

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# **Refugees as ‘Others’**

## **Social and Cultural Citizenship Rights for Refugees in New Zealand Health Services**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of  
Philosophy

at Massey University, Albany  
New Zealand

Annette Mortensen

March 2008

## ABSTRACT

Citizenship, as effective social, cultural and economic participation for refugee groups, depends on appropriate institutional structures and processes in resettlement societies. This thesis using critical social theoretical perspectives addresses the paradox of being legally a citizen, but substantively excluded from the very rights that constitute such citizenship. The thesis draws on theoretical models of newcomer integration in order to promote the development of a more inclusive society for refugees in New Zealand. The issues to be considered include responses from central government and from public institutions—particularly health, education, employment and welfare—in addressing social exclusion and promoting integration. The questions of refugee integration to be addressed conceptually must take into consideration cultural and religious diversity, on the one hand, and socio-economic inequality on the other.

In New Zealand, the 1987 review of refugee resettlement policy, which established an annual quota of 750 places, has given priority to those with the highest health and social needs and removed preferences for specific national, ethnic and religious groups. Significantly, in the 1990s radical neo-liberal economic reforms were introduced and publicly provided health, education and welfare systems were restructured. This posed serious challenges to the core idea of social citizenship in general in New Zealand society. Noticeable ethnic diversification has been just one element of the resettlement policy changes; the other has been long-term social and economic exclusion in the refugee groups settled since this time. This study indicates that New Zealand's notably humanitarian refugee resettlement policy is not matched by adequate central government and public institutional responses and resources with which to integrate refugee groups.

This qualitative study examines the role of one institution in particular, health care. The study takes a multi-method approach, using historical and social policy analysis to set the structural context for the interpretation of data from participant interviews. During fieldwork, twenty-eight semi-structured interviews were conducted with health care providers in community, primary and secondary care sectors in the

Auckland region, in both governmental and non-governmental agencies. This research demonstrates at a service level, the consequences of overlooking refugee peoples in New Zealand social policy, data collection systems, research and health strategies. Importantly though, the research discovers a number of ‘activation points’—or approaches that have been developed by health care practitioners—that highlight future opportunities for the inclusion of refugee groups. One finding is that the New Zealand health system must address the question of how to effect a shift from universalist conceptions of generalised eligibility for health services to targeted interventions for refugees.

The conclusions drawn from the study are: firstly, that an overarching integration policy for refugees, led by central government, is required. Secondly, institutional responses that accommodate the special psychosocial, socio-economic and cultural/religious requirements of refugee groups are needed. This would include the development of a locally relevant multiculturalism to guide social policy in New Zealand. In the long-term, for peoples from refugee backgrounds to become full political, social, economic and cultural members of New Zealand society, there needs to be a rethinking of the contemporary models of citizenship offered.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research was made possible with the participation of the many health care workers in the Auckland region who go well beyond the call of duty to ensure that refugee families are given the best care that can be provided. Special thanks is given to those who offered me much needed encouragement and support for the long journey to complete this thesis including: Jennifer Janif, Jody Lawrence, Nikki Denholm, Melissa Powell, Kate Healey, Peter Shaw, Elizabeth Mortensen, Heather Kizito, Penny Wilson, Dahaba Hagi, Mahad Warsame, Kathy Pritchard and Nicky Young.

I have greatly appreciated the expertise, guidance and generous support of my supervisors, Professor Paul Spoonley and Associate Professor Mike O'Brien in this challenging and complex area of study.

To my partner Evana Belich, thanks always for your never ending supply of patience, encouragement and understanding.

Finally my deep respect and admiration is extended to the refugee families in our community whose lives are testimony to suffering that is unimaginable, and resilience that is superhuman. My sincere wish is that this work will make a contribution to your future well being and integration in New Zealand society.

## Key to Interview Terms

The following conventions used are presented here to assist the reader in their interpretation.

