

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# **METHODS TO CONTROL THE MATURATION OF SOFT MOULD RIPENED CHEESE**

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of a Master of Technology  
(in Food Technology), at Massey University

Shannon Swan  
2011

**MASSEY UNIVERSITY**  
**APPLICATION FOR APPROVAL OF REQUEST TO EMBARGO A THESIS**  
**(Pursuant to AC 98/168 (Revised 2), Approved by Academic Board 16.02.99)**

Name of Candidate: Shannon Swan ID Number: 02139383

Degree: M.Tech Dept/Institute/School: IFNHH

Thesis Title: Methodologies to control the maturation of soft mould ripened cheese

Name of Chief Supervisor: Rod Bennett Telephone 81423 Extn: \_\_\_\_\_

As author of the above named thesis, I request that my thesis be embargoed from public access

until (date) October 2013 for the following reasons:

- Thesis contains commercially sensitive information.
- Thesis contains information which is personal or private and/or which was given on the basis that it not be disclosed.
- Immediate disclosure of thesis contents would not allow the author a reasonable opportunity to publish all or part of the thesis.
- Other (specify): \_\_\_\_\_

Please explain here why you think this request is justified:

The work of this thesis was undertaken with a Technology in Industry Fellowship (TIF) and the findings are of commercial significance to the sponsoring company Goodman Fielder

Signed (Candidate): Shannon Swan Date: 21 Sept '11  
 Endorsed (Chief Supervisor): Rod Bennett Date: 21 Sept 2011  
 Approved/Not Approved (Representative of VC): \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Suzanne Byrnes  
 21/9/11

## Acknowledgements

---

Massey University and Shannon Swan acknowledge the financial support provided by Puhoi Valley Cheese Ltd. (subsidiary of Goodman Fielder New Zealand). We appreciate this valuable contribution to what has been an exciting and rewarding project. Also, a special thanks to FRST for funding this fellowship.

I would also like to acknowledge the unyielding patience and support of Mr Hamish Conway (Goodman Fielder; Auckland, New Zealand), Mr Rod Bennett (Massey University; Palmerston North, New Zealand) and Associate Professor Marie Wong (Massey University; Auckland, New Zealand).

A special thanks to the *Fab Five* for being my sanity check; to *the Farmer* for being my rock; and to my *Co-Pilots* for above all teaching me to...persevere!

## Summary

---

Soft mould ripened cheeses such as Camembert, typically have a short shelf life in comparison to other cheese varieties, therefore restricting the opportunity to exploit new and developing markets. Preliminary trials were carried out to investigate the freezing point of Camembert cheese and the rate of freezing and thawing that could be achieved using the facilities at Massey University; Albany. Using the results from these trials, a freezing/ thawing protocol and an experimental plan was developed to increase the shelf life by altering the standard storage and maturation profiles of Camembert cheese.

Firstly the effect of three storage temperatures and time (for up to four weeks) on the maturation at +4°C (for eight weeks) of Camembert cheese was investigated. Maturation indicators included: extent of moisture loss of wrapped cheese samples; change in pH of the inside and outside portion of the cheese; change in the release of proteolytic products; change in the viable yeast and mould cells present on the surface of the cheese; and change in texture (uniaxial compression and puncture testing) following storage and throughout maturation. From these results it was found that storing the cheese samples below the freezing point (between -3 and -3.5±0.1°C) had a detrimental effect on the maturation of the cheese. The freezing process and time killed the cheese microflora, therefore inhibiting the release of enzymes which promoted the biochemical reactions within the cheese. As a result the cheese did not follow the same maturation trend as the control sample that was matured at only +4°C for eight weeks. Cheese that was stored at below zero, but above the actual freezing point followed the same maturation trend as the control sample following storage for up to four weeks, therefore showing the most potential in controlling the maturation of the Camembert cheese.

The effect of storage at -2°C on Camembert cheese was then investigated, both throughout the storage of the cheese (for up to six weeks) followed by maturation at +4°C for eight weeks. Maturation indicators included: change in pH of the inside and outside portion of the cheese; change in the moisture content of the cheese; change in the release of proteolytic products; change in texture (uniaxial compression and puncture testing); and Quantitative Descriptive Analysis using a panel of nine

screened and trained panellists. Statistical analysis showed that at the 99% level of confidence, the storage temperature (and time) had no significant effect on the ripening of the cheese throughout maturation at +4°C of the cheese for all maturation indicators. Therefore, storing Camembert cheese at -2°C can be used to control the maturation of Camembert cheese, allowing for longer distribution chain delivery times.

