Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
ENABLING THE CURIOUS PRACTITIONER:
PERCEPTIONS ON THE INTEGRATION OF
RESEARCH AND PRACTICE IN THE EDUCATION OF
MUSIC THERAPY STUDENTS AT MASTERS’ LEVEL

A Thesis Presented in Fulfilment of the Requirement for the
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Music

New Zealand School of Music,
Wellington, New Zealand

SARAH LEIGH HOSKYN
April 2013
Abstract

This PhD research explored perceptions about the integration of research and practice in the Masters’ training of music therapists. Using constructivist case study methodology, the study analysed viewpoints of international educators, researchers and students about how research could helpfully be integrated into the practical and conceptual learning of music therapy trainees. The synthesis of research and practice in the professional music therapy field has regularly been advocated but recent studies and reviews suggest there is significant need for development of pedagogical theory and guidance for educators and students in the interface between placements and university-based learning in key areas, including research. Participants included a purposeful sample of 19 music therapy practitioners, researchers, educators and students in the wider international profession of music therapy and at music therapy training programmes in Europe and Australasia. Data sources included focus groups of professionals, two site visits to training programmes (comprising interviews, observations, field notes and concluding improvisation session) and a researcher reflective journal. Core themes identified in the thematic analysis concentrated on cherishing students’ fire and curiosity; facilitating the acknowledgement and management of change; and helping students embrace complexity in their music therapy education. Evidence from this study indicates that moving beyond ‘research competency’ and the development of individual academic skills towards collaborative, engaged learning with peers and supervisors, has potential to nurture sustainable, practice-based researchers of the future. Devising integrative strategies for learning and assessment, undertaken in diverse ways and to suit varied contexts for training, was perceived to be inspiring for students and educators and rehearsed significant professional tasks. These strategies - despite tensions experienced in their development - had potential to deepen personal learning, develop creative and critical skills that characterise graduate attributes of University Masters’ courses, and prepare graduates for evidence-based practice in health and education workplaces. An integrative model for a more holistic approach to learning, combining individual and collaborative approaches and using opportunities inside and outside the programme was developed, allowing for differences in culture and approach of the institutions which host music therapy training. The challenges and solutions explored in this research, while being particular to this qualitative music therapy study, have potential relevance to other applied areas of professional practice and research, such as arts therapies, allied health disciplines, education and nursing.
To my parents, Ann and Benedict,
who provided music lessons, a space to practice and loving interest.

In memory of Jacob Barnes, loving musician.
1989-2011
Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge the following people:

My magnificent and constantly supportive team of supervisors: Associate Professor Sue Cornforth and Professor Leslie Bunt for your consistent ‘on-the-ground’, insightful help and wise limits on my work, and Dr Allan Badley and Professor Donald Maurice for early and later stage administrative supervision in warm, enthusiastic fashion.

The eighteen participants in the study (Hannah, Zelda, Catherine, Paloma, Quentin, Eddie, Kirsty in the Focus Groups; Bella, Beatrice, Alex, Helena, Abby, Naomi at ‘Kindstown’ and Anna, Patrick, Hilly, Florence and Hope at ‘Friendsville’) who were so willing and interested to share their knowledge and feelings about the topic (pseudonyms provided here).

My dear and inspiring colleague Dr Daphne Rickson, who provided invaluable scrutiny and peer debriefing, constant encouragement and new insights for the study.

Our students on the MMus Therapy Programme at Te Kōkī, NZSM for inspiration and feedback.

Carolyn Ayson, Rebecca Travaglia, Claire Molyneux, Andrew Filmer and Ali Talmage for a mixture of transcription, peer debriefing, engaging conversations and warm support.

Elizabeth Smith, music librarian at Massey University Wellington, endlessly willing problem-solver for all library research issues.

Dr. Morva Croxson and Barbara Mabbett for ongoing friendship, and respectively for covering my teaching for a trimester and providing proof-reading assistance.

My PhD student colleagues in the VUW Faculty of Education Research Cluster Group and group leaders Associate Professors Sue Cornforth and Catherine Manathunga for shared learning and inspiration.

Liam Dewhurst for crafting and inspiration with designs for figures, Julian Raphael for generous help with musical examples and Dori Raphael for her illustration.

Professor John Psathas and Dr Dave Lisik for invaluable advice about composition.

