PERSISTENT SYMPTOMS AFTER A TRAUMATIC BRAIN INJURY AND THEIR RELATIONSHIP TO THE PSYCHOLOGICAL IMPACT OF THE TRAUMA AND TO PTSD.

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Master of Arts in Psychology at Massey University.

IAN WISHART
1997
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank my Supervisor Dr. Janet Leathem for passing her enthusiasm for her work onto me, for her work in obtaining subjects, and for her patience in eventually extracting some readable material from me.

I am also extremely grateful to my subjects, many of whom spent time and money on travel to participate in this study, and all of whom shared their unpleasant experiences most willingly and generously.
ABSTRACT

The post-concussive syndrome (PCS) is the term used to describe the persisting and troublesome symptoms and complaints after a traumatic brain injury. Uncertainty exists about the cause of these symptoms, but usually the early symptoms are held to have their origin in the physical brain damage while the late-onset and persisting ones are thought to be caused by psychological factors. Previous studies indicate that head injured persons complain of more symptoms when they retained consciousness during the injury and when the injury was caused by someone else, especially if it was an assault. Such findings suggest that not only are psychological factors pertinent to the outcome of a head injury but that factors relating to the subjective impact of the traumatic event causing the injury may play a role. Because post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) is also a possible outcome of such an injury, it seems possible, if not likely, to confuse the two disorders, especially since they also share many symptoms in common. This study was intended to clarify the prevalence of symptoms of PCS and PTSD in persons who had suffered a brain injury more than three months previously, and to examine how these symptoms interact and whether different aspects of the subjective impact predicted either PCS or PTSD. The study was in two sections, Part 1 examining the records of 195 subjects, and results supported previous research showing that mild head injured subjects and those who had been assaulted, experienced more symptoms than those with injuries of greater severity or head injuries from other causes. Part 2 was developed to investigate these findings more fully and used 18 subjects who were administered questionnaires on PCS and PTSD symptoms and on the psychological (subjective) impact of the head injury trauma. Results showed that there was a trend for the subjective impact of the trauma to be associated with PCS and there was a significant association between the subjective impact and PTSD. It appeared that PTSD symptoms were acting as a confounding factor for the diagnosis of PCS after a traumatic brain injury with a high subjective impact. Another finding of this study was that, although subjects with memory of the trauma generally experienced more PTSD symptoms than those with no memory of it, there were several subjects who could not remember the trauma but who had a high number of intrusive PTSD symptoms. This contradicts the usual view that PTSD and amnesia for the trauma are incompatible.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## INTRODUCTION

1

## CHAPTER 1 An overview of head injury

1.1 Chapter overview ......................................................... 4

1.2 Epidemiology

1.2.1 Incidence ................................................................. 4

1.2.2 Age and gender factors ............................................... 5

1.2.3 Alcohol intoxication and head injury ............................ 5

1.2.4 Causes of mild head injury ......................................... 5

1.3 Classification of head injury........................................... 6

1.4 Outcomes of head injury

1.4.1 Severe head injury .................................................... 8

1.4.2 Mild head injury ........................................................ 9

## CHAPTER 2 Post-concussive syndrome (PCS)

2.1 Structure of PCS ........................................................... 14

2.2 Clarifying the diagnosis of PCS ....................................... 16

2.3 Etiology of PCS

2.3.1 Organic basis of PCS .................................................. 17

2.3.2 PCS and seeking compensation ....................................... 20

2.3.3 Psychological factors contributing to PCS ...................... 21

2.4 An integrative model of PCS ............................................ 23

2.5 Conclusion ......................................................................... 24
CHAPTER 3 Post-traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD)
3.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................... 25
3.2 Diagnosis of PTSD ............................................................................................... 25
   3.2.1 Partial PTSD ........................................................................................... 27
   3.2.2 Acute stress disorder ............................................................................. 27
   3.2.3 Secondary symptoms of PTSD .......................................................... 27
3.3 Etiology and risk factors for PTSD ..................................................................... 28
   3.3.1 Biological theories ................................................................................ 29
   3.3.2 Behavioral theories ............................................................................. 29
   3.3.3 Cognitive theories ............................................................................... 29
3.4 Clarifying Criterion A of PTSD ........................................................................ 30
3.5 Criterion A and brain injury ............................................................................. 31
3.6 Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 33