# Table of contents

---

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>LIST OF EQUATIONS .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>LIST OF FIGURES .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES .....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>GLOSSARY.....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>1.0 INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW.....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>2.1 CLASSIFICATION OF CHEESE</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>2.2 THE MODERN DAY CHEESE MANUFACTURE PROCESS</b>	<b>19</b>
2.2.1 CHEESE MILK PREPARATION .....	19
2.2.2 CONVERSION OF MILK TO CHEESE.....	20
2.2.3 RIPENING AND MATURATION .....	24
2.2.4 SUMMARY OF THE CHEESE MANUFACTURE PROCESS .....	25
<b>2.3 BIOCHEMICAL REACTIONS IN CHEESE RIPENING</b>	<b>25</b>
2.3.1 GLYCOLYSIS .....	26
2.3.2 LIPOLYSIS.....	27
2.3.3 PROTEOLYSIS .....	27
2.4.1 SUMMARY OF BIOCHEMICAL REACTIONS IN CHEESE .....	28
<b>2.4 STORAGE OF CHEESE</b>	<b>28</b>
2.4.1 RELATIVE HUMIDITY .....	29
2.4.2 LIGHT .....	29
2.4.3 GAS COMPOSITION .....	29
2.4.4 STORAGE TEMPERATURE .....	32
2.4.5 SUMMARY OF THE EFFECT OF STORAGE ON CHEESE .....	57
<b>2.5 CONCLUSIONS</b>	<b>58</b>
<b>3.0 METHODOLOGY.....</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>3.1 TRIAL OVERVIEW</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>3.2 MATERIALS</b>	<b>60</b>
3.2.1 PUHOI VALLEY CHEESE LTD. MANUFACTURE OF CAMEMBERT CHEESE .....	60
<b>3.3 COMPOSITION OF CAMEMBERT CHEESE</b>	<b>64</b>
3.3.1 MOISTURE CONTENT.....	64

3.3.2 PH MEASUREMENTS .....	64
3.3.3 NITROGEN CONTENT .....	64
<b>3.4 TEXTURE ANALYSIS</b>	<b>66</b>
3.4.1 UNIAXIAL COMPRESSION TESTING .....	66
3.4.2 PUNCTURE TESTING.....	67
<b>3.5 YEAST AND MOULD ENUMERATION TECHNIQUES</b>	<b>69</b>
<b>3.5 QUANTITATIVE DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS (QDA)</b>	<b>70</b>
3.5.1 QDA PANEL TRAINING.....	70
3.5.2 QDA PANEL TESTING .....	71
<b>3.6 CONSUMER RESEARCH</b>	<b>71</b>
<b>3.7 DATA ANALYSIS</b>	<b>72</b>
3.7.1 P-VALUES AS A TRUE INDICATION OF SIGNIFICANCE .....	72
<b><u>4.0 PRELIMINARY TRIALS .....</u></b>	<b><u>73</u></b>
<b>4.1 BACKGROUND</b>	<b>73</b>
<b>4.2 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES</b>	<b>73</b>
<b>4.3 METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>73</b>
4.3.1 DETERMINING THE FREEZING POINT OF CAMEMBERT CHEESE.....	74
4.3.2 EVALUATION OF FREEZING RATES OF CAMEMBERT CHEESE .....	74
4.3.3 EVALUATION OF THAWING RATES OF CAMEMBERT CHEESE .....	75
<b>4.4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION</b>	<b>75</b>
4.4.1 FREEZING POINT OF CAMEMBERT CHEESE.....	75
4.4.2 FREEZING RATES .....	76
4.4.3 THAWING RATES.....	77
<b>4.5 OUTCOMES OF PRELIMINARY TRIALS</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>4.6 PRELIMINARY TRIALS CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>79</b>
<b><u>5.0 STAGE ONE TRIALS .....</u></b>	<b><u>80</u></b>
<b>5.1 BACKGROUND</b>	<b>80</b>
<b>5.2 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES</b>	<b>80</b>
<b>5.3 METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>80</b>
5.3.1 STORAGE REGIME FOR STAGE ONE TRIALS.....	80
<b>5.4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION</b>	<b>82</b>
<b>5.5 OUTCOMES OF STAGE ONE TRIALS</b>	<b>88</b>
<b><u>6.0 STAGE TWO TRIALS .....</u></b>	<b><u>90</u></b>
<b>6.1 BACKGROUND</b>	<b>90</b>
<b>6.2 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES</b>	<b>90</b>
<b>6.3 EXPERIMENTAL PLAN</b>	<b>90</b>
6.3.1 STORAGE REGIME FOR STAGE TWO TRIALS .....	90
6.3.6 CONSUMER RESEARCH.....	92
<b>6.4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION</b>	<b>93</b>
6.4.1 COMPOSITIONAL AND TEXTUAL ANALYSIS RESEARCH .....	93
6.4.2 CONSUMER RESEARCH .....	110
<b>6.5 OUTCOMES OF STAGE TWO TRIALS</b>	<b>118</b>
<b><u>7.0 QUANTITATIVE DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS (QDA) TRIALS.....</u></b>	<b><u>119</u></b>