Name	The personal names of research participants have been changed where necessary and pseudonyms used for identification.
Number	The number of the interview and line of the transcript.
(...)	Material which has been edited.
...	Incomplete sentences without editing.
“ ”	Single words, or short phrases/ sentences used by the interviewee.
‘ ’	Words developed by the researcher or other authors.
[ ]	Insertion of additional material to make context and/or meaning clear.

## Abbreviations

ADHB	Auckland District Health Board. Auckland DHB zone Refers to the Auckland District Health Board geographical area. Note that this is equivalent to the Auckland City geographical zone.
AEG	AIDS Epidemiology Group
AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
ALMPs	Active Labour Market Policies
ANZUS	Australia, New Zealand and the United States treaty of defensive alliance (signed in 1951)
ARC	Auckland Refugee Council
ARPHS	Auckland Regional Public Health Services
ASCP	Auckland Sustainable Cities Programme

### Auckland/Auckland Region

Refers to the greater Auckland region, which includes the Central Auckland (Auckland DHB), West/North Auckland (Waitemata DHB) and South Auckland (Counties-Manukau DHB) District Health Board (DHB) geographical zones.

AUTREF	Auckland University of Technology Refugee Education
B & I	Border and Investigations
CBF	Capitation Based Funding
CCR	Canadian Council for Refugees
CCH&D	Community Child Health and Disability Service
CEDAW	United Nations Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women
CERD	Covenant on the Elimination on All Forms of Racial Discrimination
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CHE	Crown Health Enterprise
CORSO	Council of Organisations for Relief Service Overseas
COMPAS	Centre on Migration, Policy and Society
CRC	Canadian Refugee Council
CRC	Community Relations Commission For a multicultural NSW
CSC	Community Services Card
CYF	Child Youth and Family

DHB	District Health Board
DIMIA	Department of Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs
ECRE	European Council on Refugees and Exiles
EU	European Union
ESOL	English for speakers of other languages
EU	European Union
EUMS	European Union Member States
FGM	Female genital mutilation
GCIM	Global Commission on International Migration
GDP	Gross domestic product
GIS	Geographic Information System
HCA	Healthcare Aotearoa
HFA	Health Funding Authority
HHS	Hospital and Health Services
HIV	Human Immune-deficiency Virus
HoP	Hauora o Puketapapa/Roskill Union and Community Health Centre
HUHC	High User Health Card
IALS	International Adult Literacy Strategy
ICCI	Inter-Church Commission on Immigration and Refugee Resettlement
ICCPR	Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICM	Interpreter Cultural Mediator
ICRR	Inter-Departmental Committee on Refugee Resettlement
IELTS	International English Language Test Score
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IMES	Institute for Migration and Ethnic Studies
IMISCOE	International Migration, Integration and Social Cohesion
IOM	International Organization for Migration
IRO	International Refugee Organisation
IDP	Internally displaced person
IMES	Institute for Migration and Ethnic Studies
IOM	International Organisation for Migration
LMC	Labour Market Citizenship



LisNZ	The Longitudinal Immigration Survey: New Zealand
MOSD	Ministry of Social Development
MPI	Migration Policy Institute
MRRC	Mangere Refugee Reception Centre
NASS	National Asylum Support Services
NDSA	Northern District Health Boards Support Agency
NESB	Non-English speaking background
NGO	Non Government Organisation
NHI	National Health Index
NPA	National Plan of Action for Human Rights in New Zealand
NCNZ	Nursing Council of New Zealand
NZAF	New Zealand AIDS Foundation
NZNO	New Zealand Nurses Organisation
NZSCE	New Zealand Standard Classification of Ethnicity
NZIS	New Zealand Immigration Service
OEA	Office of Ethnic Affairs
OECD	Organisation for European Co-operation & Development
ON TRACC	Transcultural care service for children and young people from refugee backgrounds, who have high and complex needs.
OSH	Occupational Health and Safety
PAFT	Parents as First Teachers
PBF	Population Based Funding
PBFF	Population Based Funding Formula
PERPBFF	Population-based personal health care funding formula
PES	Public Employment Service
PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
PHO	Primary Health Organisation
Plunket	The Royal New Zealand Plunket Society
PTSD	Posttraumatic Stress Disorder
RAS	Refugees as Survivors
RCOA	Refugee Council of Australia
RMS	Refugee and Migrant Service
RHA	Regional Health Authority

