

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# Tomorrow's Schools: Today's Industry.

**Economic agendas and competitive forces in global education:**

**New Zealand and South Korea.**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the  
requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

at Massey University, Manawatū,

New Zealand.

**Marilyn Joyce Innes**

**2014**

## Abstract

Over the last four decades, education has been moving away from being not just a national or state responsibility, but also a tradable commodity, with its design, funding, pedagogical content, and resourcing closely linked to trade and industry. This thesis posits that education industries in both New Zealand and South Korea are manifestations of the long-term effects of a global mantra of competition and economic trade agendas and/or policies that the United States of America, the World Bank, and the IMF have strategically developed and implemented since the 1980s. This competitive mantra has been influential in growing the 'shadow' education industry in South Korea that flourishes alongside the egalitarian state school-system deemed, to be in 'crisis' or 'collapse' since 1999. The result is societal pressure for Korean students to spend many hours of intensive after-school study at huge financial and social cost to families. A number of Korean parents have sent their young children abroad for educational sojourns since 1999, with many thousands being enrolled in New Zealand's state schools as foreign fee-paying students (FFPS) and, thus, becoming part of New Zealand's 'billion-dollar' export education industry. This thesis argues that further 'shadow' industry activity, particularly in the guise of public-private partnerships (PPPs), is increasingly being spread into the state-schooling sectors of countries, including New Zealand, that have accepted education policies and 'good ideas' from the World Bank and the OECD. Consequently the potential is high for there to be a surge of competition and credentialism that will facilitate further private investment in education and ultimately create similar pressures to those already experienced by Korean students. With New Zealand's support of the WTO general agreement on trade in services (GATS), its continued participation in global tests, such as the OECD Programme for International Assessment (PISA), and legislation in place for charter schools and public-private partnerships, it appears that a restructuring of education or a global education reform movement is already well underway.

## Acknowledgements

The journey to this completed thesis began at Otago University in 2006 when Dr Howard Lee, my then Masters supervisor, encouraged me to undertake doctoral study. As an education historian, Dr Lee foresaw that my first-hand experiences in both New Zealand and South Korea were unique and needed to be documented. When Dr Lee moved to Massey University in 2007, he and Dr Roger Openshaw worked in a supervisory partnership with me to bring this thesis to examination. Their confidence in my ability is appreciated. I am grateful to Massey University for awarding me a Vice-chancellor's scholarship to fund my research, and for having the confidence that my study would make a valuable contribution to global educational research. My thanks go also to Dr John O'Neill, for giving of his time, academic skill, and caring support to help me during the final writing stages, the oral examination and ultimately in helping bring this thesis to its final form.

I wish to extend my gratitude to the many Korean teachers, students, parents, business owners, education officials, colleagues, foreign English teachers, and friends in South Korea whose stories and experiences provided the inspiration and impetus for this thesis to be written. Special thanks go to my close friend and ex-staff member, Eunkyung Park, and her husband Jay, for their tenacious work ethic, deep knowledge of education in Korea, and insightful stories that have framed much of what I have written about.

Finally, I wish to acknowledge the unwavering support of my husband, Chris Featonby whose faith in my ability gave me the confidence to enter postgraduate study in 2004. Chris's personal long-time interest in education, alongside his respect for me as an often 'fragile' late-life student, allowed him to act as a much needed 'critical friend'. Chris always had the capacity to calm me, challenge my ideas, ask the tough questions, and suggest additional or alternative pathways forward. Without his advice, guidance and practical help, this thesis would never have eventuated.

