

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# **Enterococci in Milk Products**

**A dissertation presented  
in partial fulfilment of the requirements  
for the degree of**

**Master of Veterinary Studies**

**at Massey University  
Palmerston North, New Zealand**

**Mirtha Lorena Giménez-Pereira  
2005**



## **Abstract**

This review examined the benefits and risks of enterococci in dairy products. Enterococci are ubiquitous bacteria present in the environment and in the gastrointestinal tract of healthy animals and humans. In milk products, they are used as probiotics resulting in positive effects on human digestibility. As adjunct starter cultures, enterococci release natural antimicrobial substances inhibiting adulteration due to food-borne pathogens. Thanks to the efficient utilisation of organic acids, enterococci contribute to the development of unique sensory characteristics in fermented dairy products. In contrast to these positive roles, some enterococcal strains were suspected to have pathogenic properties for humans, mainly based on specific virulence factors found in some strains of *Enterococcus faecalis* and to a lesser extent in strains of *Enterococcus faecium*. In addition, they were regarded as being resistant to several antibiotics. Since virulence factors and antibiotic resistance were found to be genetically encoded and transmissible, they may be transmitted to other enterococcal strains and even to other bacteria species. So far however, no genetic similarities and clear strain specificities have been observed among traits isolated from clinical or food sources. Thus, a pathogenic potential could only be associated with clinical strains, not food strains. Moreover, there is currently no evidence for pathogenic effects on humans. However, evidence for pathogenicity exists from three experimental models in animals. Due to the efficient removal of enterococci during processing, enterococci may be regarded as ‘contaminants’ if found in processed dairy foods.



## **Acknowledgements**

Since I was little, my parents have encouraged me a strong dedication to study and taught me that only with effort would I go far. Even since I was 11 years old, embracing a post-graduate degree was one of my biggest dreams. But I would never have imagined that New Zealand was linked to my destiny. New Zealand, the land of the long white cloud, has opened a whole new world to me, full of opportunities and wonderful surprises. I have met and made many invaluable friends. I have really enjoyed the multicultural face that this country has, which always made me feel at home. And although ‘kiwi’ English was a real challenge at the beginning, the kindness of the people has made the experience unforgettable. Today, my dream has come true, I am returning back to Paraguay, with a baggage full of effort, memories, and a degree, my degree that I have strongly dreamt of ...

Belonging to Massey University, and especially to the Epi-Centre was an honour to me. Here, I have met true professionals in Epidemiology who gave me the tools to deal with a range of common infectious diseases from both New Zealand and my own country. The dedication of the Epi-Centre people, along with the kindness that characterises this little family (that I already consider as mine), will always be in my heart.

I would like to express a great gratitude to my supervisors, who have always had enormous patience with my ‘latin’ English, and helped me in every way possible. Thanks Cord Heuer, and many thanks to you, Jutta Tebje-Kelly. Also, thanks to Mark Stevenson, Ron Jackson and Nigel French. You will always be welcome in Paraguay!

Thanks to the amazing Bruce Hill. I will miss our almost weekly meetings; your whole-hearted help was priceless, and I have a true admiration for you. Through you I also thank Fonterra, who made this project possible.

Thanks to my twin sister Marta, my ‘other half’, my inspiration, without you I would not have come this far...may God allow us to spend more time together. I love you.

Thanks to my amazing parents, my leaders, for their incredible patience and support. Thanks to my sister Sandra, I am looking forward to having a family as lovely as yours.

It would be impossible to describe all the love I feel for you, Augusto, your caring personality and strength are an inspiration to me; thanks for joining me in this fantastic journey, which made us a stronger couple. I feel we can consider ourselves 'blessed'.

Thanks to my beloved friends, Claudia and Warren. Thanks Pamela, and to all the warm Latin community I have met in Palmerston North and at Massey University. Thanks Mary, Denise, Birgit, Simone, Esther, Solis, Jackie, Colleen, Thibaud, Sithar, Ian, Caryl, Jenny, Patricia, Julie, Kathy...you will always be part of my memories. My appreciation all my Paraguayan friends, who cared about me during the 2 years and 3 months I have spent in New Zealand. Thanks Andrea, Gabriela, Valeria, Clara, Karin, María José, Fernando... you are fantastic friends.

I express my gratitude to the Paraguayan Ministry of Agriculture and the Veterinary Faculty at Asunción. And most of all, thanks to the New Zealand Agency for International Development (NZAID) for investing in Paraguay, and in turn, for trusting in me. I will do everything possible to employ my humble knowledge to build a better Paraguay. Thanks Sue Flynn and Sylvia Hooker, you have been like mothers to me...

And I would like to give a special thanks to God, Jesus and the Virgin Mary, for leading me towards being a better person. You are my light and everything I am I owe it to you.

