

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**READING RECOVERY**  
**AS A SMALL GROUP INTERVENTION**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements

for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in Education at

Massey University

Palmerston North, New Zealand

by

Sandra Iversen

1997

## ABSTRACT

A small scale pilot study and a larger experimental study were undertaken to determine whether the Reading Recovery procedures could be successfully adapted for small group instruction. The purpose of the pilot study was to determine effective ways of working and to make recommended changes, if necessary, to the standard Reading Recovery lesson format. The experimental study was designed to see if these modifications would be as effective as the standard one to one Reading Recovery program. Both studies involved a high percentage of children for whom English was a second or third language.

Pilot study teachers, working with either two or three children, devised ways of working with children reading at the same instructional level and with children working at different instructional levels. The experimental study involved seventy five children. Fifty of these children were taught in a pair situation and twenty five were taught one to one. A wide battery of tests including the Observation Survey (Clay 1993), a word reading test and tests of phonological processing ability was administered to all children prior to commencing the program, at the end of their program, and at year end.

The results from both studies suggest that one to one Reading Recovery can be successfully modified for small group instruction, the preferred group size being two. Results from both studies indicated that by investing at most 27% more instructional time, the teachers could service 100% more children.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many people contributed to the success of this study.

First, I would like to thank the teachers who attended my course at the Auckland College of Education and who participated in the Pilot Study. Without their effort and dedication this study would not have got underway.

Secondly, I wish to extend my appreciation to Dr Marie Snow, the Title One Administrator in Immokalee Florida, who had the insight to realize that a program such as this would benefit the children in her care. It is impossible to quantify the dedication and commitment of the teachers who participated in the experimental study. Each one doubled his/her workload that year. For each one, the approach to instruction was different to that which they had been involved in before. This resulted in extra study as well as hard teaching. I thank them sincerely for going the extra mile with an open mind.

My gratitude and appreciation, as always, go to my supervisor Professor Bill Tunmer. I wish to thank him sincerely for his continued professional guidance, interest and encouragement throughout the study. My thanks also to Dr James Chapman for intervening on my behalf to overcome initial setbacks and for reading the final manuscript.

Finally I am indebted, as ever, to my husband, Greg, for his support, encouragement, patience and tolerance.

## Spelling Task

Student's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Student Number: \_\_\_\_\_

School: \_\_\_\_\_

Total Correct: \_\_\_\_\_

Date Tested: \_\_\_\_\_

Total Points: \_\_\_\_\_

Tester: \_\_\_\_\_



			Correct spelling (0 or 1)	Points (0 to 4)
1.	fat	My dog is too fat.	fat	_____
2.	fill	Please fill my glass.	fill	_____
3.	lump	He has a lump on his head.	lump	_____
4.	pop	Don't pop the balloon.	pop	_____
5.	bank	She put her money in the bank.	bank	_____
6.	side	He painted the side of his house.	side	_____
7.	hay	Cows like to eat hay.	hay	_____
8.	meat	Dogs like to eat meat.	meat	_____
9.	kick	She likes to kick the ball.	kick	_____
10.	hot	It was a hot day.	hot	_____
11.	pack	He put his book in the pack.	pack	_____
12.	yell	Never yell in the classroom.	yell	_____
13.	van	His father has a big van.	van	_____
14.	duck	She gave the duck some bread.	duck	_____
15.	jail	Robbers go to jail.	jail	_____
16.	bit	The cat bit her finger.	bit	_____
17.	cake	The children ate some cake.	cake	_____
18.	tight	His shoe is too tight.	tight	_____

