

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Wade in the Water:
Storying Adoptees' Experiences through the
Adoption Act 1955**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Psychology

at Massey University, Manawatu

Aotearoa/New Zealand

Denise Blake

2013

Abstract

In Aotearoa/New Zealand, the Adoption Act 1955 legislated and governed adoption practices until 1985 when it was supplemented, but not amended or repealed. More than 80,000 children have lived with the effects of that Act. Underlying the legislation were assumptions about illegitimacy derived from notions of *nullius filius*, the child of no-man. Dominant culture sought to right the wrongs of illegitimacy through the practices of adoption producing a child *as if born to* legally married adoptive parents. Through these practices, adoptees became legitimate beings in the social world. The first two chapters of this thesis trace the legal and psychological narrative constitution of adoptees and make it possible for me to ask the question: how are adoptees enabled and constrained through specific subject positions within a particular moral order and how are social power relations implicated in the narrative constitution of adoptees? To address this question, I draw on a Foucaultian poststructuralist position using narrative theory to form a hybrid representation of the stories of 12 adoptees. The first analysis chapter considers how a legal narrative positions adoptees so as to exclude the possibility of articulating their experiences within ‘normal’ kinship and social narratives. To be positioned *as if born to* did not remove the history of being *born to* for the adoptee, or the ‘real’ lived effects of that lack. The second analysis chapter discusses the ways in which adoptees’ psychological experiences are affected by their legal positioning, how they cope while living the legal fiction and include accounts of, and resistance to, psychopathological narratives that constitute their experience. The next analysis chapter explores the complexity of reunion experiences in relation to ongoing identity construction for adoptees. A chapter on hybridity then draws the analysis chapters together to represent some of the complex and contradictory social elements of adoption. This thesis argues that it is possible that the legal exclusion from normalising kinship narratives constitutes the psychosocial responses of adoptees that are observed as abnormalities and result in their over-representation in clinical populations. From the participants’ perspectives, it is possible that their experiences are normal responses to abnormal circumstances.

Acknowledgements

This thesis involves both theory and research. The particular set of people and places that enabled the earliest questions and the research component of the project now stand beside those that were pivotal in its further development to extend the theoretical work and analysis to complete this PhD. Thank you to Massey University for providing me with scholarships to support both phases of the study.

I extend my aroha to the truly remarkable participants who shared of themselves. I appreciate your honesty, openness and willingness in trusting me with your stories and providing the voices that enabled this work to come to life. I feel privileged to know you and hope that I have produced a thesis to honour your stories.

I acknowledge the ongoing conversations with adoptees who were not participants in this research but whose stories continue to inform the work, including adoption researchers and lobbyists who have taken up the 'fight' to voice adoption and make a difference to those that have been subjected to its power. I especially extend my gratitude to Keith Griffith, a prominent adoption researcher, lobbyist and champion of adoptees' rights. Thank you for your knowledge and confidence in me. Keith sadly passed away while I was producing this work - moe mai ra.

I extend a profound thank you to my supervisors, Leigh Coombes and Mandy Morgan. Your gift is in living what you teach, showing me the craft and encouraging me when it got too hard. This thesis would not be what it is without your incredible knowledge, wisdom and aroha along with your guidance and support. To the many others at Massey University (students and staff) who contributed to me in their various ways, be it a conversation in the hallway or a smile on a 'difficult' day, thank you so much.

To my amazing and courageous son, Anthony, who stands beside me as my main man, who loves me no matter what, who lives the effects of my adoption and who tolerates a mother who was not always available - there are no words. To my partner Jason, who lives with the ongoing effects of my adoption and engagement in academia and who provides unconditional support to an often fanatical and demanding friend - thank you for being there and letting me be me. To the team of Prestige who manage well with the 'phantom boss' - thank you.

A special thanks to Sharon, who believed in me right from the beginning 16 years ago, and to Ronda for believing in me some more and showing me how to put a verb into a sentence. Thanks to Trish for your ongoing loyalty and help to keep me on track. To you all - thanks for loving my mama and making her smile.

To acknowledge fully the many people who supported me to produce this research would take more than just words, so I feel constrained by the limits of language to represent my gratitude and respect. However, acknowledgements are important; for those who know they had a place in this story and may not appear here, I know and remember.

