

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**An Analysis of an Industry Sponsored Governance
Development Intervention: The Case of Dairy NZ's Mark and
Measure Programme.**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Business Studies
in
Management

At Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Michelle Hunt
2014

Abstract

A plethora of 'good' corporate governance prescriptions are ascribed to boards. Yet there is little research on the influence of corporate governance prescriptions on businesses. This research aims to investigate the impact of the DairyNZ Mark and Measure Farm Business Governance Programme (the Mark and Measure course). This research uses Kirkpatrick's (1958) Four Level Model to evaluate the Mark and Measure course. The author employs an embedded case study with a sequential mixed methods design to examine the Mark and Measure course. The sequential mixed methods design included a document analysis, a quantitative comparative pre and post intervention analysis, and five qualitative semi-structured interviews. The participants in the research were made up of closely-held SME's and family businesses. The results show inconsistencies in the conceptualisation of corporate governance in academia, the Mark and Measure course, and the responses of the interviewed participants. There was an increase in most of the four levels in Kirkpatrick's model. However, caution needs to be applied to results as there are methodological issues with the employed survey instrument.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to thank my partner, parents and friends for their emotional support, encouragement, and patience throughout this thesis. They have been my chief proof readers and lunch providers even since I started working on this thesis twelve months ago.

Special thanks to my primary supervisor, Dr. James Lockhart for the hours that he has spent reading over painful drafts and his invaluable conversations and insightful and vital comments. I also have to thank him for the many times when I have looked stressed he has tried to make me laugh (although, I don't think having to tell someone that was a joke counts). I would also like to thank my second supervisor Dr. Liz Dooley, for her contribution and spectacular attention to details. I express my sincerest gratitude to Peter Allen, who has helped me navigate the complex world of corporate governance and given me his insightful practitioner experience.

Appreciation is duly given to DairyNZ for funding and allowing accessing to study their programme. To OneFarm the Centre of Excellence in Farm Business Management who kindly financially supported me throughout my thesis.

A word of thanks is also due to the faculty and staff members in the School of Management who have been very supportive throughout my study. I would also like to extend my appreciation to all the interviewees in this research for their time and helpful participation.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	i
Acknowledgements.....	ii
Table of Contents.....	iii
List of Tables.....	x
List of Figures	xi
Part One: The Research Problem	1
Chapter One: Introduction.....	2
1.1 Introduction	2
1.2 Governance Training in New Zealand	3
1.2.1 DairyNZ and Governance Training	3
1.3 Research Objectives.....	4
1.4 Research Questions.....	4
1.5 The Significance of the Study	5
1.6 Structure of the Thesis.....	6
1.7 Chapter summary.....	7
Chapter Two: Literature Review	8
2.1 Introduction	8
2.2 A Historical Overview of Corporate Governance	8
2.3 Conceptualisations of Corporate Governance	10
2.3.1 Definitions of Corporate Governance	10
2.3.3 A definition for control and corporate governance	16
2.4 Social, political and ethical issues and corporate governance.....	17

2.5	Legal issues.....	19
2.6	Major Theoretical Perspectives in Corporate Governance	20
26.1	Agency Theory.....	20
2.6.2	Stewardship Theory and Corporate Governance.....	22
2.6.3	Resource Dependence Theory	23
2.6.4	Managerial Hegemony.....	23
2.6.5	Stakeholder Theory.....	24
2.6.6	A Team Production Model	24
2.6.7	A Move Toward Behavioural Based Theories of Corporate Governance.....	26
2.7	The Board and Corporate Governance	27
2.8	Measurement of Corporate Governance.....	30
2.8.1	The Black Box	31
2.9	Corporate Governance in Closely-Held Organisations.....	32
2.9.1	Family Business	32
2.9.2	SMEs	33
2.9.3	Closely-Held Entities.....	34
2.10	Corporate Governance: The Case of One and Unification	35
2.11	Corporate Governance: Performance.....	36
2.12	Corporate Governance: Training Interventions	37
2.12.1	Frameworks for Evaluation Training	38
2.13	Summary	39
	Part Two: Method	41
	Chapter Three: Research Methodology	42