Bridget and Roger Sanders and Jiff Stewart for inspiring conversations about art, story-telling and health research; and to Andy Willmoth for sharing experience of TASC International as a teacher consultant.
Professor Elizabeth Hudson and Executive Committee of Te Kōkī, NZSM for generous financial support with study and similarly Massey University for a MU Women’s Award; the Music Therapy New Zealand, Sir Roy McKenzie Research Fund and the Faculty of Graduate Research, Victoria University for assistance with travel and transcription costs

My Wellington family, Julian, Dori and Nino for coping with the long haul of my PhD study, and for your ongoing jollity, food and music-making; also to Isabelle, Gabriele and the Simpson family in similar regard

My family and whanau abroad, who have always maintained interest and support in generous and manifold ways, despite the distance.

Warmest thanks to you all.

Statement of Ethical Approval

The research has been approved by the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences Human Ethics Subcommittee under delegated authority from the Victoria University Human Ethics Committee, Approval #: 15689, July 2008.
Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................... iv
Statement of Ethical Approval .................................................................................................... v
Table of Contents .................................................................................................................... vi
Table of Figures ....................................................................................................................... xi

CHAPTER 1 .............................................................................................................................. 1
INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................... 1
1 A professional and personal adventure .............................................................................. 1
1.1 Regulation of music therapy and arts therapies in the United Kingdom ....................... 2
1.2 Masters’ level entry to the music therapy profession .................................................... 4
1.3 International growth in evidence-based practice (EBP) ................................................ 5
1.4 The development of varied frameworks for research ..................................................... 6
1.5 Brief background to music therapy, training and practice ............................................. 8
    1.5.1 Music therapy ........................................................................................................ 8
    1.5.2 Range of music therapy practice .......................................................................... 9
    1.5.3 What training is required? .................................................................................... 10
1.6 Further background to the challenge of this thesis ...................................................... 11
1.7 Personal Stance .............................................................................................................. 12
1.8 Broad research question for this study ........................................................................ 14
1.9 Structure of the thesis ................................................................................................... 14

CHAPTER 2 .......................................................................................................................... 16
LITERATURE REVIEW .............................................................................................................. 16
2 Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 16
2.1 Theoretical debates about what constitutes research in music therapy ....................... 18
    2.1.1 Positivist (quantitative) research ......................................................................... 19
    2.1.2 Qualitative research ............................................................................................ 20
    2.1.3 Indigenous research ............................................................................................ 21
2.2 Theoretical debates and research addressing the relationship and potential integration of research and practice: ................................................................. 22
    2.2.1 Evidence-Based Practice ...................................................................................... 23
    2.2.2 Challenges of Evidence-Based Practice ............................................................... 25
    2.2.3 Practice-Based Research .................................................................................... 26
    2.2.4 Reflective Practice ............................................................................................... 28
    2.2.5 Reflective Practice and Supervision ..................................................................... 29
2.3 Studies and theoretical perspectives on music therapy training ................................... 30
2.4 Studies and theoretical perspectives on training in related fields ....................................... 32
2.5 Studies and theories about encouraging students to engage with research .......................... 34
2.5.1 Inquiry-based learning .............................................................................................. 34
2.5.2 Research-based learning ........................................................................................... 35
2.5.3 TASC International: Thinking actively in a social context ......................................... 35
2.6 Summary and why this study is needed ............................................................................ 36
2.7 The research question and subsidiary questions for the current study .............................. 37

CHAPTER 3 ............................................................................................................................. ........ 38
METHODOLOGY AND METHODS ..................................................................................................... 38

