Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Local Government Accountability in Bougainville

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Philosophy
in
Development Studies

at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Carol Lida Sasa
2013
Abstract

The arguments for decentralisation are broadly about economic efficiency and enhancing democratic practices, such as participation and accountability. Decentralisation reforms in most developing countries are in line with the political arguments for making local governments more responsive to the people they serve, by enhancing greater citizen participation and local government accountability. The lack of accountability is often singled out as one of the main factors contributing to the ineffectiveness of many local governments. Therefore, by using a case study of two COEs in Bougainville (an autonomous region of Papua New Guinea), this thesis investigates what formal accountability mechanisms exist and how these mechanisms unfold in practice, particularly those between the COEs and their constituents. The findings of this research have identified the institutional relationships that the COEs have and – how accountability occurs – within these relationships. The conclusions of this research lean towards the suggestion that the legal requirements of accountability are the likely reason for the limitations to downwards accountability: and yet constituents are finding ways in which to hold their COEs to account.
Acknowledgements

I am of the opinion that only those who have gone through the process of thesis writing, or anything similar, know what it is really like to be a Masters’ student all alone in a foreign land. I would not have been able to complete this journey without the support of so many people and therefore I believe this page is necessary. For those times when I felt that I needed more than myself and the people around me to get through life, I acknowledge the God that I pray to everyday.

I would like to begin by acknowledging the teaching staff of the Institute of Development Studies, in addition to the administrative staff at the School of People, Environment and Planning at Massey University. I make special mention of my first supervisor Dr. Gerard Prinsen. I had no idea what a Masters’ thesis was about when I began, so I am glad that, between the two of us, at least one of us did! Thank you for your guidance and valuable input throughout this learning process. To my second supervisor, Associate Professor Glenn Banks, I always knew that I had to double-check the information I wrote about PNG, because I knew that you would know if I had made it up! Thank you also for your guidance and valuable feedback on my work. I also thank Ronald Pam for the story that inspired this topic.

To the community leaders and members of the Tsitalato and Eivo COEs who participated in this research, I am grateful for your time and for the information that you so willingly shared with me. I acknowledge that this thesis would not have been possible without you all. I also thank the Local-level Government Division of Bougainville for permitting this research and I make special mention of Mr. Logoso and Mr. Nash.

I thank Camilla Angoro in Buka and the families of Manetai in Central Bougainville for their hospitality during my field work. For all the assistance I have received in terms of logistics, finding information on the COEs accessing research participants and the translation of various documents into tokpisin, I would like to thank my former colleagues at World Vision Bougainville, Lesley S Gagesin, Annette S Louie, Amanda Masono, the Gaemates and David Ephraim. I am grateful to those Bougainvilleans who took time out of their busy schedules to talk to me and I make special mention of Mr. Wadari and Mr. Laukai.

To my siblings and my parents, Yaura and Judy Sasa, I will always be grateful for your constant prayers, encouragement and phone calls! To all my family and friends in PNG and my newfound friends in Aotearoa, I could not possibly fit you all into this page. Hence, I would like to thank all of you who have supported me in this journey – I am truly grateful to you all. To my colleagues here at Massey, including my Development Studies’ seniors (2011), it is always comforting to know that I am not the only one who has to deal with moments of insanity! To Pilirani Pankomera, it is always nice to come home to a safe and comfortable flat after a hard day’s work. Finally, I would like to thank the PNG community in Palmerston North (including those who have already returned home) and PNG friends elsewhere in Aotearoa for your support.