**a b c d e f g h i j k l m n o p q r s t u v w x y :**

1 \_\_\_\_\_

10 \_\_\_\_\_

2 \_\_\_\_\_

11 \_\_\_\_\_

3 \_\_\_\_\_

12 \_\_\_\_\_

4 \_\_\_\_\_

13 \_\_\_\_\_

5 \_\_\_\_\_

14 \_\_\_\_\_

6 \_\_\_\_\_

15 \_\_\_\_\_

7 \_\_\_\_\_

16 \_\_\_\_\_

8 \_\_\_\_\_

17 \_\_\_\_\_

9 \_\_\_\_\_

18 \_\_\_\_\_

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Abstract	(ii)
Acknowledgments	(iii)
Table of Contents	(iv)
List of Tables	(xiv)
List of Figures	(xvi)
List of Appendices	(xvii)
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
Rationale	1
The Studies	2
Overview	3
Chapter 2: Review of the Literature	4
Introduction	4
Provision for At Risk Children	5
Early Intervention Programs	6
Analysis of Early Intervention Programs	7
Successful Early Intervention Programs	9
Reading Recovery	9
Philosophy, Orientation and Rationale	9
Program Structure and Content	10
Lesson Content	11
Instruction	12
Time	12
Assessment and Evaluation	13
Reading Materials	13
Teacher Qualifications, Education and Support	14

Eligibility Criteria	16
Success for All	17
Philosophy, Orientation and Rationale	17
Program Structure and Content	18
Lesson Content	18
Instruction	18
Time	19
Assessment and Evaluation	19
Reading Materials	19
Teacher Qualifications, Education and Support	20
Eligibility Criteria	20
The Boulder Project	21
Philosophy, Orientation and Rationale	21
Program Structure and Content	22
Lesson Content	22
Instruction	23
Time	23
Assessment and Evaluation	24
Reading Materials	24
Teacher Qualifications, Education and Support	25
Eligibility Criteria	25
Reading Writing Group (RWG)	25
Philosophy, Orientation and Rationale	25
Program Structure and Content	26
Lesson Content	26
Instruction	26
Time	27
Assessment and Evaluation	27
Reading Materials	27
Teacher Qualifications, Education and Support	28
Eligibility Criteria	28
Comparison of Four Successful Early Intervention Programs	28

Lesson Content	30
Instruction	31
Time	31
Assessment and Evaluation	32
Reading Materials	32
Teacher Qualifications, Education and Support	32
Eligibility Criteria	33
Children Excluded	33
Children from Non English Speaking Backgrounds	34
Teacher Expectations	35
Classroom and Family Support	36
Further Intervention Variables	36
Cost Effectiveness	37
Durable Results	38
A Framework of Factors Influencing Reading Development	40
Cognitive Factors in Reading Development	42
Emphasis on Language Prediction Skills and Phonological Recoding Skills	43
Phonological Processing Factors	44
Phonological Awareness	44
Phonological Awareness and Reading Acquisition	45
Phonological Awareness and Differences in Reading Acquisition	45
Cipher Knowledge	46
Onset and Rimes	47
Analogies and Learning New Words	49
An Interactive Analogy Model	50
Alternative Views of Orthographic Analogies	51
Analogies and Children Experiencing Difficulty with Reading	51
Phonological Processing and the Intervention Programs	52
Metacognitive Strategy Factors	54
Metacognitive Knowledge	55
Teaching Metacognitive Strategies	56
Metacognitive Strategies and Children at Risk	57

Metacognitive Strategies and the Intervention Programs	57
Exposure to Print Factors	59
Exposure to Print and Reading Achievement	59
Exposure to Print and Literacy Learning	60
Listening Vocabulary Acquisition and Concept Formation	60
Conventions of Print	61
Oral and Book Language Expectation	61
Phonological Awareness	62
Letter Name and Cipher Knowledge	63
Vocabulary Acquisition	63
The Reciprocal Relationship of Learning to Read and Exposure to Print	63
Exposure to Print and the Intervention Programs	64
Instructional Settings	67
The Model of Assisted Learning	68
The Zone of Proximal Development	68
Interaction Between the Instructional Setting and Content Factors	70
Instructional Settings and the Intervention Programs	76
Questions Unanswered	79
The Present Study	80
Chapter 3: The Pilot Study	84
Introduction	84
The Existing Format of the One to One Reading Recovery Lesson	85
Rereading of Two or More Familiar Books	86
Rereading Yesterday's New Book and Taking a Running Record	86
Letter Identification and/or Making and Breaking Words	87
Writing a Message	88
Cut Up Sentence to be Rearranged	90
Introducing and Reading the New Book	90
Method	91
Sample	91