<b>7.1 BACKGROUND</b>	<b>119</b>
<b>7.2 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES</b>	<b>119</b>
<b>7.3 METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>119</b>
7.3.1 PANEL TRAINING.....	119
7.3.2 PRODUCT TESTING.....	147
<b>7.4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION</b>	<b>148</b>
<b>7.5 CORRELATION BETWEEN QDA RESULTS AND STAGE TWO COMPOSITIONAL AND TEXTURAL ANALYSIS RESEARCH</b>	<b>175</b>
<b>7.6 OUTCOMES OF QUANTITATIVE DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS (QDA) TRIALS</b>	<b>178</b>
<b><u>8.0 FINAL DISCUSSION .....</u></b>	<b><u>179</u></b>
<b><u>9.0 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....</u></b>	<b><u>181</u></b>
<b><u>10.0 REFERENCES .....</u></b>	<b><u>183</u></b>
<b><u>A.....</u></b>	<b><u>183</u></b>
<b><u>B.....</u></b>	<b><u>184</u></b>
<b><u>C.....</u></b>	<b><u>185</u></b>
<b><u>D .....</u></b>	<b><u>186</u></b>
<b><u>E.....</u></b>	<b><u>187</u></b>
<b><u>F.....</u></b>	<b><u>187</u></b>
<b><u>G .....</u></b>	<b><u>188</u></b>
<b><u>H .....</u></b>	<b><u>189</u></b>
<b><u>J.....</u></b>	<b><u>190</u></b>
<b><u>K .....</u></b>	<b><u>190</u></b>
<b><u>L.....</u></b>	<b><u>191</u></b>
<b><u>M.....</u></b>	<b><u>192</u></b>
<b><u>N .....</u></b>	<b><u>193</u></b>
<b><u>O .....</u></b>	<b><u>193</u></b>
<b><u>P.....</u></b>	<b><u>194</u></b>

<b><u>R</u></b> .....	<b><u>194</u></b>
<b><u>S</u></b> .....	<b><u>194</u></b>
<b><u>T</u></b> .....	<b><u>195</u></b>
<b><u>U</u></b> .....	<b><u>196</u></b>
<b><u>V</u></b> .....	<b><u>196</u></b>
<b><u>W</u></b> .....	<b><u>196</u></b>
<b><u>Y</u></b> .....	<b><u>197</u></b>
<b><u>Z</u></b> .....	<b><u>197</u></b>
<b><u>11.0 APPENDIX</u></b> .....	<b><u>198</u></b>

