FROM THE WARD TO THE HOME:

Caring for a Family Member Diagnosed with Schizophrenia in New Zealand

This thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Social Policy and Social Work at Massey University by

Leigh Anne Richards-Ward
Department of Social Work and Social Policy
Massey University
Palmerston North
New Zealand

- 1996 -
ABSTRACT

The research question examined in this thesis is: 'What are the characteristics and complexities of the informal care provided within a family to a member diagnosed with schizophrenia, in New Zealand? This research question is divided into two parts. The first part examines the characteristics and complexities of the unpaid caring work provided to a family member diagnosed with schizophrenia and the second part explores how this care provision is influenced by the social, political, cultural, legal and economic context of New Zealand. This research is important because first, very little is known about the process and interpretation of care provided to a family member diagnosed with schizophrenia and second, New Zealand places great emphasis upon deinstitutionalisation and community care.

Ten women and four of their husbands were invited to participate in this research. These women were the primary informal care-givers of a family member who had experienced the cyclical acute and chronic episodes of schizophrenia. The women's husbands filled a secondary supporting role in relation to the women. The women met to identify themes related to their informal care provision. These themes were translated into an interview guide which acted as a prompt for the researcher while the women and men were articulating their stories of care-giving.

Foremost amongst the findings of this research was that the dominant understandings of care should be extended in order to reflect the informal care provided to a family member diagnosed with schizophrenia. The men supported the women's care provision which reflected their family member's unpredictable, changeable and cyclical symptoms of schizophrenia. It was characterised by the primacy of supervision and monitoring and was provided on a continual (flat-line) basis. It was also established that the women were finding it increasingly difficult to meet their informal caring responsibilities, these responsibilities being increased and extended by the Government's actions to reduce both state expenditure and state caring responsibilities. The
difficulty the women were experiencing in meeting the complex and changing care needs of their family member indicated that a continuum of care needs to be provided. It is argued that a continuum of care will need to include early intervention services, a range of community-based and institutionally-based mental health services, and a review of the definition of 'mentally disordered' contained within the Mental Health (Compulsory Assessment and Treatment) Act 1992. In order to coordinate and provide such a continuum of care, state, community and family caring responsibilities need to be combined, these three caring agents working collaboratively.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

When beginning the task of completing this thesis, I had little appreciation of how difficult, and at times, how daunting this task would be. It was the encouragement and support of many people which facilitated the completion of this thesis. It is to some of these people that I now express my appreciation.

The richness and detail presented in this thesis stems primarily from the experiences, feelings, and thoughts expressed by the women and men who participated in this research. Each one of these individuals shared aspects of their lives through telling me their stories of the care they provided to their family member diagnosed with schizophrenia. I acknowledge their commitment to their caring work and wish them well as they face future challenges this commitment will undoubtedly bring them.

Much support, inspiration and sound advice was provided by my supervisors Robyn Munford, Mike O'Brien and Celia Briar. Robyn, as chief supervisor, was a constant presence from the very beginning to the end. Robyn's own involvement with care-giving work, both professionally and personally, provided a standard by which my work could be measured. Mike became my second supervisor when Celia went on sabbatical leave to England.

I gained both a national and local understanding of the complexities of providing care to a family member diagnosed with schizophrenia, in New Zealand, by my involvement with Schizophrenia Fellowship. The assistance and support Schizophrenia Fellowship provided the participants is highlighted in this thesis.

On a day-to-day basis I was given much assistance and personal support from friends and members of my family. Your reward for this assistance and support will be seeing me engage the world with the time I used to spend working on my thesis. The possibilities are endless.
I give my parents special thanks. They developed in me a love for learning and an appreciation of the importance of receiving an education. From this grounding, I know that while my Ph.D has been completed, my learning days are far from over.

Finally, saying 'thankyou' to my husband Llewelyn seems less than adequate for the role he has played in supporting me to complete this thesis. Therefore I say Diolch yn fawr rwyn dy cariad di Llewelyn.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract .......................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgments .......................................................................................................... iv
Table of Contents ........................................................................................................... vi
List of Tables .................................................................................................................. x
List of Figures .................................................................................................................. x

INTRODUCING THE THESIS ..................................................................................... 1
• New Zealand's Mental Health Policy and Service Provision ..................................... 1
• The Effectiveness of Proposed Policy Changes ......................................................... 5
• The Research Question ............................................................................................... 6
• The Format of this thesis ............................................................................................ 11

SECTION ONE: SETTING THE SCENE ..................................................................... 18

1. ‘SCHIZOPHRENIA’ EXAMINED ............................................................................. 19
   • Definitions of Schizophrenia .................................................................................... 20
   • The Incidence of Schizophrenia ............................................................................ 24
   • Aetiology of Schizophrenia .................................................................................... 24
   • The Prognosis of Schizophrenia ........................................................................... 31
   • Treatment of Schizophrenia .................................................................................. 32
   • The Discourses of ‘Disability’, ‘Mental Illness’ and ‘Schizophrenia’ ..................... 36
   • Schizophrenia Defined: The Key Findings .......................................................... 44

