

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Client and Therapist Variability with Psychotherapy
Homework: A Preliminary Psychometric Evaluation of
Two Scales

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree
of
Master of Arts
in
Psychology
at Massey University,
Albany

Margo-ann D. Munro

2006

Abstract

The therapeutic use of homework assignments is an integral feature of Cognitive Behaviour Therapy (CBT) and is believed to be important in producing and maintaining client treatment gains. While there is empirical and theoretical support suggesting that homework completion may be associated with improved outcome, few studies have directly investigated specific therapist behaviours used in the integration of homework into practice. Similarly, research on client homework completion has, by far, focused solely on the quantity of homework completion rather than on any other factors found to be associated with increased client engagement with homework assignments. The recently developed Homework Adherence and Competence Scale (HAACS) was designed to specifically assess therapist competence and adherence to recommended homework behaviours used to administer homework. As a new measure of client homework completion, the Homework Rating Scale-II (HRS-II), extends the assessment of client homework completion beyond quantity only and provides a measure of the cognitive and behavioural determinants of client homework completion. The present study presents a psychometric evaluation of both the HAACS and HRS-II when rated by independent observers. Further, the present study sought to examine therapist differences in adherence and competence in administering homework as well as investigating the temporal pattern of client homework completion.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to acknowledge Massey University for their funding contributions that made this project possible. My supervisor's research grant that funded the raters in this study, and my Massey Scholarship, which paid for the tuition in my paper year.

I would like to commend Dr. Nik Kazantzis for his extreme patience and understanding throughout the course of my thesis. Through all the trials and tribulations, his support, enthusiasm and commitment to the project has made it worthwhile. I would also like to extend thanks to Dr. Keith Dobson from the University of Alberta for his generosity in allowing me to have access to the DVDs and CTS ratings that formed the basis for my project. His feedback throughout the project has proved invaluable.

A huge thanks to Angela and Tracey, my raters who spent innumerable hours watching and rating the DVDs for the study. Their continued enthusiasm for the project made it all worthwhile and provided me with a greater understanding of the back roads in western and central Auckland. Also, I would like to thank the current and past members of the research lab group for their input and ongoing support for my project. I would especially like to thank Paul, Judith, Gregg and Aniel who have supplied priceless guidance regarding the process of completing a thesis.

I would also like to acknowledge Dr. Barry MacDonald, who supplied great statistical support when I needed it most. I could not leave out the library staff, especially Joy Oehlers, whose help in securing and extending book loans was greatly appreciated. As well, a big thank-you to the folks in IT who helped me solve my Mac "incompatibility with library databases" problem.

I would like to thank everyone who played a part in the ongoing saga, which was my thesis (I'm seriously thinking of giving it all up to go write Country and Western songs, as I think I have enough material to succeed!).

I thank the members of the Solo Mums Club for their help in supplying childcare and anti-stress techniques when needed it. I thank Tracey and Colin, Nancy and Paul and all the others who provided a shoulder and an ear when I needed it. As for Liz, well, thanks for all the coffee and for running the batteries dead on my phone as we discussed our theses. I look forward to finally celebrating their completion with you.

Finally, and most importantly, I would like to acknowledge my family for their ongoing support and patience throughout this project. To my parents, who have phoned every week from Nova Scotia, Canada to see how it was going: thank you for being there, if not in person. To my son Ian: thank you for being such a great kid, I love ya heaps... ZOZOZO!

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iv
List of Tables	xiv
List of Figures	xvi
CHAPTER 1	
Introduction	1
<i>Overview</i>	1
<i>Introduction</i>	1
<i>Empirical Support for Homework</i>	2
<i>Definitions</i>	6
<i>Cognitive Behavior Therapy Research Project</i>	8
<i>Chapter Outline</i>	10
CHAPTER 2	
Homework in Psychotherapy	13
<i>Overview</i>	13
<i>Behavioural Theories</i>	14
<i>Classical Conditioning</i>	14
<i>Operant Conditioning</i>	16
<i>Theory of Generality</i>	18
<i>Cognitive Theories</i>	18
<i>Social Cognition</i>	19
<i>Cognitive Theory</i>	21

<i>Summary</i>	22
CHAPTER 3	
Homework Completion	25
<i>Overview</i>	25
<i>Theories of Compliance</i>	25
<i>Cognitive Dissonance Theory</i>	26
<i>Stages of Change</i>	26
<i>Protection Motivation Theory and Volitional Strategies</i>	28
<i>Theory of Planned Behaviour</i>	29
<i>Measuring Compliance</i>	30
<i>Homework Rating Scale-II</i>	31
<i>The Integration of Homework into Practice</i>	34
<i>Guiding Model for Practice</i>	36
<i>Homework Review</i>	37
<i>Homework Design</i>	38
<i>Homework Assign</i>	39
<i>Summary</i>	41
CHAPTER 4	
Therapist Adherence and Competence	43
<i>Overview</i>	43
<i>The importance of treatment integrity</i>	44
<i>Therapist Adherence and Competence</i>	45
<i>Assessment of Therapist Adherence and Competence</i>	46

