

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**What's the value in 'Boot Camps': Means-end
perspectives on motivational intervention in the
outdoors.**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

In

Management

At Massey University, Wellington,
New Zealand.

Robert James Maxwell

2010

Abstract

Motivational intervention courses or 'boot camps' for long-term unemployed participants aim to increase self esteem, self confidence and motivation so as to improve employment options and/or outcomes for participants. In New Zealand, such programmes administered by Outward Bound (Catalyst course) and the Army (Limited Service Volunteers, LSV) involve intensive spells of disciplined instruction and vigorous physical activity. In popular terms they may be considered 'Boot Camps', and are consistent with the philosophy of changing behaviour through a 'short, sharp shock'. This thesis evaluates these two outdoor motivational intervention programmes to determine their outcomes and identify the processes involved in producing them. Both programmes are attended by clients of the Ministry of Social Development, drawn from the long-term unemployed population.

This study advances understanding of experiential education through the use of qualitative, interpretive research into *how* course outcomes are achieved, moving beyond simply measuring outcomes. The research design uses means-end theory applied within a phenomenological paradigm. The means-end method links course attributes to consequences and to the end values that participants attribute to course experiences. One LSV and two Outward Bound courses are evaluated with the data obtained through participant observation and semi-structured interviews at course end, and again at 6 months post course.

This study is the first to focus on the specific population group attending motivational intervention courses, and found that the 'boot camps' increased participants' self esteem, self confidence, self awareness and sense of belonging. These findings are similar to previous research on general enrolment outdoor experiential education courses. Specific course attributes including physical training, personal interactions, expeditioning, activity debriefs, marching and time management were identified as being the most

accountable for producing course outcomes. Means-end theory and participant interviews are found to be a good fit for the evaluation of outdoor experiential education courses. It links course attributes, consequences and end values and thus provides greater insight into the processes that participants identify with respect to specific course attributes that lead to course outcomes. For example, the course component of *time management* for the LSV participants had a strong direct link to the consequence of *sense of achievement*, which then resulted in links to the end value *transference to work*. This knowledge can be used by providers of motivational interventions to design courses that target particular outcomes by focusing on the specific attributes that have been identified in this study as being important in producing such outcomes.

Acknowledgements

I wish to acknowledge and thank for their help my supervisors. One is Dr Martin Perry, whose thorough knowledge of the research process was invaluable to me to facilitate the completion of this project. The other, Dr Andy Martin, whose thorough knowledge of the experiential education field was an important resource and sounding board throughout the research process. Both supervisors not only gave me much support and guidance throughout this research, but also challenged me to achieve more than I believed possible; I thank you for this.

I wish to thank the participants that I have dealt with over the last two years. It is with gratitude that I thank those participants who kindly gave of their time to participate in interviews for my research; without them this research would never have happened. I would also like to thank both LSV and Outward Bound for access to their motivational intervention programmes; for welcoming me, making me feel like part of the family and for the open discussions that we had.

Also I would like to thank Alyth Begg from the department of Management for her help in organising my administrative study requirements including a place to study. Your help has made my journey much smoother. I also thank the other people who have helped me, in particular, Kate for the final proof, Ana for her encouragement and support and many others including the students at Outward Bound and LSV.

Finally may I thank Ruth, my partner, for her motivation, tolerance of hours spent away from her working on my study, and the many hours of proofing and re-proofing; without you this thesis would not have been possible.

Robert Maxwell
Wellington. 2009

Table of Contents

Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	v
Table of Contents	vii
List of Tables.....	xi
List of Figures	xiii
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Research Context	1
1.1.1 The Unemployed.....	1
1.1.2 ‘Motivational Intervention Programmes’ or ‘Boot camps’	1
1.1.3 Limited Service Volunteers and Outward Bound	3
1.1.4 Study Participants	3
1.1.5 Effects of Unemployment	6
1.1.6 Active Labour Market Policy.....	8
1.1.7 Motivational Intervention Outcomes	9
1.1.8 Motivation Theory	10
1.1.9 Motivation and Employment	14
1.1.10 Goal Setting.....	19
1.1.11 Outdoor Experiential Education.....	22
1.1.12 Adventure Education Programme Development	25
1.1.13 Stages in Group Development	26
1.2 Motivation for the Research.....	28
1.2.1 The Outdoor Instructor.....	28
1.2.2 The Outdoor Programme Manager	29
1.2.3 The Current Study	30
1.2.4 The Future for Programme Design	31
1.3 Nature of the Research.....	32
1.3.1 Realism.....	32
1.3.2 Ontology.....	40
1.3.3 Case Study.....	42
1.3.4 Conceptual Framework	43
1.4 Research Objectives/Questions.....	45
1.4.1 Objectives.....	45
1.4.2 Research Questions	45
1.5 Conclusions	46
1.6 Structure of the Thesis	48
Chapter 2 Literature Review	51
2.1 Introduction	51
2.2 Research on Outdoor Experiential Education Programmes.....	52
2.2.1 Outcomes and Processes	52
2.2.2 Course Components	59
2.2.3 Gender Contrasts.....	61