God bless you all!
### Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABG</td>
<td>Autonomous Bougainville Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARoB</td>
<td>Autonomous Region of Bougainville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEC</td>
<td>Bougainville Executive Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BTG</td>
<td>Bougainville Transitional Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMP</td>
<td>Constituency Member of Parliament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COE</td>
<td>Council of Elders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPC</td>
<td>Constitutional Planning Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOPNG</td>
<td>Government of Papua New Guinea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLG</td>
<td>Local-level Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUHEC</td>
<td>Massey University Human Ethics Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-government Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLPGLLG</td>
<td>Organic Law on Provincial Government and Local-level Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNG</td>
<td>Papua New Guinea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VA</td>
<td>Village Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCC</td>
<td>Village Council of Chiefs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ i  
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................................... ii  
Acronyms ......................................................................................................................................... iii  
Table of Contents ........................................................................................................................... iv  
1.2 Significance of this study ............................................................................................................ 2  
1.3 Thesis Outline .......................................................................................................................... 3  
CHAPTER 2: ACCOUNTABILITY IN LOCAL GOVERNMENT (A LITERATURE REVIEW) ........... 5  
2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 5  
2.2 Local Government .................................................................................................................... 5  
2.2.1 Background of local governments ...................................................................................... 5  
2.2.3 Local Government Reform in Papua New Guinea ............................................................... 12  
2.3 Accountability ............................................................................................................................ 14  
2.3.1 Defining the concept of accountability .............................................................................. 14  
2.3.2 Social accountability .......................................................................................................... 17  
2.3.3 Accountability in Local Government .................................................................................. 18  
2.3.4 Accountability in Local Government in Papua New Guinea ........................................... 20  
2.4 Summary of Chapter ............................................................................................................... 22  
3.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 24  
3.2 About Bougainville .................................................................................................................. 24  
3.3 The Evolution of Local Government in Bougainville: from the colonial era to autonomy ....... 26  
3.3.1 Under the German Colonial Administration ..................................................................... 26  
3.3.2 Prior to the Bougainville Conflict ...................................................................................... 27  
3.3.3 The Council of Chiefs ....................................................................................................... 28  
3.3.4 The Council of Elders ...................................................................................................... 28  
3.3.5 The Village Assembly (VA) .............................................................................................. 30  
3.4 Comparing the COE System to the LLG System in PNG ........................................................ 31  
3.5 Events leading up to the Bougainville Conflict ....................................................................... 32  
3.6 The Autonomous Bougainville Government ......................................................................... 33  
3.6.1 Autonomy in Bougainville ................................................................................................. 33  
3.6.2 Structure of Government in Bougainville ......................................................................... 34  
3.6.2.1 The Legislature ............................................................................................................ 35  
3.6.3 Accountability Mechanisms within the COEs ................................................................. 37  
3.7 Chapter Summary .................................................................................................................... 38  
CHAPTER 4: METHODOLOGY ............................................................................................... 40  
4.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 40  
4.2 The Research Inquiry .............................................................................................................. 40  
4.3 Qualitative Case Study ............................................................................................................ 41  
4.4 Methods used ........................................................................................................................... 43  
4.4.1 Document analysis .......................................................................................................... 43  
4.4.2 Semi-structured interviews with key informants ............................................................... 43  
4.5 Ethics ....................................................................................................................................... 44  
5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 46  
5.2 The Institutional Relationships of the COEs ......................................................................... 47  
5.2.2 Working with other COEs ............................................................................................... 50  
5.2.3 The COE and the Village Assembly ................................................................................. 52  
5.2.4 COEs and Members of Parliament – ABG and National Parliament ................................ 53  
5.2.5 COEs and the Local Level Government Division ............................................................ 56
5.3 The interactions of COEs and their Constituents

5.3.1 Facilitating dispute settlement and reconciliation

5.3.2 Community meetings and awareness campaigns

5.3.3 Service delivery and community projects

5.3.4 COE Members Maintaining Individual Integrity and that of the COE Office

5.4 Ways by which constituents hold COE members to account

5.4.1 Direct confrontation of COE members

5.4.2 Utilising the existing chief system

5.4.3 Going a step higher to the LLG Division

5.4.4 Constituents resisting COE authority and taking the law into their own hands

5.4.5 Utilising the Informal relationships within communities

5.5 Summary of the Findings

CHAPTER 6: DISCUSSIONS AND CONCLUDING REMARKS

6.1 Introduction

6.2 Bougainville within the context of decentralisation in Papua New Guinea

6.3 The concept of accountability in theory and in practice

6.4 The directionality of the COE’s accountability: horizontal and vertical (upwards and downwards)

6.5 Discussion on the main research question: How are existing accountability mechanisms unfolding between COEs and their constituents?

6.6 Concluding remarks

6.7 Recommendation for Policy and Further Research

References

Appendix 1: Complete list of COEs, number of VAs and COE members

Appendix 2 Content and first page of the Tsitalato COE Constitution

Appendix 3: Participant information sheet in English and Tokpisin

Appendix 4 Research question scheme

Appendix 5: MUHEC low risk notification

Appendix 6: Official clearance from the LLG Division to undertake research in Bougainville.

Appendix 7: Participant consent form – English and Tokpisin
List of Figures

Figure 1. Map of PNG showing German New Guinea (northern half) and British New Guinea (southern half)......................................................................................................................................................... 8
Figure 2. The long and short routes of accountability. ................................................................................... 17
Figure 3. Map of PNG showing where Bougainville is situated ..................................................................... 25
Figure 4. Sources of authority and structure of government in Bougainville ................................................. 36
Figure 5. Explanation for Figure 4 ................................................................................................................. 37
Figure 6. Map of Bougainville showing location of research sites. ................................................................. 42
Figure 7. Number of respondents who recall instances of COE members being accountable, compared to times when they have been held to account by constituents......................................................... 75

List of Tables

Table 1 COE accountability within its institutional relationships ............................................................................. 72