## List of Equations

---

<i>Equation 1</i>	64
<i>Equation 2</i>	70
<i>Equation 3</i>	113

## List of Figures

---

Figure 2.1: Structure of this literature review	17
Figure 2.2: Classification of natural cheese varieties according to the coagulation agent (*) and maturation mechanism (**)	18
Figure 2.3: Key steps involved in the manufacture of mould ripened cheese	19
Figure 2.4: Summary of the evolution of compounds which give rise to the flavour and aroma in cheese	25
Figure 3.5: Process flow for the manufacture of Camembert Cheese at Puhoi Valley Cheese	63
Figure 3.6: Schematic representation of the parts of cheese that were used for outer and centre portion pH analysis	64
Figure 3.7: Fractionation of the protein content of Camembert cheese	65
Figure 3.8: Example of a typical uniaxial compression curve	67
Figure 3.9: Schematic of the puncture test sampling area's for Stage One trials	68
Figure 3.10: Example of a typical puncture test curve	69
Figure 4.11: Schematic of the geometric centre of a single unit of Camembert cheese	74
Figure 4.12: Example of the layout of Camembert cheese within each case	74
Figure 4.13: Freezing profile of wrapped Camembert cheese units over 240 minutes in a freezer unit set at $\approx -18.7 \pm 0.1^\circ\text{C}$	75
Figure 4.14: Freezing profile of wrapped Camembert cheese units over 400 minutes in a freezer unit set at $\approx -18.7 \pm 0.1^\circ\text{C}$	76
Figure 4.15: Thawing profile of wrapped Camembert cheese units over 450 minutes in a chiller unit set at $\approx +4 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$	78
Figure 5.16: Schematic of storage regime of Stage ONE trials	81
Figure 6.17: Schematic of storage regime of Stage TWO trials	91
Figure 6.18: Schematic of reverse storage regime of Stage TWO trials	92
Figure 6.19: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the moisture content (%) of Camembert cheese over 14 weeks	95
Figure 6.20: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the moisture content (%) of Camembert cheese following maturation at $+4^\circ\text{C}$ for eight weeks	95
Figure 6.21: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the pH of the inside portion of Camembert cheese over 14 weeks	98
Figure 6.22: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the pH of the inside portion of Camembert cheese following maturation at $+4^\circ\text{C}$ for eight weeks	98
Figure 6.23: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the pH of the outside portion of Camembert cheese over 14 weeks	99
Figure 6.24: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the pH of the outside portion of Camembert cheese following maturation at $+4^\circ\text{C}$ for eight weeks	99
Figure 6.25: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the pH 4.4 SN/ TN protein index of Camembert cheese over 14 weeks	102
Figure 6.26: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the pH 4.4 SN/ TN protein index of Camembert cheese following maturation at $+4^\circ\text{C}$ for eight week	102
Figure 6.27: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the TCA SN/ TN protein index of Camembert cheese over 14 weeks	103
Figure 6.28: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the TCA SN/ TN protein index of Camembert cheese following maturation at $+4^\circ\text{C}$ for eight weeks	103
Figure 6.29: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the work required to compress the Camembert cheese samples to 80% of their original height over 14 weeks	105
Figure 6.30: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the work required to compress the Camembert cheese samples to 80% of their original height following maturation at $+4^\circ\text{C}$ for eight weeks	105
Figure 6.31: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on peak puncture force over 14 weeks	107
Figure 6.32: Effect of $-2^\circ\text{C}$ storage on the peak puncture force of Camembert cheese following maturation at $+4^\circ\text{C}$ for eight weeks	107
Figure 6.33: Consumers ranking for the acceptability of six Camembert cheese samples where Reference = fresh sample	112
Figure 6.34: Consumers ranking for the intensity of six Camembert cheese samples	114

<i>Figure 6.35: Mean response for overall liking and likelihood of purchase for each sample</i>	116
<i>Figure 6.36: Frequency of “preferred sample” response</i>	117
<i>Figure 7.37: Schematic of the tasting evaluation procedure to be used in the evaluation of Camembert cheese</i>	127
<i>Figure 7.38: Schematic of storage regime of Quantitative Descriptive Analysis trials</i>	148
<i>Figure 7.39: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the whiteness of the mould throughout storage at -2°C</i>	152
<i>Figure 7.40: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the whiteness of the mould throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	152
<i>Figure 7.41: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the dryness of the crust throughout storage at -2°C</i>	153
<i>Figure 7.42: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the dryness of the crust throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	153
<i>Figure 7.43: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the mushroom aroma throughout storage at -2°C</i>	157
<i>Figure 7.44: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the mushroom aroma throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	157
<i>Figure 7.45: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the dirty/ stale/ cardboard aroma throughout storage at -2°C</i>	158
<i>Figure 7.46: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the dirty/ stale/ cardboard aroma throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	158
<i>Figure 7.47: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the ammonia aroma throughout storage at -2°C</i>	159
<i>Figure 7.48: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the ammonia aroma throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	159
<i>Figure 7.49: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the springiness throughout storage at -2°C</i>	162
<i>Figure 7.50: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the springiness throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	162
<i>Figure 7.51: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the firmness throughout storage at -2°C</i>	163
<i>Figure 7.52: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the firmness throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	163
<i>Figure 7.53: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the rindcrunch throughout storage at -2°C</i>	164
<i>Figure 7.54: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the rindcrunch throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	164
<i>Figure 7.55: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the bitter flavour throughout storage at -2°C</i>	167
<i>Figure 7.56: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the bitter flavour throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	167
<i>Figure 7.57: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the acidic/ sour flavour throughout storage at -2°C</i>	168
<i>Figure 7.58: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the acidic/ sour flavour throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	168
<i>Figure 7.59: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the stickiness of the curd throughout storage at -2°C</i>	172
<i>Figure 7.60: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the stickiness of the curd throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	172
<i>Figure 7.61: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the creaminess of the curd throughout storage at -2°C</i>	173
<i>Figure 7.62: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the creaminess of the curd throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	173
<i>Figure 7.63: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the smoothness of the curd throughout storage at -2°C</i>	174
<i>Figure 7.64: Trained panel sensory evaluation score for the smoothness of the curd throughout maturation at +4°C</i>	174

