

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Mapping Resilience: The Influence of Race, Class and Gender

**A thesis presented in partial fulfilment
for the degree of
Master of Education (Adult Education)**

**At Massey University, Wellington Campus, Wellington,
New Zealand.**

Geoffrey Allan Lee

2002

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

...A lasting tribute to Jack would be for all of us to thank and acknowledge, quietly in private and thoughtfully in public, those who sustain us.

Ann Speirs

(Letter to the Otago Daily Daily Times, 20 July 2000).

I love this letter's sentiments. It says it all to me about the study of resilience and the people I have been involved with during my work. So, thank you Ann Speirs who I do not know, my supervisors Nick Zepke and Marg Gilling who I know rather well, the six case study participants who allowed me the privilege of working with you, my colleagues at the Dunedin College of Education, and all the others who I have talked at, about resilience. Thank you also to those of you who have assisted in the proof reading, editing and word processing process.

DEDICATION

To Beryl – the real sustainer.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	II
DEDICATION	II
TABLE OF CONTENTS	III
ABSTRACT.....	VI
 CHAPTER ONE - INTRODUCTION.....	 1
Preface	1
Introduction.....	1
Thesis Outline	3
The Researcher: Context, Interests and Intellectual Influences.....	4
Research Question	6
Introduction to Resilience.....	6
Race, Class and Gender: How They Impact on Education.....	9
Adult Education: Definitions and Importance	11
 CHAPTER TWO - LITERATURE REVIEW.....	 14
Resilience.....	14
Introduction.....	14
The Role of the Family, School and Community	17
The Role of the Family	17
The Role of the School	20
The Role of the Community	23
Findings from Specific Case Studies	24
Race, Class and Gender: Their Links to Resilience or the Margins?	27
Introduction.....	27
Race	29
Gender.....	30
Class.....	30

Social Class in Aotearoa/New Zealand	33
Gender Relations and Māori Education in New Zealand	34
Summary.....	36
 CHAPTER THREE - UNDERPINNINGS OF THE RESEARCH	39
Introduction.....	39
Conceptual Framework.....	39
The Research Methodology.....	40
Qualitative Research: The Issues for this Study.....	40
Case Studies as Data: The Issues.....	41
Data Collection	44
Autobiography as Data: Implications For This Study	46
The Interviews and the Documentary Evidence.....	47
Social Constructivism and Grounded Theory.....	48
Analysing the Evidence	50
Tracing the Methodology	51
The Subjects and Setting	52
 CHAPTER FOUR - THE RESEARCHER'S STORY AND THE CASE STUDIES.	
.....	55
Some Critical Incidents in Childhood.....	59
Some Critical Incidents in Adolescence and the Tertiary Experience	62
The Case Study Findings.....	65
CASE STUDY ONE - Raymond: Including Both Worlds.....	65
CASE STUDY TWO - Abby: A Growing Confidence.....	72
CASE STUDY THREE - Eva: A Process of Discovery	77
CASE STUDY FOUR - Isobel: A Special Needs Emphasis.....	84
CASE STUDY FIVE - Mere: An Enthusiast	91
CASE STUDY SIX - Nora: A Study in Determination	95
 CHAPTER FIVE - DISCUSSION	101
The Process of Discussion	101
Introduction.....	102
Race, Class and Gender - the Literature and the Data: Class	104

Race, Class and Gender – the Literature and the Data: Gender	105
Race, Class and Gender – the Literature and the Data: Race	107
The Themes	108
1. Whānau Support: The conflict between individual and group responsibility 108	
2. Children Providing Motivation for Study.....	110
3. Class Divisions Are Present in New Zealand	111
4. The Search for, and understanding of Māori Identity but also the acknowledgement of the Pakeha World	112
5. The Importance of Kohanga Reo.....	114
6. The need to help and repay others and provide a service	114
A Final Summary.....	116
 CHAPTER SIX - THE IMPLICATIONS OF THIS RESEARCH.....	118
Implications for Practice.....	118
The Workshops	119
Workshop One	119
Workshop Two	120
Workshop Three	121
Limitations of the Research	121
Implications for Further Research	121
 REFERENCES	123
 APPENDICES	
Appendix 1.....	133
Appendix 2.....	135
Appendix 3.....	136
Appendix 4.....	138

ABSTRACT

This study focuses on the interpretations of resilience by a number of adult learners in a bilingual teaching programme. The adult learners were enrolled in a College of Education programme and were in their second or third year of training. The relationship of resilience with race, class and gender was explored.

The theoretical tradition of resilience is rooted in research that examines the way that children and adolescents survive in the face of sometimes, severe adversity. Resilience is infrequently used to describe the way that adults cope with challenging or unexpected life events. Less well explored, is the way in which adults themselves interpret resilience processes and consequently negotiate risks and have good outcomes.

This inquiry, designed as a qualitative case study of six participants in a bilingual teaching class and informed by a social constructivist/critical theory perspective, was guided by the following research question: How do race, class and gender impact upon the individual's resiliency?

The case study records include in-depth interviews, documentation records and informal conversation.

The study found that a number of factors impacted upon the individuals' resiliency. However, these factors could be said to be present among all of the population. Individual differences are just as likely to be present in the study of resilience as in any other sociological study. Specific factors included the impact of whānau, the strength the case study participants drew from their children, the assertiveness developed from 'classism' seen to be present within New Zealand society, the finding of one's heritage, the development of Kōhanga and the need to provide a service for others.

How society uses power (power over, or power with) was seen as an important societal factor in the development of resilience.

CHAPTER ONE - INTRODUCTION

Preface

In my family, I am the keeper of dreams, the carer of children and pillar post of our family. (Nora)

I think because I can start over again and I am not afraid; that makes me strong. (Mere)

Resilience is being able to deal with things as they come, being able to adapt yourself to given situations so you could cope. (Isobel)

An important part of this thesis is the report of the participants' stories. I consider that I was privileged to hear these stories and I wanted to begin this thesis by highlighting a number of comments made by the case study participants. I think that these brief statements help demonstrate the resilient nature of the participants.

Introduction

The study focussed on the experiences of six adult learners who were enrolled in a bilingual teacher-training programme. These experiences were supplemented by the researcher's story. After working to obtain a strong understanding of the concepts of resilience, race, class and gender through the literature, and exploring the importance of adult education, I used it as the lens through which to focus the reactions and my interactions with the six participants.

I need to begin by highlighting my motivation for such a study. Like most motivations, it is complex and multifaceted. I will briefly list these motivations, and then attempt to draw common themes from them.

- I have been intrigued for a long time with the idea of people being able to bounce back from adversity. However, there still seems to be something missing from the literature that talks about overcoming the odds and having good outcomes. Missing is the exploration of the influence of race, gender and

particularly class in the literature about resilience. I feel that the study of class in New Zealand has been sadly neglected and I have a personal interest in exploring the effect of class upon the process of resilience.

- Reading the work of people like Michael Apple, *Education and Power*, (1995) has highlighted for me the power imbalances present in New Zealand society in general and in education in particular. Through the study of the process of resilience in a bilingual teaching class I hope that I am able to highlight some of the inconsistencies in the use of power within the New Zealand education system.
- My own personal interest in the effects of working class culture upon people (see Ken Loach's film: *My Name is Joe*) and how working class people respond and react to rather unique challenges.
- As a former primary school principal, I was, and still am, concerned about the coping strategies of teachers in an increasingly changing and complex work environment. I argue that a focus on a 'strengths model' with teachers in training may be beneficial and helpful to my profession.

When I reflect upon these motivations, I detect a slight missionary zeal lurking. I should emphasise that it is not my intention to portray a romantic image of resilience and class in particular.

I decided to locate the study within the context of a bilingual teaching class. It seemed to me that to review the *impact of race, class and gender upon resilience* was too large a task to complete without having a specific location. A bilingual teaching class offered much within a framework of case study research.

What then, is the major purpose of this study? For me it is the opportunity to review the literature, tell my story and through case study research, hear the stories of a number of participants in a bilingual teaching class. Although the study is investigating the intersection of race, class and gender and their links with the process of resilience, I entered the study through the class lens of my story. I feel this is important. Although

my gender and ethnicity as Pakeha is important, it is my working class origins that I felt the need to explore and then link to resilience.

This study gained the subjects' views and perceptions of the role of race, class and gender in helping to determine the process of resilience in their lives, and as such relied upon qualitative evidence.

In the following sections, I highlight professional and personal influences which impact upon the study, I pose questions for the study and I attempt to respond to those questions.

Thesis Outline

This thesis endeavours to discover the role that race, class and gender play in an individual's resilience.

A definition of resilience is that of Gilgun's (1999:43):

The general definition of resilience within developmental psychology involves the interactions of risks and assets that result in good outcomes (Gilgun, 1996; Masten, Best, Garmezy, 1990).... Individuals can be termed resilient only when they have been subjected to risk conditions. Egeland and colleagues (1993) view resilience as unfolding within a supportive context, a context that can deteriorate or ameliorate over time... There are other issues with definitions of resilience. Resilience itself is defined as a good outcome. What however, constitutes a good outcome? Is it the absence of poor functioning when persons have risks? Who decides whether a person is functioning well or not? Even persons who generally are not functioning well often have areas of high functioning. On the other hand, fairly well-functioning persons may have areas of maladaptation. General ideas of what constitutes a good outcome, such as loving well, working well, and expecting well, provide guidelines for defining the outcomes of interest in particular studies.

Therefore, as highlighted above, resilience can be defined in many ways.

It is acknowledged that race, class and gender is a potentially huge subject upon which to conduct research. It is suggested that by placing this study within a specific context – *Adult Learners in a Bilingual Teacher Training Programme*, its focus can be narrowed and refined.

The study is organised in six chapters. Chapter One provides an overview of the concept of resilience, attempts to define the term and describes its importance. It discusses the impact of race, class and gender in education and attempts to define adult education and its importance. It also discusses the role and interests of the researcher. Chapter Two presents a literature review linking race, class, gender and resilience and their connections. Chapter Three describes the methodology used in the study and how the gathered data was analysed. Chapter Four describes the researcher's story and the six case studies, while Chapter Five discusses the findings from the literature, the researcher's story and the case studies. Finally, Chapter Six offers conclusions as implications for practice, highlights the limitations of this research and suggests areas for further research.

The Researcher: Context, Interests and Intellectual Influences

Resilience, or the ability to 'soldier on' despite real or perceived life difficulties, has intrigued me for a long time.

Much of the literature relating to resilience seems to relate to the 'wider' or middle class 'audience' and very little research seems to have been focussed on a critical perspective of resilience. My background and upbringing had their origins in the New Zealand working class (see my story in Chapter 4). I am proud of my working class origins and I am interested in exploring the links between resilience and class. I also believe that race, class and gender are linked closely together and that an exploration of just one factor would be doing this study less than justice.

My interest in race and gender arose, in part, from a professional perspective. In the mid 1980's I took up a position as a Principal in an inner city school which had a significant

Pacific Island and Māori roll. When I reflect upon my Principalship I consider that I could have better served the needs of my pupils if I had had a greater understanding of their different gender and racial needs. In particular, the strengths of these two constructs would have helped to develop programmes that emphasised the ‘strengths’ model, or resilience, rather than an undue emphasis on deficits to be corrected.

Over the past few years, reading about ‘Critical Theory’ has contributed to my interest in looking beyond the superficial educational answer. This focus has allowed me to view more critically, educational issues of the day and especially how power is used. Foucault, (Danaher, Schirato and Webb, 2000) says that if you would know who has the power you should look at the margins. I believe that many gender, racial and working class groups are on the margins. I address these issues in the literature review. I will return to the issues of power and control in Chapters Five and Six.

The constructs of race, class and gender linked to resilience allow me to reflect more carefully on the strengths certain groups of people display.

A pilot study that I conducted in 2000 attempted to make links between a Personal and Social Responsibility Model of Teaching Physical Education (Hellison, 1995) and Resilience. A class of Year seven and eight (11, 12 and 13 year olds) children were the subjects in this pilot study and the children who were perceived to be ‘resilient’ appeared to have strengths that ‘fitted’ the philosophy of the Personal and Social Responsibility Model. These included:

- Flexibility and empathy
- Good communication skills
- Problem solving skills
- Ability to act independently
- Goals, aspirations and hopefulness

I found that this pilot study helped to confirm the value of studying resilience. I did feel however, that this pilot study could have been strengthened if issues relating to race, class and gender were addressed. I wondered about the strengths that are highlighted above and what data a focus on race, class and gender may have generated.

Resilience then, is a powerful explanatory concept for me to study and especially powerful when it is linked to race, class and gender.

The case study participants, who I consider are all strongly resilient, could be embodied in the following statement: (author unknown)

Nothing in the world can take the place of persistence

Talent will not; nothing is more common than unsuccessful men with talent.

Genius will not; unrewarded genius is almost a proverb.

Education will not; the world is full of educated derelicts.

Persistence and determination alone are omnipotent. The slogan 'press on' has solved and always will solve the problems of the human race.

Research Question

My research question therefore is:

How do race, class and gender impact upon the individual's resiliency?

Introduction to Resilience

Beginning with Werner and Smith's (1989, in Daly, 1999) classic longitudinal study of the children of Kauai, which began in 1954, the study of resilience has focussed on the way in which children successfully adapt and avoid succumbing to enduring risks despite the presence of severe and ongoing adversity. (Daly, 1999) Other research has examined the experience of resilience in terms of short-term functioning in the face of chronic major life stressors (eg divorce) or resilience as recovery when the immediate danger or stress recedes. (eg. abuse) (Masten, Best and Garmezy, 1990)

Based on the assumptions of a developmental perspective on resilience psychology, there are a number of major ingredients of adaptation to consider in understanding individual resilience. (Masten, 1994) These include: (a) developmental path or history which focuses on the competence or psychological functioning of the individual over time; (b) the nature of the adversities faced by the individual; (c) vulnerability or

protective factors; (d) individual characteristics that function as vulnerability or protective factors; (e) environmental liabilities or protective factors; and (f) the context for adaptation. These major ingredients of adaptation were carefully considered when developing a research agenda for this study.

This study examines the relationships between race, class, gender and resilience and in particular, investigates success gained by adults who could be said to belong to 'at risk' or 'underserved' groups. In addition, it offers policy makers and adult learners the perspective of other 'voices' as they consider the future for adult education and the factors of resilience that can make adult learners stronger.

Defining resilience is a continuing problem, (Kaufman, Cook, Arney, Jones and Pittinsky, 1994, in Grotberg, 1996:2) and there is a lack of consensus about its characteristics and dynamic. (Gordon and Song, 1994) Grotberg, (1996:2) for example states, "*some languages do not have an equivalent word... Spanish, for example, has no word for resilience in the psychological literature but instead uses the term la defensa ante la adversidad*". (strength in the face of adversity) French has the word, but questions whether the concept is viable in the behavioural sciences, while becoming increasingly accepting of its appropriateness. (Manciaux, 1995)

Gilgun, (1999) suggests that human beings are the agents of resilience processes. She states that *resilience appears to be a lot of work, struggle and pain*. Gilgun, (1999:65) continues by stating that *for too long, research (into resilience) has been concerned with quantities – how much, how many, but not sensitive to the central issues of the quality of human life*.

It is intended that this study reflects some of the above issues central to the issues of human life, and in doing so, better establishes the relationships between resilience and race, class and gender.

A definition of resilience that appears to incorporate the literature and is used in The International Literature Project, (1997) is:

Resilience is a universal capacity, which allows a person, group, or community to prevent, minimize or overcome the damaging effects of

adversity. Resilience may transform or make stronger the lives of those who are resilient. The resilient behaviour may be in response to adversity in the form of maintenance or normal development despite the adversity, or a promoter of growth beyond the present level of functioning. Further, resilience may be promoted not necessarily because of adversity, but, indeed, may be developed in anticipation of inevitable adversities.

Rutter, (1991, in the Coordinating Council on Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, 2001:1) states that:

... no one has absolute resilience; rather, it is more appropriate to consider susceptibility to stress as a graded phenomenon. Some individuals are more resilient than others but everyone has their limits.

Masten and Coatsworth, (1998, in the Coordinating Council on Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, 2001:1) note that researchers must make two judgements to identify resilience:

- 1 there has been a significant threat to the individual. This threat is usually high-risk status or exposure to severe adversity or trauma. These are more pathogenic when severe adversity or trauma is superimposed on a person of high-risk status.*
- 2 the quality of adaptation or development is good. That is, the child (or adult -my addition) is behaving in a competent manner.*

Why is resilience important? Maybe, if for nothing else, because it does not convey invincibility. Maybe, through the study of the concept of resilience we have “much to learn from the once-fragmented Humpty Dumpty, who ten – or even forty years later, become whole”. (Vaillant, 1995:285) Maybe, through studying the concept of resilience more stories of strengths, empathy and reconciliation can be shared which may help others. Like Liz Murray’s story:

A few people are born resilient. Elizabeth is one of them. Her parents were cocaine addicts who spent most of the family’s money on feeding their

habits. Liz explains that as a result she and her sister were neglected. The girls often lacked food and warm clothes. By age 15, Liz was homeless. Her mother had died of AIDS, and her father was on the streets. Liz made a vow to herself after her mother's death that her life would be different. She refused to end up like her mother and decided that the best way to avoid that fate was to go back to school. She adhered steadfastly to her plan. She excelled in her high school courses in an accelerated two-year programme, won a highly competitive New York Times scholarship for needy students, and gained acceptance to Harvard University. (Siebert, 2000)

Stories like those of Liz Murray's deserve to be teased out. What are the factors that contribute to the adult learner, Liz's, resilience and, what if any, are the influences of race, class and gender?

Race, Class and Gender: How They Impact on Education

Apple, (1995:xxiv) proposes

"a way of reading social life and institutions in a different way than that distributed by groups in dominance in society. Instead of seeing society as relatively pluralistic but still acting for the common good, the reader interrogates cultural, economic, and political institutions as embodying relations of dominance and subordination."

Apple suggests that these relations exist along class, race and gender lines and; that how class, gender and race relations are built, and contested, is not always readily observable, partly because many aspects of dominant institutions do not have only one effect.

Topics related to race and gender have begun appearing with increasing frequency in the adult education literature. (Imel, 1998:1) She suggests *the growth in this literature base is due to adult educators' awareness of the need to address cultural diversity or inclusive approaches to education.*

The intersection of gender, race, and class and their role in shaping how adults think about learning and knowing is being acknowledged (Caffarella, 1992; Luttrell, 1989) and discussions of race and gender are also being framed within the larger contexts of power structures and power relations. (Stalker 1994; Tisdell, 1993)

Sarah Theule Lubienski, (1997:1) writing in the National Council of Teachers of Mathematics Yearbook: states *diversity and equity are popular topics in the (mathematics) education community today amidst reforms intended to empower all students*. But, as Secada (1992, in Lubienski, 1997:1) notes, *social class is rarely focal in our discussions*.

Martin Thrupp, (1999) writes of the effects of low socio-economic status on a group of New Zealand secondary school students from a working class area. A specific example he cites from his research highlights the impact of class upon education and the opportunities for students from working class backgrounds. He discusses the issues that staff from the researched secondary schools faced with the majority of their pupils from low socio-economic backgrounds. A specific concern experienced was the setting up of programmes for gifted and talented pupils. Despite considerable effort from the staff, it was found to be almost impossible to maintain the planned programme, as the majority of staff time and energy went to managing the 'at risk', or 'underserved' pupils.

Feminist Rita Mae Brown, (1974, in hooks, 1984:3) in urging women to explore the implications of class explains:

Class is much more than Marx's definition of relationship to the means of production. Class involves your behaviour, your basic assumptions about life. Your experience, determined by your class, validates those assumptions; how you are taught to behave, what you expect from yourself and from others, your concept of a future, how you understand problems and solve them, how you think, feel, act.

Approaches suggested for enhancing women's 'different' ways of developing are remarkably similar to principles that are central to (adult) education: teaching and learning that are collaborative and reflective, social change, validation and use of the

life experiences adults bring to the classroom in the teaching/learning process. (Kerka, 1993)

Caffarella, (1992:13) says:

Women's voices are not just gender related, but also rooted in class, race, age, sexual orientation, and family status.

Adult Education: Definitions and Importance

Foley, (1995:4) discusses a definition of adult learning:

The received definition of adult education and training is a fairly restrictive one, identifying adult learning with 'education for adults other than initial preparation for a career, with primary emphasis on non-award education'. (NSW Ministry of Education, 1986:1) Even by this definition, in Australia since the Second World War, and particularly over the past fifteen years, the field of adult education has expanded and diversified. Adult education now comprises a number of specialist fields, including: human resource development in the public and private sectors, vocational education, community adult education, health education, the teaching of English to speakers of other languages, adult basic education and Aboriginal adult education.

Foley, (1995:8) continues by suggesting that adult education and learning can take any one of the following four forms:

- *Formal education – this is the form of adult education with which we are most familiar. Its distinguishing characteristics are that it is organised by professional educators, there is a defined curriculum, and it often leads to a qualification....*
- *Non-formal education – this sort of learning occurs when people see a need for some sort of systematic instruction, but in a one-off or sporadic way...*

- *Informal learning – this sort of learning occurs when people consciously try to learn from their experiences. It involves individual or group reflection on experience, but does not involve formal instruction...*
- *Incidental learning – this type of learning occurs while people perform other duties – such learning is incidental to the activity in which the person is involved, and it is often tacit and not seen as learning, at least not at the time of its occurrence...*

There are many current theories in adult learning. Leach, (2000:13) identifies four clusters of ideas around adult learning: experiential learning, self-directed learning, constructivism and transformative/emancipatory learning.

It is the last ‘cluster’ of ideas that I feel is particularly relevant and exciting when exploring the concept of resilience and the adult learner.

Leach, (2000:17) suggests that *transformative and emancipatory learning are often connected with critical theory and that transformative learning is usually associated with individual, personal change*. As this study is concerned with adults and change, it seems that the ‘use’ of critical theory with its emphasis on group change, and its associated learning theory of transformation (individual change), to help analyse and make meaning of resilience, is appropriate. Mezirow, (1981, 1985; in Zepke, 1999:5) offers a detailed explanation of how transformative learning takes place. Mezirow’s transformation theory suggests that learning occurs when critical reflection or self-reflection leads to a new or revised interpretation of the learner’s past experience. In terms of the study of the learner’s perceptions of resilience, Mezirow’s (1993:226; in Zepke, 1995:5) following statement about transformation in meaning perspectives, is useful:

Transformative learning is central to what adult education is all about. Adult development means the progressive realization of an adult’s capacity to fully and freely participate in rational dialogue, to achieve a broader, more discriminating, permeable and integrative understanding of his/her experience as a guide to action.

Resilience, as has been discussed previously, is a problematic concept. Mezirow's work, *On Critical Reflection*, (1998) highlights a concept analysis of critical reflection and especially of critical reflection of assumptions. Mezirow, (1998) claims that this concept is central to understanding how adults learn to think for themselves rather than act on the concepts, values, and feelings of others. It would seem that Mezirow's concept will assist in the process of critically reflecting on previously held views of resilience, especially within the framework of a race, class and gender construct.

Adult learning theories, especially the transformation theory of adult learning, therefore, appear to have the potential to inform this study.

CHAPTER TWO - LITERATURE REVIEW

This review of literature will be presented in two parts. The first part will examine the constructs of resilience; the second part will explore critical reviews of race, class and gender studies and their link to resilience with an emphasis on the New Zealand context. This link will be examined from a critical theory perspective and will have a particular emphasis on marginalisation. It is considered that the constructs of race, class and gender mean that individuals from those groups can find themselves on society's margins.

Marginalisation is defined by Hall, (1999:1) as *the peripheralization of individuals and groups from a dominant, central majority. Marginalisation was seen as a sociopolitical process, producing both vulnerabilities (risks) and strengths (resilience).*

Identified themes will be highlighted at the conclusion of the literature review. These themes will be analysed together with the themes that emerge from the results section and provide the basis for the discussion section.

Resilience

This part of the literature review will critically review the development of resilience in children by exploring the role of family, school and community. It will continue by exploring the literature which links resiliency to adults, and conclude by examining a number of the findings from specific qualitative studies of adult resiliency.

Introduction

Masten, (2001:228) states:

Resilience refers to a class of phenomena characterized by good outcomes in spite of serious threats to adaptation or development. Research on resilience aims to understand the processes that account for these good outcomes. Resilience is an inferential and contextual construct that requires two major kinds of judgements (Masten, 1999; Masten and Coatsworth,

1998). The first judgement addresses the threat side of the inference. Individuals are not considered resilient if there has never been a significant threat to their development; there must be current or past hazards judged to have the potential to derail normative development...The second judgement involved in an inference about resilience is the criteria by which the quality of adaptation or development outcome is assessed or evaluated as 'good' or 'OK'.

