Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

## FROM CONFRONTATION TO CIVIL WAR

# CONFLICT MANAGEMENT IN THE SATSUMA REBELLION, 1877

A Thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

in Japanese at

**Massey University** 

**Peter Tuffley** 

1997

### **ABSTRACT**

The orthodox view of the outbreak of the 1877 Satsuma Rebellion characterises those actions of Japan's central government which provoked the insurrection as mistakes made in an effort to defuse the confrontational relationship that had developed between the government and Kagoshima prefecture. This thesis offers a critical reappraisal of this view, and examines the hypothesis—suggested by the Japanese historians Inoue Kiyoshi and Môri Toshihiko, as well as by the historical novelist Shiba Ryôtarô—that those actions were intentionally provocative, with the aim of promoting a military resolution of the confrontation. Rather than an accidental outbreak of violence, the Rebellion and the ensuing civil war are considered, in Clausewitzian terms, as "a continuation of (domestic) politics, with the addition of other means", in which the transition from non-violent to military confrontation was, arguably, engineered by the government leadership (in particular by the de-facto leader of the Meiji oligarchy, Ôkubo Toshimichi), just as Bismarck engineered the outbreak of the Franco-Prussian War by means of the Ems Telegram, in order to bring about armed conflict without taking the role of aggressor.

The thesis also examines the influence of unforced strategic error on the course of the civil war in its early stages. This leads to a reappraisal of the orthodox view that the imperial forces were never in danger of defeat, and to the conclusion that the Rebellion could well have succeeded but for major strategic error on the part of the rebel leaders.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I have benefited from the help and advice of many people in my research and in the task of process of preparing, writing and editing this thesis. In particular I would like to thank the following people.

Professor Kiyoharu Ôno, Head of the Department of East Asian Studies until its absorption within the University's School of Language Studies, has been a source of unfailing encouragement and support throughout my time as an MA student at Massey.

However, I owe the greatest debt of gratitude to my supervisor, Doctor Fumio Kakubayashi. On many occasions when discussing aspects of my research, his enthusiasm and support were greatly sustaining, and his comments and guidance at various stages of the project have been invaluable. I am particularly indebted to him for the lengths to which he went in bringing to my attention and procuring for me materials that have greatly assisted my studies, as well as for the loan of books from his own library.

Before I acquired my own computer, Shinji and Keiko Morimoto allowed me to spend many hours in their home using theirs, enjoying their unfailing hospitality and benefiting from their helpful answers to numerous questions. Henk de Groot and Yasuko Tsuji were also most kind in providing additional computer access as well as help with printing at the draft stage (not to mention a most congenial study environment).

I would also like to thank the staff of the Tourism and Industry section of the town office of Ueki-chô who kindly facilitated my visit to the battlefield of Tabaruzaka and its environs—an experience that in many ways brought to vivid life for me the impact of the Satsuma Rebellion on that part of Kyûshû and gave added stimulus to my interest in this "episode of modern Japanese history", as the contemporary commentator Augustus Mounsey called it.

In apologising to anyone whose name I may have inadvertently neglected to mention, I would add, of course, that any errors in the resulting text are my own.

Finally, I thank my wife Lesley for her invaluable help with proofreading, and my family as a whole for their unfailing support, encouragement and understanding.

Peter Tuffley December 1997

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
A Note on Pronunciation and on Japanese Names	v
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: "The Greatest Obstacle to True Imperial Rule"	11
Chapter 2: Approaching Crisis	26
Chapter 3: Options for Action	38
Chapter 4: Circumstantial Evidence	46
Chapter 5: A Lost Cause?	59
Chapter 6: Conclusions	70
Bibliography	75

## A Note on Pronunciation and on Japanese Names

There are various approaches to the transliteration of Japanese into the Roman alphabet (a process often rather awkwardly referred to as "romanization").

The method employed in this thesis (except in quotations from authors taking an alternative approach) is based upon the so-called Hepburn System, with the difference that long o and u are represented by the addition of a circumflex—as, for example, in the names Saigô and Kyûshû, not to mention Tôkyô.

Generally speaking, the vowels in the Japanese words and names that appear in the text may be pronounced more or less as in Italian or New Zealand Maori (preferably without the stress-accent that is a natural feature of English); and the syllable represented in the Hepburn System as  $\mathbf{fu}$  should ideally be sounded like  $\mathbf{hu}$  (a shortened version of  $\mathbf{who}$ ), with an initial expulsion of breath between relaxed and slightly parted lips. The vowels  $\mathbf{i}$  and  $\mathbf{u}$  usually become devoiced when they occur between voiceless consonants.

Japanese personal names that appear in the text are given following the Japanese convention whereby the family name precedes the given name.