2. THE NATURE OF CARE ......................................................................................... 47
   • What is Care? ......................................................................................................... 49
   • Who Cares? ............................................................................................................ 65
   • Challenging the Public/Private Split ..................................................................... 77
   • The Nature of Care: The Key Findings ................................................................. 94
3. THE CONTEXT OF CARE

- Social Policy and Care Provision................................. 10
- The Format of this Chapter........................................ 10

Part One: The Agents of Care

- The State...................................................................... 11
- The Community.............................................................. 12
- The Family...................................................................... 13
- Merging State, Community, and Family Caring Responsibilities........................................ 14

Part Two: Policy and Practice

- Treaty of Waitangi.......................................................... 14
- New Zealand's Health Sector........................................... 15
- New Zealand's Mental Health Services............................ 16
- Legislation...................................................................... 17

Part Three: Future Issues

- Shaping Mental Health Services: Consensus Development Conference Documents.............................. 19
- Looking Forward............................................................... 20
- The Context of Care: The Key Findings.......................... 21

4. A FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS.............................................. 21

SECTION TWO: METHODOLOGICAL ISSUES............... 222

5. THE RESEARCH PROCESS.................................................. 223

- Research Paradigms and Feminist principles................................. 224
- Values, Ethics and Politics Guiding This Research............................................. 239
- Gathering the Data.................................................................. 243
- Processing the 'Interview' Material........................................... 256
- Analysing the Participants' Information................................. 258
- Reflecting the Research Process........................................... 263
SECTION THREE: THE LIVED EXPERIENCES

Introducing ‘The Lived Experiences’

6. A CONUNDRUM

- The Family Members' Unusual and Socially Inappropriate Behaviours and Thoughts
- Teenage Phenomenon or Drugs?
- The Family Member's Unsettled Behaviour
- Contact with Police
- 'Trial and Error' as a Management Strategy
- Economic Circumstances of the Participants
- Something is 'Not Quite Right'
- The Participants' Knowledge of Schizophrenia
- Finding Answers
- Varying Diagnoses
- Committal
- The Diagnosis of Schizophrenia
- A 'Conundrum': The Key Findings

7. ASSUMING RESPONSIBILITY

Part One - Naming The Moment
- Learning About Schizophrenia
- Symptoms of Schizophrenia Exhibited by the Family Member

Part Two - ‘Choosing’ To Care
- The Women's Care-giver Role
- ‘Choosing’ to Become a Care-giver
- Women Who Decided not to Fill a Care-giver Role
- The Men's Role While the Women Assumed Responsibility
- Expectations About Filling a Care-giver/Supporting Role

Part Three - Responding to The Decision to Care
- Skills and Knowledge
- The Women Being Protective
- Living Day-to-Day
- Neuroleptic Medication
- The Changing and Lowering of Expectations
- Openness About Their Family Member's Diagnosis
• Initiating Change in the Caring Relationship ................................................................. 397
• Care-giver/Supporting Role and Kinship ........................................................................ 400
• Assuming Responsibility: The Key Findings .................................................................. 402

8. BEING ON CALL .............................................................................................................. 411
• The Family Member Assuming Responsibility .............................................................. 412
• The Family Member Entering Mental Health Services .................................................. 417
• Being on Call: 'Caring About' ....................................................................................... 425
• The Women Increasing Their Level of Care Provision................................................... 434
• Wanting to be Less Protective ....................................................................................... 438
• Attempting to be Less Protective .................................................................................. 446
• The Family Member's Adult Status .............................................................................. 449
• When I am Gone ............................................................................................................. 453
• Being on Call: The Key Findings .................................................................................... 455

SECTION FOUR:
LOOKING FORWARD: POLICY AND PRACTICE ............................................................. 461

9. LOOKING FORWARD: POLICY AND PRACTICE ...................................................... 462
• What is Care. ................................................................................................................... 465
• Who Cares ..................................................................................................................... 474
• The Context Of Care ...................................................................................................... 479
• Reflecting on the Research Process ............................................................................... 487
• Future Research ............................................................................................................. 489

REFERENCES .................................................................................................................... 493

APPENDICES ...................................................................................................................... 517
Appendix 1 ....................................................................................................................... 517
Appendix 2 ....................................................................................................................... 521
Appendix 3 ....................................................................................................................... 522
Appendix 4 ....................................................................................................................... 526
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. The prevalence of schizophrenia in specific populations (Kaplan & Sadock, 1991:328)................................................................. 25
Table 2. Components of the Diathesis-Stress Model...................................................... 30
Table 3. Features weighting toward good or poor prognosis in schizophrenia..... 31
Table 4. Working conditions: Formal and informal care (Ungerson, 1990:24). .... 79
Table 5. The 'what' facets of care.............................................................................. 96
Table 6. How women and men care.......................................................................... 98
Table 7. Treaty of Waitangi provisions (Durie, 1994:85)............................................. 146
Table 8. Number of available beds and mental health staff (Barwick, 1994:12). 205
Table 9. Gender and generation of persons receiving care..................................... 246

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Outline for Chapter Three................................................................. 116
Figure 2. 'The framework for analysis of care'......................................................... 235
Figure 3. 'The framework for analysis of informal care provided within a family to a member diagnosed with schizophrenia'......... 463