RHEP	Refugee Health Education Programme
RMS	Refugee and Migrant Service
RSB	Refugee Status Branch
SEU	Social Exclusion Unit (UK)
SBS	Special Broadcasting Service
SDPOA	Government's Sustainable Development Programme of Action for New Zealand
SIA	Services to improve access
SIS	Security Intelligence Service
SNZ	Statistics New Zealand
TCRR	Tripartite Consultations on Refugee Resettlement
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
MPMC	UNESCO-MOST Multicultural Policies and Modes of Citizenship in European Cities project.
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission for Refugees
USCR	United States Committee for Refugees
WINZ	Work and Income
WHO	World Health Organisation

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Abstract</b>	ii
<b>Acknowledgments</b>	iv
<b>Table of Contents</b>	x
<b>List of Tables</b>	xvi
<b>List of Figures</b>	xvi
<b>1. INTRODUCTION</b>	1
<b>Introduction</b>	1
<b>New Zealand's Role in Refugee Resettlement</b>	2
<b>Refugees, a Special Case for Integration</b>	4
<b>Defining Refugees</b>	5
<b>Towards a Sociology of Refugee Integration</b>	7
<i>Defining Integration and Social Exclusion</i>	10
<b>Thesis Structure</b>	13
<b>2. THE HISTORY OF REFUGEE RESETTLEMENT     IN NEW ZEALAND</b>	17
<b>Introduction</b>	17
<b>Refugees: A Challenge to Pro-British Immigration Policies</b>	17
<i>Immigration restrictions 1933-1939</i>	18
<i>World War II: Finding Suitable Refugees</i>	20
<b>The Beginning of Formal Refugee Resettlement</b>	21
<i>The Arrival of Polish Children 1944</i>	21
<b>Post World War 11 and the Cold War Era</b>	22
<i>Displaced Persons 1949-1952</i>	24
<i>'Handicapped' Refugees 1959</i>	25
<b>Resettlement 1960-1989</b>	27
<i>'Hard Core Cases'</i>	28
<b>The 1987 Review of Refugee Resettlement Policy</b>	29
<i>'Women-at-Risk'</i>	31
<b>Resettlement in New Zealand from the End of the Cold War</b>	32
<i>The End of the Cold War</i>	32
<i>New Zealand and the 'Pacific Solution'</i>	35
<i>The Tampa Incident</i>	37
<b>Conclusion</b>	37
<b>3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</b>	38
<b>Introduction</b>	38
<b>The Researcher and the Researched as Multicultural Subjects</b>	39
<b>Theoretical Paradigms and Interpretive Perspective</b>	41
<b>Research Strategies</b>	45

