

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Participation and  
Project Sustainability:  
Participatory Integrated Development in  
Rain-fed Areas (PIDRA) Project in East  
Java-Indonesia**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of  
the requirement for the degree of

Master of Philosophy  
in  
Development Studies

at Massey university, Palmerston North,  
New Zealand

**Komalawati  
2008**

## **ABSTRACT**

This thesis examines the relationships between participation and project sustainability. By using the Participatory Integrated Development in the Rain-fed Areas (PIDRA), an integrated rural development project, in three districts of East Java, Indonesia, as a case study, it addresses the question about what kind of participation will lead the intended beneficiaries to continue to use and benefit from the services that remain beyond the project period.

The research found that the project mostly targeted the poor, marginalised, and vulnerable people, and widows as household heads. However, some high school graduates and wealthy villagers were also included as target beneficiaries. Most participants were actively involved and participated in the project implementation activities, but rarely participated in project planning and design as well as monitoring and evaluation. The results also show that factors influencing participation of the intended beneficiaries of the PIDRA Project in the target areas were: the responsibility of the beneficiaries to the groups as members and as leaders part of the management team; the level of education, knowledge, and skills of participants; incentives provided to access credits; the availability and use of sanctions; the geographical situation; poverty; age; support from the government; and the role of facilitators.

Analysis of the case study shows that the PIDRA Project in East Java will likely have some sustainable activities and benefits in the short term. Furthermore, participation is likely lead to the project sustainability of some project elements when participation is not only used as a means but also as an end. However, the results also suggest the increasing cooperation and collaboration of government and the NGOs, and defining participant groups based on similar educational background and socio-economic situation will enhance participation and project sustainability. This study would also raise the attention of development practitioners of the dangers of the participatory approach in their practice because it could be manipulative, harm people who are supposed to be advantaged, and hence create “new tyranny” in development interventions.

*This thesis is dedicated to Apa, Emih, and Mbah Caca,  
my beloved parents, D. Subardja and N. Sumiati,  
and to my loving brothers, Dian and Raihan,  
as well as my lovely cousins, Niar and Tika*

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

The research and writing of this thesis have been a valuable experience because I have not only felt the frustration, but I also found excitement and reward during the process. Furthermore, through this thesis, I was able to learn a lot of important lessons that I could not gain from formal education, as well as able to meet new friends and develop networks with them.

Firstly and foremost, I would like to give my deepest love and gratitude to my family, parents, brothers and sisters, for their prayers and support for me to study in New Zealand far away from my home country, Indonesia. I would also like to give my gratitude to my previous supervisor, Mr. Hudoyo, friends, and colleagues at the Food Security Agency, Ministry of Agriculture of Indonesia for giving me motivation and assistance during my study and field research.

I would also like to thank all participants in Pacitan, Ponorogo, and Trenggalek for taking the time to talk to me and in responding to my questions, specifically the facilitators from three districts. I would like to give my warmest thanks to Mba Titik, the facilitator at Pacitan District, Mr. Lukito from the PIDRA Management of Ponorogo District and the staff of AL-GHEINS, as well as Mba Titi, Mr. Ari, and the PIDRA Management of Trenggalek District who had helped me during my field research. Their assistance made my research go smoothly and they gave me valuable information that I needed to complete this thesis research.

At the New Zealand end, I would like to express my gratitude to my chief supervisor, Associate Professor Dr Glenn Banks, for providing me with academic guidance and constructive comments, as well as motivation to finish my thesis. I would also like to give my appreciation to my second supervisor, Dr Nawal El-Gack, for providing me with suggestions as well as constructive comments to improve the quality of my thesis. I would like to thank Olive, Sylvia, Sue, staff of the International Student Office, and the NZAID for giving me the opportunity and trust to complete this thesis. Special thanks to

my dear friends, Mimi, Sunema and Ralph, for accompanying me and giving me support when I felt down and lost my strength during thesis writing. Thanks to Jing Jing, Mauro, and Richard as well as other friends and lecturers from Development Studies who gave their encouragement and constructive suggestions that made me feel confident in writing this thesis. I would not forget the last but not the least, my thanks to Kim Penny for giving me suggestions and proofreading my thesis, as well as the staff of Student Learning Development Services for assisting me with difficult grammar questions.

