Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Narrative Connections:
Promoting the Moral Economy of Fair Trade

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Philosophy
in
Sociology

at Massey University, Palmerston North,
New Zealand.

Donna Martin

2009
Abstract

Fair trade is an alternative approach to international trade. It is both a social movement and an economic approach that aims to make trade fair for the many small scale producers disadvantaged in international trade. This thesis explores the discursive devices used by fair trade organisations to promote fair trade. These devices have two roles: to promote an ethical connection from consumer to producer and to involve the consumer in the work of fair trade through purchasing behaviour and political action. This second role refers to the politicisation of consumption whereby shopping becomes an act of political solidarity with disadvantaged producers. I explore these devices through narrative analysis, focusing on a thematic analysis of Trade Aid’s publication, *Vital*.

My research is framed by Michael Goodman’s (2004) work on the semiotic production of fair trade. The concept of a reflexive consumer is explored. This is the idea that consumer awareness of the conditions surrounding production can lead to purchasing decisions that reflect care for the distant producer. This opening up of the concept of consumption involves an active and engaged consumer who chooses to purchase fair trade because they feel a connection to the work of these organisations. I am interested in the particular form this information takes in *Vital*. I apply narrative research methods to explore the meta-narrative of fair trade promoted in *Vital* that tells the reader about the work of fair trade organisations, the impact this has on the lives of producer and how they can be involved in the story as a consumer and as a global citizen.
Acknowledgments

I wish to thank my supervisor, Dr Allanah Ryan, for her guidance over the past two years.

I would also like to acknowledge the support of my family over the years. In particular I thank my fiancé Pascal for his support and encouragement.

Lastly, I thank all the producers who have shared their stories and Trade Aid for making them heard.
Table of Contents

1. Introduction 1

RESEARCH AIM AND SCOPE 2

OUTLINE OF THESIS 4

2. Fair Trade: International and Local Experiences 7

INTRODUCTION 7

FAIR TRADE 7

What is Fair Trade? 7

Historical Roots of Fair Trade 9

The Benefits of Fair Trade: Economic, Social and Environmental 13

FAIR TRADE IN NEW ZEALAND: TRADE AID IMPORTERS LTD 14

CHALLENGES OF FAIR TRADE MARKET GROWTH: SELLING PRODUCTS, SELLING ETHICS 16

CONCLUSION: CONNECTING PRODUCERS AND CONSUMERS 19

3. The Production and Representation of a Moral Economy 21

INTRODUCTION 21

THEORISING THE MORAL ECONOMY OF FAIR TRADE 22

Material and Symbolic Production of Fair Trade 22

Moral Economy 24

Reflexive Consumerism 25

The Ethics of Care across Distance 27

Global Solidarity 29

REPRESENTATIONS OF FAIR TRADE 31


Caroline Wright: Commodity Fetishism in Fair Trade 34

Anne Le Mare: The Narrative of Fair Trade 36

MOTIVATING ACTION THOUGH REPRESENTATION 38

4. Narrative Research: Telling the Story of Fair Trade 41

INTRODUCTION 41

A CASE STUDY OF FAIR TRADE NARRATIVE: TRADE AID AND VITAL 42
NARRATIVE RESEARCH
What is narrative? 44
How is narrative used in social movements like fair trade? 45
Narrative Analysis
   Thematic Analysis 47
   Visual Analysis 48
   Structural Analysis 49

SAMPLING AND METHOD OF ANALYSIS 51
Sampling 51
Analytical approach 51

5. Connecting Consumers to Producers: The Story of Vital 55

INTRODUCTION 55

FAIR AND UNFAIR TRADE PRACTICES 55
What is unjust in international trade? 55
   Producers are marginalised by structural conditions 56
   Producers are exploited and enslaved by corporate production 58
How is fair trade different? 59
   Fair trade is a partnership of equals 60
   The benefits of fair trade are observable 61

PRODUCER, PRODUCTION AND PRODUCT 62
Producers: self-reliant and not such a stranger 63
   Empowering producers: People are actively involved in 63
      improving their own wellbeing through fair trade
   Still distant but not such a stranger: Producers are 65
      people with similar concerns to consumers
Production: skilful and traceable 66
   Production of fair trade products involves skilled production 67
   Production is a transparent process from 68
      raw material to finished product
Products: value-laden and transformed 69
   Products are rich - imbued with social and environmental values 69
   Fair trade combines tradition and transformation 71
      to produce quality products

THE CONSUMER AND THE GLOBAL CITIZEN 73
   Consumption is a powerful tool 74
   Fair trade engages the action of a global citizen 77

CONCLUSION 79

6. The Meta-Narrative of Transformation and 82
   The Reflexive Fair Trade Consumer

INTRODUCTION 82
STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS OF THE FAIR TRADE NARRATIVE 82

SPEAKING BACK TO THE CRITICS OF REPRESENTATIONS OF FAIR TRADE
Commodifying and Fetishising Fair Trade 86
Empowering Consumer and Producer 89
The Pleasure of Fair Trade Consumption 92
An Opportunity for “Radical Education” 95

NARRATIVE OF SOLIDARITY – CREATING AN IMAGINED COMMUNITY OF ‘FAIR TRADE CONSUMERS’ 97

THE REFLEXIVE CONSUMER AND THE PROBLEM OF PARTIALITY 99

CONCLUSION 101

7. Conclusion 102

REFERENCES 107