# Table of Contents

Abstract .....	i
Acknowledgements .....	iii
Table of Contents .....	v
List of Figures .....	vii
List of Tables .....	ix
List of Abbreviations .....	xi
Chapter 1: Introduction .....	1
1.1 General perception of enterococci - benefits and risks of their presence in food, especially in milk and dairy products .....	1
1.2 International food standards with regards to enterococci .....	3
1.3 Importance of a risk analysis with regards to enterococcal presence in milk and milk products .....	3
1.4 Aims of this study .....	4
Chapter 2: Taxonomy of Enterococci .....	7
2.1 Introduction .....	7
2.2 Historical taxonomy .....	8
2.3 Current taxonomy .....	12
2.4 Conclusions .....	14
Chapter 3: Properties of Enterococci .....	15
3.1 General properties .....	15
3.1.1 Heat resistance .....	17
3.1.2 pH resistance .....	18
3.2 Biochemical properties of technological interest .....	19
3.2.1 Acid production .....	19
3.2.2 Proteolytic and peptidolytic activities .....	21
3.2.3 Lipolytic and esterase activities .....	21
3.2.4 Citrate and pyruvate metabolism .....	22
3.2.5 Production of volatile compounds .....	27
3.2.6 Bacteriocin production .....	28
3.3 Conclusions .....	30
Chapter 4: Laboratory Identification .....	33
4.1 General considerations .....	33
4.2 Routine methods of isolation, identification and confirmation of enterococci .....	34
4.2.1 Isolation and identification .....	34
4.2.2 Confirmation .....	35
4.3 Other methods: genotypic-based techniques .....	36
4.4 Conclusions .....	36
Chapter 5: Sources and Reservoirs .....	37
5.1 Primary sources .....	37
5.1.1 Animals .....	37
5.1.2 Humans .....	39
5.1.3 Environment .....	39
5.2 Secondary sources: enterococci in foods .....	43
5.3 Conclusions .....	45



Chapter 6: Enterococci as Pathogens? .....	47
6.1 Evidence for clinical disease in humans due to enterococci .....	47
6.1.1 Clinical infections .....	47
6.1.2 Risk factors of host and environment that may contribute to pathogenesis... 48	
6.1.3 Pathogenesis.....	49
6.1.4 Review of Hill’s criteria for causality.....	49
6.2 Risk factors of enterococci that may contribute to pathogenesis.....	55
6.2.1 Virulence determinants .....	55
6.2.1.1 Identified virulence determinants.....	56
6.2.1.2 Prevalence of virulence factors among enterococci.....	58
6.2.1.3 Regulation mechanisms of the virulence expression .....	61
6.2.2 Biogenic amines.....	62
6.2.3 Antibiotic resistance.....	64
6.2.4 Transfer of virulence determinant and antibiotic-resistant genes .....	71
6.3 Conclusions.....	73
Chapter 7: Enterococci in Dairy Foods.....	75
7.1 Enterococci in milk and dairy products .....	75
7.1.1 Enterococci as contaminants in milk .....	75
7.1.2 Functions of enterococci in dairy products .....	76
7.1.2.1 Starter cultures .....	77
7.1.2.2 Adjuncts (non-starter) cultures.....	78
7.1.2.3 Probiotics .....	79
7.1.2.4 Protective cultures: the role of the ‘enterocins’ .....	81
7.1.3 Sanitary regulations - raw milk for production of dairy products.....	83
7.1.4 Effects of heat treatments on survival of enterococci .....	84
7.1.4.1 Pasteurisation of raw milk.....	84
7.1.4.2 Manufacture of dairy products.....	88
7.1.4.2.1 Milk powder .....	89
7.1.4.2.2 Cheese .....	91
7.1.4.2.3 Casein.....	93
7.1.4.2.4 Butter.....	95
7.2 Conclusions.....	98
Executive Summary .....	101
Appendix A: Selective media for the isolation of enterococci in foods and dairy products .....	105
Appendix B: Methods for confirmation of enterococci in dairy foods.....	111
Appendix C: Enterococci in cheeses.....	113
Appendix D: Enterococci in meats .....	117
Appendix E: Heat treatment of raw milk .....	121
References.....	125

## List of Figures

Figure 1: The position of <i>Enterococcus</i> between benefit and risk in medicine as well as in food and agricultural sciences.....	2
Figure 2: Sherman's classification of the <i>Streptococcus</i> genus including the sub-species that fell within the D-antigen-producing group of enterococci.....	10
Figure 3: Schleifer and Kilpper-Bälz's re-classification of the genus <i>Streptococcus</i> into three different sub-genera .....	10
Figure 4: Schleifer and Kilpper-Bälz's differentiation of the old genus <i>Streptococcus</i> and separation of its <i>Lactococcus</i> and <i>Enterococcus</i> sub-genera to constitute new genera .....	11
Figure 5: The phylogenetic position of the genus <i>Enterococcus</i> demonstrated by a 16S rRNA-dendrogram of Gram-positive genera, including <i>Streptococcus</i> and <i>Lactococcus</i> .....	12
Figure 6: 16S rRNA-based tree reflecting the relationship of enterococcal sub-species	13
Figure 7: pH values attained by <i>E. faecalis</i> , <i>E. faecium</i> and <i>E. durans</i> after growth in skim milk for 6 hours at 37 °C .....	20
Figure 8: Correlation between citrate and pyruvate utilisation after growth of enterococci in modified MRS broth for 6 hours at 37 °C .....	25
Figure 9: Correlation between citrate and pyruvate utilisation after growth of enterococci in modified MRS broth for 16 hours at 37 °C .....	26
Figure 10: Percentage of susceptible, intermediate and resistant strains to 12 commonly used antibiotics.....	66
Figure 11: The survival curve of <i>E. durans</i> at milk commercial pasteurisation temperature (72 °C/15 seconds).....	86
Figure 12: The survival curve of <i>E. faecium</i> at milk commercial pasteurisation temperature (72 °C/15 seconds).....	87
Figure 13: Typical process flow for dairy products manufacture .....	89
Figure 14: Typical process flow for liquid milk and WMP manufacture .....	90
Figure 15: Typical process flow for cheese manufacture .....	93
Figure 16: Process stages in acid casein manufacture .....	95
Figure 17: Process stages in butter manufacture.....	97



