An Evaluation and Comparison of the Horowhenua and Tararua Community Alcohol Action Programmes (CAAP)

This Thesis is presented as partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts in Psychology at Massey University

Gina Rickards
1996
ABSTRACT

In New Zealand, Community Alcohol Action Programmes (CAAP) have emerged to address the high number of alcohol-related road injuries and fatalities. The present study is an evaluation and comparison of the Horowhenua and Tararua CAAP programmes. Subjects (n=175) from several different groups within these communities were interviewed and observational studies of licensed premises (n=36) were used to collect data. Statistical analysis (chi-square) was conducted to see whether one programme had been more successful in meeting its aims and objectives than the other. Few statistically significant differences were found indicating that the programmes were on the whole similar. However, prior to the commencement of this piece of research, a number of potential problems concerning the evaluations were identified. These relate mainly to the fact that the evaluation of the programmes had not been planned for before they were implemented. It was concluded that the citizens involved in community action programmes often have little awareness of research design and evaluation. This can limit the utility of such programmes and make it difficult to draw valid or reliable conclusions concerning their efficacy.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to acknowledge the hard work of the Horowhenua and Tararua CAAP Committee members who are dedicated to the reduction of drink driving incidences in their districts. I would especially like to thank the Chairpersons and Secretaries who made my job much easier by providing all the documents and material I requested throughout the evaluations.

Thank you to all the people who generously gave their time to participate in the interviews and to Alex Green who gave up her Friday and Saturday nights to visit licensed premises with me.

Finally, I thank my family and friends for their never-ending support, enthusiasm and motivation over the past year.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ......................................................................................................................... ii  
Acknowledgement .......................................................................................................... iii  
List of Tables ................................................................................................................... v  
List of Figures .................................................................................................................. viii  
Abbreviations and Definitions ....................................................................................... xi  
Introduction .................................................................................................................... 11  
Part I Methodology for Reports ......................................................................................... 47  
Part II Results for Horowhenua Report ........................................................................ 65  
Part III Results for Tararua Report ................................................................................ 99  
Part IV Methodology for Comparison ............................................................................ 127  
Results of Comparison .................................................................................................. 129  
Discussion ...................................................................................................................... 132  
References ....................................................................................................................... 148  
Appendices ...................................................................................................................... 162  

Appendix A - Questionnaires for Surveys and Observational Checklists ..................... 162  
Appendix B - Letters Used to Gain Entry into Private Clubs .......................................... 176  
Appendix C - Recommendations for the Horowhenua and Tararua CAAPs ................ 179
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 - Composition of Sample ................................................................. 54
Table 2 - Licensed Premises Visited in the Sample ....................................... 54

Horowhenua Evaluation

Table 3 - Respondent Sex ........................................................................... 65
Table 4 - Respondent Age ........................................................................... 65
Table 5 - Respondent Ethnicity ..................................................................... 66
Table 6 - Respondent Occupation ................................................................. 66
Table 7 - Respondent Households ................................................................. 67
Table 8 - Respondent Income ....................................................................... 67
Table 9 - Respondent Income and Knowledge of the Programme .................. 68
Table 10 - Respondent Location ................................................................. 68
Table 11 - Respondents Who Drink .............................................................. 69
Table 12 - Percentage of Respondents Knowing About CAAP ..................... 70
Table 13 - Ranking of Aims by the Horowhenua CAAP Committee Members .... 72
Table 14 - Accidents Involving Alcohol Resulting in Injury ............................ 73
Table 15 - Ensuring a Safe Night Out ........................................................... 76
Table 16 - Changes in Drinking Behaviour Since April 1993 ....................... 76
Table 17 - Social Costs Borne by the Community Through Drink Driving ...... 78
Table 18 - Summary of Licensees Observation ............................................. 82
Table 19 - Summary of Clubs Observation ................................................... 84
Table 20 - Learning From the Experience of Operation Peer Pressure .......... 86
Table 21 - Preferred Number of Times to Go Out on Operation Peer Pressure .... 86
Table 22 - Most Appropriate Age for Participating in Operation Peer Pressure .. 87
Table 23 - An Overall Rating of Operation Peer Pressure .............................. 87
Table 24 - Operation Peer Pressure Rating by Participants ..................................................... 88
Table 25 - Knowledge of the Horowhenua CAAP by Students .............................................. 90
Table 26 - Number of Fatal Alcohol Related Road Deaths in the Horowhenua ...................... 94
Table 27 - Changes in General Road Behaviour .................................................................... 96
Table 28 - Areas of Behaviour Change .................................................................................. 96
Table 29 - Other Anti Drink Driving Campaigns .................................................................. 97

