The Role of the Private Sector in Public Education: A Manawatu Region Based Case Study

Liam Rutherford

A thesis submitted to the Massey University of Palmerston North in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Philosophy in Education

2011
Abstract

This thesis analyses the role of the private sector in public education. It uses a Case Study based on a questionnaire of primary Principals in the Manawatu Region of New Zealand to generate its findings. This study identifies the extent to which Principals are pressurised into filling the funding gap created by the lack of Government funding to cover the full cost of running a school. Policy changes in education initially started by the Labour Government in 1984 and continued by the National Government in 1990 have been based on values that promote individualism, personal responsibility, and a belief in the market as a way of allocating resources in society. This thesis argues that the forms of alternative funding schools have been forced to enter into are a deliberate move to normalise school/business relationships. Promotion of these relationships severally disadvantages low socio-economic schools and families and will only lead to wider disparity between rich and poor and thus a less fair and equal education system.
Acknowledgments

My sincere thanks to:

My mum, Karen Houlihan, for the unconditional encouragement and love. University always felt like it was a possibility growing up and that is because of her.

My best friend and flatmate James Stevens for stepping up and doing the cooking and cleaning when needed.

Massey Library staff at Hokowhitu for their support and willingness to help.

My supervisor Howard Lee for his guidance and advice on writing this thesis.

My partner Aleisha Knight whose constant encouragement made sure that I actually finished it and the understanding she showed around waking up at 5am.

My main supervisor Anne-Marie O'Neill who I have known for the last 4 years. The conversations I have had with her over that time have opened my eyes and made me think critically about why things happen. My life will never be the same again. I have appreciated the time she has given assisting with my studies through my Honours and Masters. It has been her encouragement that has ensured that this thesis has been completed.
Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgments ............................................................................................................................ iii
Table of Contents ............................................................................................................................. iv
Figures and Tables ........................................................................................................................... vii
  List of Figures ............................................................................................................................... vii
  List of Tables ................................................................................................................................. vii
Chapter One – Introduction ............................................................................................................. 1
  New Zealand’s Experience with the Private Sector in Public Education ................................. 2
Research Questions and Methods .................................................................................................. 2
Thesis Structure ............................................................................................................................... 3
  Chapter Two – Literature Review ............................................................................................... 3
  Chapter Three – Methodology ..................................................................................................... 3
  Chapter Four – Results .................................................................................................................. 4
  Chapter Five – Discussion ............................................................................................................ 4
Chapter Two – Literature Review .................................................................................................. 5
  Introduction .................................................................................................................................... 5
  Theories Underpinning Education Policy ..................................................................................... 5
    New Right Ideology ...................................................................................................................... 6
    Public Choice Theory .................................................................................................................. 7
    Agency Theory .............................................................................................................................. 7
    Transaction Cost Economics ......................................................................................................... 8
Privatisation ....................................................................................................................................... 8
New Zealand’s Educational Policy Development since 1984 ......................................................... 9
  The National Government (1990-1999) ...................................................................................... 11
  The National Government (2008-) .............................................................................................. 14
Funding ........................................................................................................................................... 15
  The Decile System ......................................................................................................................... 15
  The Funding Shortfall .................................................................................................................... 16
Commercialisation ......................................................................................................................... 17
  Commercialisation in Education ................................................................................................. 18
  Private Sector Motives .................................................................................................................. 19
  Categories of Commercialism ....................................................................................................... 20
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Six</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fundraising Trends</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sponsorship Trends</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advertising Trends</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commercialisation Trends</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Promotion</td>
<td>Successful School Successful Business Conference</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Fundraising</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sponsorship</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commercialisation</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School Promotion</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Five - Discussion</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fundraising</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sponsorship</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commercialisation</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School Promotion</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggestions for Future Research</td>
<td>Trends from the questionnaire not supported by literature</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Suggestions for Future Research</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures and Tables

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 The Spectrum of Combinations of PPP Models .................................................. 25
Figure 2.1 Change in Role Numbers .................................................................................. 39
Figure 2.2 Average Operations Grant per Decile Band ....................................................... 39
Figure 2.3 Low Decile Principals Allocation of Time ......................................................... 40
Figure 2.4 Mid Decile Principals Allocation of Time ......................................................... 40
Figure 2.5 High Decile Principal Allocation of Time ......................................................... 41

List of Tables

Table 1.1 - PPP Models, adapted from Akintoye, Beck, and Hardcastle (2003) ............... 27
Table 2.1 Types of Sponsorships Currently Used ............................................................... 43
Table 2.2 Currently Used Sponsorship ............................................................................... 48
Table 2.3 Currently Considered Sponsorship ................................................................... 48
Table 2.4 Currently Used Advertisements ......................................................................... 50
Table 2.5 Types of School Promotion Currently Used ...................................................... 54