<i>Assessment of Therapist Competence and Adherence in CBT</i>	47
<i>Therapist Competence and Adherence in Homework Integration</i>	48
<i>Homework Adherence and Competence Scale</i>	49
<i>Summary</i>	51
CHAPTER 5	
Psychometric Theory	55
<i>Overview</i>	55
<i>Psychometric Theory</i>	56
<i>Measurement in Psychotherapy Research</i>	57
<i>The Reporting of Psychometric Evidence</i>	58
<i>Validity Evidence</i>	61
<i>Reliability Evidence</i>	62
<i>Recent Psychometric Studies in Clinical Psychology</i>	64
<i>Summary</i>	66
CHAPTER 6	
The Present Study	67
<i>Overview</i>	67
<i>Aims</i>	67
<i>Specific Hypotheses for Study One</i>	69
<i>Score Reliability of HAACS</i>	69
<i>Internal Consistency of HAACS</i>	70
<i>Correlational Analyses</i>	70
<i>Evaluation of Therapist Differences</i>	71
<i>The Temporal Nature of Adherence and Competence</i>	71

<i>Specific Hypotheses for Study Two</i>	72
<i>Score Reliability of HRS-II</i>	72
<i>Correlational Analysis</i>	72
<i>Internal Consistency of HRS-II</i>	72
<i>Client Variability in Homework Completion</i>	73
CHAPTER 7	
Method Study One	75
<i>Session Data</i>	75
<i>Independent Raters</i>	76
<i>Training</i>	76
<i>Measures</i>	78
<i>Homework Adherence and Competence Scale</i>	78
<i>Therapist Homework Assignment Competency Scale</i>	82
<i>Cognitive Therapy Scale</i>	82
<i>Procedure</i>	83
<i>Data Preparation</i>	84
<i>Statistical Analyses Procedure</i>	85
<i>Score Reliability</i>	86
<i>Tests for normality</i>	87
<i>Internal Consistency</i>	88
<i>Correlational Analysis</i>	89
<i>Evaluation of Therapist Differences</i>	89
<i>The Temporal Nature of Adherence and Competence</i>	91
CHAPTER 8	
Study One Results	93

<i>Overview</i>	93
<i>Session characteristics</i>	93
<i>Score Reliability of HAACS</i>	94
<i>Reliability of the Adherence Scores for the HAACS</i>	96
<i>Reliability of the Competence Scores for the HAACS</i>	101
<i>Reliability of Ratings for Other Measures of Therapist Adherence and Competence</i>	104
<i>Tests for Normality</i>	104
<i>Internal Consistency of the HAACS using Item Analysis</i>	106
<i>Correlational Analysis</i>	109
<i>Evaluation of Therapist Differences</i>	111
<i>The Temporal Nature of Adherence and Competence</i>	115
CHAPTER 9	
Discussion Study One	119
<i>Overview</i>	119
<i>Reliability</i>	119
<i>Internal consistency</i>	123
<i>Correlational Analysis</i>	124
<i>Evaluation of Therapist Differences</i>	126
<i>The Temporal Nature of Adherence and Competence</i>	127
CHAPTER 10	
Method Study Two	129
<i>Rater Training</i>	129
<i>Measures</i>	130
<i>Homework Rating Scale-II</i>	132

<i>Assignment Compliance Rating Scale</i>	132
<i>Procedure</i>	132
<i>Data Analysis Procedures</i>	132
<i>Score Reliability</i>	133
<i>Correlational Analysis</i>	133
<i>Factor Analysis</i>	134
<i>Variability in Client Homework Completion</i>	136
CHAPTER 11	
Study Two Results	137
<i>Overview</i>	137
<i>Assessment of Missing Values</i>	137
<i>Session characteristics</i>	139
<i>Score Reliability</i>	139
<i>Assessment of Normality</i>	142
<i>Correlational Analysis</i>	144
<i>Factor Analysis of HRS-II</i>	148
<i>Comparison of Factor Analysis Results</i>	153
<i>Variability in Client Homework Completion</i>	156
CHAPTER 12	
Discussion Study Two	163
<i>Overview</i>	163
<i>Score Reliability</i>	164
<i>Correlational Analysis</i>	165
<i>Factor Analysis</i>	167

