


Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.



**Changing the Paradigm:
reflections on experiences
in workshops to reduce
stigma and discrimination
in mental health services.**

A thesis submitted
in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree
of Master of Philosophy
at Massey University,
Auckland, New Zealand.

Ruth Gerzon, December 2001
Massey University ID 07953615



CHANGING THE PARADIGM:

REFLECTIONS ON EXPERIENCES IN WORKSHOPS TO REDUCE

STIGMA AND DISCRIMINATION IN MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES

**A thesis submitted
in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of
Master of Philosophy at
Massey University,
Auckland, New Zealand.**

Ruth Gerzon

2001

ABSTRACT

One of the key objectives of the national Like Minds, Like Mine project against stigma and discrimination associated with mental illness is to work with the mental health sector to change attitudes and behaviour through education and policy development. This action research thesis examines the effectiveness of workshops aimed at reducing the stigma and discrimination within mental health services.

Most hospital based mental health services were developed within the 'medical model' based on professional power. Non-discriminatory services are seen to be those that support a 'recovery model', as promulgated by the Mental Health Commission, which is based on partnership and participation by service users. For many services this requires a change in their culture. This research examines the effectiveness of workshops designed to support such cultural change, facilitated by people with experience of mental illness. Observation, evaluation and reflection on two workshops, and the findings of a literature search informed practices, with new techniques developed and trialled.

DEDICATION

To people with experiences of mental illness
and mental health service staff
who hold a vision of services
where respect, partnership and participation
are a reality.

CONTENTS

Abstract	i
Contents	ii
List of figures and tables	v
Glossary	vi
Acknowledgements	vii
Chapter One: The context of discrimination	1
Introduction	1
Stigma and discrimination and mental illness	2
The history of stigma and discrimination in mental health services in Aotearoa/New Zealand	7
Institutionalisation	7
Deinstitutionalisation	9
Paradigms in health care	9
The culture of mental health services	15
New paradigm: moving to a recovery model	18
The role of training	24
Chapter Two: Learning and social change	28
Introduction	28
Adult learning	28
Education and social change	30
Experiential learning	33
Attitude change	36
Lessons from anti-racism education	39
The centrality of discourse	40
Discourse and racism	41
Who speaks for whom	43

Chapter Three: Methodology

Action research in the field of education.....	46
Processes.....	50
Group process.....	50
Participants.....	52
Cultural issues.....	52
Data collection.....	52
Quantitative data.....	53
Ethical issues.....	55
Workshop selection.....	55
Participant selection.....	56
Interview format.....	56
Conflict of Interest.....	57
Data analysis procedures.....	57
Validity Issues.....	58

Chapter Four: the cycles of research

Issues of facilitator identity.....	60
Process of inquiry.....	61
Workshop aims.....	62
Identity issues.....	63
Safety and effectiveness.....	68
Decision.....	72
Reflection on previous workshops.....	73
Planning for Workshop One.....	75
Aims.....	75
Literature search.....	76
Resource development.....	77
Workshop One delivery.....	80
Evaluations and interviews following Workshop One.....	82
Questionnaire responses.....	81
Evaluation forms.....	84

Interviews	86
Reflection and redesign following Workshop One	90
Process	91
Content.....	101
Workshop Two Delivery	103
Evaluations and Interviews following Workshop Two ..	103
Chapter Five: Reflection and redesign.....	109
The Recovery Model	109
Clarifying cultural changes	109
Avoiding dualism	111
Credibility	112
Resistance and the transtheoretical model	112
Systemic change	114
Conclusion	115
Appendix One:	
Ethics application.....	121
Acceptance.....	128
Information and consent forms.....	129
Appendix Two:	
Questionnaire.....	135
Evaluation forms.....	136
Interview questions	140
Appendix Three:	
Workshop One timetable.....	141
Workshop One handouts	143
Appendix Four:	
Workshop Two timetable	147
Workshop Two handouts.....	153
Bibliography	160

FIGURES

Figure 1: The up-hierarchy of open ego learning	34
Figure 2: Open ego learning as a cycle	35
Figure 3: The cycles of action research.....	49

TABLES

Table 1: Issues arising from the initial literature review.....	45
Table 2: A framework for understanding relationships	79
Table 3: The framework: participant responses	81
Table 4: Summary of changes made for Workshop Two	102
Table 5: A draft framework of cultural changes in services	110
Table 6: Summary of Changes planned following Workshop Two.....	115

GLOSSARY

Aroha	–	love, affection
Awhi	–	cherish, embrace
Karakia	–	prayer
Kaumatua	–	elder
Kaupapa	–	plan, theme
Mamae	–	pained, distressed
Mana	–	influence, authority
Manaaki	–	to show respect, kindness
Mihi	–	greeting
Mokemoke	–	lonely
Pakeha	–	a person of predominantly European descent living in Aotearoa/New Zealand
Porangi	–	beside oneself, out of one's mind, mad
Rangimarie	–	quiet, peaceful
Tauiwi	–	different tribe, those who came later (Pakeha, Samoan, Chinese etc., all non-Maori in Aotearoa/New Zealand)
Tipuna	–	ancestor
Tumeke	–	'too much' – slang term meaning something is really good
Turoro	–	sick person
Waiata	–	song

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Heartfelt thanks go firstly to
people involved in the
Serious Fun 'N Mind Trust
who contributed the vision
and patiently accompanied me on this journey
contributing so much to joint learning recorded here.

Secondly I thank my family, friends and supervisors
for their support and encouragement.
Without them this would never have been completed.