

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Greed, Grievances and Anarchy at Sea: *Human Security and Somali Piracy*

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Philosophy in Development Studies at Massey
University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Aaron Rees

2011

Abstract

In recent years there has been a dramatic upsurge in piracy off the Somali coast. In 2009 alone, there were 217 reported incidences of Somali piracy, with 857 seafarers being held hostage. This piracy clearly has significant ramifications for global security and development, and must therefore be addressed. It is often stated that piracy is little more than a 'symptom' of greater problems on land. However, current counter-piracy measures have largely been dominated by naval fixes, while failing to address the underlying issues driving piracy. This thesis adopts a human security framework to analyze the underlying economic, social, cultural, political and environmental conditions on land that are contributing to the causation of Somali piracy. This analysis is intended to evaluate economic rationalist (greed) and grievance-based understandings of piracy, and thus shed light on the root causes of Somali piracy, revealing possible avenues to address these causes. To achieve this aim, a qualitative analysis of media interviews with Somali pirates, and other key actors, has been conducted in combination with a critical review of available information on Somali piracy and human security in Somalia. Overall, this study finds that weak human security and external violations of human security in Somalia underpin many of the factors driving piracy off the Somali coast, suggesting that Somali piracy is a human security issue, which requires integrated development and security solutions. Therefore, this thesis proposes that ensuring human freedoms in Somalia is the only sustainable means of addressing Somali piracy.

Acknowledgments

This research was made possible by the contributions of a number of people who I would like to acknowledge and thank.

Firstly, I am immensely grateful for all the help I have received from my first supervisor, Dr Maria Borovnik, who not only got me interested in this topic, but has also provided invaluable advice and motivation throughout the research and writing process. Thanks also to Dr Rochelle Stewart-Withers for providing constructive advice on my draft.

I would like to thank my classmates and the staff at the Institute of Development Studies who have kept things interesting and fun over the last two years.

I must also acknowledge the Rogue Halfies, the finest cricket team to grace the Manawatu.

Finally, I have to thank Mansa and my family who have supported me throughout this long process.

Table of contents

<i>Abstract</i>	i
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ii
<i>Table of contents</i>	iii
<i>List of tables, figures, photographs and boxes</i>	vi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	vii
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 The issue of Somali piracy	3
1.3 Rationale and significance of the study	5
1.4 Research aim and questions	6
1.5 Thesis outline	6
Chapter 2: Human security and piracy	10
2.1 Introduction	10
2.2 The concept of 'human security'	10
2.2.1 The convergence of security and development thought	11
2.2.2 Working definition of human security	14
2.3 The relevance of a human security framework for piracy	17
2.3.1 The importance of understanding the root causes of piracy	17
2.3.2 Rationale for addressing piracy	18
2.4 Chapter summary	19
Chapter 3: Understanding the root causes of piracy	21
3.1 Introduction	21
3.2 Economic rationalism as a motivating factor	22
3.2.1 Economic rationalist explanations of conflicts and crimes	23
3.2.2 Proposed characteristics conducive of piracy	25
3.2.3 Critiques of economic rationalist explanations	28
3.3 Grievances as motivating factors	30
3.3.1 Acts of piracy motivated by grievances	30
3.3.2 Proposed grievances motivating Somali pirates	31
3.3.3 Critiques of grievance based explanations	34
3.4 Chapter summary	34
Chapter 4: Background to human insecurity in Somalia	36
4.1 Introduction	36
4.2 Historical background to human insecurity in Somalia	36

4.2.1	The pre-colonial and colonial periods	37
4.2.2	Independence and the era of General Mohammed Siad Barre	38
4.2.3	The collapse of the central government	40
4.2.4	International intervention	42
4.2.5	Attempts at reestablishing central governance	43
4.2.6	Somalia the 'failed state'	45
4.3	The humanitarian crisis in Somalia	46
4.3.1	Development in Somalia	47
4.3.2	Human rights in Somalia	48
4.3.3	Regional variations in development	49
4.4	Human security threats to coastal areas of Somalia	50
4.4.1	The growing importance of Somalia's marine resources	50
4.4.2	The Indian Ocean tsunami	52
4.4.3	Illegal, unregulated, unlicensed foreign fishing	53
4.4.4	Hazardous waste dumping	54
4.5	Chapter summary	56

Chapter 5: Background to Somali piracy and counter-piracy measures **58**

5.1	Introduction	58
5.2	The nature of Somali piracy	58
5.2.1	History of Somali piracy	59
5.2.2	Current <i>modus operandi</i> of Somali pirates	61
5.3	Somali piracy as a human security threat	66
5.3.1	Threats to the safety and wellbeing of seafarers	67
5.3.2	Economic threats	69
5.3.3	Threats to the provision of humanitarian assistance	70
5.3.4	Potential future threats	70
5.4	Responses to Somali piracy	71
5.4.1	Local responses to Somali piracy	71
5.4.2	International responses to Somali piracy	74
5.5	Chapter summary	77