2.2.4	Age	62
2.2.5	Ethnicity	64
2.2.6	Research Ontology	65
2.3	Means-End	70
2.3.1	Foundations	71
2.3.2	Means-end and Experiential Education	75
2.3.3	Credibility and Transferability	77
2.3.4	Limitations	85
2.4	Justification for the Research	89
Chapter 3 Research Design		95
3.1	Introduction	95
3.2	Course Observation	96
3.3	Interview Procedure	99
3.3.1	Content Code Development	103
3.4	Hierarchical Value Maps	110
3.5	Demographics and Scales Used	113
3.6	Ethical Considerations	115
3.7	Conclusions	116
Chapter 4 Limited Service Volunteers		117
4.1	Introduction	117
4.2	New Zealand Military Doctrine	117
4.3	Limited Service Volunteers Courses	119
4.3.1	Programme Outline	120
4.3.2	Short-term Outcomes	122
4.3.3	Target Group	122
4.3.4	Selection Process and Criteria	123
4.4	Conclusions	124
Chapter 5 Limited Service Volunteers Results		125
5.1	Introduction	125
5.2	Data Collection	126
5.3	Demographic Characteristics	127
5.4	Course Observation	128
5.4.1	Course Start	128
5.4.2	Week Two	133
5.4.3	Mid Course	136
5.4.4	Goal Setting	137
5.4.5	Closing Stage	139
5.4.6	Early Departures	140
5.5	Means-end Data	142
5.5.1	Ladders Completed by Trainees	142
5.5.2	Frequency of Content Codes	143
5.5.3	Means-end Associations	145
5.6	Results	147
5.6.1	All Participants at Course End	148
5.6.2	Subgroups	152
5.6.3	Marching	156

5.6.4	Time Management	159
5.6.5	Physical Training	164
5.6.6	Participant Interactions.....	168
5.6.7	Six Months Post Course.....	171
5.6.8	Research Method.....	174
5.7	Conclusions	176
Chapter 6 Outward Bound		179
6.1	Introduction	179
6.2	Outward Bound International.....	179
6.3	Philosophy and Ideals	181
6.4	The Outward Bound Process.....	182
6.5	Key Elements in Outward Bound Programmes	186
6.6	Outward Bound New Zealand.....	187
6.7	Catalyst Courses.....	188
6.7.1	Programme Outline	189
6.7.2	Short Term Outcomes	190
6.7.3	Early Departures.....	190
6.7.4	Target Group	191
6.7.5	Selection Process and Criteria.....	191
6.8	Conclusions	195
Chapter 7 Outward Bound Results.....		197
7.1	Introduction	197
7.2	Data Collection.....	198
7.3	Demographic Characteristics	200
7.4	Course Observation.....	200
7.4.1	Course Start.....	202
7.4.2	Focus of the Course.....	204
7.4.3	Instructor Staff	205
7.4.4	Course End	206
7.5	Means-end Data	208
7.5.1	Ladders Completed by Students.....	208
7.5.2	Frequency of Content Codes.....	209
7.5.3	Means-end Associations.....	212
7.6	Results	213
7.6.1	All Students at Course End	214
7.6.2	Physical Training	217
7.6.3	Participant Interactions.....	221
7.6.4	Activity De-briefs.....	224
7.6.5	Expedition	227
7.6.6	Six Months Post Course.....	231
7.6.7	Research Method.....	234
7.7	Conclusions	236
Chapter 8 Discussion.....		239
8.1	Introduction	239