<b>Methods of Data Collection and Analysis</b>	47
Design and Method of the Study	48
<i>The Study Setting</i>	48
<i>Entry into the Field</i>	48
<i>Participant Selection</i>	49
Procedures for Participant Involvement	50
Procedures for Handling Information	50
The Participants	51
Ethical Considerations	51
<i>Ethical Committees</i>	51
<i>Researcher Involvement</i>	51
Data Analysis	51
<i>Concept Formation</i>	52
<i>Coding</i>	53
Concept Development	56
<i>Reduction of Categories</i>	56
<i>Social Policy Analysis</i>	57
<i>Complementary and Background Data</i>	58
Concept Integration	60
<i>Conceptual Categories</i>	60
<i>Data Map</i>	61
Establishing Evaluation Criteria	62
<b>Conclusion</b>	64
4. THEORISING THE INTEGRATION OF REFUGEES	65
<b>Introduction</b>	65
<b>Marshallian Notions of Citizenship</b>	68
<b>Immigrant Multiculturalism</b>	70
<b>Key Dimensions of Citizenship for Refugees</b>	75
<b>Typologies of Membership Models for Newcomers with a     Special Focus on Refugees</b>	77
<i>Soysal's Regimes of Incorporation</i>	78
<i>Young's Model of Deliberative Democracy</i>	81
<b>Theoretical Flaws in Models/Typologies of the Integration of     Refugees</b>	82
<i>Penninx's Typology of Integration Policies</i>	85
<b>An Integration Model for Refugees</b>	88
<b>Conclusion</b>	94
5. REFUGEE INTEGRATION IN THE NEW ZEALAND CONTEXT: THE RESPONSE OF CENTRAL GOVERNMENT	96
<b>Introduction</b>	96
<b>The Social Cohesion Agenda for New Zealand</b>	97
<b>Immigration Settlement Strategies</b>	99
<i>The National Immigration Settlement Strategy</i>	99
<i>Refugee Voices</i>	103
<i>The 'Whole of Government' Approach and         Immigration Budget 2000</i>	105

<i>Regional Responses: The Auckland Regional Settlement Strategy</i>	109
<i>Immigration Budget 2004</i>	110
<i>Immigration Budget 2005</i>	112
Ethnic Perspectives in Policy in New Zealand	112
Conclusion	117
6. INSTITUTIONAL RESPONSES TO BECOMING SETTLED IN NEW ZEALAND	118
Introduction	118
Settlement Support in New Zealand	119
<i>The Voluntary Sector</i>	120
Labour Market Exclusion	121
<i>Institutional Responses to Labour Market Participation for Refugees</i>	125
<i>Income Support Policies in New Zealand</i>	125
<i>Active Labour Market Policies</i>	128
English Language and Literacy Skills	133
<i>ESOL (English for Speakers of Other Languages) for Adult Refugees</i>	134
<i>ESOL in Schools</i>	136
<i>ESOL in Pre-Schools</i>	138
<i>A Language Policy for New Zealand</i>	139
Conclusion	140
7. HEALTH POLICY AND REFUGEES IN NEW ZEALAND	141
Introduction	141
Universal Health Rights in New Zealand	141
<i>Ethnic Data Collection Systems in Health Care</i>	142
<i>The Allocation of Health Funding</i>	145
<i>Population-Based Funding Formula</i>	145
<i>Capitation Based Funding</i>	146
New Zealand Health Policies	147
<i>The Overarching Strategies for Improving the Health of New Zealanders</i>	147
<i>Objectives for Health Outcomes</i>	147
<i>The New Zealand Health Strategy</i>	149
<i>The Primary Health Care Strategy</i>	150
<i>Services to Improve Access Funding</i>	153
<i>The Reducing Inequalities in Health Strategy</i>	153
<i>Monitoring Ethnic Inequalities in Health</i>	155
Conclusion	156
8. CULTURALLY DIVERSE POPULATIONS AND THE HEALTH NEEDS OF REFUGEES	157
Introduction	157

