Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
PREPARING TEACHERS AS PROFESSIONAL EDUCATORS:
A NEW CONCEPTION FOR PRE-SERVICE TEACHER
EDUCATION

A thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Education
at Massey University, Palmerston North
New Zealand

Kathleen Ruth Vossler
2006
This thesis proposes a new conception for pre-service teacher education. Current pre-service teacher education programmes are, in the main, one-dimensional, skill-based and performative: one-dimensional, in that programmes focus on preparing teachers to deliver a pre-determined curriculum; skill-based, in that professional judgement and reasoning are ignored; and, performative in the prescribed nature of knowledge and the drive to establish standards and competencies. Rather than focusing on professionalism - which is at the heart of what it means to be an educator - professionalisation, economic-driven policies and political ideologies underpin contemporary pre-service teacher education programmes.

The new conception for pre-service teacher education has at its core, teachers as professional educators. This thesis argues that in order for teachers to become professional educators, their preparation ought to be enhanced and broadened to incorporate aspects of professional judgement, professional expertise, and ethical and moral commitment. To enable this to occur, pre-service teachers need to learn what it means to be moral agents through active and authentic engagement within communities of practice and learners. In sum, the professional educator's role is argued to be an agent for, and of, change who promotes and engenders an education system that underpins a socially, culturally and economically just society.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The journey culminating in this thesis has been wide-ranging and has involved many people. It probably began when I was a pre-service teacher in a teacher education programme, although the experiences I had only became meaningful as I subsequently reflected on the whole area of teacher education. Study for my Masterate with the late Brian Shaw was certainly a turning point as Brian introduced me to Hoyle (1974), and the whole area of professionalism. Shortly after this I became a teacher educator myself and through my teaching and study my interest in pre-service teacher education, and professionalism, intensified. The opportunity to pursue these interests came with the establishment of the Doctor of Education and I thank Luanna Meyer for getting me started. My interest developed as I began to think about and question the political influences on teacher education and the area of technical rationality and performativity. For me pre-service teacher education has to be more than a ‘bag of tricks’ or a recipe book.

There are many people who deserve my thanks, not least my friends and colleagues at the College of Education Massey University, and particularly those who have been involved with the development of the Professional Inquiry and Practice 3 paper and the text to accompany it. I especially acknowledge my friend and colleague Paul Adams. The University has supported me with an Academic Award and the management of the College of Education have made it possible for me to pursue my study. I would offer my special thanks to John Clark who worked with me initially and to my two supervisors, John Codd and John O’Neill, who have guided me and helped me clarify ideas, put things in perspective and stay on track. Their wisdom has been immeasurable.

There are two others who deserve my grateful thanks, my friend Brent Wheeler who argued and debated many aspects of this thesis with me, and my partner Greg who has been there for me and listened to me, especially when I had doubts.

EB and UP I hope you are both smiling.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Preliminaries**

**Introduction**  
The origin of an idea
- Conversation as Philosophical Inquiry  2
- Story One – The Teacher Trainee  5
- Story Two – The Teacher  6
- Story Three – The Masters Student  7
- Story Four – The Teacher Educator  8
- Making Sense of the Stories  10
- The Thesis  12
- The Thesis Outline  13

**Chapter 1**  
Teacher Professionalism  21
- What is Teacher Professionalism?  22
- Professionality  29
- The Four Ages of Professionalism  31
  - The Pre-professional Age  32
  - The Autonomous Professional Age  33
  - The Collegial Professional Age  35
  - The Post-professional Age  37
- Teacher Professionalism for Today’s Society  42

**Chapter 2**  
The Professionalisation Process  49
- Professionalisation  50
- The Professionalisation Process and Teacher Education  54
  - Competing Discourses and the Rhetoric of Debate  54
  - The Status of Teacher Education and Teacher Educators  59
  - Initiatives, Policies, Reports and Inquiries  63
    - QUALSET  64
  - The Green Paper  67
  - The Capable Teacher  70
  - Pre-employment Training for Teachers  73
  - The Parliamentary Select Committee Inquiry into Teacher Education  78
- Ministry of Education Initiatives  85
- Deprofessionalisation  87
- Competing Agendas in Teacher Education  92
### Chapter 3  The Search for ‘A’ or ‘The’ Knowledge Base  101

| The Concept of a Knowledge Base | 101 |
| 'A' or ‘The’ Science of Teaching | 102 |
| 'A’ or ‘The’ Knowledge Base or Bases | 105 |
| The reification of knowledge within the concept of a knowledge base | 106 |
| The connotations associated with the concept of the knowledge base | 107 |
| The political usefulness or purposes of the knowledge base | 108 |
| The inadequacy of the knowledge base in pre-service teacher education | 110 |
| The Problem of Teacher knowledge | 111 |
| The Concept of ‘Knowledge’ | 112 |
| Towards an Understanding of Knowledge | 113 |
| Classical Interpretations and Analyses | 113 |
| Post-positivism and Popperian Interpretations | 115 |
| Pragmatism | 116 |
| Post-modernist Explanations | 119 |
| Types of Knowledge | 121 |
| The Purposes or Uses of Knowledge | 123 |
| Is there a Knowledge Base for Pre-Service Teacher Education? | 125 |
| Pedagogical Content Knowledge | 126 |
| Knowledge of Educational Contexts | 128 |
| Knowledge of Learners and their Characteristics | 129 |

### Chapter 4  Technical Rationality and the Influence of Standards and Competencies  139

| Technical Rationality | 141 |
| The Contribution of Education and Educational Research to Technical Rationality | 145 |
| The Contribution of Political and Economic Ideology to Technical Rationality | 153 |
| The Convergence of the Political and Educational Ideologies | 156 |
| Performativity | 159 |
| Standards and Competencies | 162 |

### Chapter 5  Rethinking Education, Teaching and Teacher Education  179

| The Places called Schools | 180 |
| Schools as Communities of Practice - Communities of learners |  |
| The People called Teachers | 191 |
| Teachers as Professional Educators | 194 |
| Contrasting Conceptions of Teaching | 195 |
| Rethinking Teacher Education | 202 |
## Chapter 6
A New Conception of Pre-Service Teacher Education 209

- The Impetus for Change 210
- Interpreting the New Conception 212
- A Just Society 216
- Communities of Learners- Communities of Practice 221
  - Professional Expertise 226
    - Practical Knowledge 227
    - Critical Reflection 233
    - Critical Inquiry- The Teacher as Researcher 239
  - Professional Judgement 243
    - Practical Wisdom 244
    - Practical Reasoning 247
    - Reasonableness 249
- Ethical and Moral Commitment 251
  - Ethical Commitment 254
  - Moral Commitment 259

## Chapter 7
Conclusion 269

- Implications for Practice 278
  - Developing the teacher as an educated person 278
  - Developing programmes which are underpinned by professional expertise, professional judgement and moral and ethical commitment 280
  - Creating a community of practice and learners 281
  - Rethinking the practicum 283
- Implications for Policy 284
- Topics and Concepts for Further Research and Investigation 286
  - Phronesis as a concept to underpin Critical Reflection and Inquiry 287
  - Aristotelian Character Virtues and their Implications for the Professional Educator 288
  - Epistemological Stance as a means to understand Professional Expertise 288
- Concluding Comments 289

## Postscript 293

## References 297
## LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>Restricted and Extended Models of Professionality</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>Contrasting Conceptions of Teaching</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>A New Conception of Teaching</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>An Interactive Conception of Teaching</td>
<td>201 &amp; 213</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>