Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
DISCOURSES OF GRIEF: THE DEATH OF THE MOTHER

Daphne Anne Manderson

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Massey University
New Zealand
1999
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

During the years of this study so many people have given me support, and encouragement. I wish to acknowledge my gratitude to the women I interviewed. They are an inspiring group of women and I admired their openness as they explored with me their understandings of grief. My hope is that this thesis will in some way give validation to their time and contribution so willingly given.

My particular thanks go to my supervisors, Dr Judith Christensen and Dr Victoria Grace. Judith for the many academic challenges that you presented me, and for your wisdom and friendship over these years. Victoria, for the academic challenge, as well as your support and encouragement as my local supervisor. Thank you both for challenging me to explore the concepts of “poststructuralism” and “discourse analysis”, and for in effect turning my world upside down!

I acknowledge the huge contribution to my life given by my mother. I thank her for her being and her constant strength. To my twin Doris Manderson, thank you for always believing in me, your support and interest in my studies has never wavered. And, to my family thank you for your support in so many ways.

I also wish to thank Associate Professor Livia Käthe Wittmann, of the Feminist Studies Department at Canterbury University for the contribution that she has made to my learning over many years. And
Kaye Cederman, for her friendship, and for the debate as we both worked on our doctoral studies.

I wish to acknowledge Lesley Spence, Ray Wootton, Bev Rayna and Dee Ferris who have been long time mentors and role models for me of excellence in nursing. I thank each one of you for nurturing my interest in nursing education and research.

And to my friends and nursing colleagues who have been supportive of my research, thank you. I especially wish to thank Cathy Andrew, Ann Blackie, Paula Collett, Penny Carnaby, Marion Cross, Barbara Fox, Elizabeth Griffin, Dr Dame Jean Herbison, Marco and Teatske Küchlein, Dr. Merian Litchfield, Joseph Manderson, Dr Marjorie Manthei, Dr Elizabeth Plumridge, Archdeacon Ronnie Plaistowe, Val Quinn, Vi Sharpe, Jenny and Paul Stewart, Winifred and Archdeacon Robin Smith, Janetta Skiba, Carole Spencer, Carol Struthers, Canon Ron Taylor, Rosemary Tredgold, Mary Wade, Debra Wilson, and Eileen and Rob Whitmore.

I acknowledge with thanks the help I have received during this research from the Massey University Library staff. Their willing and courteous assistance throughout the whole of this time has been unreal. My particular thanks go to Janice Russell, who has 'gone the extra mile' so willingly. I also wish to thank Patricia Jordan at The University of Canterbury Library for her professional advice and support.

I am indebted to Tim Küchlein for his assistance with the various crises that I have had with my computer. Thank you Tim, for your time so willingly given.

Most importantly, I am indebted and grateful to the Directorate of Christchurch Polytechnic, John Scott, Lyn Brash, and Ralph Knowles who supported my request for full time leave for doctoral study. Thank you for the financial support that Christchurch Polytechnic provided toward this study opportunity. Without your support I would not have had the privilege or opportunity to have undertaken this research.
DEDICATION

To my mother

Dorothy Amelia Manderson
ABSTRACT

This purpose of this study was to explore the grief of daughters on the death of their mothers. I interviewed fifteen women. This study draws on feminist post-structuralist insights into subjectivity as constructed in the interplay, and between socially available discourses. I identified three interrelated and co-existing discourses through which the metadiscourse of grief arose. These discourses were continuity, discontinuity and silencing. Two distinct patternings of the discourses were identified within the corpus of the text, and these seemed to be shaped primarily by the age of the woman when her mother died.

These discourses are considered and collated within the social/historical context in which medical and psychological notions of grief have been hegemonic, and other subordinated and lay discourses are emerging. I suggest the understanding of oneself as a daughter in grief changes over time. The women interviewed in this study showed a ‘desire’ not to ‘get over it’ and disconnect, but to incorporate a continuing bond with the mother. How this is achieved is explained.
# CONTENTS

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** ........................................................................................................... I

**DEDICATION** ......................................................................................................................... III

**ABSTRACT** .............................................................................................................................. IV

**CHAPTER ONE**

**REFLEXIVITY: THE EMERGENCE OF THE RESEARCH PROBLEMATIC** ................................... 1

- *Introducing Kate* .................................................................................................................. 1
- *Evolving nursing practice* ...................................................................................................... 3
- *The advent of feminism* ......................................................................................................... 7
- *Clarification of the research* .................................................................................................. 10
- *Thesis structure* .................................................................................................................. 12

**CHAPTER TWO**

**HEGEMONIC LITERATURES ON DEATH AND GRIEF** .......................................................... 14

- *The medical/psychodynamic paradigm* .............................................................................. 15
- *Literatures on grief* .............................................................................................................. 18
- *Literatures on the death of a mother* .................................................................................... 31
- *Literatures from social sciences and humanities* .................................................................. 34

