

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**HOUSING, THE STATE AND URBAN POOR ORGANISATIONS IN  
METRO MANILA.**

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the

requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Development Studies at

Massey University

**Donovan Storey**

**1996**

## ABSTRACT

This study has sought to place housing into social and political contexts of analysis. It suggests that the failure to house the urban poor is a result of particular political systems in operation throughout the Third World. In particular, the system of neopatrimonialism is forwarded to explain the logic of many Third World regimes and to describe the nature of their relationship with society. Civil society is neither passive nor stagnant however. The proliferation of community organisations and Non Government Organisations in the South is testimony to this. Many feel that these actors may create enough pressure to challenge current development directions. Whilst this study supports this argument it is qualified support, as the nature and direction of this change is not clearly understood nor apparent. In examining these processes research was conducted in Metro Manila during 1994. There is strong evidence to confirm the endurance of neopatrimonialism in the Philippines and its effect on the logic of politics and the character of state-society relations. There are also clear connections between the historical development of the Filipino state and the housing crisis. In looking at the response of social actors, two urban poor organisations are studied in a comparative context, as is the role of an intermediary NGO. This study finds some support for the argument that NGO/UPO alliances are more progressive and impactful than 'traditional' UPOs, though there is evidence to suggest there are as many similarities as contrasts. UPOs that operate within urban or national social movements may be involved in change, though it is still unclear whether this is progressive or will be at the forefront of social and political transformation. While UPOs play an important role in civil society, expectations of their place in an 'alternative society' should still be circumspect and cognizant of the adversities these groups confront.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work is the result of a number of people who have supported me over the past several years. In particular, those friends in the Philippines that offered their homes, food, hospitality and warmth made this all possible. The life opportunity to live with these wonderful people (herewith unfortunately referred to as 'the urban poor'), was a rare opportunity and life changing experience. To Poning and family, Albi and family and the residents of the two communities I had contact with, *salamat*, I am forever in your debt.

I also derived a great deal of support on other levels. To Croz Walsh who first inspired me on these issues, to Jeff Sluka who offered great advice and frank thoughts throughout, and to John Overton whose support and patience was endless (though I think I got close at times) I also offer thanks. I can't wait to be able to talk to you without *asking for something!*

In the Philippines I benefited from opening doors of opportunity made possible by two very able people, 'Jing' Karaos and Annie de Leon. Thank you both. You offered refuge to an otherwise flabbergasted visitor and helped define the direction this study has taken. The work you do is an inspiration to me and I hope this effort offers some contribution to the struggle.

Helen Mitchell has stood by me, racked with concern and a hint of dismay as I have enrolled in course after course, degree after degree over the years. Helen was particularly industrious over the last weeks with offers of help as she sought a mention in the acknowledgments. You were always there Helen, but thanks for the help anyway! This study is as much a reflection of her hard work and commitment to the cause as any other persons. Also, my mother, Roselyn, has given me support throughout my student 'career'. To all other friends and 'professional' students whose friendship and ideas helped inspire my own, perhaps this would have finished earlier if it was not for your interesting company. To all those who have 'loitered with intent' in the Graduate room (you know who you are!), I'll miss your company.

This work is dedicated to Kate Mitchell, who died while I was completing fieldwork in Manila.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title Page	i
Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Table of Contents	iv
List of Figures	viii
List of Maps	ix
List of Tables	x
List of Plates	xi
Glossary of Filipino Words and Terms	xiii
Abbreviations	xiv
<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>CHAPTER ONE: THE THIRD WORLD HOUSING CRISIS</b>	<b>7</b>
Introduction	7
Housing Directions: From Lerner to Turner	9
The Housing Debate and the Showdown that Wasn't	14
Beyond the Theoretical Impasse: The Policy Impasse	17
Out of the Impasse: New Polemics	18
<b>THE URBAN POOR, HOUSING, AND THE THIRD WORLD STATE</b>	<b>23</b>
The Neopatrimonial State	26
Neopatrimonialism at the Grassroots: The Urban Poor, Local Level Politics and Resource Allocation	33
Implications of the Model for the Urban Poor	36
Summary	38
<b>CHAPTER TWO: BALANCING STATE HEGEMONY: NGOs AND THE RESPONSE OF CIVIL SOCIETY</b>	<b>40</b>
Introduction	40
The Proliferation of Civil Society Organisations: Non Government Development Organisations	42
Urban Poor Organisations	46