CHAPTER 4 The interaction of PTSD and PCS
4.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 34
4.2 Differentiating PTSD from PCS
   4.2.1 Psychological impact ............................................................................. 35
   4.2.2 Assessing how the impact of the trauma affects PTSD and PCS .......... 36
   4.2.3 The centrality of meaning and context ............................................. 37
4.3 Developing a head injury impact scale ............................................................. 38
4.4 Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 41

CHAPTER 5 Research hypotheses
5.1 Summary of previous Chapters ....................................................................... 42
5.2 Aims of this research ....................................................................................... 42
5.3 Research hypotheses ......................................................................................... 45
   5.3.1 Part 1 .................................................................................................. 45
   5.3.2 Part 2 .................................................................................................. 46
CHAPTER 6 Methodology
6.1 Subjects................................................................. 49
6.2 Measures
   6.2.1 Measures used in Part 1................................. 50
   6.2.2 Measures used in Part 2
      6.2.2.(i) The Head Injury Impact Questionnaire........ 51
      6.2.2.(ii) PTSD measures.................................. 53
      6.2.2.(iii) PCS measures............................... 55
6.3 Procedure
   6.3.1 Part 1....................................................... 57
   6.3.2 Part 2....................................................... 57
6.4 Ethical considerations........................................... 58

CHAPTER 7 Results
7.1 Part 1............................................................... 59
7.2 Part 2............................................................... 65

CHAPTER 8 Discussion
8.1 PCS and factors associated with it............................. 80
   8.1.1 Structure of PCS....................................... 81
   8.1.2 Factors associated with PCS.......................... 81
8.2 PTSD symptoms and associated factors........................ 82
8.3 The mediating role of psychological impact.................. 85
8.4 Limitations of this study....................................... 86
8.5 Suggestions for further research............................. 88
8.6 Summary............................................................ 90

REFERENCES.............................................................. 92
APPENDICES

A The Head Injury Impact Questionnaire ........................................ 107
B PCS Measure ............................................................................. 115
C PTSD measures ......................................................................... 118
D Part 2 subjects' Raw scores on the HIIQ ......................................... 120
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Percentage distribution of the causes of MHI</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Summary of outcome studies of MHI</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Frequency in percentages of post-concussive symptoms in three studies</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Clusters of post-concussive symptoms</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Outline of the diagnostic criteria for PTSD as given in DSM-IV</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Secondary symptoms of PTSD</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Characteristics of the subjects in Part 2</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Abbreviated item content corresponding to 12 psychological impact dimensions and memory measures on the HIIQ</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 PCS symptoms</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Percentage of subjects with MHI and moderate/severe brain injury who have symptoms</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Percentage of subjects reporting and not reporting flashbacks who also reported other symptoms</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Causes of brain injury and percentage of subjects who complain of problems</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Subjects raw scores for PCS, IES, HIIQ total impact, memory measures, and PTSD classification</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5 Percentage of Part 2 subjects who report PCS symptoms and comparison with results from other studies</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7.6 Number of symptoms of DSM-IV PTSD and scores on the IES for each subject ............................................................ 69

7.7 Prevalence of PTSD symptoms in Part 2 subjects compared to other studies ............................................................... 71

7.8 Mean PCS and IES scores for subjects with and without other injuries .......... 72

7.9 Difference in mean scores between MHI and moderate/severely head injured for PCS, PTSD symptoms, total psychological impact, and memory of trauma ............................................................... 73

7.10 Mean PCS and PTSD scores for high and low psychological impact groups and for the two groups representing ability to remember the trauma .............. 75

7.11 Mean scores on the psychological impact dimensions of the HIIQ for PTSD and non-PTSD groups ............................................................... 79

Table B in Appendix B PCS symptoms and corresponding Checklist items ........ 117

Table D in Appendix D Likert Scale scores on the HIIQ ....... 120
LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE ............................................................................................................. Page

1. Model representing factors operating before, during, and after a brain injury.....44

2. Percentage of mild, moderate, and severely head injured subjects with symptoms.................................................................61

3. Differences in mean PCS scores for high and low impact groups....................76

4. Differences in mean IES (PTSD) scores for high and low impact groups........76

5. Total score for all subjects on each HI IQ impact dimension ..........................77

6. Comparison of mean scores on HI IQ dimensions for PTSD and non-PTSD subjects........................................................................79