Masten, (1999) discusses the present controversy about how resilience should be defined and by what standards. She continues by suggesting that many developmental investigators have defined resiliency on the basis of an observable track record of meeting the major expectations of a given society or culture in historical context for the behaviour of children (people) of that age or situation. She also discusses a related issue: should resilience be defined on the basis of external adaptation criteria such as academic achievement or internal criteria such as a low level of distress, or both? She concludes by suggesting that the choices made about the adaptation criteria defining resilience will influence who is included in studies and will reflect cultural norms, whether or not these are articulated in a study.

According to Brodtkin and Coleman, (1996, in Dirling, 1999:1) *a resilient child has an inner strength that will help that child bounce back from the problems that would seem to doom the child to certain failure.* Lifton, (1994) identifies resilience as the human capacity of all individuals to transform and change, no matter what the risks.

Gilgun, (1999:44) discusses her concerns about definitions of resilience:

There are other issues with definitions of resilience. Resilience itself is defined as a good outcome. What, however constitutes a good outcome? Is it the absence of poor functioning when persons have risks? Who decides whether a person is functioning well or not? Even persons who generally are not functioning well often have areas of high functioning.

Researchers in child resilience, (Werner and Smith, 1982; Garnezy, 1985, in Grotberg, 1996:2) found that about one third of studied children, living with risk factors, were

well adjusted, happy and successful. The researchers began to wonder what was going on with the children and how their success could be accounted for. In a sense, the previous two sentences provide a touchstone for this study – what factors have contributed toward the success of the 6 participants in this study?

William Franklin, MD, speaking in his opening statement at the fifth International Conference on Early Identification of Children at Risk: Resilience Factors in Prediction, stated:

One thing that has become clear from the previous four conferences is how often researchers and care providers alike have been caught up in a pathological model of looking at children. We have focussed on looking for problems, a negative approach that may sometimes have the undesirable effect of causing parents to think negatively about their children. That is why the Fifth International Conference will focus on those resilience and 'self-righting' factors - those strengths – that seem to protect some children who are at high risk for development handicaps. (Frankenberg, 1987)

According to Masten, Best and Garmezy, (1990) resilience can be used to describe three major classes of phenomena in the psychological literature:

- The first type occurs in high-risk people who have better than average expected outcomes. Such studies attempt to identify the predictors of good outcomes in high-risk groups. (This study would fall into this category but include the constructs of race, class and gender – a little studied group in terms of resilience).
- The second major class of resilience phenomena refers to good adaptation despite stressful experiences. Studies examine the general effects of stressors on child behaviour and the moderators that seem to enhance or reduce adversity.
- The third class includes studies of individual differences in recovery from trauma.

Embedded in the findings of the resilience literature are a number of theoretical assumptions about which factors play a critical role in explaining resilient behaviour.

(Daly, 1999) She suggests that attempts to understand resilience have changed from trying to identify attributes that characterise the resilient individual to understanding family responses, systemic dynamics, and contextual processes.

The Role of the Family, School and Community

Resilience is an inside-out process that begins with one person's belief and emanates outward to transform whole families, classrooms, schools and communities. (Fullan, 1993, in Bernard, 1999)

Bernard, (1999:2), in discussing her research-based planning framework to train school and community teams suggests that there should be a concentration on the “*health of the helper*”. She also suggests that in order for staff to create the nurturing environment that taps “*innate resilience*”, they must truly believe in youth’s innate capacity for transformation and change.

The Role of the Family

Research on the role of the family, (Wang, Haertel and Walberg, date unknown) has documented the importance of positive child-parent relationships and has emphasised that secure childhood attachments protect against adversity in later life. Wang, Haertel and Walberg, (1997:3) suggest that parents can provide a healthy environment for their children in many ways:

- Avoid violent conflicts and abuse
- Exhibit warmth and caring
- Encourage joint activities
- Encourage responsibility through family chores
- Provide positive role models
- Introduce appropriate role models
- Show interest in accomplishments
- Enrol children in school and community programmes
- Encourage skill development
- Seek professional help where necessary
- Participate in organised adult-child programmes

West and Farrington, (1973) cite empirical data that highlight the importance of such things as: adequate and consistent parental role models and harmony between the parents; parents who spend time with children in order to pass on verbal and social attainments; parents who provide for and take an interest in constructive use of leisure and who provide firm and consistent guidance without repressive or rejecting attitudes. This research, while important, is dated and highlights the need for more focussed research in the New Zealand context. For example, “the family” and “parents” need to be redefined and reconceptualised within New Zealand’s bicultural context.

A major longitudinal study of 1400 families in the United States has attempted to identify those strengths that contribute to family resilience in times of stress. (McCubbin and McCubbin, 1988, in Howard, Dryden and Johnson, 1999) The findings from this study suggest that while the strengths required by the family vary at different points in the life cycle, overall, resilient families seem to have three particular characteristics in common. First they have a system of celebrations and acknowledgements of key events in the life of the family that have a stabilising effect during times of crisis. Secondly, family members have strong durable beliefs in their ability to control life; and thirdly, the family establishes and maintains routines for a variety of activities. These beliefs and characteristics will be explored later in this review through the Milstein and Henry, (2000) model.

The impact of caring and support is highlighted in Rutter’s (1979b, in Wang, Haertal and Walberg, 1994:57) study of discordant families. Of children from discordant families, 75% exhibited conduct disorders when they failed to have a positive relationship with either parent as, compared to 25% when children maintained a good relationship with at least one parent. In a review of studies of competence under stress, Masten, Best, and Garnezy, (1990) provided evidence that family instability and disorganisation predicted school disruptiveness. However, there is evidence that the stress produced in discordant families can be mitigated. Bernard, (1991) found that though divorce produces stress, the availability of social support from family and community could reduce stress and produce positive outcomes.

A topic of research that has received attention in the United States during the past twenty-five years is that of mobility on children's lives. Migration was shown to be a serious and pervasive risk factor for student learning among poor and minority groups, as revealed by two large national surveys in the United States. (Long, 1975; Straits, 1987, in Wang, Haertal and Walberg, 1994:57) Moving, generally keeps children of lower socio-economic status from attaining their expected achievement. There are no conducted parallel studies in New Zealand that I am aware of, but data gathered by the Education Review Office, (1997:11) led to the conclusion that

Transient students have low levels of attendance and many have special learning needs exacerbated by their intermittent schooling. In almost all instances the transient nature of their school attendance and its causes are outside the control of both the students and the schools they attend. High levels of transience are regarded by principals as a significant reason for student failure.

Bernard, (1991) pointed to the importance of children's participation in family and household activities in fostering resiliency. The value of assigned household tasks, caring for brothers and sisters, and the contribution of part-time work in supporting the family are all highlighted. It is suggested that developing the helping behaviours of children, within the family structure, can enhance their self-esteem and ultimately foster resilience. The concept of providing a service for others is addressed throughout this thesis and is one of the cornerstone concepts of the Milstein and Henry, (2000) model.

Finally, Rak and Patterson (1996, in Bondy and McKenzie, 1999:3) identify several protective family conditions, including an array of alternative caregivers when parents are not consistently present. This perspective seems to link to the concept of whānau, which is, considered to be a crucial concept in the New Zealand setting (Smith, 1992). Whānau is highlighted by all of the case study participants in this study, as integral to developing resilience within the (extended) family.

The following themes of 'resilience making' then, appear to be linked to the role of the family:

- The participation in child/adult activities
- The notion of providing a 'service' for others
- The general perspective of total love and support from the family and whānau

The Role of the School

Werner and Smith, 1982; Coburn and Nelson, 1989, in Howard, Dryden and Johnson, (1999) highlight the important role that teachers can play in promoting resiliency in their pupils. These studies discovered that among the most frequently encountered non-family, positive role models in the lives of resilient children, were favourite teachers who took a personal interest in them; were not just academic instructors but were also confidants and positive role models for personal identification.

The value of teachers providing support and an empathic attitude, is described by Noddings, (1988, in Bernard, 1991:6)

At a time when the traditional structures of caring have deteriorated, schools must become places where teachers and students live together, talk with each other; take delight in each other's company.

An emerging body of research suggests that significant school reform is needed to promote those factors that have been shown to predict resilience in student populations. (Dryden, 1995, in Howard, Dryden and Johnson, 1999:7) Several researchers have made recommendations for ways in which schools can promote resilience in students. (McMillan and Reed, 1994; Pasternak and Martinez, 1996; Reynolds, 1994; Werner, 1984; Henderson and Milstein, 1996; Milstein and Henry, 2000)

Cruickshank, (1990, in Wang, Haertel, and Walberg 1994:49) states:

Effective educational practices have constituted a major research front since the mid-1970's.

He continues by highlighting that school effectiveness has both macro level and micro level dimensions. The macro level factors encompass the total school environment and

related extra school variables. Micro level factors emphasise the effectiveness of classroom instruction, which includes replicable patterns of teacher behaviours and student achievement.

The Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, (1988, in Wang, et al 1994:50) advanced a definition of an urban school, based on a number of criteria; the following criteria are relevant to the concept of resiliency:

- Does the school have clearly defined goals?
- Does the school evaluate the language proficiency of each student? What evidence is there that students are developing their communication skills, both oral and written?
- Does the school have a core curriculum for all students?
- What is the enrolment pattern among the various educational programmes at the school?
- Is the school organised into small units to overcome anonymity among students and provide a close relationship between student and mentor?
- Are there flexible scheduling arrangements at the school?
- Is there a programme that encourages students to take responsibility for helping each other learn and helps make the school a friendly and orderly place?
- Does the school have a well-developed plan of renewal for teachers and administrators?
- Is the school clean, attractive, and well equipped?
- Are parents active in the school and kept informed about the progress of their children?
- Does the school have connections with community institutions and outside agencies to enrich the learning possibilities of students?

Through the research of Brodtkin and Coleman, (1996, in Dirling, 1999:4) a checklist was developed to allow teachers to identify the resilience factors of their pupils. Answers of 'No' suggest areas to which supportive attention can be directed.

- 1 Does the student have a sense of humour?
- 2 Is the student well liked by peers as well as adults?
- 3 Is the student flexible, caring, and empathetic?

- 4 Does the student possess good communication skills?
- 5 Is there at least one supportive caregiver in the student's life?
- 6 Can the students solve problems?
- 7 Is the student resourceful in seeking the help of others?
- 8 Does the student have a sense of autonomy – the ability to act independently?
- 9 Does the student have goals, educational aspirations, persistence and hopefulness?
- 10 Does the student have a caring, supportive environment (at least at school)?
- 11 Do you, the teacher, and the school hold high expectations for the student?
- 12 Are there numerous opportunities for the student to participate positively in school activities?

Bushweller, (1995, in Dirling, 1999:4) wrote: Research...*shows resilient kids have an uncanny ability to make school a refuge from society's ills.* He continues by suggesting that the classroom teacher can assist by giving pupils space, safety, and freedom and that through the use of a resilient-sensitive management plan, each of those needs can be met.

Wang, Haertel, and Walberg (1994) suggest that the academic achievement of 'at risk' students is the product not only of a child's intellectual ability, but also of the school's climate and the social support networks available from families. Clark, (1991, in Wang, et al., 1994:64) stated: *after the family, peers are the most important source of support.* A strong support for the influence of peers is that the use of cooperative strategies is the single most effective school-based intervention for reducing drug and alcohol use. (Bangert-Downs, 1988; Wallerstein and Bernstein, 1988) Wang, et al (1994) suggests that mentoring programmes, cooperative learning programmes, cross age tutoring, use of small learning groups, and extracurricular activities provide mechanisms for children and youth to develop positive peer relationships and stronger support networks that serve as a protective process to foster resilience.

Howard, Dryden, and Johnson, (1999) suggest that achievement in school is made more likely when teachers teach for mastery; curricula are relevant to student's present and future needs; authentic assessment practices are used; democratic classrooms are created where students contribute to the rule making and governance; rational, humane and consistent behaviour management techniques are adopted; teachers are warm,

approachable, fair and supportive; and a range of ways of being successful are made available to students. (Porter and Brophy, 1988; Nuthall and Alton-Lee, 1990; Australian Teaching Council, 1996, all in Howard, Dryden, and Johnson 1999:11)

Patterson and Patterson, (2001:3) suggest that school leaders are vital to school resilience and they cite Conner (1992) who has identified five characteristics of resilient leaders that have direct implications for schools:

- Positive in their recognition that adversity presents opportunities, not just threats to the school
- Focussed in their attempts to guide the school toward its own compelling vision, despite disruptions from the outside
- Flexible in their ability to consider alternative ways of viewing the issue and in their ability to apply alternative strategies for achieving what needs to be accomplished in the school
- Organised in their ability to see underlying themes and connections between imposed changes and the changes desired by the school
- Proactive in looking for ways to create win-win situations out of perceived conflicts between outsiders' expectations for change and the expectations for change held by those inside the school

The Role of the Community

In relation to the community, children in disadvantaged areas are generally considered more "at risk" than those in more affluent areas. However, certain community characteristics seem to operate as protective factors. The strength of social support networks provided by kin and social service agencies, for example, is one such factor. (Pence, 1988, in Howard, Dryden and Johnson, 1999:7)

Bernard, (1991) identified three characteristics of communities that foster resilience. These characteristics are: availability of social organisations that provide an array of resources to residents; consistent expression of social norms so that community members understand what constitutes desirable behaviour; and opportunities for children and youth to participate in the life of the community as valued members.

Wang, (1994:45) suggests that local communities can positively affect the social well-being, health, safety and the intellectual life of their residents. Social support by caring adults in the community can provide opportunities for students to develop new interests and skills. She continues by suggesting that

“ because schools have the most sustained contact with children and their families, public education officials should take into consideration, when designing their school improvement programmes, the potential benefits of coordinating and integrating children's services across school and community organizations”.

Findings from Specific Case Studies

The *Resiliency in Families Series*, (McCubbin, Thompson, Thompson and Futrell, 1999) highlight a number of case studies, which have implication for this study – both in a methodological sense and reported findings. I will report on each case study and draw any conclusions that appear to have relevance for this study.

Daly, (1999:34) writes about facing the challenges of infertility. She states *prior to this invitation, resiliency did not enter my writings about infertility...* She continues by suggesting that resilience is not something that can be measured in terms of success, but rather a process of navigating an ongoing set of challenges that can get in the way of an important goal. She also discusses the difficulties in determining who is resilient and who is not. She asks:

First, do we measure successful outcomes in relation to each of the problems that are encountered along the way or do we use arrival at the goal as the measure of success... do we assess resilience by perseverance to reach a goal or by their adaptability to life's immediate and day to day challenges?... Second, there has been a tradition within the resilience literature to assess how intact the individual or family is at the end of the storm. Have they survived the storm? Are they stronger?...I would argue that we need to shift these kind of assessments from “better” or “worse” and rather seek to understand the way that these crises transform lives.

Daly, (1999) concludes by suggesting that resilience is not an individual attribute but rather a capability that ebbs and flows in the course of negotiating complex physiological, psychological, and social challenges.

Gilgun, (1999) writes about mapping the process of resilience among adults with childhood adversities. During the course of analysing the data for her study she writes about *human agency* – the will to do or be something – and she claims that this concept has a major role in the resilience process. She suggests that resilience appears to be a lot of work, struggle and pain and that resilience research has been concerned with qualities. How much, how many, but not sensitive to the central issues of the quality of human life.

Catherine Chesla, (1999) in her case study, *Becoming Resilient: Skill Development in Couples Living With Non-Insulin Dependent Diabetes*, talks about the study of skilled practices having the potential to inform the study of resiliency in families. Chesla's study assumed that families learned practically from the experience with the disease (diabetes) and therefore acquired not only better understandings of the disease over time but also more evolved practices for dealing with each other.

Elizabeth Thompson, (1999:158) writing in her case study, *Resiliency in Families With a Member Facing AIDS* discusses the active role that mothers play in coping, social support, caregiving, and the creation of personal meaning around an aids diagnosis in the family. She states:

Many of these mothers employ a complex collection of resilient coping and social support techniques, including flexibility.... and reframing the experience in a way that addresses the need to define the personal and often growth-producing significance of this experience.

Helen Mederer, (1999) discusses resilience in her study, *Surviving the Demise of a Way of Life: Stress and Resilience in Northeastern Commercial Fishing Families*. This study reported that the social support coming from outside the fishing community is essential to coping for most families. In the study, women especially, report relying on friends for

discussion of marriage and family problems. Mederer, also reports that structural family features associated with resilience need to be considered. For example, age and family career stage are relevant resources. Mederer suggests that the data gathered in her study pointed up the need to understand more about the process of replacing established patterns of family interaction with institutive patterns and the need to identify the skills necessary to enhance this resiliency process.

Finally, Golby and Bretherton, (1999) in their case study, *Resilience in Postdivorce Mother-Child Relationships*, highlighted narratives that were indicative of resilience.

Daly, (1999:7) in critiquing the current resilience literature, makes the following point:

Although developments in the literature have broadened the lens and made the study of resilience more complex, they continue to overlook, or pay little attention to, some other theoretical viewpoints that might advance our understanding of resilience. For example, issues of power and control, which in some ways define the parameters of adaptability, do not have a strong presence in the literature. Similarly, although there has been an effort to identify sex differences in resilient behaviours, there has been very little attention given to the sociopolitical ramifications of gender as either a constraining or privileging force in the adaptation to stressor events.

As highlighted in the introduction in Chapter One, the issues of power and control are considered integral to this study and will be addressed throughout the thesis.

It is to some of those issues of power and control as located in race, class and gender studies that I turn to next.

Race, Class and Gender: Their Links to Resilience or the Margins?

Introduction

To be in the margin is to be part of the whole world but outside the main body. (hooks, 1984:preface)

Marginalisation was defined by Hall, (1999) as the peripheralization of individuals and groups from a dominant, central majority. She continues by highlighting the properties of marginalisation and their associated risks and resiliencies, which she reviews as follows:

- Intermediacy: having boundaries that separate and protect, such as the skin, but also referring to risk of personal territorial invasion and the dangers inherent in living in contested or border environments.
- Differentiation: the strength of cultural and personal uniqueness and the risk of becoming a scapegoat and being stigmatised.
- Power: access to resources, individual and collective awareness and organisation, and risks associated with enforced conformity.
- Secrecy: access to, and control of information to protect one's self and group, and the risks resulting from the dominating group's use of insider knowledge to their advantage.
- Reflectiveness: survival skills gained from leading an examined life, the risks involved in the exhaustive processes of constant vigilance, and analysis of each new social encounter necessary for safety.
- Voice: expression of one's experiences as valid and different from the dominant myths, and the risks of being silenced.
- Liminality: having experiences not shared by others; severe trauma, stigmatisation, and illnesses can foster abilities to empathise with others, but carry risks of alienation, altered perceptions, and heavy psychic strain.

Gimenez, (2001:26) offers a description of the object of a Race, Gender, and Class study:

Essentially, it (a race, class and gender study) is the intersections of race, gender and class. Authors vary in the metaphors they use to describe the nature of these intersections: eg. triple oppression, interplay, interrelation, cumulative effects, interconnections; interactive, triadic relation, overlapping, interactive systems; multiple jeopardy, meaning not only several, simultaneous oppressions but also the multiplicative relations among them.

Collins, (1993, 1997, in Gimenez, 2001:26-27) identifies the main elements of a Race, Gender and Class study:

- 1 Race, gender and class are distinctive yet interlocking structures of oppression.
- 2 The notion of interlocking refers to the macro level connections linking systems of oppression such as race, class and gender.
- 3 The notion of intersectionality describes microlevel processes – namely, how each individual and group occupies a social position within interlocking structures of oppression described by the metaphor of intersectionality.
- 4 Everyone has a race/gender/class specific identity.
- 5 Every individual is, simultaneously, “being oppressed and oppressor”.
- 6 Oppressions should not be ranked nor should we struggle about which oppression is more fundamental: to theorise these connections it is necessary to support a working hypothesis of equivalency between oppressions.
- 7 How do race, class and gender function as parallel and interlocking systems that shape the basic relationship of domination and subordination?

McClintock, (1995:5) suggests that:

Race, gender and class are not distinct realms of experience, existing in splendid isolation from each other; nor can they be simply yoked together retrospectively like armatures of Lego. Rather, they come into existence in and through relation to each other – if in contradictory and conflictual ways.

Price, (2001) laments the absence of the working class from the research among the trinity of race, gender and class studies. He states that an exception is the scholarship of Lillian Rubin in her *Worlds of Pain* in which she draws a portrait of working class life and argues that economic realities provide a common foundation from which shared understandings arise. Sadly, there is little current research in the New Zealand setting relating to class and the adult learner.

Race and class need to be defined and the social construction of gender also deserves an explanation.

Pihama and Mara, (1994:215) state that:

Critical thought is based upon a belief that nothing is natural in the social world; rather facts and concepts are the outcome of social construction.

Race

At one level, race is a label placed on a person by their physical make-up such as hair colour or skin colour. On another level, race is also a way that people construct a category based on an individual's observable characteristics such as skin colour. For example, given one's skin colour, they would be labelled with the level of expectation that goes along with a person being a particular colour. Hart, Gordon and Habl, (1997) suggest that if any race-based stereotype is considered, it will have its origin in the creation and perpetuation of race.

Hart et al, highlight the notion of power in race definition where that definition could be thought of as a reduction of individuals to one category of people based on their physical make-up. It is suggested that once this classification occurs, people are de-personalised and are easily manipulated socially, economically and politically. I feel, that this definition of power as applied to the construct of race, can also be applied to the construct of gender and class.

Gender

Borgen and Katzmann, (1997:1) suggest that 'gender' is a word commonly and comfortably used by many to refer to the categories of male and female but that *even Webster's dictionary formally defines gender solely as it relates to the classification of nouns and pronouns in language*. The adjectives 'masculine' and 'feminine' are often associated with gender but most people would agree that all males are not masculine and all females not feminine!

Borgen and Katzmann, (1997:1), state that *masculinity and femininity are social constructions which can vary significantly across cultures...Gender is the location one gives oneself and others give you on a continuum between the extreme expressions of femininity and masculinity*.

The position that this thesis takes therefore, is that of gender is socially constructed and can be seen as a social overlay of beliefs, values and practices that are attached to the biology of sex. It is argued, therefore, that the construction of gender is not a natural event but is constructed by social actions. Pihama and Mara, (1994) suggest that the ways in which gender is constructed in society are linked to the power relations, which exist within that society. These power relations may then be seen to serve the interests of some groups over others.

Class

Tom Herman, (1997:1) in his brief article, *What is Class?* offers the two Webster definitions of class:

- a group of people considered as a unit according to occupational, economic, or social status; especially, the social rank or caste; as the working class, the middle class
- the division of society into ranks or castes

Entwistle, (1978) suggests that social class may be conceived as a single, specific dimension of social stratification or as a multidimensional category. The first of these notions of class is usually attributed to Max Weber, (Entwistle, 1978: 33) who identified

three areas of social stratification: economic class, status and power. In this analysis of social stratification, it is suggested that *to the notion of economic class are linked such terms as wealth, income, prices, capital and market*. Status, according to Entwistle, (1978) refers to the esteem which a person attracts and hence his/her access to social relationships in homogenous social groupings and power is the ability to control the behaviour of others ...it refers especially to the control that certain groups and individuals are able to exercise over the life chances of others. (Meyer and Buckley, 1969, in Entwistle, 1978: 34) The alternative conception sees social class as single multi-dimensional total life style configuration. Aron (1969) suggests that class is a synthetic product of multiple factors. According to Entwistle, (1978: 35):

class is defined by a richer complex of factors than power, income, wealth and property. Education, artistic taste, religion, speech, manners, dress, geographical location and size of residence, ownership of property and source of income all seem to mesh into that web of factors which define one's social class.

Mahony and Zmroczek, (1997, in Weiner, 1997:3) subscribe to the second proposition of Entwistle's, when they suggest that class is not just an economic position but is deeply rooted, retained and carried through life rather than left behind, as some individuals find themselves in a different social class from that into which they were born.

Hooks, (2000:15) in her reference, *Learning in the Shadow of Race and Class*, highlights the dilemma of people from working class backgrounds in higher education:

Slowly I began to understand fully that there was no place in academe for folks from working class backgrounds who do not wish to leave the past behind. That was the price of the ticket. Poor students would be welcome at the best institutions of higher learning only if they were willing to surrender memory, to forget the past and claim the assimilated present as the only worthwhile and meaningful reality.

Carolyn Leste Law, (1995:56) writing in her book *This Fine Place So Far From Home*, discusses the ‘implicit classism’ of the academy:

My ambition then was to become an English teacher. I admired my high school teachers; I liked their lives (what I could see of them). My mother, I know, was proud of me and glad that I was doing well in a world she had never known. What she could not have guessed, though, was that in the courses of my teacher training, I learned, through myriad covert (and some not so covert) pressures and practices, to feel increasingly ashamed of my home, of my family. Again and again, I heard that children who do not read, whose parents work too hard and who have little time or skills to read to them, whose homes are not literate but oral and pretty nonverbal as well, children who have never been taken to an art museum or who do not have library cards, these are the ones at risk... I never confessed that I recognised my own home in the patronizing, contemptuous examples of my well-intentioned professors, which every day increased my resolve to erase my past and elude the humiliation of being found an imposter.

