, 1999.
Table 3.4	p. 111	Party name mentioned per minute in 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.4.4	p. 112	Stills from Alliance television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.4.5	p. 113	Alliance party vote billboard, 1999.
Image 3.4.6	p. 114	Alliance brochure, 1999.
Image 3.4.7	p. 115	Alliance billboard promoting its Kiwi Bank policy, 1999.
Image 3.4.8	p. 116	Stills from Alliance 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.4.9	p. 116	Alliance street signage, 1999.
Image 3.4.10	p. 117	Alliance's newspaper advertisement published the day before the 1999 election.
Image 3.5.1	p. 123	Stills from ACT's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.5.2	p. 123	Stills from ACT's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.5.3	p. 124	Stills from ACT's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.5.4	p. 134	Stills from ACT's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.5.5	p. 125	Stills from ACT's 1999 opening night address.

Image 3.5.6	p. 126	Stills from ACT's Treaty television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.5.7	p. 127	ACT Treaty policy print advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.5.8	p. 127	Still from ACT's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.5.9	p. 128	Stills from ACT's 1999 Law and Order television commercial.
Image 3.5.10	p. 129	ACT billboard, 1999.
Image 3.5.11	p. 130	Stills from ACT's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.5.12	p. 131	ACT Treaty newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.5.13	p. 132	Still from ACT television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.6.1	p. 137	Stills from Green's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.6.2	p. 138	Stills from Green's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.6.3	p. 139	Stills from Green's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.6.4	p. 139	Green newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.6.5	p. 140	Green newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.6.6	p. 140	Rod Donald in Green opening night address, 1999.
Image 3.6.7	p. 141	Stills from Green's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.6.8	p. 142	Green billboard, 1999.
Image 3.6.9	p. 143	Stills from Green 1999 television commercial.
Image 3.6.10	p. 145	The <i>Local News</i> , 1999.
Image 3.6.11	p. 146	Green newspaper advertisement published the day before the 1999 election.
Image 3.7.1	p. 150	Stills from United New Zealand's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.7.2	p. 150	Stills from United New Zealand's 1999 opening night address.
Image 3.7.3	p. 153	Stills from United New Zealand's 1999 closing night address.
Image 3.7.4	p. 153	Stills from United New Zealand television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.7.5	p. 155	United New Zealand newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 3.7.6	p. 156	Stills from Future New Zealand television commercial, 1999.
Image 3.7.7	p. 157	Future New Zealand brochure, 1999.
Image 3.7.8	p. 157	Future New Zealand newspaper advertisement, 1999.
Image 4.1.1	p. 166	Stills from Labour's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.1.2	p. 166	Still from Labour television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.1.3	p. 168	Stills from Labour's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.1.4	p. 168	Stills from Labour's 2002 opening night address.
Table 4.1	p. 169	Inclusive pronouns we/our per minute in 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.1.5	p. 170	Stills from Labour's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.1.6	p. 172	Stills from Labour's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.1.7	p. 173	Stills from Labour television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.1.8	p. 173	Labour's 2002 commitment card.
Image 4.1.9	p. 174	Labour's 2002 policy brochure.
Image 4.1.10	p. 175	Labour's 2002 party vote billboard.
Image 4.1.11	p. 176	Labour's images of Helen Clark in 1999 (left) and 2002 (right).
Image 4.1.12	p. 176	Labour newspaper advertisement, 2002.
Image 4.1.13	p. 178	Stills from Labour's law and order television commercial, 2002.