The 'Missing Link': INGOs, UPOs and the Building of Urban Social Movements	54
The INGO-UPO Nexus: Rethinking Utopianism	61
Summary	65
<b>CHAPTER THREE: STATE, POLITICS AND HOUSING IN THE PHILIPPINES</b>	67
Introduction	67
The Philippine State and Philippine Style Democracy	68
Urbanisation, Poverty and Housing	89
Continuity and Change: Housing and the Urban Poor	105
Summary	107
<b>CHAPTER FOUR: THE RESPONSE OF CIVIL SOCIETY: NGOs, UPOs AND THE URBAN SOCIAL MOVEMENT IN METRO MANILA</b>	109
Introduction	109
Non Government Organisations in the Philippines	109
The Response of the Grassroots: Peoples Organisations and the Urban Poor	112
The Role of Intermediary NGOs in Urban Poor Organisations in the Philippines	116
Summary	123
<b>CHAPTER FIVE: METHODOLOGY AND FIELDWORK</b>	126
Introduction	126
Research Procedures: The Discovery and Adaptation of Methodology	128
Research Practise	131
Use of Journals	134
Research Experience: Introduction to Manila	137
Culture Shock and Orientation	139
Gaining Access and Choosing Sites	147
Legitimacy and Role	150
Summary	153

<b>CHAPTER SIX: SAMAHANG BIYAYANG TUBIG</b>	154
Introduction	154
Settlement History	156
The Emergence of Local Organisations	161
Samahang Biyayang Tubig	164
Organisation Objectives and Methods	170
Political Participation of SBT	178
Summary	188
<b>CHAPTER SEVEN: TOWARDS AN ALTERNATIVE SOCIETY? THE FOUNDATION FOR DEVELOPMENT ALTERNATIVES</b>	191
Introduction	191
FDA: Framework and Evolution	193
FDA and Community Organisations	194
FDA and Community Organising	197
Widening the Impact	201
Electoral Empowerment Strategies	202
UPO Viability and Sustainability	204
Summary	205
<b>CHAPTER EIGHT: THE ALMA NOVA ALLIANCE</b>	207
Introduction	207
Area History	208
Organisation History	212
Organisation Structure	218
Organisation Objectives and Methods	223
Political Participation	234
Summary	242
Postscript	243
<b>CHAPTER NINE: CONCLUSION</b>	244
Introduction	244
Manila's Urban Poor Organisations: Comparative Evidence	245

The Role and Impact of Intermediary NGOs	249
Areas for Future Research	251
Re-Thinking Housing	252
Prospects and Myths of 'Empowerment'	254
Highlighting and Rethinking the Third World State	257
Where to From Here? Some Future Directions for Research	258
<b>APPENDICES</b>	260
1. Details of Interviews	260
2. Constitution and By-Laws of SBT	263
3. Constitution and BY-Laws of ALMA NOVA	266
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	268



**LIST OF FIGURES**

1.1	Third World State Typologies	26
1.2	Patron-Client Systems	28
1.3	The Context of Policy Implementation	35
3.1	Agencies Involved in the National Shelter Programme	99
6.1	Election Flyers	184
7.1	FDA and the Stages of Community Organising	196
8.1	ALMA NOVA and Local Organisations	216
8.2	Levels of Organisation and Linkages	231

**LIST OF MAPS**

5.1	Metro Manila with Fieldwork Sites	127
6.1	Pencil Sketch of Fieldwork Area in Muntinlupa	155
8.1	Pencil Sketch of Sauyo	209

## LIST OF TABLES

6.1	Population Characteristics of Putatan	161
-----	---------------------------------------	-----

## LIST OF PLATES

1	Barangay politics is very personal in nature.	85
2	Patronage sign in Muntinlupa school, Metro Manila.	85
3/4	Contrast in housing: Pasig River Squatters and Forbes Park.	92
5	The urban poor as represented in the press.	95
6	Demolition at dawn to make way for a shopping mall.	95
7	NGOs/UPOs public education display.	118
8	Demonstration over the implementation of UDHA.	118
9	Some of Manila's icons; jeepneys, traffic and religion.	138
10	The local <i>sari-sari</i> store with Susan, the owner.	138
11	Learning to wash clothes under the watchful eye of experts.	142
12	Family <i>banyo</i> .	142
13	I was always offered the best sleeping conditions available.	144
14	Washing day in Muntinlupa.	144
15/16	Reciprocity could be extended through donations to projects around the home.	146
17/18	Host families and friends.	152
19	Bustling early morning scene.	159
20	Train lines looking north toward Manila.	159
21	Crowded housing adjoining the <i>riles</i> .	160
22	The area also includes more impressive housing and white collar workers.	160
23/24	Muntinlupa housing and local <i>sari-sari</i> store.	162
25	Informal sector business, and electricity meter.	163
26	Housing pride.	163
27	Tenure arrangements are not often clear.	166
28	With no garbage collection, rubbish is either burned or dumped in a communal area.	166
29	One of the water outlets accrued by SBT.	172
30	Laguna 'lake' front.	172
31/32	Building of pathways.	175
33/34	Induction night of SBT leaders.	181
35/36	Barangay election materials placed near the community.	185