Tararua Evaluation

Table 30 - Respondent Sex ................................................................................................. 99
Table 31 - Respondent Age ............................................................................................... 100
Table 32 - Respondent Ethnicity .......................................................................................... 100
Table 33 - Respondent Occupation ..................................................................................... 101
Table 34 - Respondent Households ..................................................................................... 101
Table 35 - Respondent Income ........................................................................................... 102
Table 36 - Respondent Location ......................................................................................... 102
Table 37 - Respondents Who Drink .................................................................................... 102
Table 38 - Location of Respondent and Whether They Drink Alcohol or Not ....................... 103
Table 39 - Percentage of Respondents Knowing About CAAP .......................................... 104
Table 40 - Ranking of Aims by the Tararua CAAP Committee Members ........................... 106
Table 41 - Accidents Involving Alcohol Resulting in Injury ................................................ 107
Table 42 - The Priority of Reducing Drink Driving in the Tararua .......................................... 110
Table 43 - Legal Limit of Alcohol Able to be Consumed Before Driving ............................... 110
Table 44 - Number of Respondents Knowing the Legal Limit ............................................. 111
Table 45 - Changes in Drinking Behaviour Since November 1993 ...................................... 111
Table 46 - Summary of Hotels Observation ......................................................................... 114
Table 47 - Summary of Clubs Observation .......................................................................... 116
Table 48 - Knowledge of the Tararua CAAP by Students .................................................. 117
Table 49 - Where the Respondents Drink .............................................................................. 119
Table 50 - Usual Means of Transport When out Drinking .................................................. 119
Table 51 - Ensuring a Safe Night Out .................................................................................... 120
Table 52 - Number of Fatal Alcohol Related Road Deaths in the Tararua ............................ 121
Table 53 - Problems Arising from Alcohol Abuse ................................................................. 122
Table 54 - Social Costs Borne by the Community Through Drink Driving ....................... 123
Table 55 - Changes in Drinking Behaviour Since November 1993 .................................. 124
Table 56 - Other Anti Drink Driving Campaigns ................................................................. 126

Comparison Method

Table 57 - Aims in Common for the Horowhenua and Tararua CAAPs ................................. 127

Comparison Results

Table 58 - Knowledge of the Programmes in Each District ................................................ 129
Table 59 - Increase in Awareness of Social Costs Relating to the Inception of Each
Programme .......................................................................................................................... 129
Table 60 - Knowledge of Student Focused CAAP Initiatives ................................................. 130
Table 61 - Suggested Improvements for the Student Initiatives ......................................... 130
Table 62 - Courtesy Van Use Relating to Club Location ..................................................... 131
LIST OF FIGURES

Horowhenua Evaluation

Figure 1 - Alcohol Involved Accidents - Horowhenua Urban .................................................. 74
Figure 2 - Alcohol Involved Accidents - Horowhenua Rural .................................................. 75

Tararua Evaluation

Figure 3 - Alcohol Involved Accidents - Tararua Rural ......................................................... 108
Figure 4 - Alcohol Involved Accidents - Tararua Urban ......................................................... 109
The following definitions are derived from the work of Bailey and Carpinter (1991).

**The Drinking Driver** - In general, the term 'drinking driver' is used to refer to anyone who is over the legal limit of blood alcohol for driving. Sometimes it is used to refer to anyone who drinks before s/he drive irrespective of his/her level of intoxication. In the present study however, it is reserved for those drivers over the legal limit. Other terms describing a drinking driver include:

- **DWI** - Driving While Intoxicated;
- **DUI** - Driving Under the Influence.

**Blood Alcohol Levels (BAL/BAC)** - Alcohol in the blood is measured in milligrams of alcohol per 100 millilitres of blood. The legal limit for fully licensed drivers in New Zealand is 80 milligrams of alcohol per 100 millilitres of blood. This is written as 80mg%. This level varies from country to country.

**Random Stopping (RS)** - Random Stopping is where vehicles passing through a checkpoint are stopped at random. If a driver says s/he has been drinking when asked, or if the traffic officer has good reason to suspect the driver has been drinking, s/he is breath tested.
Compulsory/Random Breath Testing (CBT/RBT) - This is similar to random stopping except that all drivers passing through checkpoints are breath tested.

Server Intervention/Host Responsibility (SI/HR) - It should be noted that the term server intervention is a term used in the United States. In New Zealand, the equivalent term is host responsibility.