

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

TE RĒRENGA O TE RĀ

**AUTONOMY AND IDENTITY:
MĀORI EDUCATIONAL ASPIRATIONS**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Education

At
Massey University
Palmerston North
New Zealand

Arohia E. Durie

2001

ABSTRACT

Te Rerenga o te Rā, Autonomy and Identity: Māori Educational Aspirations explores the many factors that impact on Māori educational aspirations. Both historical and contemporary trends and patterns are analysed including comparative case studies of two other indigenous peoples, in order to identify the reasons why there is disjunction between educational policies and Māori aims. The first part of the thesis comprises an historical and contemporary analysis of the relationship between Māori and the State, including a comparative exploration of indigeneity. The second part comprises a critique of Māori education research and argues for an indigenous methodology for understanding the lived reality of Māori 'at school'. The third part comprises critical policy analysis and draws conclusions as to Māori educational aspirations. An extensive examination of policy, together with interviews with forty Māori men and women formed the basis of this research.

Major educational policies are reviewed alongside wider policies and politics in order to demonstrate the connections between the position of Māori within Aotearoa - New Zealand, and the likelihood of meeting educational aspirations. The use of narrative is a standard method of information transfer in a Māori cultural context and was deliberately chosen as a research method for that reason.

The stories about education from participants, about their own times at school, and about the pursuit of their own goals, add a personal element that bring life to the findings and spirit to the inferences.

There is no single factor that will predictably lead to the fulfilment of aspirations but several major conclusions have been drawn. The first is that any analysis of Māori educational performance requires a consideration of the wider policy frameworks within which educational practice is conducted. It is of limited value to assess classroom interaction without being cognisant of the context that gives shape to the practice. The thesis draws a strong link between the degree of Māori enthusiasm for education and the extent of the state's recognition of Māori in its policies and the legislation.

The second major conclusion is that socio-economic standing, while an important measure, is not by itself a sufficient indicator of Māori aspirations. Attention is drawn to the difference between attaining socio-economic parity with non-Māori and being able to live as Māori. The third is that the retention of a cultural identity is a critical determinant of Māori satisfaction and the ability to determine directions for the future is another. Both identity and autonomy are seen as significant prerequisites for the development of an education system that is aligned with Māori objectives.

He Mihi

*Titiro ō mata ki Hikurangi maunga, ki te toka whakairo e tū ake nei
Whakarere iho ki te riutanga o Waiapu ki ngā mātākurae o Te Tai Rawhiti
Porourangi tipuna, Porourangi tangata!
Whakawhiti atu ki Te Whetumatarau, ki Te Kawakawa mai Tawhiti
Ka tau ki Hinerupe e rere rā koe Awatere ki waho rā ki pae tawhiti e!
Ka piko atu anō rā ki Horoera ki Mātahi o te Tau
Tākiri mai te ata ka rere ko te rā!
Rere ana ki Te Motu o Kaiawa ki Ngā Kuri a Tarawhata
Hōatu to kauhau tangata ki uta, pikitia ake te tīhi taumata ki Ōtiki
Ka mārama te titiro ki Rangiatea, ki Matarēhua – kāinga o Te Whānau a
Tarahauiti Tau ake rā ki Te Ahikāroa, ki Te Tipare o Niu
E ara ki Te Roto o Kautuku, ki te manawa ora o te iwi
E tiu koe e taku manu kōrero! Koi, koi, koia e ara e!*

Kei nga maunga kōrero, pari karangaranga puta noa te motu, tena koutou katoa. Koia tēnei ko te kupu whakamihī atu i runga i te karanga whānui o tēnei kaupapa rangahau e kīia nei ko 'Te Rerenga o te Rā'. Ko te tūmanako ia, mā ngā whakaputanga o tēnei kaupapa rangahau, e āheī ai te iwi Māori kia eketia ngā taumata teitei o te mātauranga, kia tū rangatira ai tātou katoa i roto i te Ao Mārama.

Tēnei anō te tuku mihi atu ki nga puna kōrero, otirā ki a koutou katoa i tautokohia ai tēnei kaupapa mahi. Ko koutou anō te take i whakatīnanahia ai ngā wawata o roto i te kukū o taku manawa. Nō reira tēnā rawa atu koutou.

Ko te mātauranga hoki he ara tika hei whāinga mā tātou katoa. Ko te pūtake o ēnei kōrero he arahi i a tātou i runga i tēnei ara.