A recent graduate at a University in the United Kingdom, Ruth Davenport, (2001:1) discusses her working class origins and her background:

(My local secondary school was) terrible, terrible at that time. (A secondary school on a working class estate in the north of England) ...I found the teaching at ...University inspirational. Teachers here do not look down on students including working class students, and approach students positively. I was like a bud, now I am blossoming. ...It is a real shame that education funding is being cut, particularly for students from backgrounds like mine.

As this thesis is located in New Zealand it is important that the New Zealand context of race, class and gender is explored. Within this section, the three constructs will be explored.

Social Class in Aotearoa/New Zealand

One of the major reasons European immigrants settled in New Zealand in the nineteenth century, was their perception that economic advancement would be easier than in Britain where a rigid class system prevailed. Bell and Carpenter, (1994) argue that the notion of a 'classless society' masks continuing social class divisions. In particular, they suggest, that the education system has always been involved in reproducing class inequalities. Entwistle, (1978) too, highlights that education is one of a mesh of factors that seem to define a person's social class. His comment about status is relevant in the New Zealand context and in particular, how power is seen to be the ability to control the behaviour of others.

There is evidence in New Zealand that social class positions are reproduced across generations. Researchers, Lauder, Hughes and Taberner, (1985), surveyed 2,500, 1982 school leavers in Christchurch. They found that most school leavers from upper-class families went on to upper-class destinations, and most school leavers from working-class families went to working-class destinations. This study is supported by a more recent Auckland University study, which suggests that:

Students from poor backgrounds, most often from Māori and Pacific Island families who make up the most oppressed sections of the working class, are falling out of the education system...Over the past three years, the number of students enrolling at Auckland University...from schools in the working class areas of South Auckland had declined by 43%. (World Socialist Web Site, 1999)

Wylie, (1988) writes about the unfairness of the New Zealand system in terms of educational outcomes. She suggests that Māori and Pacific Islands students are over represented percentage-wise in the lower socio-economic status (SES) groups and that approximately half of these low SES students are girls. She continues by highlighting that schools in low socio-economic areas are comparatively under-resourced; that low SES students often have limited access to preschool education and that low SES students 'drop out' of the system at an earlier age than other SES groups. (Wylie's 1988

perceptions are confirmed by all five female participants in this study; they all left secondary school shortly after their 15th birthday).

Thrupp's (1999) more recent study of the effects of SES upon student achievement confirmed Wylie's earlier study. He found that the opportunities available for middle class students was significantly higher than that of their lower SES peers.

Gender Relations and Māori Education in New Zealand

Linda Smith, (1992:33) writes about Māori Women and the socio-economic class in which most are located:

Māori women belong to the group of women in the world who have been historically constructed as 'Other' by white patriarchies and white feminisms. As women, we have been defined in terms of our differences to our colonisers. As both, we have been defined by our differences to Māori men, Pakeha men and Pakeha women. The socio-economic class in which most Māori women are located makes the category of 'Other' an even more complex problematic.

Smith makes a number of points, which are relevant to the study of resilience in a race, gender and class context:

- We cannot deny the validity and power of the experiences of women who have been socialised away from whānau contexts and who have been adopted into non-Māori families.
- The fundamental unit of identity, which can make sense of different realities, lies in whakapapa or genealogical links.
- The whānau or hapu discourse is frequently overlooked in terms of its importance to understanding what it means to be Māori and female. Women who have strong whānau links take it for granted as part of being Māori.
- Māori women's realities are spiritual as well as physical.

Pere, (1988:12) in her work, *Te Wheke*, talks about mokopuna who experience the traditional ways of Māori learning being encouraged to observe, interact and share the knowledge and skills of a whole range of people. She discusses the efforts made to keep a balance between individual endeavour, such that a person is encouraged to be a strong individual, and yet have the ability to work with, and alongside, other people. She states, *One learns to face any challenge or trauma at both personal and a group level*. Pere's use of the symbol of the octopus – 'Te Wheke' would appear to include a number of characteristics of resilience. Pere's explanation of the symbol is as follows:

- The body and the head represent the individual/family unit
- Each tentacle represents a dimension that requires and needs certain things to help give sustenance to the whole
- The suckers on each tentacle represent the many facets that exist within each dimension
- The eyes reflect the type of sustenance each tentacle has been able to find and gain for the whole
- The intertwining of the tentacles represents a merging of each dimension

Bishop and Glynn, (2000) discuss Kaupapa Māori theory in educational settings, which offers an alternative approach to interpersonal and group relationships and interactions. They cite Smith, (1992, 1997) who identifies a series of fundamental principles:

- Tino Rangatiratanga – relative autonomy or self determination
- Taonga tuku – cultural aspirations
- Ako – reciprocal learning
- Participation in Kura Kaupapa Māori
- The use and establishment of whānau type relationships
- Kaupapa – the collective philosophy of achieving excellence in both of the languages and cultures

Both Pere's and Smith's concepts have elements that seem to 'fit' closely with Milstein and Henry's (2000) six resiliency factors, (see below) of prosocial bonding, the setting

of clear and consistent boundaries, the teaching of life skills, the provision of caring and support, having high expectations and encouraging meaningful participation.

Hohepa, (1997:32) writes about Māori resiliency in her reference, *Te Kohanga Reo: Risk Breaking, Risk Taking*. Of particular relevance to this study is her final comment:

Perhaps what Te Kohanga Reo can teach us is that as well as minimising risks our children might face, as well as trying to help our children develop resilience, we need to provide them with the tools to recognise risks worth taking. We need to encourage them to celebrate in the resilience of their tipuna.

Summary

Henderson and Milstein, (1996) synthesised the implications of resilience research for school practice and described six components of a model for fostering resilience in schools, with adults, and in communities. Milstein and Henry, (2000) argue that these six factors below are the crucial building blocks of resiliency. I argue that the construct of race, class and gender can, and should, be woven into these factors. I highlight the six components and suggest links to the constructs of race, class and gender.

- One component is to increase social bonding. This component is based on the evidence that children and adults with strong connection to others are far less likely to be involved in potentially unsafe and unhealthy behaviours than children or adults without these bounds. The impact of whānau, or extended family, appears to 'fit' this concept but requires a greater focus on protocols and specifically, culturally appropriate ways of developing this social bonding. Classism is still present in New Zealand. (Thrupp, 1999) To enable strong connections to others I argue that the use of power in schools and tertiary institutions needs to be focussed upon.
- The second component is to set clear and consistent boundaries. This component involves the development and consistent implementation of school policies and procedures and speaks to the importance of clarifying behavioural expectations. Policies and procedures need to be developed in a culturally

appropriate manner and, I believe mentoring assistance needs to be provided to allow for the different experience bases for learners from all parts of society.

- The third component is to teach life skills; including cooperation, conflict resolution, resistance and assertiveness skills, communication skills, problem-solving and decision-making skills, and healthy stress management. Again, the use of 'power with' rather than 'power over' needs to be acknowledged first of all, and programmes developed that acknowledge the appropriate use of power. An example in New Zealand is the DARE (Drug Awareness and Resistance Education) Programme which is sponsored and run by the New Zealand Police in conjunction with local community. Many would argue that such a programme is heavily weighted toward a white, middle-class philosophy of 'just say no' (to drugs) rather than a programme which is participant based.
- The fourth component is to provide care and support. Henderson and Milstein (1996) described this component as the most important factor in promoting resilience. It includes providing students with unconditional positive regard and encouragement. Within traditional Māori life this component is a 'given'. The encouragement of the development of Kohanga Reo in New Zealand would appear to be crucial for the development of resilience of Māori. Once again, the acknowledgement of the role of the teacher and whānau should be seen as pivotal to this component. Again the use of power needs to more carefully explored and the means given back to teachers to allow them to express their concern for their pupils.
- The fifth component is to set and communicate high expectations. These expectations should be high and realistic enough in order to provide effective motivation. High expectations need to be clarified. I argue that expectations should be just as high for different cultural events such as Kapa Haka and different socio- economic activities; both for leisure and financial gain.
- The sixth component is to provide opportunities for meaningful participation. This strategy means giving students, family and staff, responsibility for problem solving, decision-making, planning, goal setting and helping others. Providing a service to, and for others, appears to help encourage resiliency. This kind of participation is valued in traditional Māori life but perhaps not valued as highly in today's market driven economy. I am not suggesting that

we 'turn the clock back' but rather embrace equally the value of service to others. This philosophy could be highlighted across employment where once again manual labour is valued equally and its contribution to all in society, acknowledged.

O'Leary and Ickovics, (1995, in Blankership, 1998:3) talk about thriving and resilience in terms of the effective mobilization of resources:

This (mobilization) poses a dilemma from a race, class and gender perspective. On the one hand, the emphasis on mobilization of resources suggests that, by definition, those who can mobilize resources are most likely to thrive. (be resilient) From a race, class and gender perspective, however, it can be argued that individual and social resources are not easily disentangled, nor are such resources randomly distributed. As a result, by definition, certain social groups, because they lack access to social resources due to race, class, or gender, may have a more difficult time or be precluded from thriving. On the other hand, for precisely this same reason – their position in the social hierarchy and correspondent lack of access to resources – these groups are more likely to face the kinds of risk that can precipitate thriving/resilience.

This final statement, then, reflects the study question – “How do race, class and gender impact upon the individual's resilience .

CHAPTER THREE - UNDERPINNINGS OF THE RESEARCH

Introduction

This chapter will provide overviews of the methods used in the study. They include qualitative research, autobiography as data and case study as data.

Conceptual Framework

I highlight the conceptual framework in two parts:

- The impact of the literature review and in particular the significance of Milstein and Henry's (2000) model and,
- The research methodology.

The Impact of the Literature Review and the Milstein and Henry, Model:

As highlighted in the literature review, Milstein and Henry, (2000) present a model for fostering resilience in which they highlight six components they claim are crucial to resiliency building. It seems to me that these six factors also 'fit' in the context of a race, class and gender context but require the stories of the participants and associated literature to lift the model into a more critical perspective. The six component parts of the model that this thesis takes some of its strength from are:

- 1 The need to increase social bonding
- 2 The need to set clear and consistent boundaries
- 3 The need to teach life skills
- 4 The need to provide care and support
- 5 The need to set and communicate high expectations
- 6 The need to provide for meaningful participation

The Research Methodology

After analysing the findings from the literature as detailed previously, I conducted a qualitative case study including data gathered from autobiography and interviews using a social constructivist approach and grounded theory. This process allowed me to relate my ongoing experiences with adult learners with a field of research which is of great interest to me. The design of the research allowed me to be involved with participants so that I was able to have a ...*deeper understanding of experience from the perspectives of the participants.* (Maykut and Morehouse, 1994:44)

Qualitative Research: The Issues for this Study

“Generally, qualitative research can be characterised as the attempt to obtain an in-depth understanding of the situation presented by informants, rather than the production of a quantitative measurement of their characteristics or behaviour.”

(Wainwright, 1997:1)

This study relies on qualitative evidence and not quantitative evidence. However, it should be noted that some case studies could include, and even be limited to, quantitative evidence. (Yin, 1994)

It is noted that the case study strategy should not be confused with qualitative research as case studies can be based on any mix of quantitative and qualitative evidence. (Schwartz and Jacobs, 1979; Strauss and Corbin, 1990; Van Maanen, 1988; Van Maanen, Dabbs and Faulkner, 1982, in Yin 1994)

Qualitative research, which is well suited to understanding processes and strategies from a social constructionist perspective, has been underused in the study of resilience. (Daly, 1999) Beardslee's (1989, in Daly, 1999) work is one of few exceptions. He used an open-ended, life history data gathering method, and examined the role of self-understanding in resilience.

Case Studies as Data: The Issues

Case study research excels at bringing us to an understanding of a complex issue or object and can extend experience or add strength to what is already known through previous research. Case studies emphasize detailed contextual analysis of a limited number of events or conditions and their relationships. (Lis 391D.1, 1997) (no author's name was listed on this internet reference and will be referred to in this study from now on as LIS 391D.1, 1997)

The history of case study research is marked by periods of disuse. (Tellis, 1997) The earliest use of this form of research can be traced to Europe, predominately to France. From the early 1900s until 1935, The Chicago School was pre-eminent in the field and a great source of the literature.

A frequent criticism of case study is that its dependence on a single case makes it incapable of providing a generalizing conclusion. (Tellis, 1997) Hamel, Dufor and Fortin (1993) and Yin, (1984, 1989a, 1989b, 1993, 1994) argue that the relative size of the sample does not transform a multiple case into a macroscopic study. The above writers suggest that the goal of the study should be to establish the parameters, and then a particular framework be applied to all research. It is considered that in this way, even a single case could be considered acceptable, provided it met the established objective. The literature contains numerous examples of applications of the case study methodology. The earliest and most natural examples are found in the fields of law and medicine, where cases make up the large body of student work. Some areas that have used case study techniques extensively include government and evaluative situations.

Yin, (1994:14) states that *as a research strategy, the case study is used in many situations, including: the dissertations of theses in the social sciences....*

This case study research is a multiple-case study (Yin, 1994) and consists of six case studies of teacher trainees in a bilingual teaching programme. The six subjects are representative of race, class and gender in the New Zealand setting.

I felt that case study research was the ideal methodology when a holistic in-depth investigation was needed as in this case. (Feagin, Orum and Sjoberg, 1991, in Tellis, 1997)

Robert E. Stake, (1995), Helen Simmons, (1980) and Robert K. Yin, (1994) have all written extensively about case study research and they suggest techniques for organising and conducting the research successfully. The following section draws upon their work, which proposes six steps that should be used. These modified steps, which provide a framework for the description of this study, are:

- Introduction and Design of the Study
- Data Collection
- Analysing the Case Study Evidence
- Evaluating and Reporting the Evidence

Case study is but one way of doing social science research, (Yin, 1994), and in this study the methodology includes the use of autobiography as data as well. The internet-accessed reference (LIS 391D.1, 1997) states the research object in a case study is often a programme, an entity, a person, or a group of people. Each object is likely to be intricately connected to political, social, historical, and personal issues, providing wide-ranging possibilities for questions and adding complexity to the case study.

The research question that this thesis addresses is “How does race, class and gender impact upon an individual’s resilience?” Yin, (1994) suggests that “how” and “why” questions are explanatory and likely to lead to the use of case studies, histories, and experiments as the preferred research strategies. LIS 391D.1, (1997:2) confirms this view – *Case study research generally answers one or more questions which begin with “how” or “why”*.

In this research study, the case study method is chosen because it was felt important that contextual conditions were covered, as they were considered to be highly significant to this study. Yin, (1994:13) states that:

an experiment, for example, deliberately divorces a phenomenon from its context, so that attention can only be focussed on a few variables...A history does deal with the entangled situation between phenomenon and context but usually with noncontemporary events.... surveys can try to deal with phenomenon and context, but their ability to investigate the context is extremely limited.

Yin, (1994) suggests that phenomenon and context are not always distinguishable in real-life situations and that technical characteristics of the case study inquiry need to become part of a technical definition. According to Yin, (1994:13) the case study inquiry:

- *cope with the technically distinctive situation in which there will be many more variables of interest than data points*
- *rely on multiple sources of evidence, with data needing to converge in a triangulating fashion*
- *benefit from the prior development of theoretical propositions to guide data collection and analysis.*

This study of resilience appears to ‘fit’ the technical definition of a case study. Within the study, a number of variables of interest were pursued, eg. participant’s own stories; multiple sources of evidence were relied upon eg. in-depth interviews, documentation; and the social constructionist/critical theory conceptual framework helped to guide data collection and analysis.

The design required that I begin the study with important ideas and questions (see Appendix 3: Interview Guide for Participants) that I wished to pursue, but which also allowed me to pursue other issues.

The case study is descriptive and narrative. My voice as researcher is obvious as I include my story and analysed my experiences. I asked ‘how’ and ‘why’ questions often and according to Yin, these questions are *likely to favour the use of case studies*. (1994:19) Therefore, the experiences of the six participants in this case study will help institutions to deal with, and hopefully learn from, the ‘how’ and ‘why’ questions asked.

Because a research design is supposed to represent a logical set of statements, the quality of any given design should be able to be tested according to logical tests. (Yin 1994) Four tests have been commonly used to test the quality of empirical research and as such, are relevant to this case study research.

The tests are as follows:

- Construct validity; where correct operational measures for the concepts being studied are established
- Internal validity; where a casual relationship is established, whereby certain conditions are shown to lead to other conditions
- External validity; to establish the domain to which a study's findings can be generalised
- Reliability; to demonstrate that the operations of a study such as the data collection procedures can be repeated with the same results

In this study construct validity will be increased by the use of multiple sources of evidence. (See data collection section) As this study is an explorative one, it is considered that the demonstration of internal validity is not appropriate. The external validity problem has been a major problem in doing case studies. (Yin, 1994) Case studies rely on analytical generalisation and in this particular study the set of results discovered about adult resiliency should be tested through replications of the study in different settings. In this study reliability will be managed by operationalising as many of the steps of the study as possible.

Data Collection

Stake, (1995) and Yin, (1994) identified at least six sources of evidence in case studies. The following is not an ordered list, but reflects the research of both Yin, (1994) and Stake, (1995):

- Documents
- Archival records

- Interviews
- Direct observation
- Participant observation
- Physical artefacts

Documents could be letters, memoranda, agendas, administrative documents, newspaper articles, or any document that is germane to the investigation. In the interests of triangulation of evidence, the documents serve to corroborate the evidence from other sources. (Tellis, 1997) In this study, the six case study participants will be asked to supply relevant documentation to help corroborate evidence from focussed and open-ended interviews.

Archival documents can be service records, organisational records, lists of names, survey data and other such records. (Tellis, 1997) In this study, permission was asked of the case study participants to provide documentary evidence, which could support data gathered from the in-depth interviews. This information will constitute the second information source.

Interviews are one of the most important sources of case study information. (Tellis, 1997) This case study will make use of two of several forms of interviews: Open ended and focused. The first interview phase will involve focused interviews with the participants. The objective of this phase was to become sensitised to the salient issues and to generate substantive themes and categories that could be more systematically analysed in the second phase. In the second interview, a structured but open-ended, interview schedule was established on the basis of the categories identified in phase one. (See *TRACING THE METHODOLOGY*, page 52)

The data procedures within this case study were emergent in design. Examples of emergent theory methods include inductive analysis, grounded theory or case study. (Cuadraz and Uttal, 1999)

In carrying out this study, I used a grounded theory approach, allied to the case studies, which meant there was no effort to test a particular theory but rather to allow the theory

to emerge from the data. Grounded theory implies that theory is built up from data and needs to fit the situation being researched. Lincoln and Guba, (1985: 209) describe the process thus:

As the inquiry proceeds, it becomes more and more focused; salient elements begin to emerge, insights grow, and theory begins to be grounded in the data obtained.

Autobiography as Data: Implications For This Study

“Autobiography in education is no phenomenon, although most work has been done in the USA.” (Grument, 1980, 1990; Pinar, 1980, 1981; Butt, Raymond and Yamagushi, 1988; Krall, 1988, all in Clements, 2001:1) Abbs, (1974) argued that (teacher trainees) should be encouraged to investigate their memories and values which one would inevitably bring into one’s teaching. Krall, (1988, in Clements, 2001:1) encouraged graduate students to undertake autobiography in order to *reconstruct their past experiences into a more unified and comprehensible perspective and thus a more harmonious and integrated view of the present*. I am mindful of the potential problems that can arise in autobiographical research, particularly the problem of memory. Clements, (2001), summarises the particular problems as follows; (a) memory fades with time; (b) false information given after the event can distort memory; (c) we have self-schematas which can affect our autobiographical memory processes by causing us to remember an event in such a way that it is consistent with our new present self-image; (d) according to Searlemann and Herrmann, (1994), memories are not fixed but are variable depending on time and circumstance, in the interpretative stages. Put simply, we remember things differently from how they actually occurred, usually in the best light to ourselves.

For me, the challenge in writing my story was to ensure that I represented all the issues fairly, and through the acknowledgement of the role of race, class and gender begin to better understand their relationship with resilience.

The Interviews and the Documentary Evidence

Each case study participant was interviewed twice. I was guided by the work of Cuadraz and Uttal, (1999) during the development of the dual interview structure. Cuadraz and Uttal, (1999:179) states:

For the in-depth interviewer attempting to account for the interlocking systems of (oppression and) intersectionality of race, class and gender, we make two recommendations: First, the researcher needs to contextualize the social construction of meaning. Second, the researcher needs to examine the relationships between structure (eg race, class and gender) and biography (eg individual accounts) separately, together and simultaneously.

Embedded in the findings of the resilience literature, are a number of theoretical assumptions about whose factors play a critical role in explaining resilient behaviour. (Daly, 1999:6) Daly states:

The attempt to understand resilience has also moved from trying to identify attributes that characterize the resilient individual to understanding family responses, systemic dynamics and contextual processes. There has also been a shift from seeing resilience as a static and predictable response to an individual stressor, to conceptualising it as a dynamic developmental process that involves changing conditions and adaptations.

Consequently, my interview structure, enabled me to hear the case study participants' stories, followed by their concepts of how race, class and gender stratification shaped their contemporary social location. I asked the participants open-ended questions such as the following:

- Tell me about yourself – your early life – your early life history.
- Tell me what you understand resilience to be.
- What made you decide to train to be a teacher?
- What sorts of issues have you had to overcome to get to where you are now?

- What are your strengths? How have your strengths helped you to overcome any issues and problems for you?
- How do you go about meeting challenges and resolving issues now?
- Tell me about the effects of your socio-economic and class position?
- What risks and strengths have there been for you being female/Māori/working class and training to be a teacher?
- Tell me about any links for you between working class, Māori and gender. What risks and strengths have you developed as a result of the intersection of these three constructs?

The average time for each of the 12 interviews was 50 minutes. The tapes were transcribed verbatim, followed by editing to remove *ums*, and in some cases, to clarify the participants' meaning. All transcripts were sent to the participants for checking and any requested changes made.

Social Constructivism and Grounded Theory

Social constructivism builds on the epistemological concepts of radical constructivism by integrating wider reaching social aspects into the theory. Individual subjects and the realm of the social are regarded as interconnected and thus are both equally involved in the process of knowledge construction. (Ernest, 1995, in Arlidge, 2000:37)

Daly, (1999) talks about the move toward understanding complex human behaviours from a social constructionist perspective, with an emphasis on capturing the complex stories and definitions of experience from the viewpoints of the social actors. Here the emphasis is not so much on outcomes and factors but on the myriad of meanings that are part of the experience. The focus on an individual's feelings, experiences, and perceptions of an event is consistent with a social constructionist theoretical perspective. (Thompson, 1999)

Daly, (1999) also suggests that resilience literature has paid little attention to many theoretical viewpoints that could advance the understanding of resilience. Examples of deficiencies in the literature that Daly cites include issues of power and control and the

sociopolitical ramifications of gender as either a constraining or privileging force in the adaptation to stressor events.

A social constructionist perspective (Guba and Lincoln, 1994, in Thompson, 1999:140) assumes that:

Realities are apprehendable in the form of multiple, intangible mental constructions, socially and experientially based, local and specific in nature...constructions are not more or less true in any absolute sense, but simply are more or less informed and/or sophisticated...

Masten, Best and Garmezy, (1990) suggest a shift in research from the 'what' questions of description to the 'how' questions of underlying processes that influence adaptation. Case study research would appear to be ideally suited to conduct the form of inquiry as suggested by Masten et al, and I have described earlier in this chapter, in some detail, the rationale for the use of the case study method.

The conceptual framework for this study, therefore, will use a social constructionist/critical theory perspective where the sociopolitical ramifications of race, class and gender will be explored and the case study subjects will be encouraged to tell their stories and define their experiences.

Critical theory, with its central concern being the transformation of unequal social relations, suggests that dominant groups with power appear to have greater access to social, political and economic power than subordinate groups without power. These groups are usually based on race, class or gender. Coxon, Jenkins, Marshall and Massey (1994) suggest that critical theory recognises no division between theory and practice and poses the question: how to apply critical theoretical concepts to the practice of critical thought? They continue by stating that:

Critical thinking involves questioning our most basic assumptions; our taken-for-granted beliefs about the world. (p14)

This study does question the basic assumptions about resilience and in particular the links and impact upon, race, class and gender.

Critical theory, along with the social constructionist perspective therefore, will be used to help inform this study.

Analysing the Evidence

I began the analysis generated by the data gathered in this case study, by using the comparative method. (Glaser and Strauss, 1967) This process included coding data by category, comparing meanings across categories, refining categories, exploring relationships and patterns across categories. Pieces of data would often intersect to make meaningful connections and build categories or themes of relevant information. This process of data analysis developed by Maykut and Morehouse, (1994) started as the major framework for analysing the findings.