<b>The Medicalisation of Refugee Populations</b>	157
<i>Psychosocial Debates</i>	160
<b>Cultural Care for Refugees in New Zealand Health Services</b>	167
<i>Background to the New Zealand Model</i>	167
<i>Culturalist Paradigms in Healthcare in New Zealand</i>	170
(a) <i>The Theory of Transcultural Care</i>	171
(b) <i>The Cultural Safety model</i>	173
<b>Conclusion</b>	176
9. THE FINDINGS	178
<b>The Data Map: <i>Refugee Social and Cultural Citizenship Rights in New Zealand Health Services</i></b>	180
REFUGEES AS ‘OTHERS’	181
<b>Introduction</b>	181
<b>Participant Data- Refugees as ‘Others’</b>	181
<b>Excluded Populations</b>	182
<i>Discursive Exclusion</i>	182
<i>Discrimination</i>	184
<b>Prioritising Populations</b>	185
<i>Deprived Groups</i>	185
<i>Funding for Refugee Groups</i>	188
<i>Service Planning for Refugee Groups</i>	188
<i>Consultation with Refugee Groups</i>	188
<i>Accommodating Refugee Groups in Reducing Inequalities in Health Strategies</i>	189
<b>Auckland’s Issues</b>	190
<i>Settlement Support Services are Short-Term</i>	190
<i>Integrating Refugees into Auckland Health Services</i>	191
<i>District Health Board Funding</i>	191
<i>Regional Pressures on Auckland District Health Boards</i>	192
<b>Conclusion</b>	193
10. BARRIERS TO HEALTH CARE	194
<b>Introduction</b>	194
<b>Participant Data- Barriers to Health Care</b>	194
<b>Problems with Language</b>	195
<i>Equitable Access to Health Services</i>	195
<i>Client Safety Issues</i>	196
<i>Health Screening and Prevention Programmes</i>	197
<b>The Isolation of Refugee Women</b>	199
<i>Refugee Women’s Access to Health Care</i>	200
<i>Discrimination and Social Isolation</i>	201
<i>Refugee Women and Mental Health</i>	202
<b>Access Issues</b>	204
<i>Community Based Health Services</i>	204

<i>Refugee Community Health Workers</i>	207
<i>Advocacy</i>	207
<b>Conclusion</b>	210
<b>11. PROVIDING PRIMARY HEALTH CARE</b>	211
<b>Introduction</b>	211
<i>The Health of Refugees in New Zealand</i>	211
<b>Participant Data- Providing Primary Health Care</b>	213
<b>Developing Primary Health Care Strategies</b>	215
<b>Coping with Health and Social Inequalities</b>	216
<i>Target Populations in the Primary Health Strategy</i>	217
<i>Unmet Social Needs in Refugee Groups</i>	218
<i>The Primary Health Cost Structure</i>	220
<i>District Health Board Community Health Services</i>	221
<b>Managing Refugee Related Trauma</b>	222
<i>Refugees and Mental Health Care</i>	222
<i>Compounding Stressors</i>	223
<i>The Refugee Experience and Trauma</i>	224
<i>Managing Post Traumatic Stress Disorder</i>	226
<b>Conclusion</b>	227
<b>12. PROMOTING HEALTH IN REFUGEE COMMUNITIES</b>	228
<b>Introduction</b>	228
<b>Participant Data- Promoting Health</b>	229
<b>Universalism</b>	229
<i>Health Promotion with Refugee Groups</i>	230
<i>Language and Literacy Barriers</i>	232
<i>Acculturation and Patterns of Poor Health</i>	233
<i>Community-Led Health Promotion</i>	233
<i>Increasing the Opportunities for Participation</i>	235
<b>Overcoming Stigma and Fear</b>	237
<i>Refugee Groups and HIV Prevention Campaigns</i>	238
<i>Refugee Groups and TB Prevention Campaigns</i>	239
<i>Refugee Groups and Mental Health Promotion</i>	243
<i>Refugee Groups and Harm Reduction Campaigns</i>	244
<b>Cultural Safety</b>	246
<i>Health Promotion and Muslim Communities</i>	246
<i>Guidelines for Health Practitioners for Cultural Care</i>	247
<i>Linguistically Appropriate Resources</i>	250
<b>Conclusion</b>	251
<b>13. SIGNS OF ACTIVATION</b>	253
<b>Introduction</b>	253
<b>Participant Data- Signs of Activation</b>	254
<b>Capacity Building</b>	254

