

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Searching for good evaluation:  
a hīkoi**

**A thesis submitted for the  
degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy  
in Public Policy  
at Massey University, Albany,  
New Zealand**

**Sandra Kerr Brown**

**2012**



## **Abstract**

This thesis uses the metaphor of a journey, a hīkoi, as a methodology for exploring programme evaluation in Aotearoa New Zealand and further afield. The word hīkoi meaning walk or march, was the name given to the mobilisation of large numbers of Māori (indigenous New Zealanders) in street marches to Aotearoa New Zealand's parliament to claim justice and self-determination premised on the Treaty of Waitangi. Hīkoi has become associated with these marches and the concept of a collective journey of Māori towards self-determination.

This doctoral hīkoi is an exploration of the movement in Aotearoa New Zealand toward tino rangatiratanga – Māori self-determination in programme evaluation.

Hīkoi is a research methodology and an approach to evaluation. It is based on a Kaupapa Māori theoretical platform where the focus is on the journey. It is a collective journey, where goals are negotiated and shared, relationships highly valued and the journey is as important as reaching a destination. Hīkoi relationships drove the direction of this research and shaped the research question: What makes evaluation good for Māori and other indigenous peoples? <sup>1</sup>

The thesis explores this overarching question from a number of different perspectives on the journey. One key finding is that tino rangatiratanga over evaluations is important in order for evaluation processes and outcomes to be meaningful and useful to Māori.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Indigenous* is a term of self-identification. In this thesis the term is used based on the following (United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues): Self-identification as indigenous peoples at the individual level and accepted by the community as their member; Historical continuity with pre-colonial and/or pre-settler societies; Strong link to territories and surrounding natural resources; Distinct social, economic or political systems; Distinct language, culture and beliefs; Form non-dominant groups of society; Resolve to maintain and reproduce their ancestral environments and systems as distinctive peoples and communities.

The proliferation of Kaupapa Māori and ‘by Māori for Māori’ evaluations in recent years is an indication that significant progress has been made towards tino rangtiratanga, but there is some distance to travel before Māori worldviews and values are normative in the evaluations of all programmes that impact Māori communities. Findings indicate that Māori progress toward self-determination is greater than for many other indigenous peoples. Some are just beginning their journeys. The research reveals some of the benefits of indigenous peoples joining together to support each other, wherever they are at, on the indigenous evaluation hīkoi.

## Acknowledgements

To all my whānau, friends and colleagues who held out the hope that one day I would finally finish this doctoral journey – Ka nui te mihi ki ā koutou.

Thanks also to my colleagues at Te Rōpū Whāriki, Massey University. We learnt many things as we journeyed together and we had a lot of fun on the way - I needed that.

I would also like to thank my Supervisors: Professor Sally Casswell for starting the journey with me while Helen finished her PhD; Associate Professor Helen Moewaka Barnes for finishing your own PhD in time to be my supervisor and for having the best ideas ever; Dr Paul Duignan for staying the course even when you did not know where on earth I was (literally); and Dr E. Jane Davidson for completing such an awesome team of Supervisors.

Thanks go to my son Jake just for being you and to my husband Jim because in your own weird way you make every day a joy.

And to our creator without whom there would be no journey.

*He mahinga hoki tātou nāna, he mea hanga i roto i a Karaiti Ihu mo ngā mahi pai i whakaritea e te Atua i mua hei hāerērenga mō tātou.*

*Epeha 2:10*

A Tertiary Education Commission Top Achiever Doctoral Scholarship and a Building Research Capacity in the Social Sciences Doctoral Completion Award supported the writing of this thesis.

## **Preface**

Embarking on a doctorate is always the beginning of a journey, a hīkoi. Hīkoi has come to stand for a mass movement towards Māori self-determination. On this hīkoi I have been joined by, and joined with, an interesting array of individuals, groups and communities. Throughout the papers that make up the chapters of this thesis, I have endeavoured to acknowledge my fellow travelers for it would not have been a hīkoi were I travelling alone. I have not stuck rigidly to the academic convention of surnames followed by references but have put into the introduction the full names of people who have helped me on my hīkoi. This is not to downplay the importance of academic referencing, but because the academic convention privileges those that have academic writing to reference and privileges writing as the primary source of knowledge transfer. Many of the people who taught me the most on the hīkoi have not written their knowledge for an academic audience to reference and quote. Somewhere on the journey I have met all of the people I refer to in the introduction – they are not to me merely evaluators or authors, keynote speakers, funders, stakeholders or colleagues. They are people I know personally, many of whom I had the privilege of sharing food and fun with, and numerous conversations about evaluation. It has been from many of these informal conversations that I have learned the most.

Lastly, my doctoral hīkoi was a long one. In the middle I was given permission to suspend my registration so that I could take up duties as the acting Director of Te Rōpū Whāriki (Whāriki) where I was working. This was an invaluable way station on my journey because it enabled me to deepen my understanding of how evaluations are carried out in practice. I was also called away from my doctoral work to get involved in working with indigenous evaluators in Alaska to help build their evaluation capability.

