Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Investor psychological bias towards number preferences in stock price endings:
Rationality Vs Irrationality

A research thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirement of the Degree of Masters in Business Studies (Fin) at Massey University

Name: Amanda Ling Qian Wang
ID number: 05128978
Due Date: 15/04/2011
Abstract

Consumer reactions towards products that end with $X.99 have been heavily researched in the marketing literature. My study has found psychological bias towards numbers in finance prices, where there is a positive return for prices ending in $X.01 and a negative return for prices ending in $X.99 for the American and Chinese Markets, with the return difference annualised to 22.65% and 54.43% per year, respectively. I find there are more buyer initiated stocks for stocks ending with the digit 9. This is not the same as consumer psychological bias, where consumers consider prices that end with 9 to be much cheaper than those ending in other digits. Rather, the case here is a rationality response to psychological bias. This would also explain why I did not find excessive buys in the Chinese market in relation to lucky numbers, as is found in the marketing literature.
Acknowledgements

First, I would like to thank my two supervisors, Professor Philip Stork and Associate-Professor John Pinfold, for their enlightening comments and support throughout the process of my thesis. I would also like to thank Min Bai for his help in data downloading and processing. Last, but not least, I would like to thank the staff of the Finance and Economics Department of Massey University for their supportive advice during the completion of my thesis.
Table of Contents

Abstract ...................................................................................................................... 1
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................... 3
1. INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................... 6
2. LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................. 8
   2.1 Left digit effect .................................................................................. 8
      2.1.1 Psychology-based findings in support of the left digit effect ......... 9
      2.1.2 Marketing literature on numbers that end with nine ................. 10
      2.1.3 Finance research into stock prices that end with nine .............. 12
      2.1.4 Difference data and methodology used in determining trade
direction may drive the different conclusions in the financial
literature .................................................................................................................... 16
   2.2 Lucky numbers effect ........................................................................ 20
   2.3 Behavioural finance findings of other number effects ................. 21
      2.3.1 Economic theory linkage to behavioural finance ................. 21
      2.3.2 Other anomalies associated with numbers in behavioural
finance 23
   2.4 Counter arguments for number anomalies in the stock market and
the left digit effect ............................................................................................. 25
      2.4.1 Investor rationality explanation in traditional finance theory 25
3. HYPOTHESIS DEVELOPMENT .................................................................. 27
4. DATA AND METHODOLOGY ....................................................................... 31
   4.1 Data and extraction ............................................................................ 31
      4.1.1 Data extraction for the return effect ........................................ 32
   4.2 Methodologies to infer trade direction .................................................. 32
      4.2.1 Lee and Ready (1991) methodology ........................................ 32
      4.2.2 Huang and Stoll (1997) midpoint method with one second lag 33
      4.2.3. Zero lag time for the midpoint method .................................... 34
   4.3 Formulas and statistical tests ................................................................. 34
5. RESULTS ........................................................................................................ 38
   5.1 Return results ....................................................................................... 38
   5.2 Left digit effect results ......................................................................... 43
5.3 Clustering .......................................................................................... 52
5.4 Lucky numbers results ..................................................................... 55

6. ROBUSTNESS TEST ....................................................................... 57

7. DISCUSSION .................................................................................... 58
  7.1 Explanations of the returns effect ................................................ 58
  7.2 Explanations of differences in buyer initiated shares relative to seller initiated shares for stocks that end with nine and one .............. 61
    7.2.1 Methodology differences generate similar results for the number of buys and sells .......................................................... 62
    7.2.2 Investors do not react in the same way as consumers .......... 63
    7.2.3 Explanation of difference in buy and sell volumes in terms of clustering and undercutting ...................................................... 65

8. LIMITATIONS ................................................................................ 71

9. CONCLUSION ................................................................................. 73

10. BIBLIOGRAPHY ......................................................................... 76

11. APPENDIX .................................................................................. 81
    Java program for data extraction ..................................................... 97
1. INTRODUCTION

Investor rationality has always been a topic explored in behavioural finance, as there are anomalies in the stock market caused by investor irrationality. In traditional finance theory, the efficient market hypothesis asserts that investors cannot make any abnormal returns given the same amount of risk. This is due to the assumption that investors will be rational in choosing those stocks that reflect the fundamental value of the firm. When a stock deviates from this fundamental value, there should instantly be many rational arbitragers that correct this phenomenon. Thus, it would be unrealistic under the efficient market hypothesis to generate excess returns given the same amount of risk.

As can be recalled from advertisements, around 99.99% of the time advertised product pricing is $X.99. This pricing method is used to stimulate consumer sales, as humans process the stock price from left to right, however, prices ending with $X.99 can effectively change the left-most digit of the price. In products that are highly priced, this method may even be used to change the digits before the decimal point; for example, $9,999.99 rather than $10,000.00. Potential customers will perceive the former price as being much cheaper than the latter one.

In my research, I investigate whether investors show the same irrationality towards stock price endings as is documented in the marketing literature, and whether this influences stock returns. My research is, to my knowledge, the first to document
intraday returns with respect to different cent digit endings and attempt to determine whether there is a connection between investor buying behaviour and return effects. I find this research topic very fascinating, because there may be a psychological bias regarding cent digit variations, which may affect stock prices. Differences in cent digits may generate abnormal returns, which may be due to either investor irrationality, or rationality. While much of the literature in this area documents investor irrationality due to personal beliefs and attitudes, there are still many research gaps in the area of behavioral bias towards numbers. The contribution of my research to this topic is the finding that investors are rational towards stock price purchasing, and that there are differences in return with respect to cent digit endings. It is also found that this effect persists for longer than 24 hours.