## Table of Contents

<b>Chapter 1 Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Asian students arrive in New Zealand .....	4
1.2 The financial and social costs of education in Korea.....	13
1.3 Summary.....	17
<b>Chapter 2 Methodology .....</b>	<b>18</b>
2.1 Introduction.....	18
2.2 Theoretical position.....	18
2.3 Qualitative and interpretive approaches .....	20
2.3.1 Discourse .....	21
2.3.2 The Asian enigma .....	24
2.3.3 Interpretive ethnography .....	25
2.3.4 Communication .....	26
2.3.5 The position of the researcher .....	29
2.4 Using the literature.....	31
2.4.1 Korean literature overview.....	32
2.4.2 New Zealand literature overview .....	33
2.4.3 Global issues and events overview .....	36
2.5 Methods.....	37
2.5.1 Research aims.....	37
2.5.2 Sources of data .....	38
2.5.3 Strengths and weaknesses of data sources.....	40
2.5.4 Reflexivity .....	40
2.5.5 Trustworthiness of research.....	42
2.5.6 Analytical approach and methods.....	43
2.6 Structure of thesis .....	44
2.6.1 Part one .....	45
2.6.2 Part two .....	47
<b>Chapter 3 The Korean economy and education: 1900-1975 .....</b>	<b>51</b>
3.1 Education in austere times .....	56
3.2 Invasion, war and education .....	58
3.3 Unsettled new beginnings.....	60
3.4 Equalising education.....	63

3.5	International currency turmoil .....	65
3.6	Summary.....	67
<b>Chapter 4 Implementing economic reform .....</b>		<b>69</b>
4.1	Unrest grows in the West.....	69
4.2	Fixing global problems.....	70
4.3	Support from the private sector.....	72
4.4	New Zealand in crisis .....	74
4.5	Juxtaposition – Korea in the 1980s.....	76
4.6	Societal unrest in Korea.....	77
4.7	Controlling education in Korea.....	79
4.8	America seeks to change Korea’s trajectory .....	80
4.9	The road to Korean democracy .....	82
4.10	Analysis and review .....	83
<b>Chapter 5 Neoliberal policy infiltrates New Zealand education .....</b>		<b>86</b>
5.1	Milton Friedman and education reform.....	86
5.2	New Zealand’s education system faces reform .....	87
5.3	Mismatching reform agendas.....	89
5.4	Fixing the ‘risks’ .....	91
5.5	Export education policy.....	94
5.6	Strengthening privatisation .....	96
5.7	A window on the world – the Internet.....	99
5.8	Summary.....	101
<b>Chapter 6 The ‘American dream’ – globalisation in Korea .....</b>		<b>102</b>
6.1	The American solution.....	103
6.2	America globalises Asia .....	105
6.3	The Segyehwa Policy .....	105
6.3.1	Korea thinks big .....	108
6.3.2	Deregulating the economy.....	109
6.3.3	A construction boom .....	110
6.4	Education market opportunities .....	111
6.5	The necessity of English.....	113
6.5.1	The English Program in Korea (EPIK).....	114
6.6	The Internet.....	115
6.7	Overseas travel.....	116

6.7.1	Overseas ties .....	117
6.7.2	Overseas business opportunities .....	117
6.8	New Zealand engages with Asia .....	118
6.8.1	An ‘Asian invasion’ .....	119
6.8.2	Asian students in New Zealand schools .....	120
6.8.3	The Asian strategy ends.....	120
6.9	A crisis looms in Korea.....	121
6.9.1	The crisis arrives .....	122
6.10	Further school choice restrictions.....	125
6.11	Summary.....	126
<b>Chapter 7 Economic agendas and education.....</b>		<b>128</b>
7.1	Background .....	128
7.2	Neoliberalism.....	130
7.3	Neoliberalism in New Zealand education .....	131
7.4	Overview of the reform years .....	134
7.5	Part one: – Reform in the West.....	134
7.5.1	America’s economic and education crisis .....	134
7.5.2	Conduits of change.....	137
7.5.3	Positions of power.....	139
7.5.4	Global education reform .....	140
7.6	Part two: – Neoliberalism in Korea.....	142
7.6.1	1980-1988: The exposure phase .....	143
7.6.2	1989-1996: The competitive phase.....	144
7.6.3	1997-2000: The crisis phase .....	146
7.7	Part three: – International influences .....	147
7.7.1	The power of the IMF and the OECD .....	148
7.7.2	The World Bank .....	150
7.8	A review of Korea’s and New Zealand’s experiences.....	151
7.9	Summary.....	152
<b>Chapter 8 A new crisis in Korea .....</b>		<b>155</b>
8.1	Boosting the economy.....	155
8.2	The impact on education.....	156
8.3	The education market expands.....	157

