

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# The Effect of Trainee Characteristics, Learning Styles and Organisational Factors on Effective End-User Training in Four New Zealand Organisations: A Multiple Case Study.

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the  
requirements for the degree of

Master of Information Science

in

Information Systems

At Massey University, Palmerston North  
New Zealand

Jane Isabel Shand

2002

**DEDICATION**

***This thesis is dedicated to the memory of my parents***

***Isabel Purse Shand 1921-1972***

***and***

***Robert Bruce Shand 1928-2002***

## ABSTRACT

*This study represents the results of a one-year thesis project into the effectiveness of End User Training (EUT) of software applications in four large organisations in New Zealand. The ubiquity and criticality to successful business of desktop computers in business organisations in the twenty-first century is unchallenged. Information Systems (IS) research over the past thirty years has consistently identified that the success of IS is heavily dependent on the skills and knowledge of the end users of those systems. Further, a large IS research effort has identified that a critical success factor of skilled and knowledgeable users is effective EUT. Governments and organisations world-wide recognise and expend considerable resources on improving the increase of knowledge and skills of workers, with particular focus and emphasis, in more recent years, on EUT.*

*This project has identified and emphasised the large number of factors that impact on the effectiveness of EUT. Focus has been on identifying factors that are particularly pertinent to practitioners in the New Zealand environment in order to provide a rigorous academic framework for future practical EUT. Multiple case study methodology has enabled the project to provide a rich picture of the organisational environment that surround EUT in large New Zealand organisations.*

*Analysis of data in the study has identified four trainee characteristics that impacted on the results of EUT. Additionally, the study found that organisational factors to support EUT and training method when optimally combined with trainee characteristics and learning styles, could provide essential information for effective EUT design and delivery in New Zealand organisations.*

*As this study was exploratory in nature, there is opportunity for IS researchers to explore and explain in greater detail a range of factors that both produce and predict greater effectiveness in EUT.*

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to give my heartfelt thanks to the following people for all the help, support and encouragement that has been shown to me in completing this thesis.

To the Information Systems Department and staff at Massey University for supplying all the imaginable resources, both physical and mental, that one would need to write a thesis.

To my main supervisor, Peter Blakey, for his meticulous, reliable and prompt attention to every query I had throughout this project. For his supportive suggestions that opened my mind to new angles, on at times to me, some very arduous tasks and questions and for his thorough and careful editing of many drafts of the thesis.

To my secondary supervisor, Barry Jackson for his insightful, practical and down to earth suggestions on how to cope with the statistical aspects of the project.

To all the people involved from the participating organisations for the time, effort, interest and encouragement, which in all cases was beyond the call of duty.

To all the trainees who participated in the study, without whom there would be no data. To many of you who completed forms and questionnaires in your own time I am exceptionally grateful.

To Rick Burns for the insightful information I gained into the world of statistical research from a practitioner's point of view and for providing statistical software for data analysis for the thesis.

Everyone has played an integral part in the completion of this thesis, without each person's unique contribution it is difficult to imagine that it would have been completed. Thank you all.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Title .....	i
Dedication .....	ii
Abstract.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
Table of Contents.....	v
List of Tables and Figures .....	vii
 CHAPTERS:	
1. Introduction	
1.1 The Importance of End User Training (EUT) .....	1
1.2 Justification for Research.....	5
1.2.1 Relevance to Practitioners.....	7
1.2.2 The NZ context .....	8
1.3 Research Objectives .....	10
1.4 Limitations of the Study.....	11
1.5 Research Questions .....	13
1.6 Organisation of Thesis .....	16
2. Literature Review of EUT	
2.1 Introduction .....	18
2.2 Evaluation of Training and Learning Effectiveness.....	18
2.2.1 Description of Training Evaluation Models .....	18
2.3 Factors that impact EUT Effectiveness.....	20
2.3.1 Trainee Characteristics.....	22
2.3.1.1 Learning Styles.....	23
2.3.1.2 Self-Efficacy .....	24
2.3.1.3 Traits .....	27
2.3.2 Training Methods.....	28
2.3.3 Organisational Factors .....	31
2.3.3.1 Needs Analysis.....	31
2.3.3.2 Task-Technology Fit.....	34
2.3.3.3 User Support .....	34
2.4 Computer Based Training Methods .....	37
2.4.1 Advantages and Disadvantages of Online Training .....	38
2.4.2 Performance Support Systems (PSS) .....	41
2.5 Theoretical bases for EUT Research.....	43
2.5.1 Kolb's Learning Style Inventory (KLSI).....	44
2.5.2 Self-Efficacy.....	46
2.6 Conclusion .....	50
3. Research Methodology and Design	
3.1 Research Strategy .....	52
3.2 Case Study Research .....	55
3.3 Research Design.....	59
3.3.1 IS Theoretical Issues .....	59
3.3.2 Units of Analysis .....	61
3.3.3 Validity and Reliability.....	63
3.3.3.1 Construct Validity .....	64
3.3.3.2 Internal Validity.....	64
3.3.3.3 External Validity.....	64
3.3.3.4 Reliability .....	65
3.3.4 Data collection .....	65
3.3.4.1 Quantitative data .....	66
3.3.4.2 Qualitative data .....	69
3.3.5 Data analysis .....	72
3.4 Ethical Considerations .....	75
3.5 Summary.....	77