The Children	91
The Schools	92
Design	95
The Program	95
Requirements for Participation in the Pilot Study	95
Materials	96
The Tests	96
The Diagnostic Survey	97
The Letter Identification Test	97
The Concepts About Print Test	98
The Writing Test	99
The Dictation Test	99
The Word Recognition Test (Dolch)	100
The Sound Matching Task	100
The Phoneme Segmentation Task	101
The Analogical Transfer Task	102
The Pseudoword Reading Task	102
The Books	103
The Running Record	104
Procedure	106
The Teachers	106
The Weekly Meetings	108
Initial Brainstorming Session	108
Fluent Writing Review	108
Reading Two or More Familiar Books	109
Rereading Yesterday's New Book and Taking a Running Record	109
Letter Identification and/or Word Making and Breaking	110
Writing a Message	112
Cut Up Sentence Rearranged	112
Introducing and Reading the New Book	113
Starting the Program	114

Reports	114
Interim Reports	115
Roaming Around the Known	115
Fluent Writing Review	117
Reading Two or More Familiar Books	117
Rereading Yesterday's New Book and Taking a Running Record	117
Letter Identification and/or Word Making and Breaking	118
Writing a Message	119
Cut Up Sentence Rearranged	120
Extending the Known Set	120
Procedure for Extending the Known Set	122
New Book Introduced and Attempted	124
Final Reports	126
Fluent Reading/Writing Practice	127
Reading Two or More Familiar Books	127
Letter Identification and/or Word Making and Breaking	128
Rereading Yesterday's New Book and Taking a Running Record	128
Letter Identification and/or Word Making and Breaking	113
Writing a Message	129
Cut Up Sentence Rearranged	129
Extending the Known Set	130
New Book Introduced and Attempted	130
Seating Arrangements	133
Methods of Recording	133
Results and Discussion	135
The Incorporation of the Fluent Writing Review into the Lesson	135
Letter Identification and/or Word Making and Breaking.	135
Writing a Message	139
Extending the Known Set	140
Specific Modifications for Small Group Instruction	141
Children Working on the Same Level of Text Difficulty	141
Children Working at Different Levels of Text Difficulty	142

Teacher Training	143
Lesson Time	143
Other Issues	144
Results of Pre and Post Treatment Measures	146
Conclusions	149
 Chapter 4: The Experimental Study	 153
Introduction	153
Method	154
Sample	154
The Children	156
Selection of the Target Group	156
The Target Children	158
Background of Target Children	158
Ethnic Background of Target Children	158
English Language Ability of Target Children	159
 Classroom Programs of Target Children	 162
The Kindergarten Program	162
First Grade Programs	162
Literacy Practices in Teacher Centered Classrooms	163
Literacy Practices in Child Centered Classrooms	163
 Design	 164
Materials	164
The Tests	165
The Spelling Test	165
The Text Reading Task	166
 The Books	 167
The Assigned Book Level	168
 The Procedure	 171
The Teachers	171

Teacher Training for Test Administration	172
Tutor Training for Test Administration	172
Matching of Children	173
Assigning Children to Individual or Group Treatment	173
Chronology	174
The Intervention Lesson for Individual Children	175
Fluent Reading and Writing Practice	175
Rereading Two or More Familiar Books and Letter Identification and/or	176
Word Making and Breaking	
Rereading Yesterday's New Book and Taking a Running Record and	176
Writing a Message	
Extending the Known Set	177
Introducing and Reading the New Book	180
The Intervention Lesson for the Children Taught in Small Groups	180
Children Working of the Same Level of Text Difficulty	181
Fluent Reading and Writing Practice	181
Rereading Two or More Familiar Books	181
Letter Identification and/or Word Making and Breaking	181
Rereading Yesterday's New Book and Taking a Running Record	181
Writing a Message	182
Extending the Known Set	182
Introducing and Reading the New Book	183
Children Working at Different Levels of Text Difficulty	182
Fluent Reading and Writing Practice	184
Rereading Two or More Familiar Books	184
Letter Identification and/or Word Making and Breaking	185
Rereading Yesterday's New Book and Taking a Running Record	185
Writing a Message	185
Introducing and Reading the New Book	185
Lesson Length	187