37	An established high quality house.	210
38	Local <i>sari-sari</i> store.	210
39	Bakery established by recent migrants to Metro Manila.	211
40	One of the original houses of the area.	211
41/42	Flooding during rainy season.	213
43	Common problems of stagnant water and garbage disposal.	214
45	Water supply to a house.	217
46	Electricity is often 'tapped'.	217
47/48	Out in Force!	236
49	Poning on her once infamous 'rice cake run'.	239
50	NGOs and UPO activists meet at a ULR-TF conference.	239

## GLOSSARY OF FILIPINO WORDS AND TERMS

<i>Anak Bayang Pilipino</i>	Children of the Philippines
<i>Anak Bayang Tondo</i>	Children of Tondo
<i>Balik Probinsya</i>	‘Back to the Provinces’ policy
<i>banyo</i>	bathroom
<i>barangay</i>	pre-colonial community and now the smallest political unit
<i>burgis</i>	colloquial for bourgeoisie
<i>compadre</i>	chosen sponsors of children in baptism and confirmation
<i>datu</i>	leader of traditional <i>barangays</i>
<i>hiya</i>	shame
<i>ilustrado</i>	university (usually foreign) educated leaders of nationalist movements in 19th Century
<i>kagawad</i>	<i>barangay</i> councillor
<i>kamote</i>	tubular starch plant eaten by rural and urban poor
<i>katipunan</i>	name given to group of revolutionaries in late 19th Century
<i>katol</i>	slow burning insect repellent
<i>pakikisama</i>	smooth interpersonal relations
<i>personalismo</i>	the social and political elevation of the individual
<i>principalia</i>	Spanish-created local elite
<i>Punong</i>	<i>barangay</i> captain
<i>riles</i>	railway lines
<i>sambayanan</i>	community, or community spirit
<i>Santa Cruz</i>	a festival
<i>sari-sari</i>	small community stores
<i>tagalog</i>	official language of the Philippines
<i>taglish</i>	language which combines <i>tagalog</i> and english
<i>utang na loob</i>	debt of gratitude

## ABBREVIATIONS USED IN TEXT

ALMA NOVA	<i>Alyansa Ng Mga Maralita Sa Novaliches</i>
ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
BIKTIMA	<i>Bighis Tinig Maralita</i>
BLISS	<i>Bagong Lipunan Sites and Services</i>
C-5	Circumferential Road Number Five
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency
CO	Community Organisation
COMELEC	Commission for Elections
CPP	Communist Party of the Philippines
DPWH	Department of Public Works and Highways
DSWD	Department of Social Welfare and Development
EDSA	Epifanio de los Santos Avenue
FDA	Foundation for Development Alternatives
GRO	Grassroots Organisation
HUDCC	Housing and Urban Development Coordinating Council
ICSI	Institute on Church and Social Issues
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INGO	Intermediary Non Government Organisation
KPML	<i>Kongreso ng Pagkakaisa ng Maralita Lunsod</i>
LGC	Local Government Code
LOI	Letter of Instruction
MHS	Ministry of Human Settlements
NACUPO	National Congress of Urban Poor Organisations
NCR	National Capital Region
NGDO	Non Government Development Organisation
NGO	Non Government Organisation
NHA	National Housing Authority
NHMFC	National Home Mortgage Finance Corporation
NIC	Newly Industrialising Country
NSP	National Shelter Programme

NTMQC	<i>Ngakakaisang Tinig ng Maralita sa Quezon City</i>
NUPCC	National Urban Poor Coordinating Council
PACO	Putatan Athletic Community Organisation
PAKSA LUPA	<i>Pambansang Kaisahan ng mga Maralita Para sa Repormang</i>
PCUP	Presidential Commission for the Urban Poor
PD	Presidential Decree
PECCO	Philippine Ecumenical Centre for Community Organising
PHHC	People's Homesite and Housing Corporation
PHILSHA	Private Sector Low Income Housing Association
PnB	<i>Partido ng Bayan</i>
PNR	Philippine National Railways
PO	People's Organisation
QC3	Quezon City Coordinating Council
SEC	Securities and Exchange Commission
SOCO	Self-Organised Community Organisation
TRAPO	Traditional Politician
ULR-TF	Urban Land Reform Task Force
UPO	Urban Poor Organisation
USM	Urban Social Movement
VAT	Value Added Tax
ZIP	Zonal Improvement Programme
ZOTO	Zone One Tondo Organisation

### **PHILIPPINE CURRENCY**

During the period of fieldwork one American Dollar was equivalent to 27 Pesos (P) and one New Zealand Dollar was equivalent to 15 Pesos (100 Centavos make one Peso).