Figure 4.1	p. 179	NZES tracking poll, 2002.
Image 4.1.14	p. 180	Labour newspaper advertisement, 2002.
Image 4.1.15	p. 180	Stills from Labour's 2002 attack television commercial.
Image 4.2.1	p. 186	Stills from National's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.2.2	p. 186	Stills from National's Education television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.2.3	p. 188	Still from National Small Business television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.2.4	p. 188	<i>National Times</i> cover, June 2005.
Image 4.2.5	p. 189	Still from National's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.2.6	p. 189	Stills from National Education television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.2.7	p. 190	Stills from National Education television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.2.8	p. 191	Stills from National's 2002 opening night address.
Table 4.2	p. 192	I-statements per minute in 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.2.9	p. 193	Stills from National's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.2.10	p. 194	Still from National's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.2.11	p. 195	<i>National Times</i> cover, May 2002.
Image 4.2.12	p. 196	Still from National Law and Order television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.2.13	p. 197	National party vote billboard, 2002.
Image 4.2.14	p. 197	National newspaper advertisement, 2002.
Image 4.2.15	p. 199	Still from National Economic Growth television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.2.16	p. 200	End visual National television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.2.17	p. 200	End visual, Labour television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.2.18	p. 202	National Treaty newspaper advertisement, 2002.
Image 4.2.19	p. 203	Stills from National's 'I Believe' television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.2.10	p. 204	National newspaper advertisement, last week of 2002 campaign.
Image 4.3.1	p. 209	Alliance party vote brochure, 2002.
Image 4.3.2	p. 210	Stills from Alliance 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.3.3	p. 211	Stills from Alliance 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.3.4	p. 212	Alliance party vote billboard, 2002.
Image 4.3.5	p. 213	Stills from Alliance Education television commercial, 2002.
Table 4.3	p. 213	Party name mentioned per minute in 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.3.6	p. 214	Stills from Alliance 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.3.7	p. 215	Progressive Coalition newspaper advertisement, 2002.
Image 4.3.8	p. 217	Alliance newspaper advertisement, 2002.
Image 4.4.1	p. 221	Stills from ACT's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.4.2	p. 221	Stills from ACT's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.4.3	p. 222	Stills from ACT's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.4.4	p. 222	Stills from ACT Tax Cut television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.4.5	p. 223	Stills from ACT Zero Tolerance For Crime television commercial, 2002.

Image 4.4.6	p. 224	Stills from ACT's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.4.7	p. 224	Still from ACT's 2002 opening night address (left); ACT billboard (right).
Image 4.4.8	p. 225	Stills from ACT One Law for All television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.4.9	p. 225	Stills from ACT's 2002 closing night address.
Image 4.4.10	p. 226	Still from ACT's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.4.11	p. 227	Stills from ACT's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.4.12	p. 228	Still from ACT's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.4.13	p. 229	Stills from ACT's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.4.14	p. 229	Stills from ACT's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.4.15	p. 230	Stills from ACT party vote television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.4.16	p. 231	Selection of ACT billboards, 2002.
Image 4.5.1	p. 237	Green newspaper advertisement, May 2002.
Image 4.5.2	p. 239	Green newspaper advertisements, 2002.
Image 4.5.3	p. 239	Stills from Greens' 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.5.4	p. 240	Close-up of Greens' 2002 typography.
Image 4.5.5	p. 241	Green posters featuring Nandor Tanczos, 2002.
Image 4.5.6	p. 242	Still from Greens' 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.5.7	p. 242	Stills from Greens' 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.5.8	p. 243	Green party vote billboard, 2002.
Image 4.5.9	p. 243	Green party vote billboard, 2002.
Image 4.5.10	p. 244	Stills from Greens' 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.5.11	p. 245	Green Team billboard, 2002.
Image 4.5.12	p. 246	Stills from Greens' 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.5.13	p. 247	Green newspaper advertisement, 2002.
Image 4.5.14	p. 248	Stills from Greens' GE television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.5.15	p. 248	Stills from Greens' GE television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.5.16	p. 249	Still from Greens' 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.6.1	p. 255	Stills from New Zealand First's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.6.2	p. 256	Stills from New Zealand First's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.6.3	p. 257	Stills from New Zealand First's 2002 opening night address.
Image 4.6.4	p. 259	Stills from New Zealand First Treaty television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.6.5	p. 260	Stills from New Zealand First Law and Order television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.6.6	p. 260	Stills from New Zealand First Immigration television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.6.7	p. 261	New Zealand First newspaper advertisement, 2002.
Image 4.6.8	p. 262	New Zealand First party vote billboard, 2002.
Image 4.6.9	p. 262	Alfred Leete poster (left); Winston Churchill (right).
Image 4.7.1	p. 267	United Future brochure, 2002.
Image 4.7.2	p. 268	United Future brochure, 2002.
Image 4.7.3	p. 269	Still from United Future's 2002 opening night address.

Image 4.7.4	p. 270	Stills from United Future television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.7.5	p. 271	United Future newspaper advertisement, 2002.
Image 4.7.6	p. 272	Stills from United Future television commercial, 2002.
Image 4.7.7	p. 273	United Future brochure, 2002.
Table 2.1 (rep)	p. 278	Visual criteria used to identify market orientation.