3.1	Introduction	42
3.2	Context and Overview of the Research Design	42
3.3	An Embedded Case Study Design with Sequential Mixed Methods Units of Analysis.....	48
3.4	Rationale for Pragmatism and a Case Study with a Mixed Methods Design	49
3.5	A Theoretical Model for Evaluating Training Programmes	50
3.6	Phase I: Document Analysis	51
3.6.1	Analysis	51
3.7	Phase II: Pre and Post Quantitative Evaluation	52
3.7.1	An Overview	52
3.7.2	The Intervention.....	52
3.7.3	Quantitative Intervention Participants	53
3.7.4	Survey Instrument.....	53
3.7.5	Statistical Tests Used for Quantitative Analysis	54
3.8	Phase III: Qualitative Phase Post Intervention	54
3.8.1	An Overview	54
2.7.2	Qualitative Participants.....	54
3.8.3	Thematic Analysis.....	55
3.9	Chapter Summary	56
Part Three: Results		57
Chapter Four: Phase I: Document Analysis		58
4.1	Introduction	58
4.2	Mark and Measure Course.....	58
4.3	Conceptualisation of Governance in the Mark and Measure Course and the Business	

Torque Report	65
4.4 Problems in the Legal Understanding around Companies.....	67
4.5 The Seven Practices in the Mark and Measure Course.....	70
4.6 Practice One: Acting with a Purpose in Mind and Aligning Every Governance Decision and Action with the Predetermined Purpose of the Business	71
4.7 Practice Two: Holding Effective Governance Meetings	73
4.8 Practice Three: Working with Other People	75
4.8.1 Cohesiveness and Groupthink.....	75
4.8.2 Diversity	77
4.8.3 Trait Theory	77
4.8.4 Leadership.....	78
4.8.5 Power	78
4.8.6 Context and Social Capital.....	78
4.9 Practice Four: Making the Right Decisions.....	80
4.10 Practice Five- Maintaining a Learning Orientation.....	81
4.11 Practice Six: Knowing What Is Going On and What To Do About It	82
4.12 Practice Seven: Effective Compliance	84
4.13 Summary of the Seven Practices.....	85
4.14 Questionnaire Critique.....	86
4.15 Evaluating the Construction of the Questionnaire	86
4.16 Summary	89
Chapter Five: Phase II: Pre and Post Comparative Quantitative Evaluation	90
5.1 Introduction	90

5.2	Research Question	90
5.3	Missing Values.....	91
5.4	Removed Items	91
5.5	Reliability Data	92
5.5.1	Practice One: Acting With A Purpose In Mind	94
5.5.2	Practice Two: Holding Effective Governance Meetings	94
5.5.3	Practice Three: Working With Other People	94
5.5.4	Practice Four: Making the Right Decisions.....	94
5.5.5	Remaining Subscales.....	95
5.6	Assumption Check.....	95
5.7	Descriptive statistics.....	96
5.8	Paired Samples <i>t</i> Test	99
5.8.1	Practice One: Acting With A Purpose In Mind	99
5.8.2	Practice Two: Holding Effective Governance Meetings	100
5.8.3	Practice Three: Working With Other People.....	101
5.8.4	Practice Four: Making the Right Decisions.....	102
5.8.5	Practice Five: Maintaining a Learning Orientation.....	102
5.8.6	Practice Six: Knowing What Is Going On And What To Do About It.....	103
5.8.7	Practice Seven: Managing Risks Effectively.....	104
5.9	Summary	104
Chapter Six: Phase III: Qualitative Phase Post Intervention.....		105
6.1	Introduction	105
6.2	Theme 1: The Conceptualisation of Corporate Governance.....	107