'Ko te pae tawhiti whaia kia tata, ko te pae tata whakamaui kia tīnā'

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

While in the end this undertaking was my own, it would not have been possible without the cooperation, support, and encouragement of others.

There were many who pioneered Māori educational advancement and they have left a lasting legacy of dedication beyond the cause, absolute commitment to their pupils, and champions of the rights of learners. Their efforts are part of the heritage that gives Māori education a distinctive character.

Nā rātou i whakatakoto tēnei kaupapa. Nā rātou te kī.

I am also conscious of the scholars and researchers who have preceded me. Much of their work has been quoted in this thesis and regardless of the viewpoints advocated, I have appreciated their writings and wisdom, and the opportunity to study their work in a wide range of publications. Teachers from many persuasions, learners at primary, secondary and tertiary levels, and parents and grandparents, have similarly left their mark on this thesis. In that respect I am particularly grateful to the forty people whose stories provided the substance for chapters 8 and 9. Their recollections and keen insights have been invaluable and incredibly illuminating. Tēna koutou.

Closer to home, I wish to acknowledge my two supervisors, Professors John Codd and Richard Harker. Although their tolerance was often tested, their advice and constructive criticism was never failing and has been much appreciated. So too has the quiet support from Te Uru Māraurau, the Department of Māori and Multicultural Education at Massey University.

Finally, I am grateful to my own family, and the wider whānau, for bearing with me, and more than that, for never doubting the outcome. Tēna koutou katoa.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	i
He Kupu Mihi	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Table of Contents	v
List of Appendices	xi
Glossary of Māori Terms	xii
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
Māori Educational Participation	1
Research Aim	3
Overview	5
The Waitangi Tribunal	7
Crises within Crises	8
Māori Political Representation	10
Power Shifts	11
State Control	14
The Welfare State	16
The Neo-liberal Reforms	17
Ideological Misfits	18
Whānau Expectations	22
Curriculum	27
Contested Knowledges	30
Mahi Rangahau: Research Strategies	33

PART ONE

THE LEGACY OF COLONIALISM: RESISTANCE AND STRUGGLE

Chapter 2	Māori and the State	36
	Establishment of the State	36
	The Historical Context of the Treaty	36
	Power and Control: Aotearoa-New Zealand as a nation state	43
	Māori Claims	47
	Principles of the Treaty	47
	Māori Participation in the Affairs of the Nation	51
	Defining the Partnership	52
	Role of the State	55
	The Welfare State	59
	The Minimal State	60
	Constitutional Arrangements	61
	The Bi-national State	62
Chapter 3	Māori Representation and Representations of Māori	63
	Fairness and Justice	63
	Constitutional Reform	65
	The King Movement – Māori Sovereignty	69
	Right Rites	72
	Instruments for Justice	77
	Equality of Representation	79
	Colonial Stories	80
	Nation Building	84
	Conclusion	85
Chapter 4	Indigeneity	87
	Sovereignty Claims	89
	Indigenous Aspirations for Autonomy	90

Indigeneity versus sovereignty	97
Doctrine	99
Decolonisation	100
Who is indigenous?	101
Indigenisation	103
International Recognition of Indigenous Rights	105
Educational Case Studies	110
Saami Experiences	110
Nisga'a Experiences	114

PART TWO

MĀORI AT SCHOOL: VOICES FROM EXPERIENCE

Chapter 5 Re-searching Māori Education 119

Colonialism and Research	119
Critical or Critique?	121
Research Positioning	128
International Comparisons	131
Researchers as agents of imperialism	136
Good Research	140
False Premises	142
Māori Standpoints	143
Māori Freedom Models for Māori Development	156
Te Hoe Nuku Roa	157
Cultural and Ethnic Factors	158
Appropriate and Appropriation	158
Diasporic logic	161

Chapter 6	A Paradigm for Māori Research: Ngākau Māori	166
	Methodological Considerations	
	New Perspectives	166
	Ngākau Māori Research	169
	Māori Development Research	171
	Iringa Korero - Narrative Research	173
	Analysis	176
	Ethicality	179
	Research Ethics Committees	179
	Ethical Themes	181
	Ngākau Māori Research and Ethicality	184
	The Mana Factor	184
	Benefiting from Research	186
	Forty Voices	187
Chapter 7	Māori at School: Forty Voices	188
	Stories and Narratives	188
	Participants	191
	Wāhanga Korero: Hearing the Voices	194
	Analysis: Tāhuhu iringa korero	196
	Five Themes	197
	Readiness for Life	197
	Being Māori	202
	Māori at Home	217
	Motivation	217
	Diminished Horizons	220
	Forms of Discrimination	223
	Catching the Tide	228