Nigel Fielding (1993, in Wainwright, 1997:10) has summarised a common approach to data analysis in the following model, which I found useful, and it guided my work:

Interviews Transcripts/ Documentation/ Archival Information

^

Search for patterns and categories (themes)

^

Mark up or cut up the data

^

Construct the outline

Early in the analysis process I found that I was struggling with the coding of data. My initial findings were that I had many categories with a few pieces of data. I soon began to realise that I needed to make more sense of the data. As I searched for an answer to my concern, I returned to the literature for assistance! I found that Cicchetti and Garnezy's work (1993, in Gilgun, 1999:45) where they urge researchers to include *specifics on the operationalization of resilience...in all research reports*. In more specific terms, I used Gilgun's (1999:45) definition:

General ideas of what constitutes a good outcome, such as loving well, and expecting well, provide guidelines for defining the outcomes of interest in particular studies. Expecting well generally means that individuals are optimistic about the future, their opportunities, and their interpersonal relationships.

Every attempt was made to present the data as ‘the star’. (Chenail, 1995:2) I attempted to let the gathered data tell the case study participants’ story and my story.

Chenail, (1995) suggests a variety of strategies that can be used to arrange and present data. I have chosen to use a ‘narrative logic’, which allowed me to move from one exemplar to another, in order to best present the case study data.

Tracing the Methodology

To help inform my study I drew heavily upon Cuadraz and Uttal’s (1999:156) work: *Intersectionality and In-Depth Interviews: Methodological Strategies for Analyzing Race, Class and Gender*. Some of the dilemmas that the two writers experienced, I felt the same about. They ask the following questions in the preamble to their essay:

First, what claims can be made about race, class and gender if the sample does not include comparative subsamples? Second, to what extent can researchers overlay the social categories of race, class and gender on the individual accounts articulated by interviewees? Finally, how does one explicate the intersections between structures and biography, while honouring the simultaneous intersectionality of multiple structures of race, class and gender?

Indepth interviews provided crucial data for this study and I was most aware that I needed to understand both the individual stories that I was hearing and the social location of those stories as separate entities – at least in the beginning. Once again I went to Cuadraz and Uttal’s work, (1999:179):

The researcher needs to account for situational location and social location. First, the researcher needs to listen to how the individual understands their experience and explains their situational location, that is, the contemporary moment about which the account reports. Second, the researcher needs to locate these accounts in relation to the individual's social location, that is, how histories of race, class and gender stratification have shaped contemporary social location for the social group this individual represents.

The implications for the structuring of the interview schedules were enormous. (See appendix 3). I decided that I needed to divide my work with the case study participants into three parts:

- Part One: gather data about each individual
- Part Two: gather data about the social groups to which each participant 'belonged'
- Part Three: 'collect up' emergent themes that had developed through the first two interviews and present these themes 'back' to the six case study participants in the form of a reference group activity

The Subjects and Setting

The first interactions that I had with members of the studied bilingual class were during my introductory talk to the class of approximately 20 adults. (I had previously sought and received permission from Massey University Human Ethics Committee, (MUHEC, 2000) to conduct the research; sought and received permission from the institution where the case study participants were enrolled, and discussed my proposals with the Senior Lecturers who managed the Bilingual Programme.)

I outlined the objectives of the proposed study with the class, responded to questions and invited any interested class members to discuss the study in greater depth with me. I told the class of the criteria for selection which was self-selection and that they had the right to withdraw from the research at any time.

Eight participants decided to make themselves available for the study. I decided to accept the offer from all eight people. Originally I had decided upon a maximum of four

participants but upon reflection I felt the greater number would allow me to explore issues more widely and would also provide 'cover' if some participants felt that they couldn't continue for some reason. From this original number of eight, six 'sets' of in-depth interviews and documentation gathering were conducted. One participant from the original eight decided to withdraw and one participant was unable to come to the interviews and consequently withdrew from the process.

All of the final six case study participants fulfilled my initial intention of 'gathering' together people who had, or were succeeding in their world and on their terms. All of the six, were mature 'adult learners', had returned to study after a number of years away and were at least half way through the three-year course. I was mindful of what Masten, (2001:232) had to say about single case studies of resilience (see previous statement highlighting the strengths and weaknesses of case study research):

Single case studies of resilience which are person focussed and can be compelling for heuristic reasons, have numerous shortcomings, particularly in terms of generalizability. Most person- focused approaches seek to identify groups of individuals with patterns of good versus poor adaptive functioning in a life context of high versus low risk or threat, in order to examine what might account for the differences in outcome.

In this case, I identified a group of individuals with good adaptive functioning in a life context of high risk and threat and then asked how race, class and gender impacted upon that resiliency.

I interviewed each participant twice. On both occasions we met in a comfortable room on their campus. At the conclusion of the second interview, one case study participant stated that *she had enjoyed the interview process*. She said that she valued the research process, that she had learned about interviewing skills but above all, she felt that she had been listened to. It seemed that being able to tell her story in an unhurried way helped her to reaffirm the strengths that she knew she had.

At the conclusion of the study I visited all participants at their campus and gave them feedback about the study. A number of participants expressed their interest in this work

and their desire to receive further feedback. A number of participants expressed their interest in the notion of resilience and how that could help their future pupils. Perhaps the most important feedback came from case study participant Raymond:

I hope that you will use what you have found to help my people.

CHAPTER FOUR - THE RESEARCHER'S STORY

"I made some friends for life, the way I usually make them. Any jackass can be pleasant company, but if people help you when you're at your worst, that's a friend. I hurt one of my bad knees, badly, while I was there, and for almost two months I couldn't walk. Two Niemans, a Texan named Olive Talley and a New Yorker named Heidi Evans, hauled me back and forth to the doctor and demanded information about my condition that, as a boy from Alabama, I would never have asked... They, especially, taught me that you can't go through life not liking people because they didn't have to walk as hard or come as far as you did. And who knows, maybe if I had bothered to get to know them better, maybe they had." (Bragg, 1997:227)

Rick Bragg's story of himself – a child of poor white American Southerners, and of his family – an alcoholic, mostly absent father, and an extraordinarily, quietly heroic mother, highlights people who live on the margins and do more than survive; they are resilient.

I am not suggesting that my story replicates Rick Bragg's, but there are a number of elements of his story that make sense to me.

Freire, (1996:13) in his *Letters to Christina*, discusses his need to return to his 'distant childhood' and the realisation that there is always something in that childhood worth knowing. He also states, importantly, that:

I do not return to my early years as someone who is sentimentally moved by a ridiculous nostalgia or as someone who presents his not so easy childhood and adolescence as a form of revolutionary credentials.

I intend to 'tell my story' in this chapter, using examples from the literature that resonate with me. I will continue my story, where relevant, throughout this study. I feel that it is crucial to begin my story from my beginning and trace the childhood links to

(hopefully) the process of resilience in adult life. My story links to two constructs under study – gender and class. I am a Pakeha (white) New Zealander in my mid fifties.

George Vaillant, writes a chapter in his book, *The Wisdom of the Ego*, (1995) called Disadvantage, Resilience and Mature Defences, where he introduces a 25-item Childhood Environment Weakness Scale. This scale attempts to predict serious delinquency. A multiproblem family meant growing up with 9 or more of the 25 objective signs of dysfunctional family structure.

Of the 25 items listed I consider the following applied to me during my childhood:

- loss of parent before age 6
- lack of maternal supervision
- lack of maternal affection
- boy indifferent to mother

I have very little recollection of my time before age five. I understand that my family – mother, father and me, lived in a number of small towns in a provincial area of New Zealand. My father, like so many of his generation at the time, worked for the New Zealand Railways. I have a photograph of him at his retirement function taken in 1952. He died soon after that. He was in his mid to late fifties. At the time of his death I was five years old and living in Dunedin, a city of about (at that time) 130,000 people, and located in the south of New Zealand.

Shortly after my father's death, my mother and I moved to a small Southland town to live with my grandmother, my aunt and her husband. My aunt's husband, a World War One veteran, was severely disabled as a result of being gassed during a battle in France. It seems to me now, that the females of the house were slightly bewildered by a small boy, and at a loss as to how to treat and manage one. My grandmother, my aunt and my mother, and perhaps in that order, dominated my childhood.

Our living circumstances meant that money, although not plentiful, was at least adequate. As a small boy I remember receiving gifts of ten pounds from my

grandmother; a windfall in the 1950s! Nevertheless, the family was firmly working class. I remember my mother talking to me when I was only ten or eleven; she suggested that I look seriously at a 'career' as a clerk in the Stock and Station trade, or maybe even the freezing works as both jobs were 'secure' and would provide lifelong stability. This was, I believe, my mother's working class roots manifesting themselves. She knew nothing else. As Rita Mae Brown (1974:14) says

"Class is much more than Marx's definition of relationship to the means of production. Class involves your behaviour, your basic assumptions about life.

We literally lived on the other side of the tracks in Redmond Street. This street got its name from the working class town outside Manchester, England, from where the founders of this town arrived during the late 1850s. Street names in this southern part of the town included: Bury, Gorton, Salford, Hyde and Ardwick.

My story, then, in part reflects the impact of social class and gender on my upbringing; both inherited and inflicted. I think that it is not so much the experiences that I had that were important but rather the sense that I managed to make of those experiences.

I doubt that young children are aware of the influence of their socio-economic and class status – the environment that they are nurtured in is their world and what exists outside that, is of little moment.

I recall an early childhood spent quite close to home. There were few holidays and certainly not the typical New Zealand holiday at the seaside with family and tent and barbecue. I was left to my own devices, which quite suited me at the time and in fact, still does! Maybe the old adage of 'what doesn't kill you makes you stronger' applies in this case but I would add a caveat here that to 'survive' a childhood maybe isn't enough – joy and laughter, then and later in life, I feel is an equal part of the construct of resilience.

I have spent time reflecting on the impact of being 'brought up' in a matriarchal family. This situation seems to be much more the norm now, than in the 1950s and 1960s where

being from a solo parent home was relatively rare. I hasten to add that the extra number of adults 'available' to me also changes the more usual situation faced by children from some of today's solo parent homes. It would be tempting to suggest that having a number of females around to support me would enhance the quality of the early life experience. I felt that this wasn't the case. My grandmother was an excellent support who provided money, card playing tuition, (my great grandmother owned the hotel at Skippers – a famous Central Otago goldmining area – and her card playing skills were exemplary I believe!) and an ability to give a small boy time and a sympathetic and empathetic ear. My mother and my aunt portrayed a different image to me. My mother was a much less joyful person. She, like my grandmother, lost her husband at a relatively young age. She was in her mid-forties when my father died after less than ten years of marriage. If my mother was asked to define resilience I think that it would have been to *carry on* come what may. Maybe she didn't grieve for my father; maybe her desperate desire to continue with life with a small boy in tow was enough. Maybe there was not time to recover and find enjoyment again. Maybe survival was enough. I recall my aunt presenting a similar persona – I remember a strict, almost Victorian presence. In fact, I remember up until recently that both my mother and aunt, neither of whom had been to England, calling England 'home'.

Andrew Riemer, writing in his travel book *The Habsburg Café*, (1993:55) says something similar but in an Australian context:

We assumed that these people who spoke longingly of England and filled their houses with its nostalgic emblems – Toby jugs, plates decorated with views of Westminster Abbey, Canterbury Cathedral or Windsor Castle – were exiles aching for a lost world.... Yet these people were mostly, with very few exceptions, second, third or even fourth generation Australians. The 'home' they spoke of and dreamt about was a mental construct, even a lovingly cherished fantasy.

Despite having considerable time to devote to activities free from adults, I felt that I was never really accepted by the neighbourhood peer group. Although I participated in their games I know now, that I was always on the periphery of the group. Maybe my 'playmates' instinctively knew that I lacked the strong, pragmatic father they

presumably had. The indifference of the peer group toward me manifested itself in many ways – a sniggering about my slightly old fashioned clothes for example. This outsider role that I found myself cast into, meant that I began to rely more and more on my own resources.

A number of critical incidents stand out during my time at primary and secondary school. With the benefit of hindsight, maybe, these incidents could form what Mezirow, (1990:89) calls a “transformational experience”. Not necessarily for the best either! These critical incidents will be briefly analysed from a critical theory perspective.

Some Critical Incidents in Childhood

- Gathering necessary school data in the 1950's in New Zealand was not subtle. At the beginning of each year in the school where I was enrolled, the classroom teacher asked each child his/her address, place in the family and father's occupation. I remember sitting at my seat dreading my turn to respond as the answers had to be called out aloud. I lied actually – I said that my father worked for the railways as he had once done. Was I expected to say that my father was deceased? In front of the class, and said out loud? I know now that political correctness is about protecting dignity and the emotional rights of the individual but it is more than that too. It is about diluting the use and abuse of institutional power – intentioned or not. Spare us from commentators who say that ‘political correctness has gone too far’.
- The attitude of teachers in the secondary school I attended was of interest to me. It still is. I remember one teacher with affection. The teacher of English. He was encouraging and friendly – he didn't even call me by my last name! He stood out from the rest of the teachers who seemed to me to have a selective liking for pupils. Ever since that time I have been aware of the power of individual teachers to affect positive change within their pupils, and conversely, to affect negative responses to learning.
- I have mentioned my grandmother before. I do recall one particular incident where the value of withholding judgements and unconditional support was demonstrated. When I was at primary school and at early secondary school I delivered papers and I smoked cigarettes. For some reason, one day toward the

end of my paper round I put a lit cigarette in my pocket. The pocket caught fire and I was left with a significant hole in my trouser pocket. My grandmother agreed to repair my trousers and never said a word to my mother. My grandmother never asked me what caused the damage!

For some reason, my behaviour changed markedly in my adolescence. From being a relatively shy and retiring boy, my teenage years were marked by 'attention grabbing' behaviour. My years at secondary school were characterised by poor academic achievement and punishment. I was caned frequently. (Hit on the bottom by a thin bamboo rod!) Oddly enough, although my secondary schooling was far from successful, I still quite liked school. The high school that I attended in the 1960s had about 800 pupils on its roll. To say that I had a disappointing secondary school career was understating my five years! I passed very little in the way of formal assessments but enjoyed playing cricket, which consumed me really! To this day I have an intense love of the game despite cricket's history of class conflict. Until recently English amateur players entered and left the playing arena by a different gate than that of their professional counterparts!

A well-intentioned friend of the family gave me my first "grown up cricket" book when I was 10 – the book was called *Close of Play* written by Neville Cardus, (1956). Cardus, arguably the greatest cricket writer of all time and a respected music critic (music lovers would alter my order of phrasing) had a wonderful way of expressing himself:

Did grace fall the more blissfully upon me when I heard the "Echo" nocturne on a summer's night at Salzburg while the candles on the music stands burned steadily, and the stars above were like the pulsation of the notes of Mozart's music? Or when I watched Spooner rippling the sunlit grass with strokes that were without solidity or earthly momentum, and he leaned gracefully forward and flicked his wrists and the whole of the June day and the setting of sky and white tents and the trees of Canterbury were as though the created element of this lovely player's every motion and breath of being?.... or when I heard Seth Lomas conducting at a rehearsal the choir in a Lancashire town where the cobbled streets resound at the crack of dawn from the impact of hurrying clogs?...then Seth spoke and

said, "And all you open thi mouths. Foller mi beat. And never mind what tha was listening to at t 'Alle Concert last week. It's me that's conducting thi now." (Cardus, 1950)

From that day on, after reading Cardus, I have never been remotely interested in 'how do' or 'tour' sporting books, but the use of beautiful phrases wrapped up in cricket words has forever captivated me. Crucial to this part of my story is Cardus' continual reference to working class (see the last 4 lines in the previous extract) and how language and passion for something has the potential, for a time, to allow a person to transcend class barriers and encourage the individual to:

...survive the period between the past and the future in some substitute tense. (Stanislaw Lec, cited in Tripp, 1970)

My first year at secondary school was 1960 – just 14 years after the Second World War had ended and small rural town New Zealand was riding a wave of prosperity through the sheep and wool industry. During my later years at secondary school and my period of time spent training to be teacher, I never found it difficult to get a job in these primary industries. I worked at a local freezing works and with local shearing gangs as a labourer in shearing sheds. Males and females were employed in roughly equal numbers in the shearing shed with the majority of females being Māori. Although I didn't reflect upon it at the time, I think that these jobs helped to define my class and gender.

Part time jobs were plentiful in the mid 1960's but the need to work and the motivation to work was, upon reflection, the crucial issue. In my view, adolescents from the town whose families owned businesses or whose parents were professionals had jobs almost as of right; the country children from farming stock grew up working. That left the working class kids. I recall working in shearing sheds – good money at "10 bob" an hour, but being aware of the class structure even of the shearing shed. A case study participant discusses the shearing shed hierarchy and I think reinforces my point. As Foucault, (McHoul and Grace, 1998) suggests, power is everywhere; it is how we exercise that power that is crucial. I think that being introduced into a robust working culture, dominated by males, although females certainly played their part in the shearing

shed, allowed me to develop a balance. I rapidly became independent financially and I think from my mid teens on, pretty much did my own thing.

I recall at this time, brief debates with my mother about a possible career. I think that her expectation of me was minimal – none of her family or my father's family had gone on to tertiary education. I think that a secure job was her prize for me. I decided to apply for Teachers' College. I think I applied because a couple of my friends did – one successfully – and because in the halcyon days of the 1960's you were 'paid to train'! My two years as a student passed uneventfully without too much effort on my behalf.

Some Critical Incidents in Adolescence and the Tertiary Experience

- I enjoyed playing cricket and at the time, in my place, I was reasonably good at it. With hindsight this attribute got me 'through' secondary school.
- I enjoyed my time at a teachers' training institution. In the 1960s there was a focus on the all round needs of the individual and I appreciated the relaxed social environment. I wonder how I would have coped today with a much higher workload and the need to achieve academically?
- The social conditions of the time, which ensured a guaranteed job when I exited tertiary education. (Although this condition with its greater emphasis on self-promotion and self-marketing could be seen as counter productive later in life!)

My earlier, almost preoccupation with the effects of a class structure, seemed to reduce during my early teaching years. The initial teaching years were characterised by a focus on the technical aspects of teaching and little emphasis on pedagogy and critical reflection. I recall my first years teaching in a primary school with its emphasis on management and control – not a focus on pupil self control either! I recall having a number of colleagues around me who I used to socialise and play sport with. On reflection, having a number of colleagues with similar interests about me, helped a rather naïve young teacher negotiate several potentially difficult situations.

I spent time in the New Zealand Army during the late 1960s. Although I did not want to go into the army, (I was a 'birthday soldier' whereby my birth date decided whether or

not I would spend time in the army) I enjoyed the experience and found that I was quite successful in the military environment. I reflect quite often about the Vietnam conflict – my time in the army was during the height of that conflict. All New Zealand soldiers who served in Vietnam were volunteers, not conscripts like myself. Other allied countries such as Australia and the United States of America did send conscripts to the conflict and of those who returned, many suffered greatly. I remember reading about the bargain struck between the American Military and the city fathers of a small town in the American South, where in return for military duty from its young men, the town would have its services and amenities updated. The majority of young men from the town were of working class origins and/or unemployed. Contrast this with members of society who, because of their higher-class status avoided this conflict. Ex-president Clinton was a famous military ‘avoider’.

I found the class divisions in the New Zealand army much more likely to be based on ability rather than an assumed right. I also found it interesting that in the New Zealand army, Māori usually succeeded in contrast to, say, our education system of today. It seemed to me that whānau and a sense of purpose, clear boundaries and meaningful participation all contributed to Māori success in the army. I would also say that time in the army—probably the close companionship, helped to develop a certain resilience within me.

After the army I continued teaching – at a primary school in a country town, and a sole charge school in a rural area. In both places I recall the support and companionship of colleagues. In particular, the weekly meeting of small-school principals during my sole charge days were of immense benefit. Such a job can be professionally and personally isolating. I learned to be self sufficient in my days in the country – problems had to be solved and issues resolved.

My wife (we married young by today’s standards!) and I travelled to the United Kingdom in the mid 1970s for a period of travel and a different teaching experience. Like many young New Zealanders, the overseas experience provided an opportunity to experience other cultures and with hindsight, develop a degree of resilience in terms of managing different situations. I recall working in a school in North London with children from many different ethnic backgrounds. I came from a part of New Zealand

which was largely monocultural so the experience in London created a number of challenges which had to be met. Another job involved working in the public bar of a quite well appointed pub in Surrey. I was surprised at the overt class division between the drinkers in the public bar where I worked and the private bar where my wife worked. Customers in both bars knew their place. Maybe that was the same in New Zealand but more covertly so.

After the return from the overseas experience, more teaching in the country followed; and two children. Having children provided a broadening of view. A lot of things that I did were reconsidered in the light of the children's needs and certain tasks needed to be completed to meet a general family need.

And so to a senior teacher's position in Dunedin, a Principalship, followed by work in the tertiary sector. When I arrived as a teacher in the tertiary sector I felt myself to be underqualified for the positions I held. No one ever said so, but I needed to improve my qualifications. I have found though, that the gaining of qualifications themselves, while important, provided something more. The opportunity to stick at something, not to just express a desire to do something but to actually do it, will be my enduring memory of my belated tertiary study. Having said that, I still feel slightly uncomfortable in an academic setting – as if I still don't quite belong. (I was interested to note that Isobel, a case study participant expressed a similar view – see introduction) I still feel a greater affinity with the general staff rather than the academic staff. I have only recently come to terms with the need not to have to *erase my past and elude the humiliation of being found an imposter*. (Law, 1995) My working class origins are still present and I am learning to feel comfortable with that and appreciate what for me, provided both risks and assets.

The Case Study Findings

These results will be reported as a series of six case studies and then ‘units of meanings’ highlighted in the discussion section, extrapolated from those studies.

The six participants were, or had been, members of a bilingual teaching programme sited in a College of Education. All six identified as Māori – five were female and one was male. All participants were given pseudonyms, which are used throughout the study. All of the informants appeared to have resilient outcomes and they had factors in their lives that helped them to adapt to, or cope with, the effects of risks. In each of the case studies, I analysed the participant’s story first, then their comment about race, class and gender and finally I analysed both interviews together.

In the results section as reported below, I focussed on the two interviews then looked for supporting evidence in the *Documentation Sheet* that all participants had completed. At the conclusion of each case study report, I identified participant *risks and assets*. (Masten, 2001) These risks and assets were translated into race, class and gender summaries, and general themes and sited in the discussion section.

CASE STUDY ONE

Raymond: Including Both Worlds

Raymond, the only male among the case study participants, was part way through his training as a teacher. He identified with a Māori tribe in the North Island of New Zealand. Before commencing his teacher training he was a shearer, and in telling his story he drew upon his experience as a shearer and how his family was linked to shearing and the land:

I think that we came from sort of raw beginnings. We are just hard workers. We're like shearers and farmers and that sort of thing with a vision to go further I guess....My grandfather was a shearer and my great great grandfather was a shearer... my grandfather and granduncle set world

records And they progressed from being shearing contractors to farmers. In between that, they became professional in the shearing industry and they were judges in the Golden Shears and Māori Wool Board instructors, and you know, they went to the top of that field if you like; and those are the sorts of influences that I kind of draw upon, but you've got to be yourself you know.

Raymond hinted at some of the difficulties that he had faced but at no time did he hint or suggest that 'life was unfair'. He appeared to have the ability to get on with 'things':

I've been brought up in an atmosphere where there has been Pakeha over here and Māori over there and I've been part of that as well. It's hard not to be, especially where I grew up. It was predominately Māori, and the Pakeha walked on that side of the road and you walked on that side of the road...

These sorts of experiences could well have an alienating effect on anybody I suspect. I asked Raymond about any critical incidents in his history that might point to his ability to get on with things despite an upbringing in an environment that appeared to foster *a separatist thing going on*. He told a story, in response to my prompting, that he had related to me before the formal interview. I think that this story is quite crucial to Raymond's ability to 'work across worlds' and to have good outcomes:

It's probably not crucial so much to me (the story) but probably more crucial to my children. My wife is Māori. We are not sure how much she's got in her but as a mark of respect to her parents that she has now, she doesn't want to find that out you know, until her parents aren't here. So, her parents are both Pakeha but she's definitely Māori. Quite dark and yeah she said to me that one day, the story that she loved to hear her parents tell is that when they found her, when they went to get her, they adopted her and obviously colour didn't come into it; race didn't come into it. They saw the smile in her face and picked her up. That's how that went and that's influence that, as I say, I've learned from them; more than anything else about that.

Quite a number of Raymond's comments to me during the two interviews highlight this ability to work in two worlds – an acknowledgement of who he is and his Māori side, but how Pakeha has also contributed to his development. I need to trace this theme through the two interviews, as I believe it gives a good insight into Raymond's resilient nature and the impacts upon that resiliency.

He talked often about the similarities he saw between Pakeha and Māori. In particular he seemed to be saying that he started to develop 'his biculturalism' after he met his wife and her parents. He related the story about his wife's father asking him for advice when his (the father's) mother died:

(He said) I've got a problem. I said what's wrong. He said, I don't want her to go and sit up at the church by herself. I said to him why don't you bring her here at home? Why don't we just have a tidy up and have her here at the house? He said I didn't really think of that; so that's what he did and it was a really good thing you know. He was able to sit there and hold her hand and have that sort of contact ... and I thought it's not just us Māoris that are the only ones close to our people, they are too. It's wrong of me to assume that they aren't, but I always thought like that.

