

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

A case study of a contentious education policy: The origins and operations  
of the bulk funding of teachers' salaries in New Zealand: 1815-2015

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of  
Doctor of Education

Doctorate in Education

at Massey University, Manawatu, New Zealand

Perry David Bayer

2015

## **Abstract**

Bulk funding as an education policy was immensely controversial, and served to polarise the New Zealand educational community and the wider New Zealand public throughout the eight years of its operation between 1992 and 2000. Even now, fifteen years after its demise, the research undertaken for this thesis shows that bulk funding still has the power to divide people and to excite strong passions. Both the supporters and the opponents of bulk funding tended to demonise the opposite side. Each side would also tend to feel that they had uncovered profound educational truths and that they had the right arguments on their side. Therefore, each side tended to believe that their opponents could negate their arguments only by resorting to 'slandorous' speech and to 'libelous' writings. Some of the key participants in the bulk funding debate were able to be interviewed for this thesis. It quickly became apparent just how wide the gap between the two parties was during the 1990s and is still today.

The research undertaken for this study has discovered that there are often tensions between the central education authorities who devise and impose policy and the local authorities who have to implement it. Bulk funding would seem to be a classic example of the perennial tensions between the centre and the localities. These tensions are a thread that runs throughout the course of New Zealand educational history. Bulk funding did not emerge out of a vacuum. Therefore, it was decided to adopt a "forward moving" historical narrative approach instead of a "history of the present." My research showed that there have been precursors to this policy right from the time of the first mission schools in the Bay of Islands from 1815 onwards. This study found that these distant historical forebears had to be investigated in order to make more sense of what occurred in the 1990s.

Finally, being at a distance from New Zealand and working as a secondary school teacher in Hong Kong where teachers are generally well respected as Chan (2008) noted, it was interesting for me as a 'distant researcher' to look back to New Zealand and to the case of bulk funding.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I acknowledge the invaluable support of my supervisors, Professors Roger Openshaw and John Clark, as well as that of my wife, Liliana Bayer (LLB).

I also acknowledge the gracious co-operation of my eight interview subjects who appear in the Appendices as well as in the body of the work.

The patience and professionalism of staff at Archives New Zealand and the Alexander Turnbull Library in Wellington, New Zealand, is also very much appreciated.

Lastly, my heartfelt thanks go to Dr. Annie K. C. Chan, my patient and supportive Principal at CCC Ming Kei College here in Hong Kong. Thank you to Dr. Chan for also serving as my Co-Supervisor.

Perry David Bayer

Hong Kong

28 February 2015



MASSEY UNIVERSITY

27 August 2010

Perry Bayer  
5/A, T22, South Horizons  
Ap Lei Chau  
HONG KONG

Dear Perry

**Re: The Bulk Funding Debate in New Zealand, 1975-2011: A Case Study of National Public Policy Contestation**

Thank you for your Low Risk Notification which was received on 18 August 2010.

Your project has been recorded on the Low Risk Database which is reported in the Annual Report of the Massey University Human Ethics Committees.

The low risk notification for this project is valid for a maximum of three years.

Please notify me if situations subsequently occur which cause you to reconsider your initial ethical analysis that it is safe to proceed without approval by one of the University's Human Ethics Committees.

Please note that travel undertaken by students must be approved by the supervisor and the relevant Pro Vice-Chancellor and be in accordance with the Policy and Procedures for Course-Related Student Travel Overseas. In addition, the supervisor must advise the University's Insurance Officer.

**A reminder to include the following statement on all public documents:**

*"This project has been evaluated by peer review and judged to be low risk. Consequently, it has not been reviewed by one of the University's Human Ethics Committees. The researcher(s) named above are responsible for the ethical conduct of this research.*

*If you have any concerns about the conduct of this research that you wish to raise with someone other than the researcher(s), please contact Professor John O'Neill, Director (Research Ethics), telephone 06 350 5249, e-mail humanethics@massey.ac.nz".*

Please note that if a sponsoring organisation, funding authority or a journal in which you wish to publish requires evidence of committee approval (with an approval number), you will have to provide a full application to one of the University's Human Ethics Committees. You should also note that such an approval can only be provided prior to the commencement of the research.

Yours sincerely

John G O'Neill (Professor)  
Chair, Human Ethics Chairs' Committee and  
Director (Research Ethics)

cc Prof Roger Openshaw  
School of Educational Studies  
PN900

Prof Howard Lee, HoS  
School of Educational Studies  
PN900

Assoc Prof John Clark  
School of Educational Studies  
PN900

Mrs Roseanne MacGillivray  
Graduate School of Education  
PN900

---

Massey University Human Ethics Committee  
Accredited by the Health Research Council

Te Kūnenga  
ki Pūrehuroa

Research Ethics Office, Massey University, Private Bag 11222, Palmerston North 4442, New Zealand  
T +64 6 350 5573 +64 6 350 5575 F +64 6 350 5622  
E humanethics@massey.ac.nz animaethics@massey.ac.nz gtc@massey.ac.nz  
www.massey.ac.nz

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                                                                                                        |       |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| Chapter 1 - The Research Problem.....                                                                  | 1     |
| Chapter 2 - Historical Sources.....                                                                    | 24    |
| Chapter 3 - Localisation and later trends towards<br>Centralization: 1815-1942.....                    | 48    |
| Chapter 4 - The centralised education model mostly<br>in the ascendant: 1942-1975.....                 | 81    |
| Chapter 5 - Seeds of change: A decade foreshadowing<br>a new direction: 1976-1987.....                 | 105   |
| Chapter 6 - Picot presages the future: 1987-1989.....                                                  | 134   |
| Chapter 7 - A state of siege: 1989-1991.....                                                           | 155   |
| Chapter 8 - Careers at stake: 1992-1999 .....                                                          | 176   |
| Chapter 9 - Afterglow – Life after Dr. Smith: 1996-2015 and<br>the bulk funding policy: 1999-2015..... | 195   |
| Chapter 10 – Conclusion .....                                                                          | 214   |
| References.....                                                                                        | 236   |
| Appendix I – Austin interview .....                                                                    | i     |
| Appendix II – Brash email interview .....                                                              | ix    |
| Appendix III – Fancy interview .....                                                                   | x     |
| Appendix IV – Gordon interview .....                                                                   | xviii |
| Appendix V – Hearn Smith interview .....                                                               | xxix  |
| Appendix VI – Peachey interview .....                                                                  | xxxv  |
| Appendix VII – Shattky interview.....                                                                  | xlv   |
| Appendix VIII – Smith interview .....                                                                  | li    |