

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Playing in the Zone.

*A Vygotskian Interpretation of Young Children's Television-inspired Play and
Talk.*

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Masters degree of
Education at Massey University.

Margaret Anne Brennan

1999

Abstract

Children's 'representational play' has been extensively acknowledged as contributing to early learning and development. This qualitative case study examined a specialised form of representational play prompted by children's television watching. Participants involved children over the age of 3 years attending a community based childcare centre in a city in New Zealand. The study was carried out over a period of 2 weeks and employed 'naturalistic, observational' and 'stimulated recall' techniques during data collection. Children's 'television play' and talk became both the focus of the investigation and the unit of analysis. The original focus of Superhero play was extended to include other forms of television play that emerged as dominant themes within the studied centre. Vygotsky's sociocultural theory of learning was used as a theoretical tool for analysis with special attention given to Vygotsky's concepts of 'intersubjectivity' and 'cultural tools.' Intersubjectivity was defined and discussed in relation to children's appropriation of 'cultural tools' during representational play. A Vygotskian focus necessitated embedding these concepts within Vygotsky's wider theory of learning and development. Vygotsky's concept of the 'zone-of-proximal development' therefore was also considered in regard to 'television related play and talk'. Nelson's (1986) concept of 'scripts' was examined as Vygotsky viewed language as a primary 'mediating tool' that significantly contributed to children's intersubjective understandings. This study concluded that 'Superhero play' and other forms of television play are the outcome of children's appropriation of sociocultural influences. The study's conclusion supported Vygotsky's theory of development that sees learning as occurring as the result of children's 'internalization' and 'appropriation of cultural tools'.

Acknowledgments

I would like to acknowledge and thank my family and a few other special people who have supported me far beyond the call of duty. Andrew Batt, my husband, for always allowing me the space and time to do what I had to do. Our children David, Jon, Tim and Rose for their endless understanding and acceptance of a 'mother who studies'. My parents Catherine and Philip for believing in me. My dear friends Gloria, Rachel, Sue and Robin for being there. My colleagues and friends at the Christchurch College of Education for their ongoing support. The staff, children and their families at the centre where this study took place, for their generosity in allowing me to observe them and be part of their lives. My supervisors Joy Cullen and Roy Shuker for their encouragement and for sharing their experience and expertise.

Andy, this one is for you.

Contents

Title Page

Abstract

1. Introduction	1
1.0 Teletubbies – Extending the Focus of this Study	3
2. Literature Review	4
2.0 Superhero Play	4
2.1 Unique Qualities of Superhero Play	5
2.2 Adult Perspectives on Superhero Play	5
2.2.1 Teacher Concerns	5
2.2.2 Parent Concerns	10
2.3 Children's Perspectives	11
2.4 Superhero Programmes and Children's Behaviour	16
2.5 Why Children Engage in Superhero Play	19
2.6 Benefits of Superhero Play	20
Conclusion	21
3.0 The Effects of Television on Children's Cognitive Processing Abilities	24
3.1 Reactive Theory	24
3.2 Active Theory	25
3.3 Television and Children's Creativity	27
4.0 Intersubjectivity	27
4.1 Intersubjectivity and Cultural Tools	30
4.2 Intersubjectivity, Cognition and Emotion	33
4.3 Intersubjectivity and Pretend/Symbolic Play	34