Overall, I would like to give my sincere gratitude to Allah the Al-Mighty, the God of the Universe, for providing me with strength, guidance, patient, and knowledge to complete this thesis.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ABSTRACT</b>	ii
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	iv
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>	vi
<b>LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES</b>	ix
<b>I. INTRODUCTION</b>	1
1.1 The Background of the Research	1
1.2 Research Justification	3
1.3 Research Objectives	5
1.4 Thesis Outline	5
<b>II. THE NATURE OF PARTICIPATION AND PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY</b>	7
2.1 Introduction	7
2.2 The Nature and Concept of Participation	7
2.2.1 Definition of Participation	7
2.2.2 Typologies of Participation	8
2.3 Sustainability	13
2.3.1 The Nature and Concept of Sustainability	15
2.4 Participation and Project Sustainability	17
2.4.1 The Relationships between Participation and Project Sustainability	17
2.4.2 Some Examples of Studies on Participation and Project Sustainability	21
2.4.3 Participation and Sustainability: Reported Indicators	25
2.5 Conclusion	34
<b>III. BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY AREA</b>	37
3.1 Introduction	37
3.2 The PIDRA Project in Indonesia	37
3.2.1 Indonesia	37
3.2.2 Indonesia and the PIDRA Project	39
3.3 The PIDRA Project in East Java-Indonesia	47
3.3.1 East Java-Indonesia	47
3.3.2 East Java and the PIDRA Project	49
3.4 Conclusion	53

<b>IV.</b>	<b>RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</b>	55
4.1	Introduction	55
4.2	Fieldwork Preparation	56
4.2.1	Research Approach	57
4.2.2	The Selection of the Case Study Areas	57
4.2.3	The Ethical Issues	58
4.3	Fieldwork	61
4.3.1	The Implementation of Research in the Target Areas	63
4.3.2	Methodology Used and the Applications in the Field	65
4.4	Data Analysis	68
4.5	Reflections and Introspections	69
4.5.1	The Advantage of Undertaking a Research in My Home Country	69
4.5.2	The Challenges in the Field Research	70
4.5.3	The Limitations of the Research	73
4.6	Conclusion	74
<b>V.</b>	<b>THE NATURE OF PARTICIPATION AND THE PERCEPTION OF SUSTAINABILITY</b>	77
5.1	Introduction	77
5.2	The Key Target Participants and Their Involvement in the PIDRA Project in Target Areas	77
5.2.1	The Key Participants of the PIDRA Project in the Target Areas	77
5.2.2	The Process of Identifying the Group's Target Participants	79
5.2.3	The Involvement of Target Participants in the Project	83
5.3	Problems, Challenges, and Factors Influencing Participation of Participants in the Target Areas	88
5.3.1	Problems and Challenges Influencing Participation of Participants and the Potential Sustainability of the Project	89
5.3.2	Factors Influencing Participation in Three Districts of East Java	93
5.4	The Perception of Sustainability of the PIDRA Project in the Target Areas According to the Project Stakeholders	100
5.4.1	The Perception of Sustainability According to the Participants	100
5.4.2	The Perception of Sustainability According to Government Employee and the NGOs	102
5.4.3	The Perception of Sustainability According to the Stakeholders	105
5.5	Conclusion	105
<b>VI.</b>	<b>THE LIKELY SUSTAINABILITY OF THE PIDRA PROJECT</b>	107



6.1	Introduction	107
6.2	An Analysis of the Participation Level of the Target Participants	107
6.3	An Analysis of Participation Indicators Leading to Project Sustainability	111
6.4	The Likely Sustainability of the PIDRA Project in the Target Areas	128
6.5	The Kind of Participation Enhances the Likely Sustainability of the Project	131
6.6	Conclusion	133
<b>VII.</b>	<b>CONCLUSION</b>	135
7.1	Summary of Research Findings	135
7.2	Suggestions and Recommendations	137
	<b>REFERENCES</b>	141
	<b>APPENDICES</b>	150

# LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

## List of Tables

Table 2.2.	Pretty's Typology of Participation	9
Table 2.3.	Categorising Passive and Active Participation in the Literature	11
Table 3.3.	The Promotion of SHGs in the PIDRA Project between 2004 and 2007	44
Table 3.6.	The Targeted Areas and Intended Participants of the PIDRA Project in East Java	51
Table 5.5.	Internal and External Problems and Challenges for Beneficiaries' Participation in the Target Areas	90

## List of Figures

Figure 2.1.	Eight rungs on a ladder of citizen participation	8
Figure 3.1.	The Map of Indonesia	38
Figure 3.2.	The Location of the PIDRA Project in Indonesia	41
Figure 3.4.	The Map of East Java and Java Island	48
Figure 3.5.	The Location of the PIDRA Project in East Java	50
Figure 5.1.	The Reasons for Selection According to the Participants	81
Figure 5.2.	Access to Information about the Project	82
Figure 5.3.	Motivation to Participate	83
Figure 5.4.	Overall Participation of the Participants of the PIDRA Project in the Target Areas	84
Figure 5.6.	Factors Influencing Participation of the Participants	93
Figure 5.7.	The Reasons for the Likely Sustainability of the PIDRA Project in the Target Areas According to Participants	101
Figure 5.8.	The Likely Sustainability of the PIDRA Project in the Short Term According to the Government Employee and NGOs	103
Figure 6.1.	The Contributions of the Participants to the PIDRA Project in the Target Areas	118

## Photo Pages

Photo Page 1.	Images of the Project Areas in East Java, Indonesia	75
Photo Page 2.	The Activities during the Field Research	76