A qualitative exploration of environmental and relational factors affecting service user involvement from the perspective of community mental health nurses

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Philosophy in Nursing at Massey University, Palmerston North Campus, New Zealand

Vicky Keryn Brown

2012
Abstract

Mental health policy and clinical guidelines require service user involvement principles within clinical practice and service provision, yet few national studies exist to examine Mental Health Nurse’s (MHNs) viewpoints about its implementation. This qualitative research project asks the question ‘What are the environmental and relational factors which affect service user involvement in community mental health team settings from the perspectives of community MHNs?’ The research aims were: (1) Explore how the practice environment supports service user involvement; (2) Explore how they include, or not, service users in the provision of care; and, (3) To discuss how the group of community MHNs recognise and describe service user involvement. Central ethics approval was gained and eight community MHNs in two District Health Board’s (DHBs) with over 5 years experience were interviewed. Participant’s discussion was audio taped, transcribed and then analysed utilising a thematic analysis approach.

From this analysis, two predominant themes arose. Theme one highlights the ‘relationship dynamics of practice’ through exploration of concepts of historical changes; conflicting relationships, influential attitudes and powerlessness. Theme two explores ‘strength based approaches’ from the participants perspectives and includes recovery; inclusive practices; challenging stigma and beliefs towards service user involvement. Mutual agreement about the benefits of service user involvement was identified. However, changes to funding, hierarchical mental health organisations, nurses’ education, stigmatising attitudes and lack of nursing identity have impacted on the implementation and support of service user involvement. Recommendations for further research and suggestions for nursing practice are offered through building nursing capacity, capability, quality and strengthening the profession.
Acknowledgements

Writing this thesis has been akin to riding a roller coaster with the highs and lows that I have experienced. I could not have succeeded in my journey had I not been supported and encouraged by my family, friends, colleagues, mentors and my supervisor. To all of you that have motivated me, I am truly grateful.

To my daughter Kelsi - my little miracle. Your understanding, support and patience of my thesis demands have been amazing. I am proud of you and love you more than all the stars in the sky. May all your dreams come true and may life bring you as much joy as you have brought me.

To my parents and sister, thank you for your ongoing support, encouragement, babysitting duties and for being my sounding board. You have been present for all my joys and frustrations and you have inspired me to achieve. Thank you.

To my supervisor Stacey Wilson, I would not be at this part of my journey had it not been for your belief and guidance. Your expertise and passion about education and your knowledge about mental health has been a godsend. I could not have completed this thesis without the belief, encouragement, reality feedback and inspiration you provided me.

To my colleagues within mental health who gave their time and shared their stories. Thank you. It is truly an honour to view mental health through another person eyes and I thank you for sharing your experiences. Your honesty has been awe inspiring and your commitment to nursing’s future encouraging.

To the Palmerston North Medical Trust for assisting me in partly funding this journey. I thank you for your belief and trust in my ability to complete my studies.

To my employer, managers and peers – thank you for your support, encouragement and confidence in me which has enabled me to complete this journey.
### Content

- **Abstract**  
- **Acknowledgement**  
- **Content**  

#### Chapter One: Introduction

1.0 **Background to the study**  
1.1 **Relevance to nursing**  
1.2 **Relevance to mental health service provision**  
1.3 **Research question and aims**  
1.4 **A reference to terminology**  
1.5 **Organisation of the thesis**  
1.6 **Summary**

#### Chapter Two: Literature Review

2.0 **Introduction**  
2.1 **Historical influences**  
2.2 **Service user involvement**  
2.3 **Legislative influences**  
2.4 **Service user involvement**  
2.5 **Stigma**  
2.6 **Discrimination**  
2.5 **Service user involvement and the mental health nursing role**  
2.6 **Social inclusion and the way forward**  
2.7 **Summary**

#### Chapter Three: Research Design and Method

3.0 **Introduction**  
3.1 **Qualitative methodology**  
3.2 **Methodology**  
3.3 **Interviews**
3.4 Thematic analysis method 36
3.5 Method 37
3.6 Sampling 37
3.7 Ethical issues 38
3.8 The participants 42
3.9 Data analysis 43
3.10 Soundness of the research 44
3.11 Summary 47

Chapter Four: Environmental Dynamics of Practice
4.0 Introduction 48
4.1 Context of the service user and nursing environment 49
4.2 Ideology and service user positioning 56
4.3 Attitudes 62
4.4 Paternalism 66
4.5 Summary 69

Chapter Five: Strengths Based Approaches
5.0 Introduction 70
5.1 Beliefs in service user involvement 70
5.2 Insight on recovery 75
5.3 Working with inclusion in mind 78
5.4 Countering stigma 82
5.5 Summary 87

Chapter Six: Discussion and Recommendations
6.0 Introduction 88
6.1 A history of change 88
6.2 Conflict in the caring relationship 90
6.3 Influential attitudes 91
6.4 Powerlessness is risky 92
6.5 Insight on recovery 94
6.6 Working with inclusion in mind 96
6.7 Countering Stigma 97
6.8 Strengths and limitations of the study 98
6.9 Recommendations 99
6.9.1 Capacity 99
6.9.2 Capability 99
6.9.3 Quality 100
6.9.4 Strengthening the profession 101
6.10 Recommendations for further research 101
6.11 Conclusion 101

References 102

Appendixes
A Recruitment poster 115
B Information sheet 116
C Participants consent form 117
D Proof of consultation 118
E Semi structured interview guide 119