ATTACHMENT REPRESENTATIONS AND PARENTING:
THE ASSESSMENT OF COGNITIVE COMPLEXITY AND
EMOTIONAL SECURITY WITH THE ADULT
ATTACHMENT INTERVIEW

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Education (Human Development)

at Massey University

Sue Anne Watson

2009
ABSTRACT

This study examines the relationship between parent characteristics assessed before the birth of their baby and their Adult Attachment Interview (AAI: George, Kaplan & Main, 1985) classification to investigate the role of cognitive development as a key indicator of attachment classification. Data from the Washington University Sentence Completion Test (Loevinger, 1976), Reflective Functioning Scale (Fonagy, Steele, M., Steele, H., Moran & Higgitt, 1991) and Conceptual/Integrative Complexity (Baker-Brown et al., 1992) are examined in relation to adult attachment classification of Secure/Autonomous and the construct of Coherence of Transcript. Other self-report instruments are used to add further information to the examination of constructs underpinning the coding of the AAI. It was found that autonomy requires a necessary level of cognitive development but cognitive development is not sufficient for coherence or attachment representation as secure. Distinguishing between autonomy and security needs in new parents may assist community practitioners provide better focussed support for the parents themselves and for their children.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Sue Anne Watson 1940 - 2009

This degree was awarded posthumously.

Sue had not written the acknowledgements, so unfortunately we are unable to name all the people who should be thanked personally for providing input, support and inspiration over the years, but we know she was very grateful to you all. On Sue’s behalf we would also like to thank all of the parents and parents-to-be who gave their time and shared their experiences so this research could be conducted.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................... ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ......................................................................................... iii

LIST OF APPENDICES .............................................................................................. ix

LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................................ x

LIST OF FIGURES .................................................................................................... xii

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION ................................................................................ 1
    Attachment Theory ...................................................................................................... 2
        The Strange Situation Procedure and Attachment Patterns................................. 3
        The Adult Attachment Interview ........................................................................ 4
        Intergenerational Transmission of Attachment .................................................... 5
    Background to this Project ........................................................................................ 7
    Issues Arising .......................................................................................................... 9
    Outline of Thesis ....................................................................................................... 11

CHAPTER 2. ASSESSING COHERENCE AND AUTONOMY .......................... 15
    Investigating Intergenerational Transmission of Attachment ................................... 15
    Maternal Behaviour ............................................................................................... 15
    If Not Parenting Behaviours Experienced, Then What? ....................................... 17
    Internal Working Model and the Prototype Hypothesis ........................................ 21
    Parental Support to Child’s Cognitive Development ............................................ 24
    AAI as a Predictor of Parent/Child Attachment .................................................... 26
    Coherence in the Coding for the AAI ....................................................................... 26
        Coherence Overlapping with Metacognitive Monitoring .................................... 29
        Coherence as Narrative Form ............................................................................ 31
        Coherence as a Sign of Psychological Health .................................................... 33
        Antonovsky’s Sense of Coherence ...................................................................... 35
        Coherence as an Assessment Construct ................................................................ 39
    Summary of “Coherence” as Narrative Competence ............................................ 40
    The Meaning of “Autonomous” .............................................................................. 41
    Cultural and Theoretical Differences .................................................................... 41
    Self-regulation ....................................................................................................... 44
CHAPTER 3. COGNITIVE COMPLEXITY, COHERENCE AND THE AAI..59
Theories of Cognitive Development ................................................................. 59
Piagetian Theory and Post-formal Thinking ......................................................... 59
Kohlberg, Gilligan, Loevinger .............................................................................. 62
Perspective Taking ............................................................................................... 64
Epistemological Development ............................................................................. 64
Task Complexity ................................................................................................... 66
Links Between Domains of Thinking ................................................................. 66
Brain Development ............................................................................................... 67
Parenting as a Cognitive Challenge ................................................................... 68
Non-Piagetian Conceptions of Cognitive Development ....................................... 69
Relating These Ideas to the AAI ......................................................................... 69
Assessing Cognitive Complexity of New Parents ............................................... 71
The Washington University Sentence Completion Test ....................................... 71
Reflective Functioning Scale .............................................................................. 83
Cognitive Complexity ........................................................................................... 87
Summary ............................................................................................................... 90