**CHAPTER THREE**

**FEMINIST CRITIQUE OF THE MOTHER DAUGHTER RELATIONSHIP AND**

**CHALLENGES TO THE MEDICAL DISCOURSE ON GRIEF AND DEATH** ......................... 40

- *Feminist critique of the mother-child relationship, and it's cessation* .............................. 40
- *Challenges to dominant discourses of death and on grief: Surfacing the silencing and confession* 56

**CHAPTER FOUR**

**THE RESEARCH APPROACH** .................................................................................................. 66

- *Informing the research: Epistemological and ontological understandings* ....................... 66
- *Understanding discourse and discourse analysis* ................................................................ 70
- *'Subjectivity' and 'subject positions'* .................................................................................. 72
- *A politics of grief* ................................................................................................................. 77

**CHAPTER FIVE**

**THE RESEARCH PROCESS** .................................................................................................... 81

- *Research aims* ..................................................................................................................... 81
- *Ethics and values associated with this research* ................................................................. 82
Nursing ethics ................................................................. 82
Feminist ethics ............................................................. 85
Recruiting participants and gaining informed consent............... 86
The criteria for inclusion in the study ...................................... 86
The participants ............................................................. 87
Obtaining consent .......................................................... 90
Data Collection .................................................................. 90
Data analysis .................................................................... 92
Step one: Identifying general discursive parameters .................. 94
Step two: Determining the discursive structure ......................... 95
Step three: Identifying the resources and techniques of discourse ..... 96
Generating the outcome ..................................................... 97

CHAPTER SIX

THE METADISCOURSE OF GRIEF: CONTINUITY, DISCONTINUITY AND SILENCING99

Introducing the three discourses ........................................... 100
Continuity ......................................................................... 100
Discontinuity .................................................................... 103
Silencing ........................................................................... 105
The metadiscourse of grief: Discourses of continuity, discontinuity and silencing ................................. 106
The discourse of continuity .................................................. 107
The discourse of discontinuity .............................................. 109
The discourse of silencing .................................................... 113
Family silencing ................................................................ 115
Institutional silencing ........................................................ 115
I need to know, it’s my right to know ................................... 115
Schematic representation of the research outcome ................. 119
Schematic representation of how discourses are drawn on by women who were children when their mother died ................................................................. 120
Schematic representation of how discourses are drawn on by women who were adults when their mother died ................................................................. 121

CHAPTER SEVEN

INTRODUCING THE PARTICIPANTS WHO WERE BEREAVED AS CHILDREN .......... 123
Sarah .............................................................................. 123
Holly ............................................................................. 124
Kate ............................................................................... 125
Margaret ........................................................................... 125
CHAPTER EIGHT

SILENCING DISCOURSE IN THE TALK OF WOMEN BEREAVED AS CHILDREN ....... 127

Childhood silencing: Questions unanswered and unasked .................................. 128

Family politics of silencing ..................................................................................... 129

Institutional politics of silencing ........................................................................... 136

Adult silencing: The struggle with silence ............................................................... 142

Adulthood: Rejecting the silencing and creating connection .............................. 148

CHAPTER NINE

DISCONTINUITY AND CONTINUITY DISCOURSES IN THE TALK OF WOMEN

BEREAVED AS CHILDREN ...................................................................................... 154

Childhood discontinuity: The absent mothers ......................................................... 154

Transition to adulthood: The desire for the ‘good’ or ‘archetypal’ mother ......... 163

Adulthood: Making connection ............................................................................. 168

CHAPTER TEN

INTRODUCING THE PARTICIPANTS WHO WERE BEREAVED AS ADULTS .... 175

Em .......................................................................................................................... 176

Ann ........................................................................................................................ 176

Jane ....................................................................................................................... 177

Megan ................................................................................................................... 178

Val ........................................................................................................................ 179

Julie ....................................................................................................................... 180

Cathy ................................................................................................................... 181

Alice ..................................................................................................................... 182

Elizabeth ............................................................................................................. 182

Catherine .......................................................................................................... 183

Jean ..................................................................................................................... 184

CHAPTER ELEVEN

CONTINUITY AND DISCONTINUITY DISCOURSES IN THE TALK OF WOMEN

BEREAVED AS ADULTS ......................................................................................... 185

Continuity: The motif of mutuality, self in relationship ........................................ 188

Discontinuity: The challenge to continuity by the mother’s illness and death ...... 199

The beginning of loss: Illness and hospitalisation ................................................. 200

The betrayal: Mothers don’t die .......................................................................... 210

The physical loss: The body in death .................................................................... 213

Changing connections: Recovered continuity ..................................................... 218