During this conversation about dealing with the death of his father-in-law's mother, he drew the conversation back to resilience:

I've learnt a lot of things from them (Pakeha), mostly to do with their quality. We're just equal, my people have always said to me. You're no different from them, you can do what they can do, you can do, and that's been a good thing for me because that's what's gotten me through life in a lot of ways. When I come into situations which are challenging I've sort of said well, if you can do it, so can I, you know, that sort of thing, that's to me, 'resilience'.

As I mentioned, he seemed to be able to draw upon his experiences in both the Pakeha and Māori 'worlds' but more importantly reflect upon those experiences and make for

him, sense of those experiences. He appeared to be a deeply reflective person and this was particularly evident when he talked about an issue related to his training:

I'd come to class sometimes and I'd be waiting for an hour for class to start and things like that. That never went down with me at all, and people said well this is Māori and the Māori perspective, but I didn't like that at all because of my grandmother. She was always on call to do stuff at the Marae and that. She'd ring me up and say come and pick me up and take me to the Marae and that. She told me to come and pick her up at 10 o'clock and if I was two minutes past ten, I wore it, so it didn't go down with me being late you know, because that's what my grandmother taught me.

Raymond talked about Marae protocols often and again I got the sense of that inner strength present, allied to the ability to see both sides and not just take a position that may be difficult to defend, or take too many human resources to sustain in the long term. This concept of Raymond's was reinforced when he wrote in his Personal Documentation Summary about his music and performing arts interests – *I like soul, rhythm and blues: I like opera music and one day hope to see live performances. I love theatre and drama and I like it because I feel it is a good way of gaining self-confidence. I really like the kapahaka but only if the people around me enjoy it enough to do it justice. I have grown up with kapahaka in an atmosphere where everyone was happy and proud to perform.*

We had a particular conversation related to “rights and responsibilities” and Māoridom, which highlighted his reflective nature:

They'll play on something if they can, I've seen that happen a lot, you know, and then use, 'poor old me' as an excuse and don't get me wrong. I know where that comes from. I mean, you know, I remember going on a Marae with my brother who is on the other side of the fence. He's a negotiator for the crown, and he took me to this Hui, and they were discussing land issues and he had these two lawyers with him and they were both Pakeha, and the people got up and walked out...I said to my sister, gee that's a bit ignorant isn't it, that's a bit arrogant you know, they don't even know the people. She

said, what you have to realise is that is the Queen over there. When she was a little girl, she saw a Pakeha policeman shoot her father in the head. ...So that sort of mellowed me out. And I sort of thought, so it's not as if I say things about self responsibility and things like that lightly, because I do know the other side of the story as well.

We talked about the potential risks and strengths gained during the period of training to be a teacher and in particular I asked about the impact of race, class and gender upon a person's perceived strengths. Raymond kept going back to the values that were espoused within his family – the values of humility, honesty and hard work. He made mention of Mana. (authority, control. - Māori Language Commission, 1996) His comments about this concept were interesting – *if you start getting caught up in mana you start getting caught up in power and that sort of thing. You start to get away from grassroots and those sorts of things.*

During our discussions about a male training to be a teacher the question was asked about risks and the strengths of the male teacher. He responded to the issue of risks as follows:

One thing that does sadden me is when you go out to schools and kids will come up and they might hurt themselves....they might want a hug and things like that... I think that we are supposed to say no, you're not supposed to hug them or have that sort of contact...I can understand why, but for me personally it's a little bit sad because I'm concerned about what messages we are giving to those kids...it just seems hard I guess, especially being Māori. My people are sort of huggy you know, feely touchy...

He appeared to have come to terms with this particular issue but that fact that it exercised his mind was interesting. I wonder about the gender and race combining here to create the perception of risk about male, Māori teachers? I asked him about his perceived strengths in the classroom. He talked about his growing ability to listen to people and he also expressed his need to be able to be around male colleagues.

I've probably learnt to listen to other people, especially when they disagree and things like that you know. I think that I am learning to listen to people a bit better but it's pretty difficult because sometimes people are telling you a load of rubbish.... Listening to people, working with other people, working with other people you know....being around so many women that sometimes you can lose your own gender instincts I suppose. That's why it's quite good when I get to Bill and Bob and a couple of other males in my class and some of the other men around the College you know, because you can get back to being a male and all those male things.

He seemed to be saying that the need for male company was important to him and helped to sustain him. He was not downplaying the role and impact of women he had come into contact with during his training but rather highlighting that need for balance – both socially and professionally.

I asked him how being Māori had impacted upon his training to be a teacher. He stated firmly that he felt pressure definitely while undergoing that training:

...because in my view anyway there are a lot of positive things happening in Māoridom now which is great, but there's also a lot of things which aren't you know. They are quite negative and give my people a negative profile if you like, so I feel that pressure to be a model out there as well. That's pretty important to me.

Raymond was outgoing and personable and those qualities were obviously assisting him in his professional training at schools:

.... when I was at school the other day, one of the teachers came up to me and said – "the staff are very impressed with you in the staff room ...you're coming across, not as a student but as a teacher....it's just how you are carrying yourself".

He was pleased with this comment, which seemed to highlight his ability to 'work in both worlds' – to take the best from both and use it to his advantage.

Raymond claimed his biggest strength was whānau. He claimed that whānau, especially his mother, gave him the strength to speak up and that had happened because of modelling. It was interesting that he saw whānau as important and powerful but in his case it was allied to his mother's ability to allow him to express himself individually. He claimed, somewhat paradoxically, that *whānau is a good thing but in some ways it is not, because it doesn't allow people to express themselves as individuals.*

Gilgun, (1999:56) discusses agency in the study of resilience and she states *...for which I have no satisfactory conceptual definition.* Agency, apparently, is a person's will, or sense of determination, and it appears, according to Gilgun, to be pivotal in how risk and assets are used. Maybe, in Raymond's case, the powerful effects of whānau are central to the concept of agency?

Overall, then, Raymond can be thought of as displaying resilience. He hinted at a rather challenging early life, and he displayed many problem-solving behaviours he was using in his life and professional career. Race, class and gender did impact on his resiliency – the need to be seen as a role model, the need for male professional company, the often expressed link to his humble roots and values of honesty and hard work all were bound up in his treatment of risks and assets.

RISKS: The components of Raymond's risk processes included his upbringing in small town New Zealand where he was brought up in an atmosphere with Pakeha on 'one side and Māori on the other'; the early separation of his parents, and his ambivalence about the merits of general versus bilingual teacher training.

ASSETS: Raymond's assets included having a supportive whānau, a background and love for a New Zealand primary industry of shearing, his ability to learn from all people, an ability to 'stand up for what is right', an inherent ability to do what he felt he needed to do – what Gilgun, (1999) calls a 'sense of agency', and an ability to criticise protocol that he did not feel is right in both the Pakeha and the Māori world.

CASE STUDY TWO

Abby: A Growing Confidence

Abby was bright, cheerful and had a cheeky smile. Abby was born in a southern town and had stayed there all her life. During the interview she expressed her nervousness about shifting from her home place at the conclusion of her training. 'Place' seemed to be an important construct to all participants and Abby was no exception. We discovered a connection – her mother and I were both born at Bluff - the most southerly part of the South Island of New Zealand.

As with all the case study participants I began by asking her about her early history and her first memories:

I don't think about things back then because, because it wasn't much of a happy life then. Dad was a full time worker so we never saw him. Mum was basically working as well, so we'd never see her at night and the oldest brother and sister would baby- sit so I didn't have a very happy time because I used to get sent to bed...we'd hear them eating all the yummy food and watching TV and we wish we could have stayed up and we couldn't...

Abby liked school because, as she stated *I could play with my friends and eat their food*. When she went to high school 'things' improved for her as her brother and sister left home and she was able to 'rule the roost'. About this time her parents separated. She referred to her parent's break up in rather unusual terms:

Oh, Mum and Dad broke up then so that was even better because that was the other problem with the tension between the parents. We didn't know what was going on because we were too young at the time and then we finally realized when we were older what it was.

I pursued this conversation with Abby because what she was saying appeared to run counter to a number of popularly held beliefs, which suggested that staying together 'for

the children' would ultimately benefit the child. She seemed to be saying that the break up of her parents actually brought her family back closer together, and, as a consequence all were much happier and still are. Abby said that her mum and dad are now the best of friends.

It is interesting to note Abby's perception of this event – divorce being identified as a risk side of resilience, (Masten, 2001). This concept will be explored further in the themes developed through this study and the discussion. (Masten, 2001:230)

Abby continued her story by talking about her secondary school career. After explaining how she arrived on day one, at her secondary school, she discussed her induction into the IN crowd:

I remember walking in there and I was so terrified and I was sitting beside this girl who just happened to be the one that everybody knew and she just started talking to me so I just started getting around with her and the next thing I knew I was in the IN crowd.

I asked for an explanation of the IN crowd and her final comment was, I feel, quite telling:

The popular people at school. (IN crowd) Because you used to have your nerds and popular people. The popular people were actually the thickest of them all, well that's the way I see it now when I look back and the nerds were actually the ones that were doing well and I wish I had been there.

Abby's reflective ability was apparent. She appeared now to be wanting to 'do well' and I suspect that her children are now catching this strength.

Two comments that Abby made about her formal education, related to teachers who had a positive influence on her. I asked her why she felt good about a particular tertiary course that had she enjoyed:

Geoff: ...*What was different about this one (course)?*

Abby: *It was the tutor I reckon. She had a big impact on me in my view.*

Milstein and Henry, (2000:47) state: *Caring and support are key foundations of resiliency. If we are not cared for, we are likely to feel alienated and alone.*

Abby seemed to reflect this understanding and also appeared to want to offer pupils in her future classes that caring and supportive environment that she experienced albeit it infrequently. This attitude seemed to be common for both her pupils and her own children.

After two years of studying at Polytechnic, Abby became pregnant and left her formal studies. Her decision to train to be a teacher came about, she said, as a result of her seven year support of her daughter in pre school and primary education – *when I was in the class (helping my daughter) I thought I can't handle sitting back watching the teacher. I want to be in there doing that.*

Abby seemed to be like many of the case study participants in that she seemed to know that there was something important for her to do but was also conscious that she needed to do something to attain the skills to allow her to achieve.

I didn't have very good social skills and being here at College and meeting new people and strong people has built my confidence and now you just can't shut me up.... Yeah, it's made me stronger being here anyway – being with strong people.

Abby was very clear about the influence the bilingual teaching unit had upon her – she described the members of the class as being *a very tight unit*. In fact, her description of the class was really that of whānau. She highlighted the strengths she got from her teaching whānau; she knew that her classmates would support her no matter what.

During the second interview, Abby discussed the effects of her socio-economic position or class:

And thinking back I...never actually put anyone in a category because I was at a Catholic school. I didn't even know what a Māori was... My father's Māori and he never spoke Māori at home...And I didn't know what a Māori was because there was only myself...

Abby talked about an incident linked to race that had an impression on her. We talked about different class structures in New Zealand and the effect of class upon individuals. I asked if there were any specific incidents that had a particular impact:

I remember once my teacher says, we were doing a role-play, and she said "Oh we need an Indian. Oh you (Abby) look like an Indian and I thought, why do I look like an Indian, but it was actually my skin that she referred to...I felt awful because I wanted to know why I looked like an Indian.

This incident relating to Abby's colour, and other incidents, didn't have an immediate impact upon her. She said that it wasn't until she became part of a teacher-training programme that she started to think about her life 'big time'.

Again, it appeared that this particular incident had a profound effect on Abby but she was able to use the bilingual training programme as a major adaptive system (Masten, 2001) to mediate the effect of that risk for her.

I was keen to continue to explore further the issues of race that Abby had mentioned above, but return to the links with class later in the interview. I asked her about the perceived strengths she had built up as a Māori, training to be a teacher. She talked specifically about having a growing awareness of tikanga and the strong relationships that were built up in her bilingual class: *My unit is my strength*. I asked Abby if the 'unit' as she described her class helped to build her strengths therefore: *Yeah, not just that. It's my whānau as well. I've got excellent whānau support and my children think it's so cool that Mum's going to be a teacher.*

I returned to the issue of class and I asked Abby if she could make any links between race, class and gender and if she could relate any stories that indicated her growing strengths in relation to the three constructs.

We talked about the construct of class and Abby asked about the definition of social class. We discussed the ‘component’ parts of class – financial status, occupation group, family status and how they could come together to contribute to a person living in a particular class. Abby was especially interested in exhibited behaviour in relation to class and the way that people were treated as a consequence.

She said that she had quite a problem with behaviour and class.

Well, I have a problem in that respect. Sometimes I've walked into a shop with my children who are dark skinned children and they (other customers) look at my children. I don't like the way that they're looking at them – especially my older daughter because she is bigger for her age and the way they speak to them as well.... Yes, oh yes and a couple of times I've walked into a shop and my child's standing there and another child walks in or something and my child has been ignored. Where as an adult will walk in. You know how people do it all the time, children get ignored and adults are looked at first and served first and that annoys me especially when I see my daughter standing there. So therefore I go, "excuse me, she was there first," you know.

Abby was quite sure that class divisions were still an issue in New Zealand but significantly she said that she has to deal with it. This was not said in a resigned fashion but as a definite, almost positive affirmation of a right and a responsibility.

When I reflected upon the above exchange with Abby, I thought of Masten's (2001) example of an Indirect Model of risk and Resilience:

Risk

Effective Parenting

Desirable Outcome in Child

Asset

It seemed to me in this instance, Abby's effective parenting demonstrated her resilience and reduced the risks for her daughter. It appeared that Abby had effectively put her feelings on hold to allow her to demonstrate her strength to her daughter. In doing so, a great deal of resilience was shown by Abby, primarily because of her desire to present a strong image to her daughter.

We concluded the interview by talking about the most important strengths she had developed from her training programme – she was reluctant to use the word resilience – but she identified *togetherness* as the crucial strength for her.

RISKS: The components of Abby's risk processes included, the separation of her parents when she was at secondary school; an early pregnancy; an early desire to do things to please others; a perceived lack of social skills at an early age and a sharp awareness of how class and race can affect her family's chances.

ASSETS: The development of a high degree of self-assertiveness, the support of whānau as highlighted in her story often; the need to do something to improve her children's lot; the perception that individuals matter and can help, like her tertiary teacher and her English Secondary School teacher, and being around strong people on the College Campus.

CASE STUDY THREE

Eva: A Process of Discovery

Eva's background, her Whakapapa, and her process of discovery were of prime importance to her. Throughout the two interviews, the search for 'self' through the study of whakapapa, was a recurring theme. I began to see the need for this understanding to be closely linked to a person's assets or risks in the resilience paradigm. (Masten, 2001)

Eva initially presented as being quite shy and reserved but as the interviews proceeded she became more animated. She clearly had a passion to find out about herself, her heritage and her need to pass that knowledge on to her children was quite apparent.

I began by asking Eva about her early life:

I'm the youngest child of seven. My father is Māori. He is one of the North Island Māoris that migrated to the South Island for work. My mother is European and we were brought up in a European environment. Sort of traditional in the things that happened between European times. My father left his Māori heritage behind when he left his home place and he never taught any of us.

She discussed her feelings when her father died when she was four, and described her sense of loss in that she had no opportunity to learn her 'Māori side' from her father as her older brothers and sisters had done. But she also described that loss as a strength:

It's also a strength. I see it as a loss because he didn't..., he wasn't able to teach me the things I want to know now and I'm clawing my way to find out about my Māori heritage, but I see that as a strength because it really gives me the motivation to do it and I want to find out about the kind of person he was and his family and things like that.

Eva obviously felt it important that her children receive the 'Māori side' – the side that she missed because of the death of her father at her young age. She has five children aged ten, eight, five, three and two, all of whom have had a bilingual education. Again a strength, which was evident with all participants, was the link back to children and the need to 'do something' so that children can have a positive role model. Not a role model that was a sports star or important community figure but the primary caregiver. Eva's passion to make something of herself was vividly displayed and seemed to help her determination to succeed with her studies.

I asked her to describe and define resilience for me and to make any links with her search for her Māori Heritage. We talked about resilience and what it meant to her. She described resilience as

I think it's ... I don't know how to put it into words properly, but it's sort of having a stubborn streak and really going for things... Yeah, it's just always challenging yourself and striving for the excellence for your goals and to be the best you can and get everything you can out of everything.

When Eva talked about her searching for her Māori heritage she made links between resilience, becoming comfortable and her search.

Yeah I...because I feel it's only from that, that I can grow as a person through learning my roots and things and I just know that from the person I was like at intermediate school and high school and the person I am now. There's just been a huge change in my confidence and everything like that and that's only come about through learning my Māori heritage...

But interestingly enough that search seemed to be just as important with her mother's side. (The pakeha side)

I don't think it's totally unique because I've done the same, like tracing my Whakapapa and that with my mother's side as well and that's given me just as much sense of self worth as my Māori side.

When Eva's life story 'got to' the teacher training decision I asked her why she decided to train to be a teacher. Her story about her decision to enter teacher training was remarkably similar to the other four female case study participants.

...And then I moved on to work in a school doing teacher aiding with kids with special needs. Then I just decided to come and do this and I was told by several tutors at Polytech. that I would make a good teacher... I see it as me building a better future for my kids too. If I can get in and do the education with them, alongside them, and hopefully I can make a change for the whole Māori culture.

I think that this response from Eva highlighted an intersection of race, class and gender factors. Her first exposure to the concept of teaching as a career was when she was a

mother herself. It could be argued that middle class pakeha girls had the opportunity to choose teaching as a career much earlier than Eva. Conversely, it could be argued that Eva had developed a high level of resilience as a consequence of her previous experiences before her teacher aiding experience. This issue will be explored further in the discussion section.

I asked Eva about the issues that she had had to overcome to get to where she was now. She talked about overcoming her shyness and developing a greater confidence. She talked about her developing confidence:

I'm not nearly as shy as I used to be. I'm still shy around new people but once I know them I'm fine...The big thing was having the confidence. That I did have the brains to do it and the knowledge to do it...I don't believe anything holds me back. If anything it's myself. It's just being myself getting pushed to do things.

When Eva talked about her strengths she said that she found it quite difficult to do so. She said that her biggest strengths were that she was passionate about anything that she gets involved with, she was caring and that she expressed herself well. This ability to express herself wasn't immediately apparent but grew as the interviews proceeded. She also made links to her search for her Māori heritage in terms of her strengths:

...I know I don't need specific answers for everything but I like to be able to unjumble things sometimes and that's just not possible at times...Not just that I can accept that that's Aunty or Nanny or whatever. I like to know how they are related specifically.

I followed my usual questioning pattern in the second interview and began by asking Eva to talk about her socio-economic position, or class. Her response included what could be described as a number of 'risk characteristics' or opposites of 'asset characteristics'. (See Masten's, 2001, model, *Indirect Model of Risk and Resilience*) For example, she described her mother being forced back into work when her father died and she stated that *automatically I think that you're the different ethnic identity and that*

you're put into the lower class and a whole lot of assumptions are made about you and stereotypes. She described how class division in New Zealand looked to her:

I think there are two sorts of issues of class and things because there's the money side of it. You have the poor and the well to do and things like that but then there's also just people that think they're better than other people and they put themselves into that top class.

I asked her to describe some specific examples that related to her comment linking ethnic identity and class:

Well, a good one actually is here at our bilingual unit. There are many misconceptions out in public of what we actually do here ...and that our degree is not worth the paper it is written on...and that we're not actually learning the curriculum and not real teachers and we're only learning Māori and things like that. That's because of how people view Māori and they don't know of course, but like we're second best to the mainstream sector.

But her final response was interesting because it seemed to me that she was defining the 'assets' part of Masten's, (2001) *Indirect Model of Risk and Resilience*:

We've only just started to push our image and getting it through to our own students in the bilingual unit we're not second-class. We're bloody higher than them. We can go out there and teach both mainstream and bilingual so obviously we're better qualified people.

I asked her to talk about the risks and strengths for a female training to be a teacher. She echoed the comment made by the majority of the female case study participants:

...one of the risks is that I'm not as focused on my kids as I should be or as I'd like to be. I look at how I was with my two older kids when I was at home with them and the things I did with them.

This crucial comment followed - *I still believe that I'm the best mother they could ever have. The best mother they could ever have. I see that I don't do as much for them that I did for the other ones but...*

Her final comment about strengths or assets, related to strengths about being a woman built up while being a member of this teaching class:

I'm not scared to stand up for myself and I think that a lot of women say the same things. I won't let myself or other women be put down because of gender issues and I'm just as likely to go out there and do something because they've said that to me. I just use my friends and my family that I've got if I've got issues in relationships. I think I'm more encouraging towards them and supportive of them to get out there and do something for themselves and get out of bad relationships.

I asked Eva about the risks and strengths for her as a Māori training to be a teacher. She claimed that there were no risks for her; just for other people in the community and their views and perceptions. She was very clear when talking about her strengths:

I know for myself that training to be a teacher, I'm going to be able to go out there and well it gives me a lot more strength as a person and as a Māori person especially and I'm going to be able to go out there and I'm not saying that I can get rid of all those misconceptions but...if I can change things with my class or whatever...that's a big leap and that's what I was about to say – that's strengths isn't it?

This comment was confirmed in her Personal Documentation Summary: *...I personally could link to performing arts in Kapa Haka and entertaining and competing with my roopu.*

I concluded the interview by asking her to talk about the links between race, class and gender in terms of her training. I asked her to emphasise her strengths as the following exchange highlights:

Geoff: What strengths do you think you've developed as a consequence of those? (Links between race, class and gender)

Eva: Oh seeing something and knowing what you want and going for it no matter what; ...just going for it and making it like the gender yeah, making me want to do that much better.

Geoff: What does your Mother think of you?

Eva: She's delighted!

Geoff: Your Mother adds to your strengths or resilience?

Eva: Oh definitely. I used her as one of my role models throughout my life because yeah, as for her, especially a Pakeha woman being left with seven kids you know, aged from four to eighteen. It's been a big struggle for her.

Eva's final comment related to the bilingual unit. She stressed the sense of unity that she found, as this comment highlights:

It's like having people, all people, in the bilingual unit as my whānau.

RISKS: The risks for Eva included the loss of a parent at early age (her father died when she was four); and the accompanying early lack of confidence which was related to an understanding that her mother had to work hard and so didn't like to ask for too much. Also, having a 'problem without an name' where she was aware of class and its divisions – *I believe that we are mixed classes and whether people think they are doing it or not, they put us into those categories and stereotype us...*

ASSETS: Her supportive Mum; her sense of Whānau at the Teachers' College Campus; her drive to find out about her Māori heritage; her fierce pride in her achievements and her growing self assertiveness.

CASE STUDY FOUR

Isobel: A Special Needs Emphasis

Isobel began by telling me about her early life. She was born into a Māori family where her mother was Pakeha and her father was Māori. She was then taken from her birth place to a North Island city where her mother married an 'English Gentleman', and significantly, she was brought up with no idea that she had any Māori blood in her. As this story shows, she didn't find out that she was of Māori descent until she had children of her own. This 'lack of knowing' appeared to have a profound effect on her and once again highlighted that need for knowledge of self and extended family. Although she had no idea of her racial background, she said that she was always drawn toward adopted children and Māori children:

...most of my friends at school were Māori or children that had been adopted and I had no idea why. I don't know whether it was an inherited feeling I had...

Isobel left school when she was fourteen and got various jobs in factories and shops and importantly, always went back to helping do volunteer work at her local Intellectually Handicapped Children (IHC) school. She remarked that she had worked with children with special needs on and off for years. Her story about her children and her understanding of who she was, is integral to this case study:

I had my own children, the first three children...and found out that I wasn't actually who I thought I was. That the reason I had children who were born darker than me was because I had Māori blood in me and that's what was happening. It was coming out in my children....I found out that my mother had been married before and my family was down here so for various reasons I just wanted to get away from the North Island anyway and it just seemed a natural progression to find out who I was. I came down here, met a guy, had another child, and she has special needs. I got involved with Kohanga ...because I wanted to find out who I was and because I still had

an interest in dealing with children with special needs and I just sort of carried that on when I moved down here...

Isobel seemed to be linking her search for 'herself', and teaching Māori children closely, when she suggested that after having her youngest daughter, getting into education was the next logical step:

...getting into an education that was going to teach me more about me and who I was and perhaps get me into areas of teaching Māori children with special needs...

Yet, her comment in her Personal Documentation summary indicated that her search is continuing – *I like to think that I fit in but I really feel like I don't belong anywhere.*

This comment once again seems to be reinforcing the concept of knowing, and this 'knowing' seems to have the potential to add to a person's strengths.

Isobel had already identified a number of risks and assets within a resilience paradigm, and her definition of resilience and thoughts about resilience seemed to follow logically on after describing her early story:

Resilience, well, I suppose to me, because of various things I've been through in life I think I'm resilient. Resilience is being able to deal with things as they come, being able to adapt yourself to given situations so you could cope... I just suppose finding what your inner strength is, even if you don't know what it is. You know it's in there somewhere and being able to pull out whatever you need at any given time.