This has now led to my receiving a Fulbright fellowship to continue working with them and it is to this next chapter of my ongoing evaluation hīkoi that I am now heading. What I quickly realised on my hīkoi was that, as with so many other aspects of indigenous life, there are no clear boundaries between academic demands and the demands of the community.

## Table of Contents

<b>Abstract</b> .....	<b>iii</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	<b>v</b>
<b>Preface</b> .....	<b>vi</b>
<b>List of Tables and Figures</b> .....	<b>xi</b>
<b>Glossary of Māori Words and Terms</b> .....	<b>xii</b>
<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
Hīkoi .....	3
Framing Good Evaluation .....	6
Kaupapa Māori Theory .....	9
Evaluation Theorists .....	13
Māori Theorists .....	15
Kaupapa Māori in Context .....	17
Evaluation in Action .....	18
The Treaty of Waitangi .....	21
Building Indigenous Evaluation Capacity .....	22
Hīkoi Methodology .....	24
The Chapters .....	29
Epilogue .....	32
Link One .....	34
<b>Chapter One: First Person, First Peoples: A Journey through Boundaries</b> .....	<b>37</b>
Abstract .....	37
Introduction .....	37
Australasian Evaluation Society Conference, 2003 .....	39
American Evaluation Association Conference, 2004 .....	43
Aotearoa New Zealand Evaluation Conference, 2005 .....	47
Joint Canadian Evaluation Society/American Evaluation Association Conference, 2005 ..	50
Link Two .....	57
<b>Chapter Two: Kaupapa Māori Theory Based Evaluation</b> .....	<b>61</b>
Abstract .....	61
Introduction .....	62
Theory in Evaluation .....	62
Kaupapa Māori Theory .....	63
Kaupapa Māori Principles .....	67

Kaupapa Māori Theory in Evaluation.....	70
The International Evaluation Context.....	80
Kaupapa Māori Evaluation in the International Context .....	81
Kaupapa Māori evaluation alignment with Decision Support and Consumer Service Evaluation .....	82
Kaupapa Māori evaluation alignment with Formative Approach.....	85
Kaupapa Māori evaluation alignment with Collaborative, Theory Driven and Constructivist Evaluation .....	86
Kaupapa Māori evaluation alignment with Transformative Evaluation .....	89
Conclusion .....	94
Link Three.....	98
<b>Chapter Three: Kaupapa Māori Action Research to Improve Heart Disease Services in Aotearoa New Zealand.....</b>	<b>101</b>
Abstract.....	101
Introduction.....	102
Kaupapa Māori and Action Research .....	103
Methodology.....	105
Findings .....	108
Phase One – Different worlds .....	108
Phase Two – Change facilitation .....	113
Phase Three – Research reflection.....	117
Discussion.....	124
Link Four .....	129
<b>Chapter Four: Evaluation Hīkoi - A Model for Aotearoa New Zealand? .....</b>	<b>131</b>
Abstract.....	131
Introduction.....	131
Health Promotion and the Māori Rights Hīkoi: 1975 to 1985 .....	133
Health Promotion Evaluation: 1986 to 1999.....	135
Evaluating Māori Health Promotion Initiatives .....	138
Health Promotion in Changing Times: 2000 to 2010 .....	141
The Hīkoi Evaluation Approach .....	143
Evidenced Based Health Promotion .....	149
The Health Promotion Hīkoi 2011 and Beyond.....	153
Conclusion .....	157
Link Five.....	159
<b>Chapter Five: Indigenous Evaluation: It’s Only New Because It’s Been Missing for So Long.....</b>	<b>161</b>

Abstract .....	161
Introduction .....	162
Background to the Capacity Building Project .....	165
Planning the Capacity Building Project.....	167
IAC perspective and beginnings of Ukk’aa.....	167
Whāriki perspective on the development of the Capacity Building Project.....	170
The Teaching and Learning Plan.....	172
Ukk’ aa reflections on the teaching and learning .....	174
Whāriki reflections on the teaching and learning.....	178
Key Learning from the Capacity Building Project.....	181
Ukk’aa reflections .....	181
The Seasonal Model - one example of ‘doing it our way’ .....	187
Whāriki reflections .....	190
Ukk’aa Conclusions.....	193
<b>Discussion .....</b>	<b>197</b>
Knowledge in the kete .....	197
Reading between the lines and boxes of the Table.....	198
Māori and indigenous evaluation – emergent issues .....	207
Issue 1: Power and Politics.....	207
Issue 2: The Status of Evidence.....	212
Issue 3: Evaluator credibility .....	217
<b>Conclusions .....</b>	<b>224</b>
Good Evaluation for Māori .....	224
Indigenous Worldviews and Values .....	226
Tino rangatiratanga - Sovereignty .....	228
The journey is as important as the destination .....	230
Fit for the context .....	231
Concluding notes from the hīkoi .....	233
<b>References .....</b>	<b>237</b>
<b>Appendix One: Meta-Evaluation Chart (Māori).....</b>	<b>270</b>
<b>Appendix Two: Statements of Contribution .....</b>	<b>272</b>

## List of Tables and Figures

Figure 1: The Evaluation Cycle: Catch the Vision for Indigenous Evaluation....	173
Figure 2: Seasonal Model .....	188
Table 1: Māori Theorists and Key Principles .....	68
Table 2: Development of major new directions in evaluation theory .....	81
Table 3: The Evaluation Hīkoi.....	204

## Glossary of Māori Words and Terms

Māori words and terms have much fuller meanings than the definitions given here.