Variability in Client Homework Completion 169

CHAPTER 13

General Discussion and Conclusions 171

Limitations 171

Recommendations for Future Research 174

Clinical Implications 175

Conclusion 177

REFERENCES 179

APPENDIX A Homework Adherence and Competence Scale 205

APPENDIX B Therapist Adherence and Competence Scale 231

APPENDIX C Cognitive Therapy Scale 233

APPENDIX D Homework Rating Scale-II 241

APPENDIX E Assignment Compliance Rating Scale 243

APPENDIX F Multiple Regression Analysis – HAACS Adherence 245

APPENDIX G Equations for Bland-Altman Procedure 249

APPENDIX H Pearson's r Correlation Matrix for HRS-II Scores 251

APPENDIX I Scree Plot and Unrotated Loadings for HRS-II 253

Factor Analysis

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1	<i>Adherence items of the Homework Adherence and Competence Scale</i>	80
Table 2	<i>Frequency of therapist representation in the sample</i>	94
Table 3	<i>Rater by Rater Cross-Tabulation for HAACS Adherence Items</i>	95
Table 4	<i>Percent Between - Rater Agreement for HAACS Adherence Ratings</i>	95
Table 5	<i>Frequencies of Adherence Behaviours and Rater Agreement for HAACS Review Section</i>	97
Table 6	<i>Frequency of Adherence Behaviours and Rater Agreement for HAACS Design Section</i>	98
Table 7	<i>Frequency of Adherence Behaviours and Rater Agreement for HAACS Assign Section</i>	100
Table 8	<i>Intraclass correlation coefficients for HAACS Competence Ratings</i>	102
Table 9	<i>Means, Standard Deviations, Minimum and Maximum Scores for Therapist Skill Ratings of Sample Sessions</i>	106
Table 10	<i>Item-total Correlations Between HAACS Adherence Items and the Other HAACS Sections</i>	108
Table 11	<i>Correlation Matrix for Measures of Therapist Adherence and Competence Variables</i>	111
Table 12	<i>Mean Scores and Standard Deviations for Measures of Adherence and Competence as a Function of Therapist</i>	112
Table 13	<i>Frequency of Sessions from Three Phases of Therapy</i>	115
Table 14	<i>Means and Standard Deviations of HAACS Adherence and</i>	116

Competence Behaviours Over the Phases of Therapy

Table 15	<i>Correlation Matrix of HAACS Review, Design and Assign Sections for Adherence and Competence</i>	117
Table 16	<i>Therapist and client factors for the HRS-II identified in previous research</i>	130
Table 17	<i>Frequency distribution of therapist</i>	139
Table 18	<i>Intraclass Correlation Coefficients (ICC) for Items on the HRS-II and ACRS</i>	140
Table 19	<i>Percent Agreement Between Raters Based on Absolute and Within 1-Point Agreement</i>	142
Table 20	<i>Mean Item and Scale totals showing Range, Mean, Standard Deviations and Variance for HRS-II and ACRS</i>	144
Table 21	<i>Correlation Matrix of HRS-II Items, HRS-II Total Score and ACRS Scores</i>	146
Table 22	<i>Summary of items and factor loading for Varimax Rotation Solution for HRS-II</i>	151
Table 23	<i>Comparison of Factor Analyses based on Independent Observer, Therapist and Client Ratings of HRS-II.</i>	154
Table 24	<i>Means and Standard Deviations of Client Homework Completion Across Therapy Phases</i>	157
Table 25	<i>Prediction of HAACS AI Scores Using Mean Adherence Item Ratings on the HAACS based on Multiple Regression Analysis</i>	248
Table 26	<i>Correlation Matrix of HRS-II items using Pearson's r</i>	252
Table 27	<i>Component Matrix HRS-II</i>	254
Table 28	<i>Total Variance Explained by Eigenvalues</i>	254

LIST OF FIGURES

<i>Figure 1.</i>	Integrated cognitive and behavioural model of homework completion	32
<i>Figure 2.</i>	Cyclical process for recommending homework (Kazantzis, MacEwen & Datillio, 2005). Used with permission.	37
<i>Figure 3.</i>	Therapist Quick Reference- Adapted for Rating the HAACS	53
<i>Figure 4.</i>	Bland–Altman plot for the difference between percent scores for the Homework Rating Scale-II and the Assignment Completion Rating Scale versus the magnitude of the percentage scores for the average of the two measures.	148
<i>Figure 5.</i>	Independent observer ratings of client homework beliefs across phases of therapy.	159
<i>Figure 6.</i>	Independent observer ratings of client homework obstacles across phases of therapy.	159
<i>Figure 7.</i>	Independent observer ratings of client homework behaviours across phases of therapy.	160
<i>Figure 8.</i>	Independent observer ratings of client homework consequences across phases of therapy.	160
<i>Figure 9.</i>	Independent observer ratings of client homework synthesis across phases of therapy.	161
<i>Figure 10.</i>	Scree plot of factor analysis for HRS-II.	255