

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Understanding Service Development in
Statutory Mental Health Organisations in
Aotearoa New Zealand: An Organisational
Case Study**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
in
Social Work

At Massey University, Manawatu, New Zealand

Nicola Stanley-Clarke

2013

Abstract

This research aimed to understand service development in statutory mental health organisations in Aotearoa New Zealand. Of major focus was the analysis of the elements that influenced service development as well as developing an understanding of decision-making in the service development process. The study involved an organisational case study of one statutory mental health provider, Living Well and included the collection and analysis of both primary and secondary data. The primary data included qualitative interviews, document analysis and the observation of meetings. Secondary data included literature, research, policy and external reviews of the organisation.

Archetype theory provided the theoretical framework for analysing the processes of service development within Living Well. This enabled a holistic assessment of service development as it related to the structures and systems of the organisation alongside its central purpose (*raison d'être*) and the values, beliefs and ideologies that comprised its interpretive scheme.

The use of an organisational case study contributed to the body of knowledge and theory building on service development and archetype transformation within statutory mental health providers in Aotearoa/New Zealand. The findings of this research supported the development of an approach for understanding service development within statutory mental health organisations and a guide for service development. The approach emphasises that Living Well's interpretive scheme was central to the service development process and was in an ongoing state of flux as the organisation attempted to balance conflicting priorities and demands with the delivery of responsive mental health services (the organisation's *raison d'être*). The complexity of the service development process within Living Well was exemplified in ongoing tension between clinical values and management priorities. The research findings reveal that service development within statutory mental health organisations like Living Well, requires alignment between the different factors that influence the service development process. Further, the likelihood of successful implementation is dependent on the priority

allocated to service development related to its necessity; the organisation's current operational and clinical demands; as well as the relationships and roles of those involved in the service development process. The guide for service development provides recognition of these core features of Living Well's interpretive scheme, utilising informal processes to engender support, to minimise opposition and to ensure client care is the primary focus.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank a number of people who supported me as I completed this PhD research. Firstly, I would like to acknowledge my supervisors Associate Professor Jackie Sanders and Professor Robyn Munford for their valuable support and guidance throughout this journey. Next, the clinicians and management at Living Well, without their willing participation this research would not have been possible. I would also like to thank all of my colleagues in the School of Health and Social Sciences in particular, Dr Kieran O'Donoghue, Dr Polly Yeung and Dr Kath Hay, who helped me believe the task was achievable as well as all my friends and extended family for their support and encouragement.

I also wish to acknowledge Sharyn Trischler, Tim Nolan and Lisa Toms for their assistance with transcribing, referencing and the final presentation of the thesis.

Finally, and most importantly, to my husband, Karl and daughters, Rose and Poppy for their enduring patience, support and love.

Table of Contents

ABSTRACT	I
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	III
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	IV
List of Figures	ix
List of Tables.....	x
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION.....	1
The Research.....	2
The Social Policy Context	3
The Provision of Mental Health Care and Treatment in Aotearoa New Zealand	6
Living Well.....	10
Definition of Key Terms:.....	11
Structure of the Thesis	15
Conclusion	17
CHAPTER TWO: ARCHETYPE THEORY	18
Introduction	18
Locating Archetype Theory	20
The Informal and Formal Structures and Systems of Organisations	24
Identifying Archetypes	27
Archetype Change	28
Convergent Archetype Change	29
Radical Archetype Change	30
The Process of Archetype Change	31
The Archetype of the Professional Organisation	34

The Original Bureaucratic Archetype.....	36
The Professional Bureaucracy	42
Factors Influencing Archetype Change Within the Professional Bureaucracy.....	46
External Political Determinants for Change Within the State Sector	53
Critical Appraisal of Archetype Theory.....	57
Conclusion.....	60
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY AND METHODS	62
Introduction.....	62
An Organisational Case Study	63
The Research Process	65
Organisational Document Analysis	67
Observing Meetings	68
Participant Interviews.....	71
Secondary Data.....	74
Data Analysis.....	76
Research Limitations	78
Ethical Considerations.....	79
Conclusion.....	83
CHAPTER FOUR: CHANGING TRENDS IN MENTAL HEALTH CARE	85
Introduction.....	85
Statutory Mental Health Organisations: From Institutions to Care in the Community	85
The Implications of Community Care.....	90
The Function of Inpatient Care at the Turn of the 21st Century.....	93
Patterns of Service Development Decision-Making within Statutory Mental Health Services	96
The Place of Evaluation and Evidence-Based Service Development	100
The Development of Mental Health Services in Aotearoa New Zealand.....	105
Aotearoa New Zealand’s Mental Health Policy Framework.....	114