<i>National Responsiveness</i>	255
<i>Regional Responsiveness</i>	257
<b>Cultural Competence</b>	261
<i>National Responsiveness</i>	262
<i>Regional Responsiveness</i>	262
<b>Quality of Service</b>	265
<i>Monitoring and Evaluating Service Provision</i>	265
<i>Service Planning</i>	266
<b>Conclusion</b>	270
14. CONCLUSIONS	272
<b>Introduction</b>	272
<b>Sociology from a Critical Perspective</b>	272
<b>Methodological Issues</b>	275
<b>The Policy and Practice Implications of the Study</b>	277
<i>Refugee Integration Policy</i>	277
<i>The Implications for Practice</i>	279
<i>Refugee Settlement Policies and Practice</i>	279
<i>Statistical Data Gathering</i>	280
<i>Specific Policy Requirements</i>	281
1. <i>Long-Term Settlement Support</i>	281
2. <i>Institutional Reform</i>	281
<i>Specific Issues for Health Care</i>	282
<i>Refugee Inclusion in Health Strategies</i>	282
<i>Culturally Responsive Health Services</i>	282
<i>An Inclusive Cultural Safety Paradigm</i>	283
<b>Future Directions for Research</b>	283
<b>Long-term Settlement Outcomes for Refugees in New Zealand?</b>	284
APPENDICES	286
(1) <b>Major Refugee Groups Settled in New Zealand, 1944-2005</b>	286
(2) <b>Letter to Managers of Health Services</b>	287
(3) <b>Letter of Introduction to Prospective Participants</b>	289
(4) <b>Information for Participants</b>	291
(5) <b>Consent to Participate in Research Project</b>	295
(6) <b>Confidentiality Agreement</b>	297
(7) <b>Letter to Participants</b>	298
(8) <b>Initial Interview Guide</b>	300
(9) <b>Ethical Considerations</b>	301
(10) <b>Second Interview Guide</b>	303
(11) <b>Data Collection Methods</b>	305
(12) <b>Ministry of Health Strategies and Policies Analysed in the Study</b>	307
REFERENCES	309



## LIST OF TABLES

<b>Table 1</b>	<b>(shown in Appendix One) Major Refugee Groups Resettled in New Zealand 1944-2005</b>	286
<b>Table 2.1</b>	<b>Refugees Approved for Resettlement in New Zealand 1992-2003</b>	34
<b>Table 5.1</b>	<b>Budget 2000, Pilot One: Support for Groups Working with Refugee Claimants</b>	107
<b>Table 5.2</b>	<b>Budget 2000, Pilot Two: Resident Refugee Family Orientation Courses</b>	107
<b>Table 5.3</b>	<b>Funding approved by Cabinet for the 2004 Immigration Budget</b>	111
<b>Table 7.1</b>	<b>The Primary Health Care Strategy</b>	152

## LIST OF FIGURES

<b>Figure 5.1</b>	<b>A Strategic Overview of Ethnic Perspectives</b>	113
<b>Figure 6.1</b>	<b>Migrants and Refugee Work and Income Clients Receiving Benefit by Duration Bands for 1996-2001</b>	122
<b>Figure 7.1</b>	<b>Ministry of Health Statement of Intent Outcomes Framework</b>	148
<b>Figure 7.2</b>	<b>Intervention Framework to Improve Health and Reduce Inequalities</b>	154
<b>Figure 8.1</b>	<b>The 1996 Interpretation of Cultural Safety</b>	168
<b>Figure 8.2</b>	<b>Revised Model for the Teaching of Cultural Safety, the Treaty of Waitangi and Maori Health in Nursing and Midwifery Programmes</b>	169
<b>Figure 9.1</b>	<b>Social and Cultural Citizenship Rights for Refugees in New Zealand Health Services</b>	180
<b>Figure 9.2</b>	<b>Refugees as ‘Others’</b>	181
<b>Figure 10.1</b>	<b>Barriers to Health Care Access</b>	194
<b>Figure 11.1</b>	<b>Providing Primary Health Care</b>	211
<b>Figure 12.1</b>	<b>Promoting Health in Refugee Communities</b>	229
<b>Figure 13.1</b>	<b>Signs of Activation</b>	254