

WHO ARE ABUSING OUR CHILDREN?

An exploratory study on reflections on child abuse by media commentators

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
of
Master of Social Work
at
Massey University, Albany,
New Zealand

by

Raema Lesley Merchant

August 2010

Table of Contents

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background.....	1
1.2 Research questions	2
1.3 Thesis organisation.....	3
1.4 The scope of this study.....	3
1.5 Definitions and conceptual issues	4
1.6 Conclusion.....	6
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	7
2.1 Introduction	7
2.2 Historical context.....	7
2.3 Newspaper media	8
2.4 Role of the Media	10
2.5 Child abuse in relation to the media coverage.....	12
2.5.1 Crime reporting	12
2.5.2 Perceptions of child abuse as represented in the media	14
2.5.3 Do the media reflect or affect the world?.....	15
2.5.4 Effects of newspaper coverage of child abuse	16
2.5.5 Are there racial or racist assumptions made by newspaper media?.....	17
2.5.6 Media coverage of Māori issues	19
2.5.7 The “warrior” gene.....	22
2.5.8 Alternative responses to media coverage of physical child abuse	23

2.5.9	The role of professionals in media coverage of child abuse	24
2.6	Conclusion.....	25
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY _____		27
3.1	Introduction	27
3.2	Epistemology and theoretical paradigms.....	27
3.3	Methodologies	30
	i) Newspaper articles	30
	ii) Interviews	36
	iii) Statistical data	39
3.4	Ethical issues	41
3.5	Conclusion.....	41
CHAPTER FOUR: THE FINDINGS FROM THE NEWSPAPERS 2000-2007 _____		42
4.1	Newspaper Data.....	42
4.2	Distribution of articles.....	42
4.3	Content of articles.....	45
	i) Type of article	45
	ii) News Angles	46
4.4	What children are mentioned in the newspapers?	48
	i) Newspaper coverage	48
	ii) Demographics of children mentioned in media	51
	iii) Ethnicity	51
	iv) Age and Gender	53
	v) Relationship of perpetrator to child	54
	vi) Outcome of the physical abuse	55
CHAPTER FIVE: THE VOICES OF THE WRITERS _____		56
5.1	Introduction	56

5.2	Why did you write about child abuse?	57
5.3	What influences your writing? What informs you?	58
	i) Personal interests	59
	ii) Current events	59
	iii) Public issues and campaigns	60
	iv) Professional issues about child abuse	61
	v) Public demand	63
5.4	What type of writing do you do?	64
5.5	What is the role of a journalist?.....	67
5.6	Who is your audience?	68
5.7	What do you believe that your readers want/ expect/ like?.....	69
5.8	Who/what decides content of what you write?.....	71
5.9	What other sources of information do you access? Why?	74
5.10	How much of yourself do you put into your writing?.....	75

CHAPTER SIX: PERCEPTIONS OF THE WRITERS ABOUT PHYSICAL ABUSE _____ 79

6.11	What are your perceptions of perpetrators of physical abuse of children?.....	79
6.2	Who are the abusers?.....	80
	i) Socio-economic factors	80
	ii) Drugs and alcohol:	81
	iii) Ethnicity of abusers:	82
	iv) Family:	90
6.3	Did anything change your views having written this article? Do you write differently now?	93

CHAPTER SEVEN: FINDINGS FROM KNOWN STATISTICAL DATA IN NEW ZEALAND 2000-2007 _____ 95

7.1	Introduction	95
7.2	Child homicides and infanticide.....	95

i)	Age Distribution	96
ii)	Gender	97
iii)	Ethnicity	98
7.3	Substantiated physical abuse or serious assault requiring hospitalisation.....	100
i)	Age Distribution	100
ii)	Gender	102
iii)	Ethnicity	103
7.4	Convicted offenders of homicide or serious assault on children less than 14 years	105
i)	Adults convicted of physical assaults on children under fourteen years.	105
ii)	Murders of children	106
iii)	Gender of perpetrators	107
iv)	Ethnicity of perpetrators	108
v)	Method of assault	108
vi)	Sentencing outcomes	109

CHAPTER EIGHT: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION _____ 110

8.1	Introduction	110
8.2	Part one: Newspaper content	111
i)	What or who influences what is written about child abuse?	111
ii)	Peaks and troughs of reporting	112
iii)	Topics and news angles	112
iv)	Why do a few children get most of the publicity?	114
8.3	Part two: Relationship between official data and newspaper data- what does it mean?	114
i)	The subjective versus objective debate	114
ii)	Which demographics are important?	116
iii)	Public perception of physical child abuse	117
8.4	Part three –Bringing it together, making sense of the meanings	119

i) To what extent does media representation of physical child abuse reflect or represent racial or racist assumptions about the causes and incidence of child abuse?	119
8.5 Summary and Conclusions	126
8.6 Potential significance of the study.....	127
8.7 Limitations of the study.....	127
8.8 Future research opportunities	128
BIBLIOGRAPHY	129
APPENDIX I: LETTERS TO PARTICIPANTS	133
APPENDIX II: ETHICS APPROVAL	137
APPENDIX III: DATA FROM CYFS	138
APPENDIX IV: DATA FROM IPRU	140
APPENDIX V WOMEN’S AFFAIRS DATA	143
APPENDIX VI: NZ POLICE STATISTICS	145
APPENDIX VII: DEMOGRAPHICS OF CHILDREN IN THE MEDIA	147
APPENDIX VIII:NEWSPAPERS	SEE ENCLOSED CD

Abstract

This research explores what has been published in the print media on the topic of physical child abuse over an eight year period of time. The study encompasses news reports, feature articles, opinion columns and editorials written on the issue of physical child abuse in New Zealand from 2000 to 2007. Using inductive and exploratory research, qualitative data has been collected by capturing the voices from a range of media commentators and comparing these with data from newspaper articles and other sources of statistical data obtained from a statutory child protection agency, hospitals and police.