Prologue: At the Heart of Adoption

This story begins with my conception. My 19-year-old birth mother was sent away when her pregnancy was revealed, to a family far away from her own. That family was not kind and she left and fended for herself. Everyone told her that giving her baby to a family who could care for me was the best thing to do. Her family were respectable middle-class Pākehā. Her mother was wheelchair bound at the age of 35 because of rheumatoid arthritis and her father was the carer. They thought they were making her do what was best. During my birth, she was given Largactil, an antipsychotic drug; perhaps they thought she needed to dull the pain. She was treated badly and after the birth ran away from the hospital. She was eventually found by the police and made to sign the adoption forms. I was in the hospital for three weeks before my adoptive family took me home.

Placed in a family that looked, sounded and acted in different ways to me meant that I always already lived difference. I had brown skin while my adoptive family was white. There was no 'secrecy' around the 'abnormality' of my family - skin colour does not lie. I was taunted and teased about my difference, and that hurt. As a child, I would think about the mother who did not want me, and imagined a drunk who was probably already dead. My adoptive family did not provide the stable nurturing duties befitting the 'good' adoptive family. I experienced poverty, alcoholism, violence and neglect. Over the years, people would try to guess at my ethnicity - Māori? Chinese? Both? After explaining my lack of a genealogical history, people would respond in silence or look at me with regret. I felt disconnected and misunderstood. Māori would try to claim me, but when I could not whakapapa, often the recognition was lost.

As a young teenage mother, judged for keeping her son, I held tightly to my belief that at least, with me, my son had a blood relative. Even at that stage, I knew that adoption mattered to the next generation. As the years passed, I noticed the effects of my lived experience as an adoptee on my son's position in the world. For instance, he had an inherited medical condition that could not be traced. While doing a family tree activity for school, he was unable to access a birth history; together we fabricated a family in which we could both belong and be proud. My son lived the effects of adoption; I reproduced the lie.

I learnt that I embodied the effects of adoption, produced through deception and lies. After therapy to unpick the threads, I was ready to search for my birth history. Reuniting with my birth mother was the most wondrous and enlightening 'gift'; I finally belonged. We mirrored each other so significantly that the connection cannot be described; I was where I was always meant to be and it just felt so very right.

For years, I had yearned to research the ways in which adoption matters and to add to the body of knowledge that makes a difference in the lives of adoptees. I realised adoptees had been silenced in their experiences; there has been no place to speak and no language in which to talk. I saw a gap in the way that psychology represented adoption and here I found a space to add a voice. By drawing on my insider knowledge and ensuing dedication to make visible what has been invisible, I aim to 'trouble'

how adoption is understood in psychology and the social power relations that produce the 'real' lived experience of adoption.

The effects of adoption extend further than the subjectivity of the adoptee; birth parents, adoptive parents and extended family members are all influenced by the political and moral narratives that produce adoption. Therefore, in telling this story, I recognise that other stories connect to, effect and constitute one another. We all share, from our own positions, emotional experiences of loss, rejection, shame and guilt. While this research focuses specifically on adoptees, I acknowledge the others involved in the adoption triad and I take a moment to honour with a heartfelt tear, all who are affected.

This story is dedicated to my birth mother. Our reunion only lasted three and half years before we were separated again by an illness that took her life.

Dear Mummy
You gave me life then I lost you
Many years past
I found you and you found me back
I loved you and you loved me more
You once told me that I never knew what real love was
But you showed me and now I know.
Our love was unconditional, infinite and complete
You made me whole; you gently care
You held me when I cried; you hugged me when I hurt
Or just because you could
You held me in everyway
In our short time together, we lived a lifetime
I was a baby, a child, a girl and a woman
I was your birth daughter; you were my mummy
You growled me, you taught me, you nurtured me, and you understood me
You were my mummy
You once said
You never deserved the title of mum
But you were in every breath
Every laugh, every tear
And every gift
To the moon and back...