8.4	The mothers' movement.....	160
8.5	English in schools.....	162
8.6	An exodus of students and money.....	163
8.7	A credit crisis in Korea .....	164
8.8	Summary.....	165
<b>Chapter 9 Adversity creates opportunity in New Zealand .....</b>		<b>166</b>
9.1	A 'school collapse' crisis in Korea .....	167
9.2	Korean students arrive in New Zealand .....	168
9.2.1	Local Korean involvement .....	169
9.2.2	The 1987 Treasury plan becomes reality .....	170
9.2.3	Problems in the market.....	171
9.2.4	Seriously Asia.....	173
9.3	Rebranding education .....	174
9.4	The market declines .....	176
9.5	International markets.....	179
9.6	Understanding Korean statistics.....	180
9.7	Summary.....	182
<b>Chapter 10 The face of education in Korea .....</b>		<b>185</b>
10.1	The daily lives of Korean students.....	185
10.2	Korea's School system .....	187
10.2.1	Punishments and pressures .....	190
10.2.2	Classroom survival.....	191
10.3	Health issues.....	194
10.4	Post schooling.....	195
10.5	English language anxiety .....	196
10.6	Summary.....	197
<b>Chapter 11 Status and credentialism in Korea .....</b>		<b>199</b>
11.1	Education for security.....	200
11.2	Societal classes .....	201
11.3	The value of education .....	202
11.4	Western influence .....	203
11.5	Equality and opportunity.....	204
11.6	Credentialism in Korea .....	206
11.6.1	Academic inflation.....	207



11.6.2	America as a credential destination .....	210
11.7	Mothers as education managers.....	212
11.8	Procedures and principles .....	213
11.9	English language credentialism .....	215
<b>Chapter 12</b>	<b>The shadow education industry.....</b>	<b>217</b>
12.1	Industry discourse .....	218
12.2	The development of a shadow industry.....	220
12.3	The English language industry .....	221
12.4	Grandiose English marketing.....	222
12.5	The ‘partnership’ business in Korea .....	224
12.5.1	Partnership in state schools .....	225
12.6	Controlling and expanding the market.....	227
12.7	Korea’s education industry drivers.....	228
12.8	Education as ‘the enemy’ .....	230
12.9	The impact of the shadow industry.....	231
12.10	Global market expansion.....	233
12.11	The World Bank and PPPs.....	236
12.12	Industry pathways in New Zealand .....	237
12.13	Summary.....	238
<b>Chapter 13</b>	<b>Korea’s transnational education market.....</b>	<b>240</b>
13.1	Understanding transnationalism.....	241
13.2	Market growth.....	244
13.3	Wild geese and penguins.....	245
13.4	Understanding the students’ background.....	247
13.5	Controls, barriers and sanctions.....	248
13.5.1	The visa games .....	250
13.6	Second tier destination .....	252
13.7	Summary.....	254
<b>Chapter 14</b>	<b>Economic agendas and competitive forces .....</b>	<b>256</b>
14.1	Creativity or competition .....	256
14.2	The four phases of neoliberal reform.....	257
14.2.1	The first phase .....	259
14.2.2	The second phase .....	260
14.2.3	The third phase.....	262

