Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Insight: Leadership training, organisational context, and transfer of learning – a case study

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Business and Administration
in
Management
at
Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand.

Arnold Young
2011
Abstract

The transfer of learning remains a topic of interest with appeal for both researchers and practitioners. This research explores the transfer of learning from a leadership development training course from multiple perspectives and challenges traditional views on the relationship between formal training and work-based forms of learning.

The research adopted a qualitative case-study approach and took a holistic, longitudinal, view of a leadership development training course offered by a large financial services organisation in New Zealand. Forty four course participants, their managers, peers and subordinates, course trainers and the organisation’s senior executives were involved over three time periods. Social processes were found to have limited influence on enhancing the transfer of learning but had significant influence on inhibiting transfer. Managerial and organisational support were particularly influential barriers to transfer, whereas peer and subordinate support were found to have much less influence on transfer. The role of formal training was viewed in a new light with the finding that formal training complemented other forms of workplace learning and acted as a vehicle for socialisation and the transfer of tacit knowledge.

In contrast to the traditional view that formal training is irrelevant to the community of practice concept, this research found that formal training could facilitate participation, identity development and practice in established communities of practice as well as providing a basis for the formation of new communities of practice.
Acknowledgements

This research is the fulfilment of a long-held ambition which would not have been possible without the help of a large and diverse group of people. Their help took many forms and extended for over a decade. To all these people I offer my deepest thanks. Specifically, and in chronological order:

I thank my wife, Jane, who has been a strong and constant source of support from the very beginning. There are not enough words to thank her for the sacrifices that she has made during this long journey.

Thanks, also, to my friends and former colleagues at Finco (who must, unfortunately, remain anonymous) for your readiness to nurture and support this research.

My supervisors, Associate Professor Sarah Leberman and Dr Karl Pajo at Massey University, deserve my thanks for providing expert guidance and infinite patience while I struggled to come to terms with the art of research and academic writing. It cannot have been easy for them but they persevered and this thesis is largely due to their efforts.

This research would not have been possible without the many people at Finco who participated in this research. Thank you for your willingness to take part and the insights that you provided.

My sister, Lynlee Earles, provided much-needed logistical support by expertly transcribing most of the interviews, as well as proof-reading the final version of this thesis, in her spare time. Thank you, Lynlee.

Finally, thanks go to my daughter Emily who has never known life without a doctoral candidate for a father. Hopefully, we can now begin to make up for lost time together.
# Table of Contents

Abstract............................................................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgements........................................................................................................................ ii
List of figures....................................................................................................................................... vi
List of tables ......................................................................................................................................... vii

Chapter 1: Introduction .................................................................................................................... 1
  Background........................................................................................................................................ 1
  The strategic imperative for investigating leadership development training and the transfer of learning ......................................................................................................................... 1
  Overview of the thesis .......................................................................................................................... 4

Chapter 2: The status of extant research ......................................................................................... 8
  Introduction ......................................................................................................................................... 8
  Learning and the transfer of learning .............................................................................................. 9
    The transfer matrix ......................................................................................................................... 10
  Recent trends in research involving transfer facilitating activities.................................................. 12
  Soft skills transfer ............................................................................................................................. 13
  Transfer of learning from leadership development training ........................................................... 14
  Recent research trends in transfer of leadership development training ........................................... 15
  Summary of issues in transfer of learning research ....................................................................... 16
  Social processes in learning and its transfer .................................................................................. 17
    Workplace learning ......................................................................................................................... 17
    The dichotomies of workplace learning ........................................................................................ 17
    The dichotomy of individual and collective learning ................................................................... 18
    The socio-technical model in individual-collective learning .................................................... 19
  Issues in the social processes of workplace learning summarised .................................................. 21
  The community of practice approach to learning ....................................................................... 21
    Formal training and communities of practice .......................................................................... 23
    Issues of formal training and the community of practice concept summarised ......................... 27
  Summary of chapter ......................................................................................................................... 27
Chapter 3: Fulfilling the research aim ................................................................. 30

Introduction ........................................................................................................ 30
Research strategy ................................................................................................. 30
  Case study method ............................................................................................. 31
  Case selection .................................................................................................... 32
The research site and the Insight leadership development training course ........ 32
Data collection ..................................................................................................... 34
Research participants .......................................................................................... 34
  Semi-structured interview method ..................................................................... 38
Participant interviews .......................................................................................... 38
Data analysis ......................................................................................................... 41
Strategies for trustworthiness ............................................................................... 45

Chapter 4: Social supports in the transfer of learning ....................................... 47

Introduction ......................................................................................................... 47
Transfer of learning from Insight ........................................................................ 47
Managerial support for transfer .......................................................................... 48
  Autonomy and open skills learning ................................................................... 48
  Managerial feedback ......................................................................................... 49
Peer and subordinate support for transfer .......................................................... 52
Organisational support for transfer .................................................................... 53
  Influence of workload, unplanned work and lack of time on transfer ............ 53
  Ongoing social support .................................................................................... 54
Summary of chapter ............................................................................................. 55

Chapter 5: Exploring dichotomies of learning .................................................... 57

Introduction ......................................................................................................... 57
Coupling formal training and work-based learning ............................................. 57
Formal training as a conduit to work-based learning ........................................ 59
Formal training as a conduit to tacit knowledge ................................................. 59
  Networking ........................................................................................................ 61
  Collaboration and teamwork .............................................................................. 63
  Transfer of implicit learning ............................................................................. 66
Formal training as a conduit to socialisation ...................................................... 68
  Socialisation and formal training ..................................................................... 69
Chapter 5: Exploring dichotomies of learning (continued)

The longitudinal dimension, implicit learning and socialisation .................. 74
Summary of chapter .................................................................................. 76

Chapter 6: Toward a community of practice ............................................ 78
Introduction .............................................................................................. 78
Parallels between Insight and a community of practice ......................... 78
A role for formal training in a community of practice ......................... 81
Participation .......................................................................................... 82
Identity ................................................................................................. 84
Practice ................................................................................................. 88
Community of practice development .................................................... 91
Evolution from training course to community of practice .................... 96
Networking as a basis for developing a community of practice .......... 97
Trust, connectedness and collaboration in communities of practice .... 97
Timeframes and continuity in networks and communities of practice .... 100
Summary of chapter .............................................................................. 102

Chapter 7: Implications for research and practice ................................. 104
Introduction .......................................................................................... 104
Social supports for the transfer of learning .......................................... 105
Workplace learning .............................................................................. 107
Communities of practice .................................................................... 108
Integration of concepts ......................................................................... 109
Limitations of the research .................................................................. 110
Conclusion ............................................................................................ 112

References ........................................................................................... 113

Appendix 1: Insight Programme Overview ............................................ 125
Appendix 2: Detail of Insight Modules .................................................. 128
Appendix 3: Information Sheet ............................................................... 131
Appendix 4: Interview Guide ................................................................. 133
Appendix 5: Coding Summary ............................................................... 136
List of Figures

Figure 1. A model of the transfer process .................................................. 10
Figure 2. The transfer matrix: nine possible role/time combinations ................. 11
Figure 3. Summarised organisation chart ..................................................... 33
Figure 4. Timeline of key events and timing of interviews ............................... 40
Figure 5. Nodes emerging from interviews .................................................. 43
Figure 6. Nodes clustered into themes ......................................................... 44
Figure 7. Core constructs of the community of practice concept ....................... 82
Figure 8. An integrative model of workplace learning .................................... 110
List of Tables

Table 1. Number of research participants by category ........................................ 37
Table 2. Timing and purpose of longitudinal approach ........................................ 75