Introducing the Archetype of Living Well	117
Conclusion	120
CHAPTER FIVE: RUNNING THE BUSINESS.....	122
Introduction	122
The Business Structure	123
The Functional Aspects of Living Well’s Business Structure	124
The Symbolic Aspects of Living Well’s Business Structure	128
Management Priorities of Risk Management, Accountability, and Efficiency	137
Clinical Values: The Ethic of Care, Clinical Expertise, Autonomy and Peer Review	143
The Tension between Management Priorities and Clinical Values	148
Acute Demand.....	154
Conclusion	160
CHAPTER SIX: THE ROLE OF GOVERNMENT POLICY, POLITICS AND STRATEGIC PLANNING IN SERVICE DEVELOPMENT	162
Introduction	162
The Role of the Ministry of Health and National Strategic Frameworks.....	163
Using Policy and Strategy to Inform and Shape Service Development	168
Ministry of Health Programme Priorities for Local Service Development	174
The Role of Politics in Service Development	177
The Electoral Cycle	181
The Role of the Media	184
The Relevance of National Strategy and Policy to Clinicians.....	186
Strategic Planning and Direction at a Local Service Level.....	190
Implementing Local Strategy	195
The Senior Management Team	200
Conclusion	203

CHAPTER SEVEN: FORMAL PATHWAYS FOR SERVICE DEVELOPMENT - PROJECTS, REVIEWS AND EVALUATIONS.....205

Introduction.....205

The Function of Projects and Reviews in Service Development206

Generating Project Proposals and Ideas for Service Development211

The Need for Ongoing Service Development219

The Pace of Formal Change223

Outcomes from Formal Change.....230

Function of Meetings in the Formal Service Development Process240

Resource Implications for Formal Service Development.....245

Project Examples.....252

 Single Point of Entry (SPOE) Project.....253

 Home Based Treatment255

 Improving the Patient’s Journey.....260

Conclusion.....261

CHAPTER EIGHT: INFORMAL PROCESSES SHAPING SERVICE DEVELOPMENT.....264

Introduction.....264

Clinically Driven Projects.....264

Clinical Involvement in Service Development267

Clinical Reflection and Quality Initiatives.....279

Resistance to Service Development.....284

The Role of Psychiatrists in Service Development290

Leadership293

Conclusion.....297

CHAPTER NINE: THE CLINICAL GOVERNANCE STRATEGY - SERVICE DEVELOPMENT OBSERVED.....300

Introduction	300
Content of the Proposal.....	301
Proposed Structural Changes	302
Proposed Philosophical Change.....	305
Participants' Understanding of the Change	307
Levels of Commitment	311
The Project Implementation Process	317
Attaining Clinical Governance	320
The Establishment of the Clinical Governance Directorate	321
The Clinical Governance Unit	326
Disestablishing the Unit Manager Role	328
The Outcomes of Archetype Change	334
Conclusion	337
Post Script	338
CHAPTER TEN: CONCLUSION	340
Introduction	340
The Research Context	341
Key Findings	344
An Approach for Service Development.....	344
1. Living Well's interpretive scheme was central to service development.	346
2. Service development involved the use of both formal and informal pathways.....	349
3. Service development was prioritised based on technical necessity, operational and clinical demand, and personalities and relationships.	352
The Implications of the Findings.....	354
a. Keep clients at the centre	356
b. Identify the proposal's importance in terms of operational and clinical demand	357
c. Wait until the time is right	357
d. Make use of informal processes.....	358
Limitations of the Research	360

Future research360
Concluding remarks.....361
BIBLIOGRAPHY363
APPENDICES.....402

List of Figures

Figure 1: The changing archetype of the mental health bureaucracy	89
Figure 2: The new quasi-market archetype of mental health services	111
Figure 3: Living Well's archetype.....	118
Figure 4: Living Well's 2006 Organisational Chart.....	125
Figure 5: Management hierarchy before and after the Clinical Governance Strategy	304
Figure 6: Transition to Clinical Governance	306
Figure 7: Revisiting the archetype of Living Well	342
Figure 8: An approach for understanding service development at Living Well.....	345
Figure 9: A guide for proceeding with service development.....	356

List of Tables

Table 1: Archetype Variants of the Professional Organisation	35
Table 2: Headings for document analysis.....	68
Table 3: Meeting schedule	71
Table 4: Participant details.....	73
Table 5: Participants' employment roles pre and post change	319