Isobel talked about the issues she had to overcome to get to where she was now. She highlighted 'gender issues' as something to be overcome. She talked about the expectations of her mother who believed that girls didn't need to sit school certificate because the chances were that *I was going to do actually what my sister did and have a baby and leave school anyway...* That comment was followed by this exchange:

Isobel: You know, so that was sort of against me as far as education went.

Geoff: The parental expectations?

Isobel: Yeah, they were never the same for boys and girls.

Isobel: Yeah, I don't know – there's so many different things that you know, I can't put my finger on any one thing – I mean I've been through a lot..

Geoff: Yes...

Isobel: You know, I had a mother who by the time I was eight, I had to do housework. I mean, I had an older brother and sister and a younger brother and sister – they didn't and I did.

The parental expectations in relation to gender provided considerable risk for Isobel and were confirmed in the second interview with its more specific emphasis on gender issues.

It appeared therefore that the educational expectations of Isobel were not high. Given these expectations, what were the strengths that she had employed to get to where she was now. (Halfway through her teacher training) She discusses the 'gap' between the expectations held for her and what she had actually done:

Isobel: Yeah, I sort of thought, you know, I've got to do something with my life. I had three children to support and it took a long time before getting to here. I mean twelve years just about when I got down here to the point where I thought I've got to go to college.

Geoff: So, twelve years between coming here (to this city) and coming to do your teacher training? What's happened in those twelve years?

Isobel: I suppose having my youngest daughter and realizing that I was in a really bad relationship. I was not in a good relationship and I knew that I needed to do something for me and that there came a point where I would end up supporting myself and my child, because the other children were a lot older and had left home and I suppose in that time I sort of realised more, that I was drawn to teaching children.

Isobel made mention about the value of Kohanga Reo and the perspective that it brought to the learning and teaching task for her. She commented that *if I was taught like that when I was younger I would have been different.*

Kohanga Reo seemed to be very important for her and her statement about having a different, and presumably better opportunity seemed to 'fit' Smiths, (1991) research about the vital nature of Kohanga. What the research didn't address was the potential powerful effect upon another generation's strengths. Isobel appeared to have drawn strength from the opportunities afforded her daughter.

Isobel continued to talk about her 'journey' toward tertiary education. She said that it took her a whole year between the time of making the decision to enter tertiary education and actually getting there. Her story here, is a telling one:

I had friends who were applying to come and they kept telling me I should apply. But I made up excuses and they were excuses. I said things like oh, I don't know – surely we'll have a full teacher aide at school and that might hinder my going to college. Well that was a load of rubbish. The fact of the matter was the relationship I was in. I was not to be outside the home. I was to be there at his lordship's beck and call. ...I put up with that for a whole year and then I suddenly, I don't know, something just said, it's time to get out there and do what you need to do – what you want to do.

Isobel talked about her relationship and how it had gone 'downhill' after she applied to go to a College of Education and she reflected upon the emotional and financial costs. She discussed her strengths and she reflected upon what had 'got her through' those difficult times:

Isobel: My friends nagged me.

Geoff: Friends have been important?

Isobel: I think if they hadn't sort of, they kept pointing out to me that this was something that I should do for myself, then perhaps I would have sat there for the next twelve years...

Geoff: Friends have made a difference?

Isobel: Yes and I think because I had come to the point where I knew I had to live my life for myself. I mean, I've always believed you can't live your life through other people although I allowed myself to do that for a long time.

That idea of connectedness and support of friends and whānau again appear to be present but paradoxically the eventual understanding of the need to take a certain level of self-responsibility is also evident.

During the second interview Isobel's daughter was with her. Her daughter has a disability that requires full time monitoring.

Isobel talked about the impact of class or socio-economic status upon her and her family. She said that the family she grew up in had everything that they needed but that she didn't associate with 'kids like myself' because she considered them to be snobs. She described a snob as:

people who think that they are better than other people – people who think that money says, well, I've got to be better because I have money you know!

She continued by saying that she didn't have anything in common with them (children in her neighbourhood):

I mean monetary wise we probably did, but I just had a mother who believed that any money my father earned was for her and not for her children so perhaps I thought I didn't fit in. I didn't have the flash clothes and the flash shoes that went with it you know with this having money status and it's just the way it was. I just didn't feel comfortable around snobs.

Isobel talked about the strengths and risks developed as a female training to be a teacher. As usual she talked in a quiet and assured way and it was quite evident that she possessed a certain calmness - her ability to manage her daughter was evident – she performed several tasks for her daughter who was in a wheelchair, while still talking with me and maintaining a calm exterior:

Well, I suppose that teaching is seen as a woman's profession... there are other issues that come into it that perhaps don't make you a good teacher. I mean in the first year (in training) I was pregnant twice and had a miscarriage both times so I mean there was sort of that break in training with my daughter being sick... There would be a day off here and a day off there when she was in hospital or specialist treatment so that took away some of the in-class stuff... it meant that I'd have to do it on my own you know, outside class hours.

When asked, Isobel reflected about managing her daughter who has a special need, and how that impacted upon her training. (She mentioned in her written summary that she provided for me, that she liked sad songs, for example, 'Nobody's Child') She suggested that she would learn more from her daughter and from herself as a result of her daughter's disability. She appeared to have many risks present within the resilience paradigm but had transformed many of those risks into assets. This assets and risks resilience paradigm was expressed in her statement about children with special needs – *I feel that special education is something that has to be looked at more in depth and that as a student I mean, I believe every student should have to spend one posting in a special education unit.* Isobel again referred to her daughter and her special needs when she responded to the question about the impact of being Māori and training to be a teacher:

I suppose it's impacted in a way. I sort of look at it all perhaps if I hadn't decided that my Māori heritage was important to me maybe I would never have gone into the bilingual unit. I don't know – perhaps being with my daughter was just a good thing... In some ways it's perhaps not as good as I'd like it to be because I'm so fair. I've got fair skin. I've got fair hair. The only dark thing in there is my eyes and a lot of people that go into the bilingual unit tend to look at the ones in class and go well, those ones are Māori so we know why they're here but those ones look white. Why are they here? Unfortunately I'm put with those who are white – why are they here? I suppose it's just a fact of life, put up with it, deal with it, if you don't like it tough... people look at me as being a white person standing up for Māori.

They don't look at me as just one of those Māoris who is complaining so...in one way it's a bit unfair and in another way it's given me an unfair advantage over somebody else I don't know.

She remarked that any unfavourable comment passed about her used to worry her, – now she said that ‘those’ comments just ‘pass her by’.

When she reflected upon the link between race, class and gender, she commented that being a woman and Māori means that that a person is usually at the lower end of the socio economic ladder. She continued by stating that Māori women are perceived to be in the lower socio economic group.

She concluded by discussing her strengths in the light of all of her comment and previous discussions. She said patience was a real strength of hers and that that strength had been reinforced during the bringing up of her youngest daughter. This strength of patience was manifested with her being drawn to working with people with special needs. Her final comment related to the learning of the Māori language:

Learning is a way of using Māori history and their myths and legends and teaching children ordinary everything things. You know, to go into a classroom and be able to give the children a story, a myth or a legend that is based on Māori beliefs.

RISKS: Isobel's risks included not knowing about her heritage until comparatively late in life; managing a child with a profound disability; a lack of expectation from her parents; being in a ‘really bad’ relationship for a time; and her perception of looking ‘white’ while identifying as Māori.

ASSETS: Isobel's assets included a network of supportive friends who supported her in her decision to enter tertiary training; a strong awareness of the need to teach all people about Māori language and custom; and a quiet desire to achieve and to be of service to others.

CASE STUDY FIVE

Mere: An Enthusiast

Mere began by telling me about her early life. She had a Pakeha mother and a Māori father and she was the mother of two boys aged six and seven. She said that her life was mainly pakeha with a 'bit of Māori thrown in'. She said that in her early life she moved quite a bit which she said was not very good for her. I asked her what she remembered about her early school years and she said that '*doing a Samoan dance which the teacher said I was good at*'. She continued by discussing her time at secondary school:

That was a bit rough...and that was when I was going through puberty and I went off the rails something chronic. So I left school before I was 15 ...the school was pretty good though.

I asked her to describe what 'going off the rails' meant and she responded:

Well, I started to get rebellious. My mother and father were splitting up...and I started to go out on my own and do my own thing.

After her time at secondary school she moved to stay with her grandmother where they worked together in a factory. She said that she enjoyed that experience – both being with her grandmother and the job itself.

When she talked about resilience and her strengths and risks in light of her early experiences, which led her to enrol in teacher training, she described resilience as an ability *to keep going, survival, handling things*. Her next comment which was linked to her concept of resilience, described her reason for deciding to enter teacher training:

Probably with what I went through when I was a teenager and that. I think that I've got an empathy with kids and I know what's happening at the time because kids go through the same thing generation after generation. ...It's just the life style that you set them but if I can change or help some kids stay on track and to get to them before they get too old like me, then going back to school and stuff like that.

Her comment about needing to 'give something back' is mentioned in the sociological literature. Blankenship, (1998) suggests that thriving sometimes manifests itself in an other-directed commitment to community advocacy. An example cited is that of outreach workers and counsellors, who are often recovering drug addicts themselves. They frequently describe their commitment to their professions as a way of paying back society for the years they did little but get high, and of expressing their gratitude to those who helped them get into, or stay, in recovery.

When Mere talked about her particular strengths she described liking being with children and also knowing that she had to provide a sense of discipline for them also. She stated that she would rather be the person doing things with children rather than standing up telling them! The following exchange highlighted her reflective nature and her clear understanding of her strengths, which link to her resilience:

Geoff: What are your other strengths?

Mere: Oh, optimism I think.

Geoff: Ok

Mere: Getting out, doing things because they won't come to you.

Geoff: Right.

Mere: Handling situations. If you don't like it, just don't go there.

This 'getting out and doing things' seemed to be important to Mere but her ability to function in this way seemed to come from a specific experience. She described waking up one morning and 'not needing this any more'. She said that during one particular year she was ill, feeling stressed out and as a consequence she was determined to make changes to her life. Significantly, she said that she realized that she had to take some degree of responsibility for her life but also recognised the need to be 'close to my aunts' for support.

In this particular instance Mere, being ill, had the chance to reflect and make changes to her life. In terms of resilience it appears that the previous negative experiences allowed her the opportunity to make positive changes as distinct from not having a negative experience to reflect upon.

Mere appeared to have 'thought through' a strong philosophy that worked for her. This philosophy was expressed in the written summary she supplied:

I tend to step past problems and have my own philosophy on life. You don't have to put up with shit in your life. It is your life so live it the way you feel good living it...I have an inner essence to me. I know that life can be better for me and my boys and the man in my life.

Mere talked about the need to 'do it for yourself' but she also highlighted the need for support from others. This is an interesting comment because it seems to highlight the primacy of the individual, allied to support from crucial others. I continued this theme and asked Mere about the support from other people. She mentioned her friend who she met while doing a polytechnic course a number of years ago – *she's been my rock – always putting me on the right track if I'm going off it a bit – she's pretty straight forward*. Mere reflected upon resilience – whether it is an individual thing or whether it is bound up with others:

Well, I think that resilience is on your own, you've got to do it on your own, you've got to have the strength inside to do it, because that person could disappear tomorrow, could die or something could happen that you're not friends anymore. So it's got to be you.

The second interview focussed on issues of race, class and gender and in some cases teased out a number of points that Mere had already made. Mere said that her family wanted for nothing when she was a child – *we had a pretty good even life*. She described what class meant to her:

Mere: Well upper class is like lawyers, doctors, suburbia, the big houses, prices, money.

Geoff: So you define class by occupation?

Mere: By situation – what else?

Geoff: How would you recognise working class?

Mere: Reception work is working class but when you become the professional then it ...(changes)

Geoff: So it's got a link to occupation?

Mere: ...Money I think, money and occupation go together.

She concluded her comments about class by observing that *it's not just from the money. They held themselves up there as well. It's the way they portrayed themselves.*

Mere continued by discussing issues of gender and what the risks and strengths were for her as a female teacher trainee. She talked about her fear of failure, especially in relation to her family and talked about her need to 'stick with it'. She stated very strongly that she couldn't withdraw from the training programme because that would mean losing face with her family. She said having that pressure from her family was like a push and getting her to 'do it'. She hastened to add that she wanted to complete the qualification anyway!

She mentioned that specific strengths she had built up were working with different people who had different attitudes but also recognising which people to be with and which ones to stay away from!

Mere was very definite when she responded to the question about how being Māori had impacted on her training as a teacher. She said that it was uplifting for Māori having a bilingual training programme. I asked her about the strengths she had developed during the training:

...knowing that I am accepted there for who I am and I don't have to suck up to anybody... They just accept me the way I am and they lift me up when I need it and just being accepted I think, is a big strength.

When Mere talked about the links between race, class and gender and in particular, the strengths and weaknesses with that 'combination', she was very precise and indicated that she had considered the 'lot' of Māori women as well as the telling of her story.

Māori have been put down – held down I mean. Not put down but held down, and Pakeha have been the controllers even though a lot of Pakehas see the Māori way... It's a slow progression. ..But I can see it's going to

take a long time to get there too – there's always that racism out there....Like there are class differences in that race. Yes, there's some that are happy to be where they are or some that are stuck there or some that are pretty low that need the awahina... - to help themselves....getting them to help themselves.

Her final comment related to the bilingual teaching programme:

I love it. It's exactly where I want to be.

RISKS: The separation of her parents when she was in her early teens; leaving school very early just before 15; her perception of the colonising effect on Māori; and moving around a lot when she was young – *not good for us!*

ASSETS: A strong philosophy of renewal – *I think because I can start over again I am not afraid to (start over again) – that makes me strong*; the sense of achievement that she has developed as a result of her tertiary training; her desire to promote Māori language and custom; and an ability to articulate her empathy with children and relate to children as a consequence.

CASE STUDY SIX

Nora: A Study in Determination

By the time that Nora was sixteen she was pregnant. She was brought up in a bilingual environment where her father was Māori and her mother Pakeha. Her mother and father were part of a third family of six brothers and sisters, one of which was a whole brother. She is now in a committed relationship and has three children with her current partner.

She talked openly about her family. She described her mother as the stable provider for her family while her father *flicks from job to job – gets koha and board quite easy*. She said that her father's attitude had an impact on her – *that has made lots of things in my life change so that I don't become like him*.

She decided to go back to school with her older son to help out with reading and maths:

I've done a lot of mother help and supervising and stuff like that and I thought well, I haven't the patience any longer to be in the preschool area so I've decided to move up to the primary school. It took me a long time to get up the confidence to actually come to Teachers' College. My husband has already got a degree in Art during which time we went to another city to live. At that time I lost my daughter. She died of cot death.

Her daughter's death underpinned a lot of her conversation and in a rather poignant fashion, demonstrated Nora's resilience. She talked about the changes in her family's life after the death of her daughter and the feelings about wanting to have another child. In a way she reinforced Mezirow's theory of transformative learning where a life-changing event is 'needed' to bring about long-term change.

I was this great mother but wouldn't ever think of being in this position. Never did even think of being there – just focussed mostly on my children and my husband and bringing my children up. So it was a big step for me to come to College...your children you know, change your whole entire life.

She talked quietly but proudly of her Māori heritage. She identified as Ngati Porou, as her father had originally come from Ruatoria on the East Coast of the North Island. She also said that her father was a Kaumatua in the local community but that his position caused difficulties for her *because if I meet any of the Kaumatua or Kuia in the community they automatically assume that I can korerorero Māori fluently and it makes me feel very uncomfortable.*

We talked about the issues that Nora had had to deal with during her training period. She was reluctant to talk about herself but eventually did, and in so doing, provided a deeper insight into her strengths and what had contributed toward her undoubted resilience.

A lot of it is juggling my schoolwork with the children. I'm going home tired and cranky from school. ..some nights I'm not getting started on my

academic work until nine o'clock and I just go until I can't go anymore. I found that hard at times. I've had to give up a lot of things I like to do but I've enjoyed learning lots of new stuff...I'm doing my training because of my children. I want to send my children to boarding school and educate them.

She continued by discussing her choice of childcare and early childhood education for her children. Again, there was a significant indication of resilience:

I put him (her son) into the full immersion unit because there was nothing else and the first three weeks he spent crying which made me cry because he was so upset. He just couldn't cope with the immersion situation so his father wanted to pull him out and I said no. I teach my children that if they haven't given 100% then don't even speak to me about it.

In this particular instance her son wanted to continue in the programme – *I asked him what do you want to do next term and he said it's all right, I'm getting better.* Again Nora indicated strongly her ability to 'hang in there', and again, her children were a major motivation for her behaviour.

She described what resilience was. She suggested that it was people making opportunities for themselves that they otherwise wouldn't make. This was followed up by talking about her perception of her specific strengths. She began by discussing the time after her daughter died:

After my daughter died, I went on a spiritual journey I'll call it. ..from an early age I've been able to identify things that weren't normal about me and so from the very beginning of college I used my psychic abilities to help me a lot...I rely very much on that to get me through some of those tough times...I'm the first response person for the Cot Death Society here and have been for a while...like I'm eight years down the track since my daughter died...my role in that work is to respond and to make sure that all parents know what's involved in a tangi...I've had to organise tangis for

people. A lot of it's organisation I suppose. I've become a good organiser as all mothers are.

Nora stated that she trusted her intuition, 100%! She completed the first interview by again focussing on her strengths where she talked about her desire to make a difference especially for abused children. She talked strongly about her need to be the person that children go to at the school who will do something and not just talk!

The second interview began by Nora discussing the effects of her class or socio-economic position:

We were lower-class I suppose and my father skipped from job to job so it made it really hard for my mother. ...My mother's had it quite hard and I've chosen not to have that for myself and my family.

We didn't have very much money so obviously it's to go out once a month. Mum would take us up town on a Friday night maybe. We might get a new pair of something, but usually she made all of our clothes, which was cool. But it wasn't so cool when we went to school and kids looked at you because you had these funny looking pants...Defines the class doesn't it – when you're at school.

Nora continued by discussing the impact of the shortage of money, her father's social work and her mother's struggle. All of those factors linked to the class positioning for Nora and contributed to the environment she found herself in:

Dad's focus was never on my brother or I ...it left Mum quite short quite often and it proved to be an inconvenience for my social life status and it led to me falling into the wrong group of friends who were of similar backgrounds. ...that led me to source other methods of getting clothing, which wasn't very good. I got caught once and I wasn't fast enough getting out of the shop so I got chased down the road....that's the pressure that's put upon you as a pre-teenager, if you don't fit in because your clothing's not right or you haven't got the most...

She discussed the impact of being female upon teacher training and Nora mentioned the organisation side at home and how that she found organisation in the classroom easier as a result of her home experiences. She also said that she had become much more compassionate toward children but also that that compassion could be a hindrance as she could be seen as a 'pushover'! She did claim though, that the training experience had developed her personality – *I'm a lot stronger now. I don't tolerate much stuff now. I was a bit of a knock over before. I don't tolerate nearly as much stuff now.*

She talked about being Māori and training to be a teacher. She was obviously proud of the spirit within the bilingual unit and she mentioned that if one class member is finding it tough then everybody in the class gets together and 'pulls' together to get that person 'back on task'. She did say that all class members have days where, because of outside influences, they think, *it's too tough, I can't do this anymore*. Overwhelmingly though, she attributed being in a Māori Unit had helped all class members to first of all survive, and then to do well. She gave an example of how an individual class member's birthday was celebrated:

What we had to do was to buy each other an outfit from the Op Shop. The ugliest thing we could find and they had to give it to that person on the night and we went out for dinner and that event went all night... We also have a Māori catering unit just because there was a need for it and it was a good way of fund-raising for us.

We talked finally about the intersection between class, race and gender and the impact 'they' had upon her teacher training. Her response reflected the cultural capital model highlighted by Bourdieu (Bourdieu and Passerog, 1977):

I think there is a lot of stereotyping and the public eye...I wouldn't say that I'm lower class now, I feel that I've moved to middle class really. Stereotyping in the public eye depicts Māori women as being behind pots and pans and cooking at the Marae – bare foot and pregnant. I don't think so, not these days!

Her final comment linked resilience to the construct of race, class and gender and her determination to do something for herself that would benefit her family:

I needed to help change my family. My goals that I'd set weren't going to happen at home behind the pots and pans at the Marae and this is what I've done to change it for myself and my family to come to Teachers' College.

RISKS: An early pregnancy; the loss of a daughter to cot death; the need to balance home life and career; the limited material assets available in her early life; the stereotyping of Māori and the impact of the public view of that stereotyping.

ASSETS: A strong 'professional' whānau support; a desire not to replicate weaknesses that she perceived in others; a long-term supporter of the Cot Death Society; a desire to 'do better' for her family and herself; and that almost indefinable sense of 'self-agency'. (Gilgun, 1999)

CHAPTER FIVE - DISCUSSION

I commenced this study by outlining a rationale. As the study unfolded, I began to realise that Milstein and Henry's (2000) six components of resilience 'fitted' so much of what the case study respondents were saying to me. For example, Eva's comment about Māori having *only just started to push our image and getting it through to our students in the bilingual unit we're not second class. We're bloody higher than them....* suggests a high degree of resilience. This comment seemed to belong in the third component – The need to teach life skills to include assertiveness skills. What is different from the Milstein model however, seems to me to be the need to recognise the power dynamic present in a race, class and gender construct of resilience.

This section will be reported upon in the following parts:

- The process of this discussion
- An introduction to include the Milstein and Henry, (2000) resiliency model
- Race, Class and Gender: The data and the literature
- Themes arising from the data and the literature
- A final summary statement to include a response to the study question

The Process of Discussion

I felt that I needed to ensure that the process of discussion was transparent and that I followed a series of logical steps, which incorporated the gathered data and the findings from the literature. Consequently, I followed this process:

- At the conclusion of each case study report I listed the participant's risks and assets. These risks and assets were gleaned from the interrogation of the gathered data.
- From the gathered data embedded in the six risk and assets summaries, and the literature findings, I developed a series of summary statements that focus on race, class and gender.
- From the summary statements, there emerged a number of themes, which seemed to encapsulate the stories told to me.

- The detailed themes provide the response to the study question.
- The themes provide the basis for the series of suggested workshops in the *Implications for Practice* section in the final chapter.

Introduction

Facing the challenges of teacher training in a bilingual environment, the case study participants were required to call upon internal protective factors and environmental protective factors. As well as mobilising these factors, the constraining or liberating influences of race, class and gender were reported upon. Blankership, (1998) viewing resilience/thriving from a race, class and gender perspective, suggests both the ability to thrive/be resilient in the face of risk and the likelihood of facing risk in the first place are largely determined by the same thing: location in the social hierarchy. Blankership tells the story of Christopher Reeve:

Consider, for example, the horseback riding accident several years ago that paralysed actor Christopher Reeve. For many months after the accident, the headlines of the popular media documented his amazing physical and emotional progress. And anyone who saw his appearance at the Academy Awards could not help but be moved. Yet from the perspective of feminist sociology, and with all due respect for the strength and courage Reeve has appeared to show, his ability to thrive/be resilient in the face of such tragedy was influenced in part by a social position among the elite that permitted access to the very best available surgeons, therapists, doctors, technology, and equipment. Similar resources would not be available to many individuals facing a similar challenge. Moreover, from a race, class, and gender framework, the type of challenge individuals face is likely to be associated with their social location. Whereas members of privileged groups may become paralysed in a skiing or horseback riding accident, the less privileged may be more likely to become paralysed after being caught in the crossfire of a drag-related shooting or after being beaten by a police officer. (p.5)

Milstein and Henry, (2000) list the internal protective factors that are characteristics of individuals that promote resiliency, and environmental protective factors that are characteristics modelled by families, schools, communities, and Peer Groups that promote resiliency. These dual sets of factors are considered in this discussion along with the issues of power and control.