4.4 Prerequisites for Intersubjectivity During Play	34
4.5 The Place of Intersubjectivity in Vygotsky's and Piaget's Theories of Pretend Play	35
4.6 Intersubjectivity and Developmental Perspectives	36
4.7 Critique of Existing Research Examining Intersubjectivity	37
5.0 Cultural Tools	38
5.1 Appropriation of Cultural Tools	39
5.2 Cultural Tools and Symbol Use	40
5.3 The Television Symbol System as a Cultural Tool	41
5.4 Cultural Tools and Children's Socialisation	41
5.5 Cultural Tools and Temporal Aspects	43
6.0 Zone of Proximal Development	44
6.1 Dyadic Interactions Within the Zone	44
6.2 Difficulties of Researching the Zone of Proximal Development	45
6.3 Pretend Play Providing a Zone of Proximal Development	46
7.0 Scripts	50
7.1 Scripts as Cultural Tools	50
7.2 A Developmental Model of Scripts	51
7.3 Cultural Scripting	52
Conclusion	55
8.0 How This Relates to Existing Knowledge and Literature Within the Field	59
9.0 Focus of Investigation	62
3. Methodology	63
10.0 Research Design	63
10.1 Validity	64
10.2 Generalization	64
10.3 Reflexivity	65
11.0 Data Collection	65

11.1 Procedure for Data Collection	66
11.1.1 Instruments	66
11.1.2 Researcher-as-instrument	67
11.1.3 Researcher Profile	67
11.2 Methods of Data Collection	67
11.2.1 Rationale for using 'stimulated recall as a method of data collection in qualitative research	68
12.0 Selecting a Research Site	70
12.1 Gaining Access and the Procedures Followed by the Researcher	70
12.1.1 Ethical Considerations	71
13.0 Entering the Field	72
13.1 Participant Observations	72
13.2 Direct Observation	75
13.3 Interviews	75
13.3.1 Individual Interviews (children).	75
13.3.2 Group Interviews (children).	76
13.3.3 Adult Interviews	76
13.4 Field Notes	78
13.5 Off Site Contextual Data	79
14.0 Data Analysis	79
14.1 Approach taken to Data Analysis	79
14.2 Limitations of this Approach	80
14.3 Rationale for Using a Sociocultural Framework of Analysis	80
14.4 Addressing Validity Issues	81
15.0 The Process of Data Analysis	82
15.1 Step One: In The Field	82
15.2 Step Two: Withdrawing from the Field	82
15.3 Step Three: Identifying the Units of Meaning	83
15.4 Step Four: Placing the Units into Larger Categories	83
15.5 Step Five: Refinement and Finalisation of Categories	84

15.6 Step Six: Identifying Relationships Across Categories	85
16.0 Final Validity Checks	85
17.0 Units of Analysis	86
17.1 Unit of Analysis used in this Study	86
18.0 Research Questions as a Guideline for Data Analysis	86
18.1 Intersubjectivity was Considered by Examining these Categories	87
19.0 Participants	87
4. Findings and Discussion	88
20.0 Propositional Statements	88
20.1 The Zone of Proximal Development as a Cultural Tool	92
20.2 Rules as Cultural Tools	118
20.2 Scripts as Cultural Tools	141
5. Conclusion	164
Findings	165
Limitations of the Study	170
Educational Implications	171
Future Directions	173
6. References	175
7. Appendices	192
Appendix 1: Letter to Supervisor and Early Childhood Staff	192
Appendix 2: Information Sheet for Parents/Caregivers/Guardians	195
Appendix 2a: Letter to Parents/Families Outlining Study's Aims and Requirements	198
Appendix 3: Consent Form for Centre Management	199
Appendix 3a: Consent Form for Teachers/Staff	199
Appendix 4: Consent Form for Consent Form for Parents/Caregivers	201

Appendix 5: Notice Placed on Family Notice Board at Centre	202
Appendix 6: Researcher Questions Regarding Children's TV Preferences or Interests	202
Appendix a: Example of Coded Transcript	203
Appendix b: Naming and Identifying Tentative Categories	207
Appendix c: Examples of Data Forming Initial Categories	211
Appendix d: Data Analysis	213
Appendix e: Categories Derived from Common Units of Meaning	215
Appendix f: Sample of Propositional Statements	218
Appendix g: Process used in Forming a Propositional Statement	219
Appendix h: Propositional Statements Categorised in Relation to the Research Question	226
Appendix i: Sketch Plan of Centre	228

List of Tables

Table 1 – Propositional Statements	90-91
------------------------------------	-------