## List of Tables

---

Table 2.1: Typical composition (% by weight) of Camembert cheese	18
Table 2.2: Various types of controlled storage techniques and their basic principles	30
Table 2.3: Summary of various studies conducted with regard to the influence of ripening temperature on key cheese maturation properties	33
Table 2.4: Experimental conditions used in puncture tests for various soft cheeses	41
Table 2.5: Experimental conditions used in rheological tests for various cheeses	42
Table 2.6: Experimental conditions used in uniaxial compression testing of cheese	43
Table 2.7: Summary of methods used to measure the degree of lipolysis in soft Camembert-type cheeses	46
Table 2.8: Summary of the methods used to measure the degree of proteolysis in Camembert cheese	47
Table 2.9: Enumeration methods for yeast and moulds that were isolated from cheese	50
Table 2.10: Common screening methods used for trained panel Quantitative Descriptive Analysis	54
Table 2.11: Summary of descriptors used in texture analysis of a variety of cheeses	55
Table 4.12: Summary of the freezing point ( $^{\circ}\text{C}$ ) and time taken to reach the freezing point (mins) of each freezing treatment	77
Table 4.13: Summary of the time taken to reach $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ for of each thawing treatment	78
Table 5.14: Percentage change (%) of each maturation property following 8 weeks maturation at $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ when compared to the $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ control	84
Table 5.15: Table of significant effects; storage of Camembert cheese samples stored at $+1^{\circ}\text{C}$ for up to FOUR weeks	85
Table 5.16: Table of significant effects; storage of Camembert cheese sample stored at $-2^{\circ}\text{C}$ for up to FOUR weeks	85
Table 5.17: Table of significant effects; storage of Camembert cheese samples stored at $-10^{\circ}\text{C}$ for up to FOUR weeks	86
Table 5.18: Results of the two-tailed t-test for mean difference from the control at the 99% level of significance for cheese samples at the end of maturation	87
Table 6.19: Table of significant effects; maturation properties of Camembert cheese in relation to storage time at $-2^{\circ}\text{C}$ , maturation at $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ and total holding time	93
Table 6.20: Rate of change in the moisture content of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ : moisture content % = [rate] week $^{-1}$ (p-value)	94
Table 6.21: Rate of change in the inside pH of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ : pH of the inside portion = [rate] week $^{-1}$ (p-value)	96
Table 6.22: Rate of change in the outside pH of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ : pH of the outside portion = [rate] week $^{-1}$ (p-value)	97
Table 6.23: Rate of change in the pH 4.4 SN/ TN protein index of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ : pH 4.4 SN/ TN = [rate] week $^{-1}$ (p-value)	100
Table 6.24: Rate of change in the TCA SN/TN protein index of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ : TCA SN/ TN = [rate] week $^{-1}$ (p-value)	100
Table 6.25: Rate of change in the uniaxial compression work (N.mm) of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ : uniaxial compression (N.mm) = [rate] week $^{-1}$ (p-value)	104
Table 6.26: Rate of change in the puncture force (N) of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at $+4^{\circ}\text{C}$ : puncture force (N) = [rate] week $^{-1}$ (p-value)	106
Table 6.27: Correlations between the maturation properties of Camembert cheese	109
Table 6.28: Table of significant effects; acceptability response of the Camembert cheese samples	111
Table 6.29: Table of significant effects; intensity response of Camembert cheese samples	115
Table 7.30: Pearson correlation of attributes used for Session Two training	123
Table 7.31: Reference standards used in Quantitative Descriptive Analysis	129
Table 7.32: Trained panel descriptors and definitions	130
Table 7.33: Table of mean scores for the judging of two samples of approximately 2 and 6 weeks old	131
Table 7.34: Table of mean scores for the judging of two samples, of approximately 6 weeks old	132
Table 7.35: Table of significant effects between two samples for Session Five	134