Internal protective factors include:

- Gives of self in service to others or a cause or both
- Uses life skills, including good decision making, assertiveness, impulse control, and problem solving
- Is sociable and has ability to be a friend and form positive relationships
- Has a sense of humour
- Exhibits internal locus ie. belief in ability to influence one's environment
- Is autonomous and independent
- Has positive view of personal future
- Is flexible
- Has spirituality or belief in a greater power
- Has capacity for connection for connection to learning
- Is self motivated
- Has feelings of self-worth and self confidence
- Is good at something or has personal competence

Environmental factors include:

- Promotes close bonds
- Values and encourages education
- Uses high warmth and a low criticism style of interaction
- Sets and enforces clear boundaries
- Encourages supportive relationships with many caring others
- Promotes sharing of responsibilities and service to others
- Provides access to resources for meeting basic needs of housing, employment, health care and recreation
- Expresses high and realistic expectations for success
- Encourages goal setting and mastery

- Encourages prosocial development of values such as altruism and life skills such as cooperation
- Provides leadership, decision making, and other opportunities for meaningful participation
- Appreciates the unique talents of each individual

Race, Class and Gender - the Literature and the Data: Class

All participants acknowledged the influence of ‘class’, although some of the participants hadn’t considered the influence of class, however, until we had discussed it. It seemed that one of the constructs of class was that of expectation. Both Isobel’s story and the autobiography highlight the lack of parental expectations for further education. This construct of class seems to be most insidious – it appears to have the potential to undermine the confidence of people for so long; Isobel’s comment about *wanting to belong but not knowing anymore where she fits* seems to highlight the difficulty of ‘changing classes’ – how do you still retain your working class roots but function in an academic, middle class, environment? Isobel’s comment about belonging is replicated by bell hooks’ (2000:15) comment – *I began to understand fully that there was no place in academe for folks from working class backgrounds who wished to leave the past behind*. This change in class status undoubtedly helped to build resilience but also paradoxically has the potential to leave people in a sort of emotional limbo – where should their allegiance now lie? I make comment in my autobiography about my feelings of discomfort in a tertiary education environment. I do feel however, that these nagging doubts have added to my determination to achieve – Eva makes a similar point when she talks about her growing strength: *getting it through to our own students in the bilingual unit we’re not second-class*.

An acknowledgement of the strengths gained from New Zealand’s working class needs to be made. A number of the case study participants, and the autobiography, made mention of employment in the working class ‘environment’. Raymond’s story included reference to his own *raw beginnings*. His references to his family history of shearing highlights the dignity of labour and the strength and self esteem that is able to be drawn from that. I found that also in my time working in a shearing shed the pride that was developed by Māori and Pakeha in ‘doing a good day’s work’ was a source of strength.

Mere talked about the enjoyment and satisfaction that she received from her factory employment with her grandmother. It could be argued that there is little room in a postmodern society for respect for traditional working class jobs. I argue that respect for a day's work is due every worker no matter what perceived class his or her job appears to be in and that this respect from others could assist in the building of resilience.

Raymond's background appeared to ground him. Although he was training in an environment far away from his earlier working life he appeared to draw upon that 'former' life for part of his ongoing strength: *We are just hard workers. We're like shearers...with a vision to go further.*

An important concept to highlight within the construct of class is that of the use of power. Abby, in her story about her daughter being left until last to be served in a shop highlights the use, or misuse, of power. It seemed to me that the lack of access to the structures which hold 'the power' contributed to the case study participants from achieving their full potential and developing their strengths. The culture present within the bilingual teaching class where the case study participants studied seemed to allow a more equal and equitable sharing of power. These structures need to be encouraged and strengthened.

Race, Class and Gender – the Literature and the Data: Gender

All of the seven participants in the study – the six case study participant's stories and the researchers' autobiographical story, had partners and children. All of the case study participants had dependent children – my wife's and my children are older and dependent in different ways! However, a fundamental difference between Raymonds' and my story and the five female participants seemed to be the level of involvement with their children. They were all the primary care givers and many had been the sole caregiver at times. While Raymond and I acknowledge the importance of our children, it is the female participants who have stated that they get a lot of their strength from their children. Maybe in this respect, there is a difference still between the socially accepted responsibilities for children but also maybe this construct has allowed the females to build a strength and resilience that they might not have otherwise had.

It is interesting to note that although all case study participants' stories and the autobiography highlighted the positive role of their children, only the females linked their children to the development of their strengths. I highlight in my autobiography the role that my mother, grandmother and my aunt played in my early life and I now suspect they developed some of their strengths from having a small boy to look after! In fact, the lack of a male role model probably accelerated the strengths they all developed. I suspect the same strengths developed for the female case study participants in this study.

All the participants in the study had worked in 'traditional' working class jobs. Both Raymond and I had engaged in traditional, New Zealand primary industry. (Although I must admit that Raymond possessed far greater skills than I could ever aspire to!) The females in the study had worked in 'factory' positions where wages were a lot less than in the primary industry where Raymond and I had worked. I suspect that Raymond's and my ability to earn considerable sums of money set us apart from the majority of 'working class' females. However, these working class jobs seem to have assisted in building resilience for all of us. All participants seem to appreciate their later tertiary study when they reflected upon their earlier working life. Nora, for example, is determined that her children will not have to undertake difficult jobs – she is now convinced that education is just crucial for her children but her insight has come as a result of her overcoming her earlier difficulties.

Raymond talked about his need for male company. (*...it's quite good when I get to Bill and Bob and a couple in my class and some of the other men around the College you know because you can get back to being a male and all those male things.*)

Race, Class and Gender – the Literature and the Data: Race

One of the essential differences between the six case study reports and the researcher's autobiography is the importance placed on whānau by the case study participants. All six participants suggested that whānau provided them with their greatest strength. Raymond, for example, suggested that whānau through his mother gave him the strength to speak up. My upbringing was more tenuous in terms of a support structure. It seems that an essential difference was that the Māori participants had the potential to receive unconditional support from their extended family – this wasn't necessarily the case in the traditional Pakeha family of the 1950s.

I do however, need to highlight the differences between the upbringings of the case study participants and my upbringing. I acknowledge that it is unwise to categorise a 'Māori upbringing' and a 'Pakeha upbringing' but the gathered data from the autobiography and the case studies suggest some important differences. As I mention above, whānau, appears to provide the six case study participants with one of their greatest strengths. Eva, for example, discussed her search for her heritage – *there's been a huge change in my confidence...and that's come about through learning my Māori heritage*. My story indicates something quite different. I was left for long periods on my own and maybe as a consequence of that, I feel that much of my strength comes from within. I think the concept of initially acquiring strength from whānau, as opposed to primarily gaining strength from within, appears to be a fundamental cultural difference between Māori and Pakeha within the resiliency paradigm. As Pere, (1988) suggests, there needs to be a balance between individual and group endeavour. In my experience it appears that Pakeha are more inclined toward individual endeavour.

It seems that even from the experience of just the six case study participants that there were vast differences in their formative lives. For example, Raymond was raised in a traditional Māori environment while Isobel did not know that her father was Māori until she had her own children.

Nora talked about her spirituality. In particular she discussed her 'spiritual journey' following the death of her daughter. It appeared that this spiritual quest had helped Nora develop a previously unknown strength. She talked about how she uses this strength in

her everyday life like dealing with examination stress for example. Smith, (1992:43) discusses this spiritual discourse and suggests that

the spiritual discourse incorporates more than the dimension of wairua. It is a struggle over world-view, over Māori knowledge, over history and over the various realms in which we function as humans. It is a discourse which is beginning the task of connecting what we have been taught in the past with how we live in the future.

It seems that Smith's comment allied to Nora's perspectives 'fits' Milstein's and Henry's (2000) first factor of resiliency; that of increasing social bonding and in particular the statement that *people with strong connection with others are far less involved in potentially unsafe and unhealthy behaviours*. Nora's resiliency, in part, seems to come from her spiritual journey which has resulted in her being able to effect change for herself and her whānau.

The Themes

I consider that all case study participants demonstrated resilient qualities. They all demonstrated many of the qualities that Milstein and Henry, (2000) highlighted above. In order to respond to my study question posed earlier I feel that it is important to draw out a number of themes, which seem to me to reflect how race, class and gender impact upon resilience.

1. Whānau Support: The conflict between individual and group responsibility

Linda Smith, (1992) in her glossary of terms described *Whānau as extended family*. Being resilient in the face of considerable life changes during their training for the case study participants, meant gaining and receiving on going support. This support was highlighted by many of the participants. Raymond claimed that his biggest strength was whānau. He said that:

Whānau is a good thing but in some ways it is not, because it doesn't allow people to express themselves as individuals.

Raymond's comments are echoed by Rose Pere, (1988:16):

An effort is made to keep a balance between individual and group endeavour, such that a person is encouraged to be a strong individual and yet have the ability to work alongside other people.

Eva referred to her bilingual class as her whānau – it's like having all in the bilingual unit as my whānau. Abby made very similar comment when she stated:

My unit is my strength. Yeah, not just that. It's my whānau support and my children think it's so cool that Mum's going to be a teacher.

Many of the participants talked about the support they were receiving, and had received, from individuals and groups. Abby, for example, discussed the value of good teachers and the part that they played, and did not play, in her development. It would seem, that although the good teacher is important for all children it is of even more importance for 'at risk' or 'underserved' children. A teaching whānau seemed to be what Abby was talking about.

Linda Smith, (1992:37-39) writing in *Māori Women: Discourses and Mana Wahine*, states that *the whānau or hapu discourse is frequently overlooked in terms of its importance to understanding what it means to be Māori and female*. She continues: *We cannot assume that the lives of all Māori women have been shaped by the same kind of forces. (traditional whānau relationships) We cannot deny the validity and power of the experience of women who have been socialised away from whānau contexts; ...who have been adopted into non-Māori families.*

Although the majority of participants suggested that whānau provided a crucial sense of strength for them, one story in particular, provided a different understanding of the power of whānau. Raymond is talking about his wife:

... the story that she loved to hear her parents tell is that when they found her, when they went to get her, they adopted her and obviously colour didn't come into it; race didn't come in to it.

Although Raymond acknowledged the power of traditional whānau he also recognised the power of Pakeha whānau to provide a sense of well-being and comfort.

2. Children Providing Motivation for Study

During interviews it became apparent that all the case study participants had childhoods where risks were present. All participants talked about their need to 'do things' for their children and to give them a better chance. This could be argued to be the case for all parents but it seemed to be a particularly strong motivation for the participants.

Abby's comments about her children are telling. She has responded to a question about her motivation and her reply was a forthright one:

It's definitely my children. I always think if I didn't have my children I wouldn't be here because I wouldn't have gone to playcentre and I wouldn't be here.

Having a daughter with a special need impacted upon Isobel's strengths. She talked about her learning from her daughter's disability and the need to incorporate that learning in teacher training. It seemed that Isobel had transformed this risk into a considerable asset.

Mere described resilience as an ability to *keep going, survival, handling things* and that linked with her comment about children and her motivation for her training and her ability to 'keep going':

Probably with what I went through when I was teenager and that. I think that I've got an empathy with kids and I know when what's happening at the time because kids go through the same thing generation after generation.

I note my comment about my children toward the end of my story. I highlight the changes and differences in me as a result of their arrival. It would appear that taking care of children and providing for them has the potential to enhance resiliency for all. Maybe there are powerful lessons here for the New Zealand male! I believe that all of the female case study participants drew much of their strength from their children. The children became a strong motivating force for them all. I am not suggesting that Raymond and I feel any less for our children, but rather that the females visibly and powerfully received much of their strength from, and gave many of their strengths to, their children.

3. *Class Divisions Are Present in New Zealand*

Abby related a story, which linked the constructs of race and class and together presented an interlocking oppression for her. She talked about having a problem when she went into a shop with her children and felt uncomfortable about the way that the shop staff and other customers look at her children. In some cases she said that shop staff would serve another, Pakeha child, despite her child waiting. Abby discussed her way of dealing with such an issue – *I go, excuse me, she was there first*. This reaction to a particular form of covert racism and classism seemed to indicate a risk translated into an asset. Here, race, class and gender had conspired to produce a resiliency trait but one that was only possible because of Abby's growing maturity. The modelling she provided for her daughter seemed highly appropriate.

Eva made mention of the 'classism of the academy'. She talked about public perception of the bilingual degree:

There are many misconceptions out in public of what we actually do ... and that our degree is not worth the paper it is written on ... and we're only learning Māori and things like that.

Her response indicated her resilience:

We've only just started to push our image and getting it through to our own students in the bilingual unit we're not second-class. We're bloody higher

than that. We can go out there and teach both mainstream and bilingual so obviously we're better qualified people.

Eva's story of 'classism' seemed to reflect part of Law's (1995) writings in *This Fine Place So Far From Home*. What Eva and her classmates and lecturers were doing that was different from Law's experience though, was to celebrate that difference of race and class in teaching pedagogy and in doing so build strengths and resilience for all in their learning community.

4. The Search for, and understanding of Māori Identity but also the acknowledgement of the Pakeha World

A respected Māori Elder in my community talks about the need for Māori to walk comfortably in 'both worlds'. This ability seemed to enhance the assets and develop the strengths of a number of the case study participants.

Raymond seemed to place a lot of store on his heritage and whakapapa. He identified with a North Island Māori tribe of which he was obviously very proud: *I think that we came from sort of raw beginnings. We are just hard workers and that sort of thing with a vision to go further I guess...* But he also talked about Pakeha: *I've learned a lot of things from them (Pakeha), mostly to do with their quality.*

His comment about being able to achieve which related to a story handed down to him, appears to be crucial to his understanding of, and operationalising, resilience:

...My people have always said to me...you're no different from them, you can do what they can do...When I come into situations which are challenging I've sort of said well, if you can do it...so can I ...that's to me resilience.

Raymond talks at length about his wife, who is Māori, being adopted by Pakeha parents.

Eva talked about the loss of her father at early age: *It's (the death of her father) also strength. I see it as a loss because ...he wasn't able to teach me the things I want to*

know now and I'm clawing my way to find out about my Māori heritage, but I see that as a strength because it gives me the motivation to do it and I want to find out about the kind of person he was and his family and things like that. She continued, and elaborated upon her views: *...I can grow as person through learning my roots and things and I know that from the person I was like at intermediate school and high school, and the person I am now.* Significantly, the 'Pakeha side' was also important to Eva: *I don't think it's totally unique because I've done the same, like tracing my Whakapapa and that with my mother's side as well and that's given me just as much sense of self worth as my Māori side.*

Eva appeared to gain strength from this search, which was conducted on both sides. Her understanding of her 'Māori side' didn't appear to be diminished in any way by her parallel search and understanding of, her 'Pakeha side'.

Nora talked at length about her spirituality as a way of getting 'through'. She described this focus as *bringing wairua into my body*. She described her spirituality as:

So that I'm able to sit down because I don't find academic stuff stimulating – the jargon and all that, I find that hard to deal with because it's just not me.

Linda Smith, (1992:43) suggests that the spiritual discourse for Māori women incorporates more than just the dimension of wairua. She suggests that it is a

struggle over world-view, over Māori knowledge, over history...It is a discourse, which is beginning the task of connecting what we have been taught about the past with, how we live in the present.

Nora's strength, in part, appeared to come from her spirituality and her ability to make legitimate this part of her.

5. *The Importance of Kohanga Reo*

A number of the case study participants made mention of the importance of Kohanga Reo in their lives. Isobel, for example stated: *I got involved with Kohanga ...because I needed to find out who I was and In the Kohanga it's child driven you know ...doing Kohanga and seeing that there was a different perspective to how children learned and I think I sort of looked at that as maybe if that was the way I had been taught when I was younger I would have had a different (life)*

Smith, (1992) suggests that out of Kohanga Reo has emerged an active and politically aware generation of Māori women. She continues: *they (Māori women) have experienced the struggle at a hands on, day to day level.*

Again, this story appears to have contributed toward Isobel's strengths. Perhaps this 'strength' contributes to Gilgun's self agency.

6. *The need to help and repay others and provide a service*

Milstein, et al (2000) highlights a construct of resilience as that of the need to help and support others. All case study participants highlighted this need:

- *I wanted them (my nephews, nieces as well as immediate family) to be set up the same way ...so that they could concentrate on their studies and be the very best they could be. (Nora)*
- *I always think if I didn't have my children I wouldn't be here now because I wouldn't have gone to Kohanga... (Abby)*
- *I'm just trying to give them what I missed out on. (Eva)*

In all cases the growing ability to meet their children's and whānau's needs appeared to help in developing the strength of all the participants. Studying and gaining a qualification was integral to this growing self-confidence. It seemed that many issues could be pushed to one side to help reach the greater goal for children. I feel the same myself when I reflect upon my own, now adult, children. The legacy that will be left for them, I think replicates many of the case study participant's stories where the thing that

you want for yourself is caught powerfully by your children. It should be noted that all six themes do not stand on their own, but rather are 'sub sets' of each other.

A theme which seemed to run through each participant's story and the autobiographical story and which was reflected in each of the described themes, seemed to be that of self agency as described by Gilgun, (1999).

It seemed to me that the following comments from the case study participants reflected the concept of self-agency but had their genesis in the link between their individual experiences and the prevailing social structure of race, class and gender. Unlike the majority of race, class and gender studies though, these comments reflected an ability to reflect on experience and structure and despite the risks, develop assets. The comments that reflect this notion include:

- *... That training to be a teacher, I'm going to be able to go out there and well that gives me a lot of strength as a person and as a Māori person especially. (Eva)*
- *Well, I think that resilience is on your own, you've got to do it on your own, you've got to have the strength inside to do it, because that person could disappear tomorrow, could die or something could happen that you're not friends anymore. So it's got to be you. (Mere)*
- *I needed to help change my family. My goals that I'd set weren't going to happen at home behind the pots and pans at the Marae and this is what I've done to change it for myself and my family to come to Teachers' College. (Nora)*
- *...I put up with that for a whole year and then I suddenly, I don't know, something just said, it's time to get out there and do what you need to do – what you want to do. (Isobel)*

A Final Summary

How then, do race, class and gender impact upon resilience? It seems that this study, rather than provide answers, may be able to provide some indicators and perspectives for future debate and dialogue.

- Whānau seem to be crucial to the development of resilience whether this be in the Māori or Pakeha world. This would seem to reflect Milstein's (2000) concept of 'providing unconditional support' as crucial as a resiliency building block.
- The need to hold, and maintain, consistently high expectations of all learners. This construct however, needs to be considered in cultural terms. In other words, there is a need to place kapa haka on the same 'high expectations' scale as the more traditional schools subjects of literacy and numeracy. Also, the need to present high family expectations seems crucial – work needs to be done to present a positive expectation across class boundaries.
- Children seemed to provide an incentive for all participants to want to achieve.
- Across all race, class and gender 'lines' is Gilgun's (1999) concept of self-agency. Mere makes comment *about waking up one morning and needing to get on with things!* Although this study has attempted to identify links between race, gender and class and resilience, there still seems to be an almost indefinable quality of strength within some people. I am sure that all the identified themes assisted the case study participants to become strong(er) but equally that inner strength so hard to define, resided within all participants.
- How power is exercised in New Zealand is crucially important. It seemed that many of the case study participants lacked a vision of what they could provide for society and what society could provide for them. Abby talked about wanting to leave secondary school and go to an unemployment benefit. It appeared that the trilogy of race, class and gender had conspired against her at a particular stage. She had found the strength to recover – others have not had that capacity.
- The need to know your whakapapa or your roots, or to whom you belong appears to be crucial in terms of personal resilience building. Both Isobel and Eva described their searches and how they gained strength from making

connections with their whānau. Isobel's dislocation from her birth family appeared to be a profound issue for her – although I would describe her now as resilient, I wonder if an earlier knowledge of her birth father, would have allowed her to build up her considerable strengths at a much earlier age. Raymond talked about his wife's need not to know at the present, about her Māori parentage, as a mark of respect for her adoptive parents. Importantly, in the case of Raymond's wife, the desire still seemed to be there to know about parentage – but it would happen at a later and more appropriate time.

CHAPTER SIX - THE IMPLICATIONS OF THIS RESEARCH

This chapter will highlight implications for practice, the limitations of this research and implications for further research. I will link the summaries of the themes, to include the Milstein and Henry, (2000) model, as reported in chapter five, to implications for practice.

Implications for Practice

The bilingual teaching programme in which the case study participants were studying, provided the framework for the development of positive and powerful attitudes toward teaching and both Pakeha and the Māori culture. More importantly, it allowed for the expression of, and the development of self. These strengths will contribute toward a more powerful and resilient teaching force better able to meet the needs of Māori and all learners. I think it is important that such programmes continue – maybe even with higher Ministry of Education subsidy if necessary.

An emphasis on the teaching of ‘classism’ and its effects may also be important – not just an understanding of socio-economic differences but class in its wider sense and the impact of class upon tertiary students. I believe that teacher-training providers need to consider the development of specific programmes, which focus on the impact of class upon their students.

I also argue the case for the teaching for resilience within postgraduate programmes. An ideal vehicle would be within Educational Management and Leadership programmes. These programmes could have as an academic base, Milstein’s and Henry’s (2000) six building blocks for resiliency, but be reconfigured to include the importance of whānau, the importance of addressing the issues of classism and Gilgun’s (1999) concept of self agency.

The Workshops

I outline a framework for a sequential series of three workshops, which could be developed within tertiary institutions, to assist in developing student resiliency. These workshops would acknowledge the constructs of race, class and gender and use the Milstein and Henry model to underpin the workshop structure. I argue that these workshops be made available for all – I hesitate to use the word compulsory!

All workshops would be designed to be interactive and, have as their major focus, the exploration of resilience and its effect on the constructs of race, class and gender. I argue that an important philosophical tenant is the relationship of resilience with the use of power. This link would be explored within the workshops.

The workshops would have the following six building blocks underpinning the race, class and gender emphasis, (Milstein and Henry, 2000):

- The increasing of social bonding
- The setting of clear and consistent boundaries
- The teaching of life skills
- The provision of care and support
- Setting and communicating high standards
- Opportunities provided for meaningful participation

Workshop One

This workshop is designed to introduce participants to race, class and gender dynamics in the classroom and is based on material developed by Cannon, (2001). Participants would be encouraged to accept the following ground rules:

- Acknowledge that racism, classism, sexism and other institutionalised forms of oppression do exist
- Acknowledge that one mechanism of institutionalised racism, classism and the like is that we are all systematically misinformed about our own group and about members of other groups. This is true for members of privileged and oppressed groups
- Agree not to blame victims for the conditions of their lives

- Actively pursue information about our groups and those of other
- Share information about our own groups with other members of the class, and never demean, devalue, or in any way put people down for their experiences
- Agree to combat actively the myths and stereotypes about our own groups and other groups so that we can break down the walls that prohibit group cooperation and group gain
- Create a safe atmosphere for open discussion
- To reflect consistently on the use/misuse of power in their institution

Workshop Two

The first exercise in this workshop is designed to help participants become more acquainted with the six resiliency factors in a race, class and gender context. Participants will be asked to identify and record factors of race, class and gender that affect resiliency in their lives; under the following headings:

- Prosocial bonding
- Clear and consistent boundaries
- Life skills
- Caring and Support
- High expectations
- Meaningful participation

Secondly, participants will be asked to share with other individuals their thoughts about how each factor exists in their lives. Others will be asked to do the same for the participant.

Thirdly, participants will be asked to think about ways in which they can promote resiliency in others that they know and care about. In particular they will be asked to describe how they try to provide support in terms of whānau for each of the resiliency factors.

Workshop Three

1. Group members will be asked to identify what their institution is presently doing well to promote resiliency among students, educators and community members
2. Group members will next be asked to identify what their institution is doing OK but could do better to promote resiliency
3. Last, group members will be asked to identify things they know about that can promote resiliency but are not presently the way things are being done in the institution

Underpinning this workshop will be the concepts developed in workshop one and again participants will be encouraged to focus on issues around the constructs of race, class and gender and above all the importance of relationships.

Limitations of the Research

As stated in the methodology section, case study research needs to be treated with caution. In this study for example, data was gathered from just seven participants. Although the data gathered was rich, extrapolating it out to themes should be treated with caution.

I acknowledge also that the case study participants were not a representative group from the wider community representing the constructs of race, class and gender, but rather a group of people who had discovered that they could achieve, were enjoying that experience and were determined to pass their attitudes on to their whānau and family and friends.

Implications for Further Research

I feel that this thesis is 'just the tip of the iceberg'. Greater in-depth study would benefit the more specific causes of resilience within different races, classes and gender. For example, time spent with a family exploring the links between class and expectations would be of major value and could allow an even greater in-depth analysis of this construct of resilience.

It is encouraging to note that the New Zealand Ministry of Education, (2000) has now removed its statement *Barriers to Learning* from the current National Administrative Guidelines. Unfortunately the term 'at risk' is still present which suggests to me a deficit model in operation rather than a strengths model based about the notion of resilience. More focussed research needs to be conducted in New Zealand into why people succeed against the 'odds'. This research has identified a number of important strengths that could be further explored; for example the link between self-agency and whānau. More in-depth research may discover or highlight further links and provide the basis for a stronger teaching programme built on the strengths that people have and can develop.

What then for the construct of resilience and race, class and gender in New Zealand? A bicultural perspective of resilience has much to commend it with its emphasis on whānau and whakapapa, and Pakeha New Zealand could be asking what can be shared across cultures. Acknowledging the strengths inherent in all classes and races may just help develop a greater resilience in all New Zealanders.

Maybe the most significant impact of race, class and gender on the individual's resilience therefore, is to allow for a greater understanding of all our strengths.