CHAPTER 4. OTHER INDIVIDUAL DIFFERENCES OF NEW PARENTS ....91
Research Before the Birth of the Child ................................................................. 91
Demographic Variables: Age, Gender, Education, Socioeconomic Status, Marital Status ................................................................. 93
Personality ........................................................................................................... 95
Social Desirability ............................................................................................... 98
Locus of Control ................................................................................................. 100
Affective Measures ............................................................................................. 101
Self Esteem ......................................................................................................... 101
Depression .......................................................................................................... 103
Parental Bonding Instrument ................................................................. 149
Social Support .......................................................................................... 150
Negative Life Events ................................................................. 152
Summary of Association between Parenting Received and AAI Classification 152
Summary of Association between Parenting Received and AAI Coherence of Transcript ................................................................. 153
Cognitive Variables .................................................................................. 153
Ego Level ................................................................................................. 153
Reflective Functioning .......................................................................... 156
Conceptual/Integrative Complexity .......................................................... 156
Sense of Coherence ................................................................................. 157
Verbal Ability ........................................................................................... 157
Education ................................................................................................. 158
Metacognitive Monitoring........................................................................ 159
Examining the Intercorrelations of Cognitive Variables .......................... 159
Summary of Association between Cognitive Development Variables and AAI Coherence of Transcript ............................................................................................................. 163
Summary of Association between Cognitive Development Variables and AAI Classification ............................................................................................................................. 164
Personality Variables ............................................................................... 165
Under/Overcontrol and Resiliency ............................................................ 165
Locus of Control, Social Desirability, Self-Esteem .................................... 165
Depression ............................................................................................... 166
Summary of Associations between Personality Variables and AAI classifications ............................................................................................................................. 167
Summary of Associations between Personality Variables and Coherence of Transcript ............................................................................................................................. 167
Other Variables ......................................................................................... 168
Age .......................................................................................................... 168
Health ...................................................................................................... 168
Parenthood Experience ........................................................................... 169
Experience of Parenthood ....................................................................... 169
Infant Temperament ................................................................................. 170
Trilemma Toddlers’ Attachment Dimensions - Security and Dependency .......... 171
Summary of Associations between Parenthood Variables and AAI classifications ............................................................................................................................. 173
Summary of Associations between Parenthood Variables and Coherence of Transcript ................................................................. 174
How Well Prepared for Parenting Did Parents Think They Were? ................. 175
Summary ................................................................................................................. 175
Correlations between Coherence of Transcript and the Groups of Variables.... 176
Distinctions between the Secure/Autonomous Group and the Insecure Groups  177

CHAPTER 7. RESULTS - CASE STUDIES .......................................................... 179
Attachment Category F: Secure/Autonomous ...................................................... 180
Dana’s Story (#8: F3) .......................................................................................... 181
Karen’s Story (#20: F4b) ..................................................................................... 184
Rob’s Story (#23: F3a) ......................................................................................... 190
Attachment Category Ds: Dismissing ................................................................. 191
Ruth’s Story (#37; Ds3a) ..................................................................................... 193
Paul’s Story (#19: Ds3b/Ds2) ............................................................................. 197
Karl’s Story (#11: Ds3/Ds1) ............................................................................... 199
Attachment Category E: Preoccupied ................................................................. 203
Tony’s Story (#38: E2) ........................................................................................ 204
Attached Category U/d: Unresolved/disorganised ................................................. 207
Tess’s Story (#10: U/d/F4b) ............................................................................... 207
Cannot Classify CC ............................................................................................... 210
Penny’s Story (#7, CC/E3a/Ds3a) ..................................................................... 210
Attachment Classification and Category Description ............................................. 213
Different Types of Cognitive Development ........................................................ 215
Ego Development ................................................................................................. 216
Reflective Functioning ......................................................................................... 218
Conceptual and Integrative Complexity ............................................................. 219
Summary ............................................................................................................. 220