14.2.4	The fourth phase .....	264
14.3	America's race to the top .....	265
14.4	The global reform movement.....	267
14.5	The enigma of public-private partnerships (PPPs) .....	269
14.6	Trade in education.....	270
14.7	Today's reform: Tomorrow's industry.....	271
14.8	New Zealand's position .....	273
14.9	Summary.....	273
<b>Chapter 15</b>	<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>275</b>
15.1	Aims of the research.....	275
15.2	Major findings.....	275
15.3	Limitations of the thesis .....	277
15.4	Suggestions for further research, policy, and practice .....	278
15.5	The future of education.....	279
15.6	A final provocation .....	280
<b>Bibliography</b> .....		<b>282</b>

## List of Figures

1. <b>Figure 1</b>	
First time visa and levy data for Korean students in New Zealand .....	5
2. <b>Figure 2</b>	
South Korea: Students by sector March 2011 .....	6
3. <b>Figure 3</b>	
2009 Enrolments of international fee-paying students by education sector and by main source countries .....	9
4. <b>Figure 4</b>	
Comparative growth of private education spending in Korea .....	14
5. <b>Figure 5</b>	
Korean students studying outside Korea, 2001-2006 .....	181

## Abbreviations

ACG	Academic Colleges Group
APEC	Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation
AMF	Asian Monetary Fund
APMRN	Aotearoa/New Zealand Asia Pacific Migration Research Network
ASP	After School Programme
BOT	Board of Trustees
BSM	Beginning School Mathematics
CBS	Columbia Broadcasting System
DDD	Dirty Dangerous Demeaning
EEC	European Economic Community
EFF	Extended Fund Facility
EPIK	English Program in Korea
ERP	Education Reform Proposals
ENZ	Education New Zealand
ERO	Education Review Office
ESL	English Second Language
FFPS	Foreign Fee-paying Students
FTA	Free Trade Agreement
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GERM	Global Education Reform Movement
GFC	Global Financial Crisis
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
ICT	Information Communication Technology
IIE	Institute for International Education
ILO	International Labor Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INSEAD	Institut Européen d'Administration des Affaires

IRD	Inland Revenue Department
KBS	Korean Broadcasting Service
KCCI	Korean Chamber of Commerce and Industry
KEDI	Korean Education Development Institute
KERIS	Korean Education Research and Information Service
KFTA	Korean Federation of Teacher Associations
KICE	Korean Institute of Curriculum and Evaluation
KIF	Korean Institute of Finance
KMOEHRD	Korean Ministry of Education and Human Resource Development
KNZBC	Korea New Zealand Business Council
KORETTA	Korea English Teacher Training Assistant
KOTESOL	Korea Teachers of English to Speakers of Other Languages
KTU	Korean Trade Union
LTBV	Long Term Business Visa
MEST	Ministry of Education Science and Technology
NAEP	National Assessment of Educational Progress
NAFTA	North Atlantic Free Trade Agreement
NEA	National Education Association
NEST	Native English Study Teacher
NIC	Newly Industrialised Countries
NZBRT	New Zealand Business Round Table
NZCF	New Zealand Curriculum Framework
NZEI	New Zealand Educational Institute
NZIEM	New Zealand International Education Marketing Network
NZPA	New Zealand Press Association
NZQA	New Zealand Qualification Authority
NZVCC	New Zealand Vice Chancellors' Committee
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OKF	Overseas Koreans Foundation
PIN	Public Information Notice
PISA	Program for International Student Achievement
PPP	Public Private Partnership

PPTA	Post Primary Teachers Association
PTE	Private Training Enterprise
ROK	Republic of Korea
SABER	Systems Approach for Better Education Results
SAP	Structural Adjustment Programme
SOE	State Owned Enterprise
SNU	Seoul National University
TOEFL	Test of English as a Foreign Language
TOEIC	Test of English for International Communication
UNESCO	United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation
USAMGIK	United States America Military Government In Korea
UNC	United Nations Command
VER	Voluntary Export Restraint
WIN	Whip Inflation Now
WTO	World Trade Organisation