Table 7.36: Table of significant effects between two samples for Session Six	136
Table 7.37: Check to see the panellists mean scores for Fresh buttery flavour and Stickiness of the curd	137
Table 7.38: Table of significant effects between two samples for Session Seven	138
Table 7.39: Check to see the panellists mean scores for bitter flavour	140
Table 7.40: Table showing effects between three samples for Session Eight	140
Table 7.41: Table showing effects between the duplicate samples for Session Eight	141
Table 7.42: Table showing effects between three samples for Session Nine	142
Table 7.43: Table showing effects between three samples for Session Ten	144
Table 7.44: Table showing effects between the duplicate samples for Session Ten	144
Table 7.45: Table showing effects between three samples for Session Twelve	146
Table 7.46: Table of significant effects (ANOVA)	149
Table 7.47: Rate of change in the whiteness of the mould attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: whiteness of the mould = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	151
Table 7.48: Rate of change in the dryness of the crust attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: dryness of the crust = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	151
Table 7.49: Rate of change in the mushroom aroma attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: mushroom aroma = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	154
Table 7.50: Rate of change in the dirty/ stale/ cardboard aroma attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: dirty/ stale/ cardboard aroma = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	155
Table 7.51: Rate of change in the ammonia aroma attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: ammonia aroma = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	156
Table 7.52: Rate of change in the springiness attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: springiness = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	160
Table 7.53: Rate of change in the firmness attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: firmness = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	161
Table 7.54: Rate of change in the rind crunch attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: rind crunch = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	161
Table 7.55: Rate of change in the bitter flavour attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: bitter flavour = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	165
Table 7.56: Rate of change in the acidic/ sour flavour attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: acidic/ sour flavour = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	166
Table 7.57: Rate of change in the stickiness of the curd attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: stickiness of the curd = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	169
Table 7.58: Rate of change in the creaminess of the curd attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: creaminess of the curd = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	170
Table 7.59: Rate of change in the smoothness of the curd attribute of Camembert cheese throughout maturation at +4°C: smoothness of the curd = [rate] week <sup>-1</sup> (p-value)	171
Table 7.60: Correlations between QDA results and Stage TWO compositional and textural analysis research	176

## Glossary

---

Below is a glossary of terms used throughout various stages of this Masters report:

<b>Term</b>	<b>Definition</b>
<i>Case</i>	Preliminary trials: A cardboard box (70 x 300 x 200mm; HWD) containing 12 units of 210g Puhoi Valley Ltd. Camembert cheese; six units on the bottom layer, and six units on the top layer
<i>Controlled maturation</i>	The effect of manipulating the storage time and temperature to optimise the potential shelf-life of Camembert cheese
<i>Control sample</i>	Stage ONE trials: Camembert cheese samples were held at +4°C maturation for up to seven weeks Stage TWO trials: Camembert cheese samples held at -2°C for up to 14 weeks
<i>Maturation temperature</i>	The temperature Camembert cheese samples were held at +4°C, as recommended in Puhoi Valley Cheese product specification
<i>Maturation time</i>	The time (weeks) that the Camembert cheese samples were held at +4°C
<i>Maturation properties</i>	The rheological/ textural, compositional, biochemical, sensory and microbiological changes that are characteristic to Camembert cheese
<i>Reference sample</i>	Stage TWO QDA trials: Camembert cheese samples were picked up fresh from Puhoi Valley Cheese Ltd. prior to sensory evaluation
<i>Storage temperature</i>	The temperature that Camembert cheese samples were held at prior to maturation For example: Stage ONE Trials (+1°C, -2°C and -10°C), Stage TWO Trials (-2°C)
<i>Storage time</i>	The time (weeks) that the Camembert cheese samples were held at each respective storage temperature treatment
<i>Total holding time</i>	The sum amount of time (weeks) that the Camembert cheese samples were held during storage and maturation
<i>Week</i>	The unit of time used in this study. One week = seven days