PART THREE

EDUCATIONAL POLICY AND CULTURAL IDENTITY

Chapter 8	Policy Discourse in Māori Education	230
	In Search of a School	230
	Policy Directions	232
	Assimilation	233
	Integration	235
	Biculturalism	244
	Autonomy	248
	Māori in Mainstream English Schools	251
	Policy Platforms	254
	Hui Taumata	255
	Te Urupare Rangapu	257
	Devolution	258
	Ka Awātea	259
	Re-centralisation	262
	Gaps or Spaces	264
	A Māori Education Authority	268
	The Ministry of Education	270
	The Broad Strategies	272
Chapter 9	Māori Educational Aspirations: Contradictions and Compromises	
	Context and Compromises	276
	Inequality	278
	Kāwanatanga, Kura and Kainga	283
	Te Reo Māori, The Māori Language	286
	Monocultural Ideals	287
	Urbanisation	288
	Curriculum Progress	294
	Māori Identity	298
	Māori in Education	299

School Administration	302
Reports	305
Teacher Education	308
Whānau Wellbeing	310
Chapter 10 Education and Māori Identity: Conclusion	313
Epilogue	320
He Rārangi Whakapuakanga: References	324

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples

Appendix 2: Interview Questions

*

GLOSSARY OF MĀORI TERMS

Ahikaa	retention of a territorial right by continuing occupation
Ākoranga Māori	Māori learning and teaching
Āpiti hono	joining together
Hāhi	church or religion
Hapū	tribe
Hawaiki	a homeland in the Pacific; point of origin for early voyagers
He Whakapūtanga o te Rangatiratanga o Nū Tirene	the Declaration of Independence
Huarahi	road, pathway, direction
Hui	a gathering, seminar, or conference
Iwi	tribe, or people
Ka Awātea	title of a report for the Minister of Māori Affairs, signifying a new beginning
Kainga	home, village
Kapa Haka	performing arts
Kaumātua	older person, elder
Kaupapa Māori	Māori agenda; Māori focused activities
Kāwanatanga	the government
Kawenata	covenant (used to describe the Treaty of Waitangi)
Kingitanga	Māori king movement
Kō	a digging implement
Kohanga Reo	Māori language nest
Kōrero	talk, discussion
‘Ko te pae tawhiti whaia kia tata, ko te pae tata whakamaua kia tina’.	‘Seek out the distant horizons and cherish those you attain’.
Kura	School
Kura Kaupapa	Schools where Māori language and values are practiced
Mahi Rangahau	research activity

Mahinga kai	traditional food sites
Mana a iwi	the standing of a tribe
Mana Moana	tribal authority over water
Mana Motuhake	autonomy
Mana tangata	personal dignity
Mana whakahaere	rights to undertake an activity or process
Mana whenua	traditional rights over land
Marae	tribal or community gathering place
Marae ātea	ceremonial gathering place
Mātauranga Māori	Māori knowledge
Mate	sickness or death
Nga āhuatanga - noho-a-tangata	social policy
Nga Matatini Māori	Māori diversity
Ngā - Whakanekeneketanga	change over time
Ngākau Māori	a research method based on commitment to Māori
O rātou taonga katoa	all their possessions
Paihere Tangata	collectivity and common bonds
Pākehā	New Zealander of Anglo-Saxon descent
Pāngarau	mathematics
Putaiiao	science
Rangahau Māori	Māori research
Rangatiratanga	authority
Roopu Māori	a Māori group
Runanga	tribal or community council
Taha Māori	a Māori component
Takatakahi mana	disrespect for authority
Takiwā	region,district
Tangata whenua	indigenous status
Taonga	valued possession
Taonga katoa	all valued possessions
Tapu	system of prohibition
Tatai hono	joining together
Te ao Māori	the Māori world

Tēna koutou	greetings
Te reo Māori	Māori language (or tongue)
Tikanga	rules, regulations
Tino rangatiratanga	absolute authority
Tipuna	ancestor
Tupu	growth
Turangawaewae	ancestral land
Waitohu	indicator
Whakakotahi	unity
Whakamana	create pride, esteem
Whakapapa	geneology
Whakatauaki	proverb
Whānau	extended family, or a group behaving as if it were a family