REFERENCES

- Abbs, P. (1974). *Autobiography in education*. London: HEB.
- Apple, M. (1995). *Education and power*. New York, Routledge.
- Arlidge, Jane. (2000). Constructivism: Is anyone making meaning in New Zealand adult and vocational education? In *New Zealand journal of adult learning*, 28 (1), 33-49.
- Aron, R. (1969). Two definitions of class. In Beteille, A. (Ed.). *Social inequity*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.
- Bangert-Downs, R. (1988). The effects of school-based substance abuse education. In *Journal of drug education*, 18 (3), 1-9.
- Bain, B. (Ed.). (1997) The international resilience project: findings from the research and the effectiveness of interventions. In *Psychology and education in the 21st century: Proceedings of the 54th annual convention of the international council of psychologists*. Edmonton: ICPress, 1997, 118-128. Available: <http://www.circ.uab.edu/cpages/resil1.htm> (1999, October 28).
- Bell, Avril. & Carpenter, Vicki. (1994). In Coxon, E., Jenkins, K., Marshall, J. & Massey, L. (Eds.). *The politics of learning and teaching in Aotearoa/New Zealand*. Palmerston North: Dunmore Press.
- Bernard, B. (1999). A framework for practice: Tapping innate resilience. In *Resiliency in action*. Berkeley, California. Available: <http://www.qolsandiego.net/docs/benard%20Framework%20resilience.htm> (1999, October 28).
- Bishop, R. & Glynn, T. (2000). Kaupapa Māori Messages. In *Set: Research information for teachers*. No. 1.
- Blankership, K. (1998). A race, class and gender analysis of thriving. In *Journal of social issues*. Summer. Available: http://www.findarticles.com/cf_dls/m0341/2_54/53489958/print.jhtml (2001, June 5).
- Bondy, Elizabeth. & McKenzie, Jim. (1999). Resilience building and social reconstructionist teaching: A first-year teacher's story. In *The elementary school journal*. November, 100 (2).
- Borgen, Jen. & Katzmann, K. (1997). Defining gender. In *Geography and gender*.

- Available: <http://typhoon.sdsu.edu/740/gender.html> (2001, October 28).
- Bourdieu, P. & Passeron, J.C. (1977). *Reproduction in education, society and culture*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Bragg, Rick. (1997). *Redbirds. Memories from the South*. London, Harvill Press.
- Brown, Rita Mae. (1974). The last straw. In Charlotte Brunch and Nancy Myron Charlotte. (Eds.). *Class and feminism*. Baltimore: Diana Press.
- Caffarella, R.S. (1992). Psychosocial development of women: linkages to teaching and leadership in adult education. Information Series No. 350. Columbus: *ERIC Clearinghouse on adult, career, and vocational education*. (ED 354 109).
- Cannon, Lynn Weber. (2001). Groundrules for fostering positive race, class and gender dynamics in the classroom. In *Feminist pedagogy: Resources and tools*. Department of Women's Studies, The Ohio State University. Available: <http://womens-studies.ohio-state.edu/pedagogy/groundrules2.htm> (2001, October 28).
- Cardus, Neville. (1950). *Second innings*. London: Collins.
- Cardus, Neville. (1956). *Autobiography*. London: Collins.
- Chenail, Ronald. (1997). Keeping things plumb in qualitative research. In *The qualitative report*, 3 (3), September.
- Chesla, Catherine, A. (1999). Becoming resilient: Skill development in couples living with non-Insulin dependent diabetes. In McCubbin, H., Thompson, E., Thompson, A. and Futrell, J. (Eds.). (1999). *The dynamics of resilient families*. London: Sage Publications.
- Clements, P. (2001). Autobiographical research and emergence of the fictive voice. In Soler, J., Craft, A. and Burgess, H., (Eds.). *Teacher development: Exploring our own practice*. London: Paul Chapman Publishing.
- Coordinating Council on Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, (2001). *Defining resilience*. Available: http://ojjdp.ncjrs.org/council/res_defin.html (2001, January 18).
- Conway, M. (1990). *Autobiographical memory*. New Jersey: Open University Press.
- Coxon, E., Jenkins, K., Marshall, J. & Massey, L. (1994). (Eds.). *The politics of learning and teaching in Aotearoa –New Zealand*. Palmerston North, Dunmore Press.

- Cuadraz, G. & Uttal, L. (1999). Intersectionality and in-depth interviews: Methodological strategies for analyzing race, class and gender. In *Race, gender and class*, 6 (3), 156-186.
- Daly, Kerry. (1999). Crisis of genealogy: Facing the challenges of infertility. In McCubbin, H., Thompson, E., Thompson, A. and Futrell, J. (Eds.). (1999) *The dynamics of resilient families*. London: Sage Publications.
- Danaher, Geoff., Schirato, Tony. & Webb, Jen. (2000). *Understanding foucault*. St Leonards: Allen and Unwin.
- Davenport, Ruth. (2001). *Student profile – MMU*. Available: <http://www.mmu.ac.uk/hss/sis/profiles04.html> (2001, June 30).
- Dirling, Joanne. (1999). Inclusion: Enhancing resilience. In, *Preventing school failure*. Spring.
- Education Review Office. (1997). *Students at risk: Barriers to learning*. 7, Winter. Available: <http://www.ero.govt.nz/Publications/eers1997/97no7hl.htm> (2001, October 26).
- Entwistle, Harold. (1978). *Class, culture and education*. Cambridge: Methuen.
- Findsen, Brian. (1999). Freire and adult education: Principles and practice. In Roberts, P. (Ed.). Paulo Freire, *Politics and pedagogy*. Palmerston North: Dunmore Press.
- Foley, G. (ed). (1995). *Understanding adult education and training*. St Leonards, NSW: Allen and Unwin.
- Frankenberg, W. (1987). *Fifth international conference: Early identification of children at risk: Resiliency factors in prediction*. Denver, CO: University of Colorado.
- Freire, P. (1996). *Letters to Cristina*. London: Routledge.
- Garmezy, N. (1974). Children at risk: The search for the antecedents of schizophrenia. Part 1. Conceptual models and research methods. *Schizophrenia bulletin*, 8, 14-90.
- Gibbs, Anita. (1997). Focus groups. In *Social research update*. Issue No 19. Guilford: Department of Sociology, University of Guildford. Available: <http://www.soc.surrey.ac.uk/sru/SRU19.html> (2001, January 26).
- Gilgun, Jane. (1999). Mapping resilience as process among adults with childhood adversities. In McCubbin, H., Thompson, E., Thompson, A., Futrell, J. (Eds.). (1999). *The dynamics of resilience families*. California: Sage Publications.

- Gimenez, Martha, E. (2001). Marxism, and class, gender, and race: Rethinking the trilogy. In *Race, gender and class*, 8 (2), 23-33. Available: www.sunu.edu/sunorgc (2001, July 24).
- Glaser, B.G. & Strauss, A.L., (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company.
- Golby, Barbara, J. & Bretherton, I. (1999). Resilience in postdivorce mother-child relationships. In McCubbin, H., Thompson, A., Futrell, J. (Eds.). (1999). *The dynamics of resilience families*. London: Sage Publications.
- Gordon, E. & Song, L.D., (1994). Variations in the experience of resilience. In M. Wang & E. Gordon (Eds.). *Educational resilience in inner-city America*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Gordon, E. & Wang, M. (Eds.). (1994). *Educational resilience in inner-city America*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Grotberg, Edith. (1996). *The international resilience project. Findings from the research and the effectiveness of interventions*. Civitan International Research Centre, UAB. Available: <http://www.circ.uab.edu/cpages/resil1.htm> (1999, October 28).
- Hall, Joanne, M. (1999). Marginalization revisited: Critical, postmodern, and liberation perspectives. In *Advances in nursing science*, 22 (2), 88-102.
- Hamel, J., Dufor, S. & Fortin, D. (1993). *Case study methods*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Hart, Alexandra., Gordon, Sharon. & Habl, Sophia. (1997). What is race? In *Geography and race*. Available: <http://typhoon.sdsu.edu/740/race.html> (2001, October 28).
- Henderson, N. & Milstein, M.N. (1996). *Resiliency in schools*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin.
- Hellison, D.R. (1995). *Teaching responsibility through physical education*. Champaign. IL. Human Kinetics.
- Herman, Tom. (1997). What is class? In *Geography and class*. Available: <http://typhoon.sdsu.edu/geo740/classin.html> (2001, June 23).
- Hohepa, Margie. (1997) Te Kohanga Reo: Risk breaking, risk taking. In Nicola Taylor & Anne Smith, (Eds.). *Enhancing Children's Potential: Minimising Risk and Maximising Resiliency. Proceedings of the children's issues centre, second child and family policy conference*. July, Dunedin, New Zealand.
- hooks, bell. (1984). *Feminist theory from margin to center*. Boston: South End Press.

- hooks, bell. (2000). Learning in the shadow of race and class. In *The chronicle of higher education*, 47 (12).
- Howard, S., Dryden, J. & Johnson, B. (1999). Childhood resilience: Review and critique of literature. In *Oxford review of education*, 25 (3).
- Imel, Susan. (1998). Race and Gender in Adult Education. In *ERIC Clearinghouse. Adult, career and vocational education. Trends and issues alerts*.
- Irwin, Kathie. (1992). Becoming an academic: Contradictions and dilemmas of a Māori feminist. In Middleton, S., and Jones, A. (Eds.). *Women and education in Aotearoa 2*. Wellington, Bridget Williams.
- Kerka, Sandra. (1993). Women, human development, and learning. In *ERIC Clearinghouse. Adult, career and vocational education*. Columbus OH.
- Kerka, Sandra. (1998). Career development and gender, race and class. In *ERIC Digest* No. 199. Available: <http://ericacve.org/docgen.asp?tbl=digests&ID=52> (2000, December 13).
- Lauder, H., Hughes, D. & Taberner, S.J. (1985). Education, class and inequality in New Zealand: A preliminary report, *Delta* 36, 31-37.
- Law, Carolyn Leste. (1995). *This fine place so far from home*. Washington: Temple University Press.
- Leach, Linda. (2000). Master of Education Programme: Course 8403: *Adult learning: myths and realities. 2000 study guide. Module one: Adult learning theories*. Wellington: College of Education, Massey University.
- Lifton, R. (1994). *The protean self: Human resilience in an age of fragmentation*. New York: Basic Books.
- Lincoln, Y.S. & Guba, E.G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverley Hills: Sage.
- LIS 391D.1 (1997). *The case study as a research method*. Available: <http://fiat.gslis.utexas.edu/~ssoy/usesusers/1391d1b.htm> (2001, February 5).
- Loach, Ken. (Director). (1997). *My name is Joe*. (Film) London, England.
- Lubienski, Sarah. (1997). Class matters: A preliminary excursion. In *National council of teachers of mathematics yearbook*. Reston.
- Luttrell, W. (1989). Working - class women's ways of knowing: Effects of gender, race, and class. In *Sociology of Education* 62: 33-46.
- McClintlock, Anne. (1995). *Imperial leather: Race, gender, and sexuality in the colonial context*. New York: Routledge.

- McCubbin, H., Thompson, E., Thompson, A. & Futrell, J. (Eds.). (1999). The dynamics of resilient families. *Resiliency in families series*. London: Sage Publications.
- McHoul, Alec. & Grace, Wendy. (1998). *A Foucault Primer. Discourse, power and the subject*. Dunedin: University of Otago Press.
- McMillan, J.H. & Reed, D.F. (1994). At risk students and resiliency: Factors contributing to academic success. In *Clearing House*, 67 (3), 137-140.
- Manciaux, M., (1995). *De la vulnerabilite a la resilience: du concept a l'action*. Paper presented at the Symposio internacional on Stress e violencia, Lisbon, Portugal, September 27-30, 1995.
- Māori Language Commission, (1996). *Te Matatiki. Contemporary Māori words*. Auckland: Oxford University Press.
- Masten, Ann. (2001). Unknown Title. In *American Psychologist*. March: 228-235.
- Masten, Ann. (1994). Resilience in individual development: Successful adaptation despite risk and adversity. In Wang, M. and Gordon, E. (Eds.). (1994). *Educational resilience in inner-city America*. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, New Jersey.
- Masten, A.S., Best, K.M. & Garmezy, N. (1990). Resilience and development: Contributions from the study of children who overcome diversity. *Development and Psychopathology*, 2, 425-444.
- Massey University Human Ethics Committee, (2000). *The code of ethical conduct for teaching and research involving human subjects*. Palmerston North, Massey University.
- Maykut, P., & Morehouse, R. (1994). *Beginning qualitative research. A philosophic and practical guide*. Washington, DC: The Falmer Press.
- Meder, Helen, J. (1999). Surviving the demise of a way of life: Stress and resilience in Northeastern commercial fishing families. In McCubbin, H., Thompson, E., Thompson, A. & Futrell, J. (Eds.). (1999). *The dynamics of resilient families*. London: Sage Publications.
- Mezirow, Jack. (1998). On critical reflection. In *Adult education quarterly*. Washington, Spring.
- Milstein, M. & Henry, A. (2000). *Spreading resiliency. Making it happen for schools and communities*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.
- Ministry of Education, (2000). *National administrative guidelines*. Wellington: Learning Media.

- Neumann, A. & Peterson, Penelope. (Eds.). (1997). *Learning from our lives: Women, research, and autobiography in education*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Pasternak, R. & Martinez, K. (1996). Resiliency: What is it and how can correctional educational practices encourage its development? In *Preventing school failure*, 40 (2), 63-66.
- Patterson, Jerry. & Patterson, Janice. (2001). Resilience in the face of imposed changes. In *Principal leadership*, 1 (6), 55-55.
- Pere, R.R. (1988). Te Wheke: Whaia Te Maramatanga me te Aroha, in Middleton, S. (Ed.). *Women and education in Aotearoa*. Wellington, Bridget Williams.
- Pihama, L. & Mara, D. (1994). Gender relations in education. In *The politics of learning and teaching in Aotearoa-New Zealand*. Palmerston North: Dunmore Press.
- Price, Derek. (2001). The Praxis of critical empiricism: Race, class gender and social justice. In *Race, class and gender*, 8 (2), 94-115.
- Project Resilience, (1999). *Child, adolescent, and adult phases of the resiliencies*. Available: <http://www.projectresilience.com/devdefs.htm> (2000, November 22)
- Reynolds, M.C. (1994). Special education as a resilience-related venture. In Wang, M. & Gordon, E. (eds) *Educational resilience in inner-city America*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Riemer, Andrew. (1993). *The Habsburg Café*. Sydney: Harper Collins.
- Schwartz, H. & Jacobs, J. (1979). *Qualitative sociology: A method to the madness*. New York: Free Press.
- Searlemann, A. & Herrmann, D. (1994). *Memory from a broader perspective*. New York: McGraw Hill.
- Siebert, A. (ed). (2000). From homeless to Harvard – Liz Murray’s story. In *Thrive net Story of the Month – June 2000*. Available: <http://www.thrivenet.com/stories/stories00/stry0006.html> (2000, November 22).
- Simmons, H. (1980). *Towards a science of the singular: Essays about case study in Educational research and evaluation*. Norwich, UK: University of East Anglia, Centre for Applied Research in Education.
- Smith, Linda. (1992). Māori women: Discourses, projects and Mana Wahine. In, Middleton, S. and Jones, A. (Eds.). *Women and education in Aotearoa*. Wellington: Bridget Williams Books.
- Speirs, Ann. (2000). *Letter to the Otago Daily Times Editor*. Dunedin: Allied Press. 20 July.

- Stake, R.E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Strauss, A. & Corbin, J. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques*. Newbury Park: Sage.
- Stalker, J. (1994). Discourse, power relations and male bias: Reframing the field. In Hymans, M., Armstrong, J. & Anderson, E. (Eds.). *Proceedings of the 35th annual adult education research conference proceedings*, Knoxville: University of Tennessee.
- Tellis, Winston. (1997). Introduction to case study. In *The qualitative report*, 3 (2), July. Available: <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR3-4/tellis1.html> (2000, November 7).
- Thompson, Elizabeth. (1999). Resiliency in families with a member facing aids. In McCubbin, H., Thompson, E., Thompson, A. & Futrell, J. (Eds.). *The dynamics of resilient families*. London: Sage Publications.
- Thrupp, M. (1999). *Schools making a difference: Let's be realistic*. London: Open University Press.
- Tisdell, E. J. (1993). Interlocking systems of power, privilege, and oppression in adult higher education classes. In *Adult education quarterly* 43 (4).
- Tripp, Rhonda. (1970). *The international thesaurus of quotations*. London: George Allen and Unwin.
- Vaillant, George, E. (1993). *The wisdom of the ego*. London: Harvard University Press.
- Van Maanen, J. (1988). *Tales of the field: On writing ethnography*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Van Maanen, J., Dabbs, J. M. Jr. & Faulkner, R.R. (1982). *Varieties of qualitative research*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Wainwright, David. (1997). Can sociological research be qualitative, critical and valid? In, *The qualitative report*, 3 (4), December. Available: <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR3-2/wain.html> (2000, September 8).
- Wallerstein, N. & Bernstein, E. (1988) Empowerment education: Freire's ideas adapted to health education. In *Health education quarterly*, 15 (4), 379-394.
- Wang, M., Haertel, G. & Walberg, H. (1994). Educational resilience in inner cities. In, Wang, M. & Gordon, E. (Eds.). *Educational resilience in inner city America*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

- Wang, M., Haertel, G. & Walberg, H. (date unknown). Educational resilience: An emergent construct. In *Spotlight on student success*, No. 105. Available: <http://thunder.ocis.temple.edu/~aiglesia/105.html> (1999, October 21).
- Wang, M., Haertel, G. & Walberg, H. (1994). Educational resilience in inner cities. In Wang, M. & Gordon, E. (Eds.). *Educational resilience in inner city America*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Wang, M., Haertel, G. & Walberg, H. (1997). Fostering educational resilience: What do we know. In *Spotlight on student success*, No. 308. Available: <http://www.temple.edu/LSS/spot308.htm> (1999, November 11).
- Weiner, Gaby. (1997). *New era or old times: Class, gender and education*. Paper presented at the British Educational Research Association Annual Conference. September 11-14: University of York. Available: <http://www.leeds.ac.uk/educol/documents/000000357.htm> (2001, March 23).
- Werner, E.E. (1984). Resilient children. *Young children*, 40 (1), 68-72.
- Werner, E. & Smith, R.S. (1982). *Vulnerable but invincible: A longitudinal study of resilient children and youth*. New York: McGraw Hill.
- West, D.J. & Farrington, D.P. (1973). Who becomes delinquent? *Second report of the Cambridge study in delinquent development*. London: Heinemann.
- Willis, Arlette Ingram, (1998). In their own words: Stories of the interconnectedness of life, teaching and research. In *Reading research quarterly*, Oct-Dec.
- World Socialist Web Site, (1999). *Sharp decline in number of working class students in New Zealand*. International Committee of the Fourth International Group. Available: <http://www.wsws.org/articles/1999/apr1999/nz2-a20.shtml> (2001, February 19).
- Wylie, C. (1988). Fair enough? *Set*, No.1. Item 9.
- Yin, R. (1984). *Case study research: Design and methods*. (1st ed.) Beverley Hills, CA: Sage Publishing.
- Yin, R. (1989a). *Case study research: Design and methods*. (Revised ed.) Beverley Hills, CA: Sage Publishing.
- Yin, R. (1989b). *Interorganizational partnerships in local job creation and job training efforts*. Washington, DC: COSMOS Corp.
- Yin, R. (1993). *Applications of case study research*. Beverley Hills, CA: Sage Publishing.

- Yin, Robert K. (1994). *Case study research: Design and methods*. (2nd ed.) London: Sage Publications.
- Zepke, N. (1999). Introduction to adult learning cultures. In, Zepke, N., Knight, M., Leach, L. & Viskovic, A. (Eds.). *Adult learning cultures*. Wellington: Wellington Polytechnic Press.

Appendix 1

Date

.....

.....

Dear.....

Research Project: Mapping Resilience as Process in an Adult Learners' Bilingual Teaching Class: The Role of Race, Class and Gender.

I am writing to you to ask your permission for your involvement in a research thesis on adult resilience.

My name is Geoff Lee and I am enrolled in a Masterate in Education at Massey University at Wellington.

The purpose of the study is to inquire into the role of race, class and gender in mapping resilience in the adult learner.

I would like to gain your perceptions of how resilience is developed by conducting up to three in-depth interviews with you. Any documentation or artefacts, which could add to my understanding of your story, would also be gratefully accepted and would be returned to you at the conclusion of the study.

Interviews

The three interviews are each expected to take between 45 and 60 minutes. The interviews will be tape-recorded. At the conclusion of the study all tapes and written notes will be destroyed.

Confidentiality

A person who will sign a confidentiality agreement will transcribe information that you provide in the interviews. All tapes and transcripts will be destroyed when the research has been completed.

I would like your permission to quote from your comments in this thesis. I will not identify individual people or our institution in the thesis.

Please note that your rights include the following:

- to decline participation
- to withdraw from the activity at any time
- to have privacy and confidentiality protected
- to turn off a recording device at any time
- to ask questions at any time
- to receive information about the outcome of the activity in an appropriate form

If you would like further information about the research please contact me:

Geoff Lee
Senior Lecturer, Educational Management,
Dunedin College of Education
Private Bag 1912
Dunedin

Phone (03) 4772381
Fax (03) 4771475
Email geoff.lee@dce.ac.nz

If you have concerns about the research, you could contact me at the above address. Alternatively, you may wish to contact my supervisors at Massey University at Wellington, Marg Gilling and Nick Zepke. Their telephone number is (04) 8012794. Marg's extension is 8662 and Nick's is 8730.

I hope that you will agree to participate in this project. Thank you for considering it.

Yours sincerely

Geoff Lee

Appendix 2

THESIS TOPIC: MAPPING RESILIENCE AS PROCESS IN AN ADULT LEARNERS' BILINGUAL TEACHING CLASS: THE ROLE OF RACE, CLASS AND GENDER.

CONSENT FORM

I have read the information sheet and have had the details of the study explained to me. My questions have been answered to my satisfaction, and I understand that I may ask further questions at any time.

I understand that I have the right to withdraw from the study at any time and to decline to answer or respond to any questions.

I agree to provide information to the researcher on the understanding that my name will not be used without my permission. (The information will only be used for this research and publication arising from this thesis)

I agree/do not agree to the interview being audio taped.

I also understand that I have the right to ask for the audio tape to be turned off at any time during the interview.

I agree to participate in this study under the conditions set out in the Information Sheet.

Signed:.....

Name:.....

Date:.....

Appendix 3

Interview Guide for First Set of Interviews and request for documentation and archival records.

Note that the development of this interview guide has been informed by Cuadraz and Uttal, (1999) work: *Intersectionality and In-Depth Interviews: Methodological Strategies for Analyzing Race, Class and Gender*. (see Chapter Three – Methodology)

Interview One/ Session One

- 1 Tell me about you – about your early life – your early life history.
- 2 Tell me what you understand resilience to be – what does the term mean to you?
- 3 What made you decide to train to be a teacher?
- 4 What sort of issues have you had to overcome to be where you are now?
- 5 What are your strengths – how have your strengths helped you to overcome any issues and problems for you?
- 6 How do you go about meeting challenges and resolving issues now? What helps you?
- 7 Tell me about individual rights and responsibilities – what do these terms mean to you?

Is there any of your documentation that you would be prepared to share with me that would help to explain your responses? This could include letters, written reports, formal studies, newspaper clippings etc

Are there any archival records that would help explain your responses? This could include personal records like teaching practice reports.

Interview Two/Session Two

- 1 Tell me about your early life – in particular talk to me about the effects of your socio-economic position or class position.
- 2 How has being a female impacted upon your training to be a teacher? What risks have there been for you and what strengths have you built up as a consequence of this training experience?
- 3 How has being Māori impacted upon your training to be a teacher? What risks have there been for you and what strengths have you built up?
- 4 Tell me about any links that you see between your social class, your gender and your race. What are the risks that you can think of and what are the strengths that you developed as a consequence of these intersections?

Interview Three/Session Three

- 1 Explore themes arising from the previous interviews – especially ‘issues’ that focus around ‘risks and resiliencies’.
- 2 Ask for participant comment about any issues – content, philosophy, methodology etc.

Appendix 4

PERSONAL DOCUMENTATION

NAME.....

I am interested in the ‘things’ that sustain you and help keep you ‘strong’. If you have time over the next weeks I would appreciate you completing this summary form. You may wish to complete a selected number of highlighted items. We could also take photographs to help highlight issues or items that are important to you.

If you have any documentation that could highlight your abilities and ‘make sense’ of your coping strategies I would appreciate it if I could borrow it briefly.

POETRY: *What kind of poetry do you like? Will you list your favourite poetry and are you prepared to attach any poetry you have written?*

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

MUSIC AND PERFORMING ARTS: What kind of music do you like? Tell me about your interest (if any) in the performing arts. Will you list your favourite pieces of music and performing arts, concerts etc?

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

FILM: What kind of films do you like? Tell me about your favourite films.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

SHOPPING: Tell me about where you shop.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

SPORT AND FITNESS AND LEISURE: Tell me about the sport you enjoy playing and watching. Tell me about fitness also.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

READING: Tell me about books that are important to you.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

FOOD: Tell me about food that you like and that is important to you.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

ABOUT YOU: What can you tell me about you? Anything that is important to you is important.

.....

.....

.....

[illegible]