These brief definitions are indicative only.

<i>Māori</i>	<i>English</i>
Aroha	love, concern, compassion
Hapū	kinship group of multiple whānau
Hauora	health, wellbeing
Hīkoi	march or walk
Hui	meeting or gathering
Iwi	tribe
Iwitanga	tribal practices
Karakia	chant or prayer
Kaumātua	respected elder, male or female
Kaupapa	platform, underlying base
Kaupapa Māori	a theory of research and practice based in Māori worldviews
Kawanatanga	governance
Kete	basket or kit
Koha	contribution or gift
Mana	prestige, integrity and honour; spiritual force bestowed on people
Manāki	care for, blessing
Mana whenua	customary authority exercised by a tribe or sub-tribe
Marae	gathering places
Mātauranga	education, knowledge, wisdom
Mokopuna	grandchild
Ora	health, wellbeing
Pākehā	people of European origin
Pono	truth, honesty
Rangahau Hauora	Health Research
Rangatira	chief or leader, male or female

Rangatiratanga	sovereignty or the right to exercise authority
Rōpū	group
Tangata whenua	people born of the land, local people
Tangihanga	weeping, funeral
Tautoko	support
Taonga	something that is highly prized
Te reo Māori	Māori language
Tika	right, correct
Tikanga	Māori practices or processes
Tino rangatiratanga	self-determination
Tohu	landmark, symbol, sign
Waiata	sing, song, chant
Wairua	spirit
Waka huia	treasure box
Wānanga	meeting
Whākapapa	line of descent from ancestors
Whakataukī	proverb, saying
Whānau	extended family
Whāriki	floor covering or mat

In this thesis, te reo Māori, the language of my forefathers, has equal status with English, my mother-tongue. Its use is therefore not subordinated by italicisation.

## **Authorship and Publication**

The candidate is the sole author of two of the five papers, first author on two papers (one is a book chapter) and coordinating author on one paper.

### ***1. First Person/First Peoples: A Journey through Boundaries***

#### Sole author

Kerr, S. (2006). "First Person, First Peoples: A Journey Through Boundaries" in *American Journal of Evaluation*. Volume 27, Issue 3. P.360-369.

### ***2. Kaupapa Māori theory based evaluation***

#### Sole author

Kerr, S. (2012) Kaupapa Māori theory-based evaluation. *Evaluation Journal of Australasia* 12(1) 2012: 6-18

Also in *Karearea Vol 1: Winter 2011 page 8*.

### ***3. Kaupapa Māori Action Research to improve Heart Disease Services in Aotearoa, New Zealand***

#### First author

Kerr, S., Penney, L., Moewaka Barnes, H. and McCreanor, T. (2009) 'Kaupapa Māori Action Research to improve heart disease services in Aotearoa, New Zealand', *Ethnicity & Health*. 2010, 1-17 (iFirst).

The candidate conceptualized, drafted, provided research results and wrote the following sections: Introduction; Kaupapa Māori and Action Research and; Phase Three: Research Reflection; and Discussion.

Liane Penney wrote the sections describing her research and the results (Phase One and Two) and contributed to reviews of the full draft and revisions to the final draft. Tim McCreanor contributed to the completion of a full draft and revisions to the final draft. Helen Moewaka Barnes contributed review and revisions to the final draft.

#### ***4. Evaluation Hīkoi: A Model for Aotearoa New Zealand?***

##### First author

Kerr, S. and Moewaka Barnes, H. Evaluation *Hīkoi: A Model for Aotearoa New Zealand?* In *Promoting Health in Aotearoa New Zealand* (in press). Signal, L. and Ratima, M. (Editors).

The candidate conceptualized, researched, drafted, wrote and revised the chapter. Helen Moewaka Barnes contributed literature and revisions. The book is in press and expected to be published in 2013.

#### ***5. Indigenous Evaluation: It's only new because it's been missing so long***

##### Coordinating and contributing author

Anderson C., Chase M., Johnson J., Mekiana D., McIntyre, D., Ruerup, A. and Kerr, S. (2012). Indigenous Evaluation: It's only new because it's been missing for so long. An Indigenous Evaluation Capacity Building Project between Alaska Native people and Aotearoa New Zealand Māori (indigenous New Zealanders) *American Journal of Evaluation* 33:566-582, first published on September 26, 2012doi:10.1177/1098214012449686.

The candidate conceptualized, planned, drafted, revised and coordinated the completion of the paper. All other authors provided individual contributions and revisions to the paper.