Group Dynamics	188
The Inservice Class for Teachers	190
Support for Teachers	194
Discontinuing the Intervention Program	194
Follow Up Support for Children	196
Follow Up Testing	196
Chapter 5: Results and Discussion	198
Experimental Group Comparisons	198
Comparison With Control Groups	202
Further Analysis of Children's Writing	205
Ethnic Minority Groups	207
Discussion	208
Major Findings	208
Why the Program was Able to be Successfully Modified	212
The Attention to Phonological Processing Factors	212
The Provision for a Balance of Skills	213
The Provision for a Balance of Skills	213
The Reading, Writing, Oral Language Connection	213
The Provision of Similar Instruction	214
The Incorporation of New Lesson Components	214
The Nature of the Instructional Setting	215
The Emphasis on Independence	215
The Teaching for Higher Level Metacognitive Strategies	216
The Use of Expanded Diagnosis	217
The Role of the Group Dynamics	217
Theoretical Underpinning	
Chapter 6: Conclusion	224
Introduction	224
Key Findings	225
Research Design Issues	226

<b>Suggestions for Further Investigation</b>	<b>228</b>
<b>References</b>	<b>230</b>
<b>Appendices</b>	<b>246</b>

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1	Comparison of Four Successful Early Intervention Programs	29-30
Table 2	Pilot Study Children	92
Table 3	Classroom Types	93
Table 4	Pilot Study Teachers	107
Table 5	Books Chosen and Words Taught During One Week (Teacher A)	121
Table 6	Books Chosen and Words Taught During One Week (Teacher B)	122
Table 7	Sample Lesson: Children Working at the Same Level of Text Difficulty	125-126
Table 8	Sample Lesson: Children Working at Different Levels of Text Difficulty	131-132
Table 9	Timeline of Events	132-133
Table 10	Lesson Format and Timing	144
Table 11	Pre and Post Treatment Measures	147
Table 12	Ohio Stanine/Raw Score Correlations	156

Table 13	Aspects of English Language Proficiency of Target Children	160
Table 14	Gender, Ethnicity, Language and English Language Proficiency of Target Children	161
Table 15	Comparison of Series Reading Levels	171
Table 16	Chronology of Events: Significant Dates During the Implementation of the Experimental Study	174-175
Table 17	Opportunities for Extending the Known Set of Reading and Writing Vocabulary	178-179
Table 18	Lesson Plan: Children at the Same Instructional Level	183-184
Table 19	Lesson Plan: Children Working at Different Instructional Levels	186-187
Table 20	Average Time and Percentage of Total Time of the One-to-One and Small Group Instruction based on 100 Lessons	188
Table 21	Means and Standard Deviation for all Measures as a Function of Type of Instruction and time of Testing	199
Table 22	Tests of Difference between Means of Two Experimental Groups on Various Measures	200
Table 23	Means and Standard Deviations of Four Comparison Groups on all Common Pretreatment and End of Year Measures	203

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1	A Frame work of Factors Influencing Reading Development	41
Figure 2	A Model of Assisted Learning	69

## LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A	Letter Identification Test	247
Appendix B	Letter Identification Score Sheet	248
Appendix C	Format for Administering the Concepts about Print Test	249
Appendix D	Score Sheet and Scoring Standards for Concepts about Print Test	251
Appendix E	Dictation Test	253
Appendix F	Dolch Word Test	254
Appendix G	Sound Matching Task and Score Sheet	255
Appendix H	Phoneme Segmentation Task and Score Sheet	266
Appendix I	Analogical Transfer Task and Score Sheet	268
Appendix J	Pseudoword Naming Task and Score Sheet	271
Appendix K	Record of Reading Behaviour	275
Appendix L	Notations for Recording Reading Behaviour	276
Appendix M	Accuracy Percentage Table	277

Appendix N	Daily Lesson Plan	278
Appendix O	Dolch Words -Revised Order	279
Appendix P	Spelling Task and Score Sheet	282
Appendix Q	Text Reading Task	285