4.	The Present Study	78
4.1	Description of each case	78
4.1.1	Organisation A	78
4.1.1.1	Research Objectives	79
4.1.1.2	Research Design	81
4.1.2	Organisation B	82
4.1.2.1	Research Objectives	83
4.1.2.2	Research Design	84
4.1.3	Organisation C	85
4.1.3.1	Research Objectives	86
4.1.3.2	Research Design	87
4.1.4	Organisation D	88
4.1.4.1	Research Objectives	89
4.1.4.2	Research Design	90
4.2	Intra-organisation comparisons	91
4.2.1	Identification of Commonalities and Differences	91
4.2.2	Replication Propositions	93
4.3	Hypotheses for the Study	93
4.4	Summary	94
5.	Analysis and Results	
5.1	Introduction	95
5.2	Study Analysis	96
5.2.1	Hypotheses Testing	97
5.2.1.1	Chi-Squared Test	98
5.2.1.2	Kruskal-Wallis H-Test	103
5.2.1.3	One Way ANOVA and F-Test	105
5.2.2	Correlation Testing	107
5.2.2.1	Contingency Coefficient C	107
5.2.2.2	Spearman's Rank Correlation Coefficient	108
5.2.2.3	Multiple Regression and ANOVA	110
5.2.3	Learning Styles	112
5.2.4	Summary of Study Analysis	114
5.3	Case Analyses	116
5.3.1	Organisation A	119
5.3.2	Organisation B	120
5.3.2.1	Organisation B1	121
5.3.2.2	Organisation B2	122
5.3.3	Organisation C	123
5.3.4	Organisation D	124
5.3.5	Summary of Case Analyses	126
5.4	Summary of Data Analysis	127
6.	Discussion and Conclusions	
6.1	Introduction	128
6.2	Limitations of the Research	128
6.3	Discussion of Statistical Analysis	129
6.3.1	The Study's Hypotheses	129
6.3.2	The Study's Propositions	132
6.4	Value of the Research	134
6.4.1	Practitioner	134
6.4.2	Academic	136
6.5	Suggestions for further research	136
6.6	Conclusions	138

## 7. APPENDICES

1.	Invitation to organisations to participate in research .....	140
2.	Structure of initial interviews with training managers .....	142
3.	Data matrix showing units of analysis, variables and data sources .....	143
4.	Trainee demographic and skills self-evaluation questionnaire .....	144
5.	Training needs analysis and skills identification questionnaire .....	147
6.	Interview with training managers – guideline .....	150
7.	Interview sheets – trainee needs analysis .....	152
8.	Trainee information and participant consent form.....	153
9.	Proposal to Organisation B .....	155
10.	Raw Data Gathered from Organisations .....	156
11.	Average and Dependent Variable Calculations of Raw Data .....	160
12.	Complete Data Returned from Organisations .....	166

8.	REFERENCES .....	168
----	------------------	-----

## LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

## TABLES

1.1	..... Summary of Trainee Characteristics that Impact Training. (Goldstein, 1993; Tannebaum and Yukl, 1992).....	6
2.1	Characteristics of Kolb's Learning Styles.....	46
3.1	Terminologies for Stages of Case Research Programmes (Benbasat et al, 1987)	56
3.2	Summary of Case Study Attributes .....	58
3.3	Summary of Research Design Components.....	71
3.4	Data Analysis Techniques Available for Study Variables .....	74
4.1	Four Level Evaluation of Training (Kirkpatrick, 1998) .....	81
4.2	Summary Data for Cases in the Study.....	94
5.1	Statistical Tests Used for Data Analysis .....	96
5.2	Count and Percentage of Gender, Qualifications and Learning Styles .....	96
5.3	Frequency Data for Demographic Variables .....	98
5.4	Contingency Table and Chi-square Probabilities of Variables to Increased Skills ...	101
5.5	Chi-square probabilities for Combined Categories of Learning Styles .....	102
5.6	The Kruskal-Wallis H-Test of at Least Ordinal Variables.....	104
5.7	One Way ANOVA and F values of all variables .....	106
5.8	Calculated C Coefficients for Variables.....	107
5.9	Spearman Rank Correlation Coefficients.....	109
5.10	Multiple Regression Analysis to Percent Change in Skills.....	111
5.11	Position of each Learning Style for Magnitude of Variables' Averages .....	112
5.12	Descriptive Statistics of Learning Styles .....	114
5.13	Significant Correlations of Variables to Percent Increase in Skills by Learning Styles.....	116
5.14	Descriptive Statistics of Quantitative Variables for Organisations .....	117
5.15	Position of each Organisation for Magnitude of Variables.....	118
5.16	Organisational Support Factors Present in each Organisation.....	119
5.17	Average of Variables for Learning Styles Categories for Organisation A .....	120
5.18	Average of Variables for Learning Styles Categories for Organisation B1 .....	122
5.19	Average of Variables for Learning Styles Categories for Organisation B2 .....	123
5.20	Average of Variables for Learning Styles Categories for Organisation C.....	124
5.21	Average of Variables for Learning Styles Categories for Organisation D.....	126
5.22	Matrix of Training Methods by Learning Styles .....	127



## FIGURES

1.1	Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) (Davis et al, 1989).....	2
2.1	The Research Model for EUT (Bostrom et al, 1990).....	22
2.2	Training Strategy Framework (Sein et al, 1999) .....	32
2.3	Example of Contents-Level Framework for Needs Assessment (Nelson et. al, 1995) .....	33
2.4	A Framework for the Training and Learning Process (Compeau et al. 1995) .....	37
2.5	Kolb's Model of Experiential Learning (Kolb et al, 1995) .....	44
2.6	Diagrammatic representation of Kolb's Learning Style Grid (Bostrom et. al 1990)	45
2.7	The determinants and consequences of self-efficacy: A computer usage model (Igbaria and livari, 1995) .....	48
2.8	Multifaceted Model of Specific Computer Self-Efficacy (Marakas et al, 1998). .....	49
3.1	The Research Continuum .....	53
3.2	Conceptual Framework of End User Training .....	61
5.1	Learning Style Categories by Organisation.....	100
6.1	Framework for Conducting EUT.....	135