Chapter 6: Research methodology **78**

6.1	Introduction	78
6.2	Research philosophy and methodological design	78
6.3	Methodology for data collection	81
6.3.1	The use of an indirect data collection methodology	81
6.3.2	Locating and recording potential sources of data	82
6.3.3	Reflections on the data collection process	84
6.4	Methodology for data analysis	87
6.5	Chapter summary	90

Chapter 7: The underlying motives driving Somali piracy **92**

7.1	Introduction	92
7.2	Economic rationalism as a motivating factor to commit piracy	92

7.2.1	Strong incentives to commit piracy	93
7.2.2	Weak disincentives to commit piracy	95
7.3	Grievances as motivating factors to commit piracy	98
7.3.1	Desperation	98
7.3.2	Illegal acts by foreign vessels in Somali waters	100
7.3.3	The 'unjust' actions of the international community	102
7.4	Chapter summary	104
Chapter 8: Discussion and conclusions		105
8.1	Introduction	105
8.2	Possible factors driving Somali piracy	105
8.2.1	Evaluation of economic rationalist understandings of piracy	106
8.2.2	Evaluation of grievance-based understandings of piracy	111
8.2.3	Conclusions on the possible factors driving Somali piracy	116
8.3	Human insecurity and the motives of Somali pirates	118
8.3.1	Human insecurity and economic rationalist motives	119
8.3.2	Human insecurity and grievances-based motives	120
8.3.3	Conclusions on human insecurity and the motives of Somali pirates	122
8.4	Possible means of addressing Somali piracy	122
8.4.1	Ensuring 'freedom from fear'	123
8.4.2	Ensuring 'freedom from want'	125
8.4.3	Ensuring 'freedom to take action on one's own behalf'	126
8.4.4	Conclusions on possible means of addressing Somali piracy	127
8.5	Conclusions	128
8.5.1	Summary of the research findings	129
8.5.2	Concluding comments	131
	<i>References</i>	133

List of tables, figures, photographs, and boxes

Tables

Table 4.1	Regional distribution of GDP per capita among the Somali districts in 2002 (US\$)	49
Table 5.1	Number of seafarers held hostage or kidnapped, physically injured, and killed by Somali pirates, 2004-2009	67
Table 6.1	Search engines used to find general media content on Somali piracy	82
Table 6.2	Key words used in online searches for content on Somali piracy	83
Table 6.3	International and Somali-based media sources used to find content on Somali piracy	83
Table 6.4	Unorganized preliminary codes representing the abstract themes in the interview data	88
Table 6.5	Codes representing variables from economic rationalist and grievance-based understandings of piracy	89
Table 6.6	An example of axial coding in relation to economic rationalist understandings of Somali piracy	90
Table 6.7	An example of axial coding in relation grievance-based understandings of Somali piracy	90

Figures

Figure 1.1	Reported incidences of piracy attributed to Somali pirates	4
Figure 4.1	Map of regional authorities in Somalia	41
Figure 5.1	Range and frequency of incidences of piracy attributed to Somali pirates, 2006-2009	66

Photographs

Plate 4.1	Hazardous waste washed ashore in Puntland by the 2004 tsunami	55
Plate 5.1	Weaponry seized from pirates during anti-piracy operations	64

Boxes

Box 5.1	The <i>Sirius Star</i> , a VLCC hijacked by Somali pirates	65
Box 5.2	Seafarers' perspectives on Somali piracy	68

List of abbreviations

ADB	African Development Bank
AMISOM	African Union Mission in Somalia
CHS	Commission on Human Security
CTF 151	Combined Task Force 151
DFID	United Kingdom's Department for International Development
EU NAVFOR	European Union Naval Force
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
ICC-IMB	International Chamber of Commerce's Maritime Bureau
ICU	Islamic Courts Union
IUU	Illegal, unregulated, unlicensed foreign fishing
MSPA	Maritime Security Patrol Area
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
PPP	Purchasing Power Parity
RPGs	Rocket propelled grenades
SNM	Somali National Movement
SSCS	Sea Shepherd Conservation Society
SSDF	Somali Salvation Democratic Front
TNG	Transitional National Government
TFG	Transitional Federal Government
UN	United Nations
UNEP	United Nations Environmental Programme
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNITAF	Unified Task Force
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UNOSOM I	United Nations Operation in Somalia
UNOSOM II	United Nations Operation in Somalia II
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
US	United States of America
VLCCs	Very Large Crude Carriers
WFP	World Food Programme