6.3	Theme 2: Kirkpatrick’s Four Level Evaluation Model	109
6.4	Chapter Summary	127
	Part Four: Discussion, Conclusion, Limitations	128
	Chapter Seven: Discussion	129
7.1	Introduction	129
7.2	Confusion with the Conceptualisation of Corporate Governance	129
7.3	A Lifecycle Model of Corporate Governance (LCMCG)	130
7.4	The Mark and Measure Course and Corporate Governance	134
7.5	Reducing the Seven Practices to Five	137
7.6	The Business Torque Questionnaire	140
7.7	Kirkpatrick’s Four Level Model and the Mark and Measure Course	141
7.7.1	Level One: Reaction.....	141
7.7.2	Level Two: Learning.....	142
7.7.3	Level Three: Behaviour.....	143
7.7.4	Level Four: Impact.....	145
7.8	Independent Boards and the Creation of Agency.....	147
7.9	Summary	147
	Chapter Eight: Conclusion	149
8.1	Contributions to Knowledge	149
8.2	Limitations.....	152
8.3	Where to for Mark and Measure	153
	References	155
	Appendix One: tables of ‘good’ corporate governance practices.....	167

Appendix Two:-Low risk notification quantitative data.....	171
Appendix Three: information sheet for qualitative interviews.....	173
Appendix Four: Quantitative research questions	178
Appendix Five- An overview of research around board meetings.....	180
Appendix Six: Business Torque questionnaire items	185
Appendix Seven –Business Torque questionnaire, subscales items for the seven practices.....	186
Appendix Eight: Missing Data	187
Appendix Nine- A Development of a New Corporate Governance Questionnaire.....	214

List of Tables

Table 2-1.	Overview of the common approaches in training evaluation.....	39
Table 3-1.	Timeline for research showing the design and delivery of intervention and parallel research process	47
Table 3-2.	Four Level Evaluation Model aligned with the research methodology.....	50
Table 4-1.	An overview of topics and conceptualisations of the Seven Practices, the Seven Aptitudes, and the Business Torque questionnaire	60
Table 4-2.	Functional and dysfunctional board traits	80
Table 4-3.	Indicators that have violated the suggested nine steps for evaluation	88
Table 5-1.	Cronbach’s Alpha Coefficients for Business Torque Questionnaire showing the seven practices subscale scores	93
Table 5-2.	Skew and Kurtosis for each of the Seven Practices.....	96
Table 5-3.	Means and Standard deviations for each of the Seven Practices	97
Table 6-1.	Showing which practices the participants have understood during qualitative interviews.....	113
Table 6-2.	Summary of behaviour changes the participants reported on the Seven Practices. .	122

List of Figures

Figure 2-1. A behavioural based classification of corporate governance theories	26
<i>Figure 3-1.</i> Outline for the study that is an embedded case study with an exploratory sequential mixed methods design	46
Figure 4-1. The road to formal governance as suggested in the Mark and Measure course	69
Figure 5-1. Means scores obtained on the Seven Practices by all participants over the two measurement points (n=48)	98
Figure 5-2. Practice One means and 95% CIs associated with the pre- and post- training conditions.	100
Figure 5-3. Practice Two means and 95% CIs associated with the pre- and post- training conditions.	101
Figure 5-4. Practice Four means and 95% CIs associated with the pre- and post- training conditions.	102
Figure 5-5. Practice Five means and 95% CIs associated with the pre- and post- training conditions.	103
Figure 5-6. Practice Six means and 95% CIs associated with the pre- and post- training conditions.	103
Figure 5-7. Practice Seven means and 95% CIs associated with the pre- and post- training conditions.	104
Figure 6-1. A thematic map showing the main themes and associated sub-themes in the qualitative interviews.....	106
Figure 7-1. Hypothesised corporate governance theories located in the lifecycle of the firm	133
Figure 7-2. The Hilmer and Tricker Model of effective boards	138
Figure 7-3. An overlay of the reduced Five practices and how they fit with the effective board governance model	139

Part One: The Research Problem

The thesis structure illustrated below. Each chapter is represented to give the reader an understanding of the position of the chapter, in relation to other chapters and to the thesis as a whole.

Part 1 The research problem	Chapter 1	Introduction
	Chapter 2	Literature Review
Part 2 Method	Chapter 3	Research Methodology
Part 3 Results	Chapter 4	Document Analysis
	Chapter 5	Comparative Analysis
	Chapter 6	Qualitative Interviews
Part 4 Discussion, Conclusion, Limitations	Chapter 7	Discussion
	Chapter 8	Conclusions and Limitations