Table of Contents

Abstract	i
Acknowledgements	iii
Prologue: At the Heart of Adoption.....	iv
Table of Contents.....	vi
An Historical Reading.....	2
The Rationale for Storying Adoption and its Legislation	2
Social Climates and Movements towards Adoption	3
The Role of the Law in Child Welfare	4
The Scorn of Illegitimacy.....	5
Child Care Practices	5
Aotearoa/New Zealand Introduces Adoption Laws	6
The Turn to Adoption as Socially Acceptable	9
The Influence of Psychology	10
Adoption as a ‘Norm’	11
The ‘Complete Break’	12
Do Not Tell	14
Strategies to enable the secret.....	15
Challenging the ‘Complete Break’	16
Further Socio-political Movements.....	17
Call for Law Reform	18
The ongoing battle	20
Research and Psychopathology	26
A Clinical Population.....	27
Adoptees Disordered.....	29
Adopted child syndrome.....	31
Who Am I?.....	35
Psychoanalytical Pathology	36
Genetic Sexual Attraction	38
Genetic Research.....	39
Genetics, the environment and criminology research.....	42
So the Story Goes.....	43
Theoretical Framework	46
Epistemological Underpinnings	47
A poststructuralist approach	47
Foucaultian knowledge	48
Theorising Subject Positions.....	54
Weaving in the Narrative	57
Narrative Matters: Structure, Style, and Organising Principles	58
Narrative research.....	60
Locating the Researcher.....	61
Reflexivity	62
Moving To and In an Adopted Body	63

Theorising the Adopted Body	66
Foucault's Inscribed Body	67
Merleau-Ponty's Phenomenological Body	71
Melding Together Knowledge of a Body	75
Embodiment.....	77
Emotions as a Discursive Device for Lived Experience.....	80
A Narrative Unconsciousness.....	85
Body Matters	86
Method	90
Sampling and Recruitment	90
The participants	91
Data Collection through Interviewing and Transcribing	92
Interviewing style	92
Transcribing.....	93
Ethical Considerations.....	94
Massey University's ethical requirements.....	94
Privacy and confidentiality.....	95
Informed consent, protection from harm and beneficence.....	95
Narrative Analysis: A Process of Constructing a Hybrid Story.....	96
Once Upon a Time an Adoptee was Born... ..	100
The Illegitimate Subject.....	100
As if born to.....	105
The significance of a name.....	111
Kinship, Blood and Genetic Ties.....	114
Techniques of matching	119
The family tree	121
Access to a Medical History	124
Fear of the unknown.....	125
General health and physical knowledge	127
Legitimacy through Secrets and Silence.....	129
Chosen	134
Children as commodities	137
There are no words	139
Psychosocially Affected.....	148
The Good Adoptive Family	148
Grief, Rejection, Abandonment and Instability	152
Ways of Coping when As If Born To.....	157
Alcohol and drug use.....	162
Acceptance.....	164
Empathy and commonality.....	168
Questioning Adoption.....	170
Challenging the legitimacy of adoption	173
Birth Family Reunions.....	176
Returning to Origins.....	180
Keeping the Secret.....	181
Revealing the Secret	187
Timing a search	189
Supporting a search	191
Engaging with contact.....	198
Stories within Reunions.....	200
Secrets that remain	212

Performing Mosaic Moments of Adoption.....	218
The Hybrid Subject	234
Hybrid Species	235
The Social Mix.....	240
In the hyphen	245
Hybridity as a Third Space.....	249
A Hybrid Story.....	251
Coda - Contemporary Implications	254
Implications for Health Professionals	256
Reconciliation	258
Postscript: Wade in the Water, Wade in the Water Children... ..	260
References	262
Appendices	282
Appendix A: Questions for Semi-Structured Interviews	282
Appendix B: Authority for Release of Transcript.....	283
Appendix C: Information Sheet	284
Appendix D: Participant Consent Form.....	286
Appendix E: Chronology of Moves to Reform Adoption over the Last 33 Years.....	287
Appendix F: Articles Produced from this Research:.....	292

Table of Figures

Figure 1. The Adoption Regulations: Effects of adoption order	13
Figure 2. Adoption Orders in New Zealand: 1880 - 1996.....	17
Figure 3. Explanation of the way in which 'open' adoption works.....	20
Figure 4. Forced adoption victims to get apology in July	23
Figure 5. 1994 newspaper article on adopted child syndrome	33
Figure 6. Babies waiting to be adopted	101
Figure 7. Adult Adoption Information Act 1985: Access to information	182
Figure 8. Example of a letter sent to a counsellor with an original birth certificate.....	193
Figure 9. Copy of an original birth certificate, accessed December 2012.....	195