8.2	Discussion of the Results	239
8.2.1	Research Question 1	240
8.2.2	Research Question 2	241
8.2.3	Research Question 3	242
8.2.4	Research Question 4	246
8.3	Limitations	250
8.4	Conclusions.....	254
Chapter 9 Conclusions and Implications		257
9.1	Introduction.....	257
9.2	Conclusions.....	258
9.2.1	Outcomes	258
9.2.2	Processes	259
9.2.3	Method	259
9.3	Implications.....	261
9.3.1	Course Design.....	261
9.3.2	Means-end Theory in Outdoor Experiential Education	262
9.4	Recommendations for Future Research	263
9.5	Final Thoughts	264
Appendix.....		265
Appendix 1 Definitions.....		265
Appendix 2 Unemployment definition		267
Appendix 3. Student means-end interview form.		268
Appendix 4. Goldenberg’s list of consequences (2002).		269
Appendix 5. Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course participants: Males (n = 67). Cut off level 5.		270
Appendix 6. Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course participants: Females (n = 18). Cut off level 3.		271
Appendix 7. Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course participants: 17-18 year olds (n = 44). Cut off level 4.....		272
Appendix 8. Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course participants: 19-25 year olds (n = 41). Cut off level 4.....		273
Appendix 9. Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course participants: Māori (n = 50). Cut off level 5.		274
Appendix 10. Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course participants: Europeans (n = 25). Cut off level 3.....		275
Appendix 11. Approval to research at Outward Bound.....		276
References.....		279

List of Tables

Table 2.1 Potential benefits of outdoor education pursuits.	52
Table 2.2 Summaries of a selection of past outdoor education studies.	56
Table 2.3 Previous experiential education means-end investigations.	75
Table 3.1 Means-end interview form.	103
Table 3.2 Development of value content codes.	104
Table 3.3 Attributes content codes and sub-categories (alphabetical listing).	107
Table 3.4 Consequences content codes and sub-categories (alphabetical listing).	108
Table 3.5 Values content codes and sub-categories (alphabetical listing).	109
Table 3.6 Descriptions of demographics.	113
Table 5.1 Number of ladders completed by LSV respondents at course end.	142
Table 5.2 Frequency of content codes in LSV respondents' means-end chains.	144
Table 5.3 Frequency of content codes in LSV trainees' means-end chains 6 months post course.	145
Table 5.4 Summary of the cut off level for the HVMs course components.	147
Table 7.1 Number of ladders completed by Outward Bound respondents at course end.	208
Table 7.2 Frequency of content codes in Outward Bound respondents' ladders.	210
Table 7.3 Frequency of content codes in Outward Bound respondents' means-end chains: 6 months post course.	211
Table 7.4 Summary of the cut off level for the Outward Bound HVMs.	213

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Maslows' hierarchy of needs (1970).	15
Figure 1.2 Employment motivation illustration.	18
Figure 1.3 Venn diagram representing motivational intervention domains.	22
Figure 1.4 A summary of the relationship between the different inter-related fields of Experiential Education (Martin, 2001).	23
Figure 1.5 A model of the experiential learning cycle (Kolb, 1984).	25
Figure 1.6 Basic ingredients of realist social explanation.	32
Figure 1.7 The realist evaluation cycle (Pawson & Tilley, 1997).	35
Figure 1.8 Conceptual framework.	44
Figure 5.1 Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course participants: All respondents (n = 85).	149
Figure 5.2 Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course component: Marching (n=85).	157
Figure 5.3 Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course component: Time management (n=85).	161
Figure 5.4 Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course component: Physical training (n=85).	165
Figure 5.5 Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course component: Participant Interactions (n=85).	168
Figure 5.6 Hierarchical value map for Limited Service Volunteers course participants: All participants at 6 months post course (n = 28).	172
Figure 6.1 The Outward Bound process model.	182
Figure 6.2 The active learning cycle.	184
Figure 6.3 A holistic model of the key elements of the experiential education process.	185
Figure 6.4 Referral pathway for Catalyst student.	193
Figure 7.1 Hierarchical value map for Outward Bound course students: All respondents (n = 15).	215
Figure 7.2 Hierarchical value map for Outward Bound course component: Physical training (n=15).	218
Figure 7.3 Hierarchical value map for Outward Bound course component: Interactions (n=15).	222
Figure 7.4 Hierarchical value map for Outward Bound course component: Activity de-briefs (n=15).	225
Figure 7.5 Hierarchical value map for Outward Bound course component: Expeditioning (n=15).	228
Figure 7.6 Hierarchical value map for Outward Bound course students: 6 months post course: (n=14).	232