The research looks at how physical child abuse is represented in the newspaper media and explores whether there are accuracies or deficiencies in this reporting that may impact on public perceptions of child abuse. In particular, the study explores whether what is being written in the newspaper is objective or whether there is an in-built ethnic or social bias in the reporting of child abuse.

The findings of the three parts of the study are integrated and it is determined that there is a disproportionate reporting of child abuse based on a) the ethnicity of the child or perpetrator, b) the seriousness of the abuse, and c) the sensationalist nature of the incident of child abuse. Another significant finding is that media reflects and reinforces common views and perceptions of physical child abuse and that the public are exposed to only the “tip of the iceberg” in terms of accurate and balanced reporting.

The report concludes with a discussion about whether the media affects or reflects the worldview of physical child abuse. A symbiotic model is proposed which uses voices from the writers themselves to support the argument that there is a bi-directional relationship between the media and the public.

List of Tables

Table 3.1 Database Categories used to record newspaper articles:	33
Table 3.2 Sources of Data	40
Table 4.1 Time each case was in the media spotlight	50
Table 5-1 Demographics of Participants	56
Table 5-2 Participant Ideas	70
Table 8.1 Headlines From the Media.....	120

List of figures

Figure 2.1	Model of the Media	16
Figure 4.1	Articles on physical abuse per year 2000-2007	42
Figure 4.2	Articles written in each newspaper studied 2000-2007	43
Figure 4.3	Number of physical abuse cases in news each month 2000-2007	44
Figure 4.4	Distribution of articles on physical abuse according to type.....	45
Figure 4.5	Primary angles in the newspapers studied.....	47
Figure 4.6	Subordinate angles in the newspapers studied	47
Figure 4.7	Number of articles written per child	49
Figure 4.8	Media Coverage by Ethnicity of Victims	52
Figure 4.10	Media Coverage by Age.....	53
Figure 4.11	Media Coverage by Gender.....	53
Figure 4.12	Relationship of Perpetrator and Victim.....	54
Figure 4.13	Outcome of the Assault.....	55
Figure 7.1	Mortality by ages of victims 2000-2005	96
Figure 7.2	Total numbers of victims by age groups (Data for 2000-2007)	97
Figure 7.3	Victim Mortalities by gender each year 2000-2005	97
Figure 7.4	Deaths of Victims 2000-2005 by Ethnicity	98
Figure 7.5	Ethnicity of Child Victims 2000-2007.....	99
Figure 7.6	Deaths of Child Victims 2000-2005 by Ethnicity	99
Figure 7.7	Numbers of Physical Abuse Victims by Age 2004-2007.....	101
Figure 7.8	Distributions of Ages of Victims Per Year	101
Figure 7.9	Numbers of Physical Abuse Cases Per Year by Gender	102
Figure 7.10	Hospitalised Victims by Gender 2000-2007	103
Figure 7.11	Hospital Discharge Statistics by Ethnicities 2000-2007	103
Figure 7.12	Hospital Discharge Figures on Victims's Ethnicities 2000-2007	104
Figure 7.13	Ethnicities of Child Victims 2004-2007	104
Figure 7.14	Assaults on Child Victims Under 14 Years of Age 2000-2007.....	106
Figure 7.15	Numbers Murdered in Family Violence Incidents 2000-2004.....	106
Figure 7.16	Gender of Convicted Assault Offenders 2000-2007	107
Figure 7.17	Gender of Adults who murdered Children 2000-2004.....	107
Figure 7.18	Ethnicity of Convicted Offenders of Child Assault of 2000-2007	108
Figure 7.19	Modes of Assault on Child Victims 2000-2007	108
Figure 8.1	The logic flow of the discussion.....	111
Figure 8.2	A Proposed Model of Awareness in Physical Child Abuse.....	118
Figure 8.3	Ethnicity imbalances between media and official statistics	120
Figure 8.4	The proposed model of symbiosis between the media and public.....	124

Acknowledgements

This thesis has been an interesting journey and I could not have achieved it without the help and support of many people. Firstly, I would like to thank the journalists and media commentators who willingly gave their time and shared their experiences with me. Child abuse can be a difficult and emotionally demanding topic to write about, and I admire the honesty and integrity shown in the interviews.

To my supervisors, Dr Mike O'Brien and Dr Fiona Te Momo, thank you for your support and academic guidance in this venture, and for your flexibility and understanding when a final thesis seemed less than likely.

I am indebted to the never-ending support of my children, their men-folk, my sisters and my colleagues who have been with me steadfastly throughout the times when the end of the tunnel seemed a long way off, and more recently, with proof-reading, helpful critique and coffee.

Most importantly, I wish to acknowledge my husband Ray, and Lauren, Philippa, Erin, Ngaire and Anna who believed in me from the beginning. Ray, nothing would have been achieved without your total support, understanding, love, and hours and hours of being a patient listener to my ideas as I worked.

Finally, as I have been on this journey, I have become aware of the need for all people to work together to address the horror of child abuse in this country, and to this end, I hope that this study can be used somehow to help achieve this.

Naku te rourou nau te rourou ka ora ai nga tamariki – with your basket and my basket, the children will live.