## List of Tables

Table 1: Current enterococcal different ‘species groups’ and their sub-species, based on their phylogenetic relationship within the genus .....	8
Table 2: Characteristic physiological properties of validly described enterococcal species .....	16
Table 3: Concentrations of main volatile compounds produced by enterococci of food, human and animal origin.....	27
Table 4: Well-characterised bacteriocins produced by <i>E. faecium</i> and <i>E. faecalis</i> strains .....	30
Table 5: Occurrence of enterococci in the gastro-intestinal tract .....	38
Table 6: Environmental samples collected in Europe (Sweden, Denmark, Spain and the United Kingdom) and the percentage of samples containing detectable amounts of enterococci .....	41
Table 7: Distribution of enterococci in food.....	44
Table 8: <i>E. faecium</i> strains isolated from cheese, sheep, and hospitalised patients, with their PCR results for virulence traits genes.....	60
Table 9: Common enterococcal virulence traits and the enterococcal species where they have been found .....	61
Table 10: Quantified (mg/l broth) biogenic amine production by 26 enterococci isolates .....	63
Table 11: Antibiotic resistance behaviour of selected <i>E. faecalis</i> and <i>E. faecium</i> strains isolated from samples of sausages, ham, minced meat, and cheese .....	69
Table 12: Biotechnological important LAB genera.....	79
Table 13: Characteristics of the <i>E. faecium</i> SF68 strain .....	81
Table 14: Heat resistance of three enterococci species in whole milk and non-fat milk, at 72 °C/15 seconds.....	85
Table 15: Pre- and post-pasteurisation counts of the most common enterococci found in raw milk (HTST at 72 °C/15 seconds).....	88
Table 16: Enterococcal results of analyses performed on 84 samples from 10 New Zealand milk powder manufacturing plants.....	91
Table 17: Numbers and predominance of <i>Enterococcus</i> spp. in cheeses from Mediterranean countries.....	115



## List of Abbreviations

ABAB	Azide blood agar base
Ace	Adhesin of collagen from <i>E. faecalis</i>
AD broth	Azide dextrose broth
AS	Aggregation substance
BA agar	Bile aesculin agar
Bar medium	Barnes medium
BB broth	Bromocresol purple azide broth
BEA agar	Bile aesculin azide agar
BHI broth	Brain heart infusion broth
CATC agar	Citrate azide tween carbonate agar
CFU	Colony-forming units
CHEF	Contour-clamped homogenous electric field electrophoresis
Cyl	Cytolysin
DNA	Deoxyribose nucleic acid
EfaA <sub>fm</sub>	Adhesin-like <i>E. faecium</i> endocarditis antigen
EfaA <sub>fs</sub>	Adhesin-like <i>E. faecalis</i> endocarditis antigen
ESD medium	<i>Enterococcus</i> selective differential medium
Esp	Enterococcal surface protein
fGTC agar	Fluorogenic gentamicin thallos carbonate agar
FSR system	<i>E. faecalis</i> regulator system
G + C	Glycine + Cytosine
Gel	Gelatinase
GeE	Gelatinase gene
GREF	Glycopeptide-resistant <i>E. faecium</i>
HTST pasteurisation	High temperature short time pasteurisation
KAA medium	Kanamycin-aesculin-azide medium
LAB	Lactic acid bacteria
LDL cholesterol	Low-density lipoprotein cholesterol
mE agar	Membrane filter <i>Enterococcus</i> agar
mmol	Millimol/es
MRS medium	Man, Rogosa and Sharpe medium
NaCl	Sodium chloride
PCR	Polymerase chain reaction
PFGE	Pulsed-field gel electrophoresis
ppm	Parts per million
PYR test	Pyrrolidonyl- $\beta$ -naphthylamide test
RAPD	Random amplified polymorphic DNA
RNA	Ribonucleic acid
rRNA	Ribosomal ribonucleic acid
SB agar	Slanetz-Bartley agar
SMP	Skim milk powder
Spr	Serine protease
SprE	Serine protease gene
SREF	Streptogramin-resistant <i>E. faecium</i>
TS broth	Trypticase soy broth
TTC	Tripheniltetrazolium chloride
UHT process	Ultra high temperature process
VRE	Vancomycin-resistant enterococci
VSE	Vancomycin-susceptible enterococci
w/v	Weight/volume
WMP	Whole milk powder