3 Introduction ................................................................................................................ ............. 38
3.1 Theoretical perspective that informs the research .............................................................. 38
3.1.1 Epistemology: Social Constructivism........................................................................ 39
3.1.2 The use of the researcher as instrument in the research.............................................. 41
3.2 Methodology ............................................................................................................... ..... 42
3.2.1 Qualitative Exploratory Case Study Research ........................................................... 42
3.2.2 Interpretive research ................................................................................................. 44
3.2.3 Autoethnographic commentary ................................................................................. 45
3.2.4 Authenticity, trustworthiness and the controversy of ‘validity’ .................................. 45
3.3 Choice of methods and data collection techniques ............................................................ 46
3.3.1 Focus Groups ........................................................................................................... 46
3.3.2 In-depth interviewing ............................................................................................... 47
3.3.3 Reflective research journal ....................................................................................... 48
3.3.4 Field notes from site visits ........................................................................................ 48
3.4 Design and Framework of the PhD Research Study .......................................................... 48
3.5 Ethical Considerations .................................................................................................... .. 53
3.5.1 Informed consent to participate ................................................................................. 54
3.5.2 Confidentiality and de-identification of data ............................................................. 54
3.5.3 Avoiding issues of power and vulnerability for students and staff ............................. 55
3.6 Methods and procedures for data collection ...................................................................... 56
3.6.1 Overall recruitment strategy ...................................................................................... 56
3.6.2 Procedures for Focus groups ..................................................................................... 56
3.6.3 Procedures for two site visits to educational settings (Europe and Australasia) .......... 58
3.6.4 Reflective research journal ....................................................................................... 62
3.7 Analysis of Data .......................................................................................................... ..... 62
3.7.1 Thematic analysis ..................................................................................................... 62
3.7.2 Procedures for Stage 1: Analysis of focus groups....................................................... 65
3.7.3 Procedures for Stage 2: Analysis of the site visits ...................................................... 66
3.7.4 Procedures for Stage 3: Triangulation of data sources from Stage 1 and 2 alongside research journal .............................................................................................................. ......... 67
3.8 Mapping the Findings ....................................................................................................... 68
3.8.1 Using musical analogies to frame the findings .......................................................... 68
3.8.2 The musical forms used as metaphors in the findings ................................................ 70
3.8.3 Text presentation of the findings ............................................................................... 73
CHAPTER 4: STAGE 1 OF FINDINGS ................................................................................................ 77
‘BEING ON FIRE’: GROUND BASS ................................................................................................ 77
4 Introduction ................................................................................................................ ............. 77
4.1 Key to identifying the data sources ................................................................................... 78
4.2 Core theme for this chapter: Stage 1: ‘Being on fire’ ........................................................ 79
4.2.1 Layout of sub-themes ............................................................................................... 79
4.2.2 Awakening curiosity about music therapy ................................................................. 80
4.2.3 Experiencing the excitement of search and inquiry about practice ......................... 84
4.2.4 Being inspired by client-led thinking as a way into research .................................... 88
4.2.5 Being inspired by an interactive loop – the ‘back and forth’ from research to practice 92
4.2.6 Valuing the inspiration and influence of mentors ...................................................... 96
4.2.7 Being inspired and held by a collaborative model of research. ................................. 100
4.2.8 The quest and travelling into the unknown .............................................................. 105
4.2.9 Working bloody hard .............................................................................................. 108
Description of sub-theme: ..................................................................................................... . 108
4.3 Concluding comments .................................................................................................... 110
CHAPTER 5: STAGE 2 OF FINDINGS .............................................................................................. 111
ACKNOWLEDGING AND MANAGING CHANGE: .............................................................................. 111
THEME AND VARIATIONS ............................................................................................................. 111
5 Introduction ................................................................................................................ ........... 111
5.1 Core theme for this chapter: Stage 2: ‘Acknowledging and managing change’ .......... 112
5.1.1 Layout of sub-themes for the chapter ...................................................................... 113
5.1.2 Valuing our heritage and traditions of knowledge ................................................... 114
5.1.3 The ‘perspective’s ever changing’ ........................................................................... 117
5.1.4 The evolving of professional language and definitions in music therapy .......... 120
5.1.5 The discipline constantly re-aligns in relation to various contextual influences ...... 124
5.1.6 Developing the profession ...................................................................................... 128
5.1.7 Experiencing being at a crossroads: the opportunity for change ......................... 132
5.1.8 Using critical appraisal in research and practice ...................................................... 134
Table of Figures

Figure 1: Model of Stage 1 of Study - Focus groups ................................................................. 50
Figure 2: Model of Stage 2 of Study - Site visits 1 and 2 ......................................................... 51
Figure 3: Model of Stage 3 of Study - triangulation of data sources ................................. 53
Figure 4: A musical model for the thematic analysis ............................................................. 70
Figure 5: Koru patterns on the ‘cat’s eye’ shell ................................................................. 76
Figure 6: Map of themes for chapter 4 .................................................................................. 80
Figure 7: Map of themes for chapter 5 .................................................................................. 114
Figure 8: Photo of the South Wairarapa landscape: an impressionist viewpoint .............. 138
Figure 9: Map of themes for chapter 6 .................................................................................. 142
Figure 10: Contexts for seven music therapy programmes and the challenges for integration .............................................................................................................. 166
Figure 11: Summary of seven programme contexts and curriculum strategies for integration of research and practice .............................................................................. 171
Figure 12: Table of competencies for research for qualified music therapists in Three countries .................................................................................................................. 175
Figure 13: Interaction between emotional engagement and critical thinking - parallels in research and practice .......................................................... 183
Figure 14: Balancing research and practice at the outset of the study .................................. 185
Figure 15: Matrix of processes integrating research and practice (inside-outside; collaborative-individual) .................................................................................. 189
Figure 16: When a knight won his spurs ............................................................................. 189
Figure 17: “Every analyst who is awake whilst working is engaging in research” – after Winnicott (Dorothy Raphael) ................................................................. 201