CHAPTER 8. DISCUSSION .................................................................................... 223
Issues Concerning this Research ......................................................................... 224
Sample Size ......................................................................................................... 225
Research Design and Procedures ........................................................................ 225
Findings from this Project ..................................................................................... 227
Distribution of AAI Classifications ................................................................... 227
Demographic Characteristics and Attachment Category ..................................... 228
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1. Adult State of Mind with Respect to Attachment .......................... 6
Table 1.2. Adult Attachment Interview Coding Scales ............................... 7
Table 2.1. State of Mind Scales Associated with Secure/Autonomous Adult Attachment Category ............................................................... 27
Table 5.1. Numbers of Participants at Three Times .................................... 134
Table 5.2. Ethnicity of First Time Mothers in New Zealand and in Current Sample .......................................................... 135
Table 5.3. Frequency Distribution of Education Level of Parents at Time 1 and Time 3 ................................................................. 135
Table 6.1. Distribution of Attachment Classifications at Time 1 and Time 3 .... 145
Table 6.2a. Means and Standard Deviations for Adult Attachment Interview Scales by Attachment Classification, Women Only ........................................ 146
Table 6.2b. Means and Standard Deviations for Adult Attachment Interview Scales by Attachment Classification, Men Only .............................. 146
Table 6.3. Mean Scores for Parental Bonding Instrument for Three Non-Clinical Adult Samples ................................................................. 148
Table 6.4. Bivariate Correlations of Caregiving Received .............................. 149
Table 6.5. Numbers of Cases with High Scores in the Secure/Autonomous Group (n = 18) and Insecure Groups (n = 12) on Caregiving Received Variables .......... 149
Table 6.6. Distribution of Ego-Level of Initial Volunteers, the Interview Sample and Sample at Time 3 ........................................................................ 151
Table 6.7. Means and Standard Deviations for Cognitive Variables by Attachment Classification .................................................. 153
Table 6.8. Bivariate Correlations of Variables Associated with Health .......... 155
Table 6.9. Bivariate Correlations of Cognitive Variables, Attachment Group and Coherence of Transcript ........................................... 157
Table 6.10. Bivariate Regressions of Cognitive Variables with Coherence of Transcript ........................................................................ 159
Table 6.11. Multivariate Regressions, Coherence of Transcript with Variables Entered in Pairs ...................................................................... 159
Table 6.12. Multivariate Regression with Attachment Group and Education, Reflective Functioning and Sense of Coherence .......................... 160
Table 6.13. Factor Analysis with Principal Component Analysis of Cognitive Development Variables ......................................................... 161
Table 6.14. Bivariate Correlations of Personality Variables .......................... 163
Table 6.15. Factor Analysis with Principal Component Analysis of Personality Variables .............................................................. 164
Table 6.16. Bivariate Correlations of Experience of Parenthood and Parent Characteristic ................................................................. 167
Table 6.17. Bivariate Correlations of Infant Temperament, Experience of Parenthood, and Attachment of Child, with Parents’ Attachment Group and Coherence of Transcript .................................................. 168
Table 6.18. Means and Standard Deviations for Infant Temperament, Experience of Parenthood and Attachment Security and Dependency ........................................... 169
Table 6.19. Means and Standard Deviations for Difficult Temperament, Security and Dependency of Infants and their Parents’ Experience of Parenthood by Attachment Classification .................................................. 171
Table 6.20. Summary of Responses from Preparation for Parenthood Questions, numbers in sample at T1 (n = 32) and T3 (n = 20) ................................................. 172
Table 7.1. Summary Scores for Dana ............................................................. 181
Table 7.2. Summary Scores for Karen ............................................................ 186
Table 7.3. Summary Scores for Rob ............................................................... 190
Table 7.4. Summary Scores for Ruth ............................................................... 194
Table 7.5. Summary Scores for Paul ............................................................... 196
Table 7.6. Summary Scores for Karl ............................................................... 200
Table 7.7. Summary Scores for Tony ............................................................. 204
Table 7.8. Summary Scores for Tess ............................................................. 207
Table 7.9. Summary Scores for Penny ........................................................... 210
Table 7.10 High and Low Ego Development Scores and other Cognitive Scores .............................................................. 215
Table 7.11. High and Low Reflective Functioning Scores and other Cognitive Scores ................................................................. 216
Table 7.12. High and Low Conceptual/Integrative Complexity and Other Cognitive Scores ................................................................. 217

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 6.1. Bivariate Intercorrelations of Parenting Received and Coherence of Transcript ..................................................................................................... 152
Figure 6.2. Bivariate Intercorrelations of Cognitive Variables and Coherence of Transcript ..................................................................................................... 158
Figure 6.3. Infants’ Attachment Profiles ................................................................................................................................. 170